

Contents

List of abbreviations	9
1. Introduction	11
1.1. Problem definition and objective of the investigation	11
1.2. Proceeding of the investigation	12
2. Comparative advertising from the marketing point of view	13
2.1. Role of advertising	13
2.2. Definition of comparative advertising	13
2.3. Comparative advertising in the marketing-mix	14
2.3.1. Sales promotion	15
2.3.2. Public relations	15
2.4. Objectives of comparative advertising	16
2.4.1. Comparative product or service advertising	16
2.4.2. Corporate image	17
2.4.3. Corporate identity	17
2.5. Effectiveness of comparative advertising	18
2.5.1. Cognition	18
2.5.2. Affect	19
2.5.3. Conation	20
2.5.4. Consequences for the applicability of comparative advertising	21
2.6. Consideration of the practical application of comparative advertising	22
2.7. Relation between advertising and law	24
3. Comparative advertising under German law	25
3.1. Legal basis for comparative advertising	25
3.2. Unfair Competition Act	26
3.2.1. Great general clause (§ 1)	27
3.2.2. Small general clause (§ 2)	29
3.2.3. Tasks and aims	30
3.3. Classification of different types of comparative advertising	30
3.3.1. Personal comparative advertising	31
3.3.2. Imitative comparative advertising	32
3.3.3. Critical comparative advertising	32

3.4. Constituent fact of critical comparative advertising	33
3.4.1. Competitive action	34
3.4.2. Reference to identified competitors	34
3.4.3. Demarcation of general references	35
3.5. General limits	39
3.5.1. Order of truthfulness	39
3.5.2. Order of factualness	41
3.6. Fundamental prohibition of critical comparative advertising	42
3.6.1. Traditional exceptions of the fundamental prohibition	42
3.7. Recent decisions of the Bundesgerichtshof	44
3.7.1. Criteria of the sufficient reason	45
3.7.2. Necessary limits	45
3.7.3. Recent exceptions of the fundamental prohibition	46
3.7.4. Advertising with results of comparative products test	49
3.8. 'Cola-Test'-decision and its impact on critical comparative advertising	49
4. Balancing of the various interests of the market participants	52
4.1. Proceeding of the balancing of the various interests	52
4.2. Interests of the competitor	52
4.2.1. 'Hellegold-Motiv'	52
4.3. Interests of the consumer	55
4.3.1. Market transparency	55
4.3.2. Market confusion	57
4.4. Interests of the advertiser	59
4.4.1. Freedom of expression of opinion	59
4.4.2. Interest in effective advertising	60
4.5. Interests of the general public	60
4.5.1. Market access	61
4.6. Conclusive balancing of the various interests of the market participants	62
4.6.1. Demand of a permission of critical comparative advertising	64
5. Comparative advertising under European Community law	65
5.1. Objectives of European Community law	65
5.2. Council Directive 84/450/EEC	66
5.2.1. Legal basis for Council Directive 84/450/EEC	66
5.2.2. Importance of Article 30 EC Treaty	67
5.2.3. Development of Council Directive 84/450/EEC	70
5.2.4. Reasons for the amendment of Council Directive 84/450/EEC	72
5.2.5. Amendment of Council Directive 84/450/EEC	73

6. Future prospects	81
6.1. Future prospects for the law on comparative advertising in Germany	81
6.1.1. Implementation by the legislator	81
6.1.2. Judicial decisions on comparative advertising in Germany	82
6.2. Theory and practice	83
List of cases	84
List of references	87
Appendix	
1. British Codes of Advertising and Sales Promotion Rules	A1
2. Burger King vs. McDonald's	A2/1
2. Colgate vs. Listerine	A2/2
3. Ten guidelines for the proper use of comparative advertising, developed by the American Association of Advertising Agencies	A3
4. Avis vs. Hertz	A4
5. La Choy vs. Kikkoman	A5
6. Kraft vs. Weight Watchers	A6
7. Diet Sprite vs. Diet 7.UP	A7
8. The Budget Gourmet vs. Lean Cuisine	A8
9. Isuzu vs. Rover	A9
10. Nissan vs. Honda, Toyota, Acura, Mitsubishi, Mercedes-Benz, BMW, Porsche	A10
11. Saab vs. Mercedes-Benz, Volvo, BMW, Porsche	A11
12. Volvo vs. Ford, Vauxhall	A12
13. Volvo vs. BMW	A13
14. Volvo vs. Audi, BMW, Porsche	A14
15. Nissan vs. BMW	A15
16. Mazda vs. Acura, BMW, Infiniti, Lexus, Mercedes-Benz	A16
17. Atari vs. Apple, IBM, Commodore	A17
18. Blue Chip vs. IBM	A18
19. Bayer vs. Johnson & Johnson	A19
20. Hogan vs. Titleist, Wilson ProStaff	A20
21. AT&T vs. MCI, US SPRINT	A21
22. MCI vs. AT&T	A22
23. Tyco vs. Lego	A23
24. DHL vs. Federal Express, United Parcel Service	A24
25. Fiat vs. Simca	A25