

# Contents

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| Abbreviations  | 9         |
| Preface  | 12        |
| <b>Part I: The Problem of Evaluation in Development Cooperation</b>                              | <b>13</b> |
| 1 <i>Introduction and Formulation of the Problem</i>   | 15        |
| 1.1 Development Cooperation: Discussion and Controversy  | 15        |
| 1.2 The Lack of Impact and Sustainability Analyses   | 17        |
| 1.3 Aims and Structure of the Present Study  | 20        |
| 2 <i>Impact and Sustainability Studies</i>   | 25        |
| 2.1 A Clarification of Concepts  | 25        |
| 2.2 Impact Studies on the Macrolevel   | 28        |
| 2.2.1 Macroanalyses Using Aggregate Data   | 28        |
| 2.2.2 Macroeconomic Analyses   | 32        |
| 2.2.3 Implications for the Present Study: A New Analytic Approach                                | 36        |
| 2.3 Project-Level Reports Based on Personal Observation and First-Hand Experience                | 38        |
| 2.4 Impact Studies on the Level of Programs and Projects   | 39        |
| 2.4.1 Reasons for the Lack of Impact and Sustainability Studies on the Project and Program Level | 39        |
| 2.4.2 Program- and Project-Level Findings on the Effectiveness of Development Cooperation        | 47        |
| 2.4.3 Assessment of the Findings and Their Implications  | 57        |
| <b>Part II: The Evaluation Model</b>   | <b>63</b> |
| 3 <i>A Theoretical Model for Evaluating the Sustainability of Development Projects</i>           | 65        |
| 3.1 Elements of the Theoretical Model  | 65        |
| 3.2 Applying The Life-Course Model to Development Projects                                       | 66        |
| 3.2.1 The Project as the Model's Object of Study   | 66        |
| 3.2.2 The Life-Course Research Perspective   | 67        |

|                  |  |            |
|------------------|--|------------|
| 3.3              | A Multidimensional Model of Sustainability   | 73         |
| 3.3.1            | The Systematization and Assessment of Existing Models  | 73         |
| 3.3.2            | The Study's Sustainability Model   | 76         |
| 3.4              | The Model of Organization Theory   | 79         |
| 3.4.1            | The Basic Model of Cause and Effect  | 79         |
| 3.4.2            | The Basic Elements of an Organization  | 81         |
| 3.4.3            | Organizational Effectiveness   | 85         |
| 3.5              | The Model of Diffusion Theory  | 88         |
| 3.5.1            | The Perspective of Diffusion Studies   | 88         |
| 3.5.2            | Factors Influencing the Diffusion Process  | 90         |
| 3.6              | The Theoretical Model and the Hypotheses of the Study: A Summary   | 94         |
| <br>             |  |            |
| 4                | <i>A Methodological Model for Evaluating the Sustainability of Development Projects</i>                          | 97         |
| 4.1              | Different Perspectives in Evaluation Research  | 97         |
| 4.1.1            | Implementation and Evaluation Models   | 97         |
| 4.1.2            | The Problem of Goals in Evaluation Research  | 101        |
| 4.2              | Methodological Paradigms of Evaluation Research  | 102        |
| 4.3              | Research Designs for Impact Evaluation   | 105        |
| 4.3.1            | Experimental Versus Nonexperimental Designs  | 105        |
| 4.3.2            | Designs for Impact Assessment in Developing-Country Studies  | 111        |
| 4.3.3            | The Necessity of a Multimethod Approach  | 113        |
| 4.4              | The Multimethod Model of This Research Study   | 115        |
| 4.4.1            | The Research Design  | 115        |
| 4.4.2            | The Analytic Classificatory Framework for Capturing and Assessing the Life Course of a Project                   | 118        |
| 4.4.3            | Selected Indicators and the Assessment Procedure (with Examples)   | 122        |
| 4.4.4            | Five Types of Sustainability   | 130        |
| 4.5              | Data-Collection Methods Employed   | 133        |
| 4.5.1            | Data-Collection Methods for the Evaluation of the Planning and Implementation Phases                             | 133        |
| 4.5.2            | Data-Collection Methods for the Evaluation of the Impact Phase   | 136        |
| 4.6              | Summary  | 140        |
| <br>             |  |            |
| <b>Part III:</b> | <b>The Results of the Evaluation</b>   | <b>143</b> |
| 5                | <i>Characterization of the Area of Development-Policy Assistance, Projects, and Countries Selected for Study</i> | 145        |
| 5.1              | The Educational Sector as the Object of Study  | 145        |

|       |  |     |
|-------|--|-----|
| 5.1.1 | The Significance of Education and Vocational Training in Development Policy  | 145 |
| 5.1.2 | The Problematic State of Educational Policy in the Third World   | 147 |
| 5.1.3 | Vocational Training  | 152 |
| 5.1.4 | Implications for the Present Study   | 157 |
| 5.2   | The Educational Program of Development Policy and the Focal Points of its Assistance Efforts                             | 158 |
| 5.2.1 | Historical Changes in Program Policy   | 158 |
| 5.2.2 | The Focal Points of Assistance as Reflected in Expenditure Data  | 160 |
| 5.2.3 | The Focal Points of Program Implementation   | 162 |
| 5.3   | Selection of Projects Studied  | 167 |
| 5.4   | The State of Education and Vocational Training in the Countries Studied  | 172 |
| 5.4.1 | General Overview   | 172 |
| 5.4.2 | The Educational and Vocational-Training Systems of the Selected Countries and the Classification of the Projects Studied | 176 |
| 5.5   | The Economic Structure and Level of Development of the Countries Studied   | 189 |
| 5.5.1 | General Overview   | 189 |
| 5.5.2 | The Economic and Employment Structure  | 191 |
| 6     | <i>The Quality of Project Interventions</i>  | 196 |
| 6.1   | Assessment Criteria  | 196 |
| 6.2   | Case-Study Examples  | 198 |
| 6.2.1 | The Kerschensteiner Institute in Guatemala (Z-1)   | 198 |
| 6.2.2 | INTECAP in Guatemala (D-3)   | 200 |
| 6.3   | Summary of Findings  | 202 |
| 7     | <i>Internal Sustainability: The Organizational Effectiveness of the Project-Implementing Agencies</i>                    | 210 |
| 7.1   | Methodology  | 210 |
| 7.2   | Case-Study Examples  | 211 |
| 7.2.1 | The Goals of Project Participants  | 211 |
| 7.2.2 | The Personnel of the Training Organizations  | 215 |
| 7.2.3 | The Organizational Structure of the Training Organizations   | 219 |
| 7.2.4 | The Financial Resources of the Training Organizations  | 227 |
| 7.2.5 | The Technical Facilities of the Training Organizations   | 231 |
| 7.2.6 | The Training Models of the Training Organizations  | 233 |
| 7.2.7 | Project Profiles as Evaluation and Management Tools  | 239 |
| 7.3   | A Summary of the Results of All Projects Studied   | 242 |

|       |  |     |
|-------|--|-----|
| 7.4   | Internal Sustainability and the German Project Contribution  | 271 |
| 8     | <i>External Sustainability: Diffusion Effects in the Systems of Vocational Training and Employment</i> | 282 |
| 8.1   | Methodology  | 282 |
| 8.2   | Diffusion Effects in the System of Vocational and Technical Training                                   | 283 |
| 8.2.1 | Case-Study Examples  | 283 |
| 8.2.2 | Summary: Findings from All Projects Studied and from the Causal Analysis                               | 285 |
| 8.3   | Diffusion Effects in the Employment System   | 294 |
| 8.3.1 | Case-Study Examples  | 295 |
| 8.3.2 | Summary: Findings from All Projects Studied and from the Causal Analysis                               | 299 |
| 9     | <i>Overall Summary, Conclusions, and Recommendations for Development Cooperation</i>                   | 311 |
|       | <i>Appendixes</i>  | 325 |
|       | <i>References and Bibliography</i>   | 373 |