OVERVIEW

PREFACE i

OVERVIEW iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS iv
INDEX OF TABLES x
INDEX OF FIGURES xi

A. INTRODUCTION: 1
The Transition Crisis and the Economics of Transition

B. CONDITIONS AT THE MICROECONOMIC LEVEL:
FINANCIAL UNDERDEVELOPMENT AND MICROECONOMIC DISTORTIONS 31

I. The Role of the Financial Sector for Stability and Growth 35
II. Banking Sectors in FSU Economies:
- Credit Allocation in Transition - 59
III. Enterprises in FSU Economies:
- Corporate Governance in Transition - 85
IV. Transmission Mechanisms in FSU Economies:
- Monetary Policy in Transition - 117

C. ARREARS, SOFT BUDGET CONSTRAINTS AND ENDOGENOUS MONEY 143

V. The Emergence of Arrears in FSU Economies 149
VI. Systemic Change, Collusive Arrears and Credibility 183
VI. A Microeconomic Explanation for the Macroeconomic Effects of Arrears 207

D. BARTER, HARD BUDGET CONSTRAINTS AND ENDOGENOUS VELOCITY 247

VIII. Monetary Disruptions and the Emergence of Barter in FSU Economies 251
IX. Modelling Barter and Demonetisation in FSU Economies 279

E. CONCLUSIONS: 311
Questions, Results and Policy Implications

REFERENCES I

TABLE OF CONTENTS

A. INTRODUCTION

The Transformation Crisis and the Economics of Transition 1

1. BREAKDOWN AND INITIAL HOPES 2
2. THE TRANSFORMATION CRISIS: THE STYLISED FACTS 4
   - 2.1 Macroeconomic Disruptions 4
   - 2.2 Macroeconomic Policies 7
   - 2.3 Maladjustment at the Microeconomic Level 9
   - 2.4 Open Questions 12
3. MACROECONOMIC ANALYSIS OF THE TRANSITION CRISIS 14
   - 3.1 Keynesian Demand Explanations 14
   - 3.2 Neoclassical Supply Side Explanations 16
   - 3.3 Post-Keynesian Credit Crunch Theories 17
   - 3.4 Monetarist Answers 18
   - 3.5 Conclusions 20
4. THE MICROECONOMICS OF TRANSITION 21
5. THE APPROACH OF THE PRESENT STUDY 23

B. CONDITIONS AT THE MICROECONOMIC LEVEL: FINANCIAL UNDERDEVELOPMENT AND MICROECONOMIC DISTORTIONS 31

I. The Role of the Financial Sector for Stability and Growth 35

1. INTRODUCTION 36
2. THE ROLE OF THE FINANCIAL SECTOR IN A MARKET ECONOMY 38
   - 2.1 Capital Allocation 38
   - 2.2 Corporate Governance 40
   - 2.3 Transmission of Monetary Impulses 46
3. THE ROLE OF THE FINANCIAL SECTOR IN A PLANNED ECONOMY 48
   - 3.1 Institutional Features of Post-Soviet Financial Systems 49
   - 3.2 Accomplishment of the Tasks Under Central-Planning 50
   - 3.3 Macroeconomic Stability under Central Planning 51
4. THE ROLE OF THE FINANCIAL SECTOR IN THE TRANSITION 53
   - 4.1 Stabilisation 53
   - 4.2 Privatisation and Restructuring 54
   - 4.3 The Sequencing Problem 55
5. CONCLUSIONS 56

II. Banking Sectors in FSU Economies - Credit Allocation in Transition - 59

1. **INTRODUCTION** 60
2. **EARLY DEVELOPMENTS IN THE BANKING SECTOR** 62
   - 2.1 From Rigid Planning to the Gorbatchev Reforms 62
   - 2.2 Price Liberalisation and Banking Sector Expansion 63
   - 2.3 The Break-up of the Ruble Zone 65
3. **MICROECONOMIC BEHAVIOUR AND OPERATIONAL PROBLEMS** 67
   - 3.1 A Taxonomy of Banks 67
   - 3.2 Corporate Governance in Banks 70
   - 3.3 Problems of Credit Allocation 71
4. **MACROECONOMIC IMPLICATIONS OF SYSTEMIC WEAKNESSES** 74
   - 4.1 Financial Repression: Regulations and Rules of Behaviour 74
   - 4.2 Lending Boom and Credit Crunch 76
   - 4.3 Bad credit and Perverse Incentives 79
   - 4.4 The Interest Wedge and Disintermediation 80
   - 4.5 Credit Rationing and Stagnation 81
5. **CONCLUSIONS** 82

III. Enterprises in FSU Economies - Corporate Governance in Transition - 85

1. **INTRODUCTION** 86
2. **EARLY DEVELOPMENTS AND OUTCOMES OF PRIVATISATION** 87
   - 2.1 Enterprises Under Central Planning 87
   - 2.2 Methods of Privatisation 89
   - 2.3 Privatisation Outcomes 92
3. **HYPOTHESES OF ENTERPRISE BEHAVIOUR** 94
   - 3.1 Enterprises are Not Allowed (The May-not Hypothesis) 94
   - 3.2 Enterprises are Not Able (The Cannot Hypothesis) 97
   - 3.3 Enterprises are Not Willing (The Will-not Hypothesis) 99
4. **A SYNTHESIS: THE SURVIVAL-ORIENTED ENTERPRISE** 102
   - 4.1 Macroeconomic Instability and Uncertainty 104
   - 4.2 Inter-Enterprise Coordination 106
   - 4.3 Intra-Enterprises Cooperation 109
5. **CONCLUSIONS** 112

IV. Transmission Mechanisms in FSU Economies - Monetary Policy in Transition - 117

1. INTRODUCTION 118
2. THEORIES OF MONETARY TRANSMISSION 119
   - 2.1 The Money View 119
   - 2.2 The Credit View 123
   - 2.3 The Developing Countries Perspective 126
3. TRANSMISSION MECHANISMS IN TRANSITION 130
   - 3.1 Difficulties in the Application of Theories 130
   - 3.2 Impediments to Monetary Transmission 131
   - 3.3 Possible Transmission Processes in FSU Transition 133
4. MONETARY POLICY IN TRANSITION 135
   - 4.1 Policy Objectives 135
   - 4.2 The Choice of Instruments 137
5. CONCLUSIONS 139

C. ARREARS, SOFT BUDGET CONSTRAINTS AND ENDOGENOUS MONEY 143

V. The Emergence of Arrears in FSU Economies 149

1. INTRODUCTION 150
2. THE LEGACY OF THE PAYMENTS SYSTEM: A TECHNICAL APPROACH 152
   - 2.1 Inertia of Payments System Procedures 153
   - 2.2 Payments System Inefficiencies and Float 156
   - 2.3 Abundance of Non-Cash versus Shortage of Cash 161
3. CREDITOR-DEBTOR RELATIONS: A PROPERTY RIGHTS APPROACH 165
   - 3.1 Bankruptcy Laws and Non-Enforceability of Property Rights 165
   - 3.2 Relationships Between Enterprises and Banks 167
   - 3.3 Creditor Passivity: Missing Incentives 169
4. LOBBIES AND IMPLICIT CONTRACTS: A POLITICAL ECONOMY APPROACH 171
   - 4.1 The Struggle over the Central Bank 172
   - 4.2 Tax Arrears and Implicit Contracts 174
   - 4.3 Wage Arrears: Ex Post Adjustment versus Inflationary Potential 176
5. CONCLUSIONS 178

VI. Systemic Change, Collusive Arrears and Credibility 183

1. INTRODUCTION 184
2. THE MODEL OF REFERENCE 187
   - 2.1 Decision Rules of Enterprises 187
   - 2.2 Formation of Rational Expectations 188
   - 2.3 The Impact of Stabilisation on Adjustment and Arrears 190
   - 2.4 Conclusions from the Model 192
3. CAUSES OF THE LACK OF CREDIBILITY 194
   - 3.1 The Reputation of Monetary Policy-Makers 194
   - 3.2 The Structure of the Economy 196
   - 3.3 The Nature of the Credit Crunch 197
4. AN EXPLICIT MECHANISM OF COLLUSION 198
   - 4.1 Non-Cooperative Games and Anti-Social Behaviour 199
   - 4.2 A Formalisation of Contagion 200
   - 4.3 Path-Dependency and the Role of Political Leadership 201
5. CONCLUSIONS 203

VII. A Microeconomic Explanation for the Macroeconomic Effects of Arrears 207

1. INTRODUCTION 208
2. CONDITIONS AT THE MICROECONOMIC LEVEL 211
   - 2.1 Ownership Structures and Intra-enterprise Cooperation 212
   - 2.2 Survival-Orientation and Inter-enterprise Coordination 214
   - 2.3 The Passivity of the Banking System 217
3. MICROECONOMIC DECISION MAKING DURING TRANSITION 220
   - 3.1 Assumptions 220
   - 3.2 The Scheme 222
   - 3.3 Results and Microeconomic Implications 227
4. A MACROECONOMIC MODEL OF THE POST-SOVIET ECONOMY 229
   - 4.1 Assumptions 229
   - 4.2 The Model 231
   - 4.3 Results and Macroeconomic Implications 232
5. ACTIVE MONETARY POLICY 233
   - 5.1 Raising Interest Rates 233
   - 5.2 Monetary Restraint 234
   - 5.3 Imposing a Ban on Arrears 236
6. CONCLUSIONS AND A PROPOSAL FOR A SHORT-TERM PROGRAMME 238

D. BARTER, HARD BUDGET CONSTRAINTS AND ENDOGENOUS VELOCITY 247

VIII. Monetary Disruptions and the Emergence of Barter in FSU Economies 251

1. INTRODUCTION 252
2. THEORETICAL CONSIDERATIONS ABOUT MONEY AND BARTER 258
3. PUSH FACTORS OF BARTERISATION 263
   - 3.1 Dual Money System, Cash Shortages and Capital Flight 263
   - 3.2 Taxing Procedures, Tax Evasion and Disintermediation 266
4. PULL FACTORS OF BARTERISATION: 268
   - 4.1 Payment Inefficiencies, Banks and Fraud 268
   - 4.2 Prepayment and Credit Crunch 270
   - 4.3 Arrears and Survival-Oriented Enterprises 273
5. CONCLUSIONS 274

IX. Modelling Barter and Demonetisation in FSU Economies 279

1. INTRODUCTION 280
2. CAUSES OF BARTERISATION 286
   - 2.1 Push Factors of Barterisation 287
   - 2.2 Pull Factors of Barterisation: 289
3. A MONETARY MODEL OF PULL FACTORS 291
   - 3.1 Assumptions 291
   - 3.2 The Model 295
   - 3.3 A Simulation 297
4. A MONETARY MODEL OF PUSH FACTORS 298
   - 4.1 Assumptions 299
   - 4.2 The Model 301
   - 4.3 A Simulation 304
5. CONCLUSIONS AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS 305

E. CONCLUSIONS

Questions, Results and Policy Implications 311

1. FACTS AND QUESTIONS 312

2. THE RESULTS OF THE ANALYSIS 313

2.1 Introduction 313

2.2 Financial Underdevelopment and Microeconomic Distortions 313

2.3 Arrears, Soft Budget Constraints and Money Endogeneity 316

2.4 Barter, Hard Budget Constraints and Endogenous Velocity 317

2.5 Conclusions 319

3. REFORMING MACROECONOMIC POLICY 320

4. REFORMS AT THE MICROECONOMIC LEVEL 322

4.1 Approaches to Banking Sector Restructuring 323

4.2 Approaches to Enterprise Sector Restructuring 326

5. OUTLOOK 327

INDEX OF TABLES

Table A.1: Growth Rates of Real GDP 1992-97 4

Table A.2: Index of Real Output 1992-97 (1991=100) 5

Table A.3: Inflation Rates 1992-97 (year end) 5

Table A.4: Velocity and Real Broad Money and Monetisation 6

Table A.5: Government Deficits 1992-97 7

Table A.6: Tax Revenues 1992-97 in % of GDP 8

Table A.7: Domestic Credit (end year) (% change) 1992-97 8

Table A.8: Investment, Unemployment and Productivity 10

Table A.9: Inter-Enterprise Arrears 1992-94; in % of broad money 11

Table A.10: Proportion of Barter Transactions in Russian Industry 1993-97 12

INDEX OF FIGURES

Figure VI.1: Path-Dependency and Political Leadership 203

Figure VI.2: Single Stable Equilibrium 203

Figure VI.3: Bandwagon Effect 203

Figure VII.1: A Circular System with Arrears and Viable Firms 210

Figure VII.2: A Linear Industrial Structure 221

Figure VII.3: Russia 1993-95 - Index of Prices and Trade Credit 240

Figure VII.4: Russia 1992 - Inflation, Arrears and Money - Real Indexes 240

Figure VII.5: Kazakstan 1995-96 - Real Arrears and Inflation 241

Figure VII.6: Russia 1993-95 - Real Indexes 241

Figure VIII.1: Share of Barter Turnover 1992-97 253

Figure VIII.2: Diffusion Indexes 253

Figure VIII.3: Barter Share in Turnover 254

Figure VIII.4: Alternative Means of Settlement - Share in Turnover 254

Figure IX.1: FSU 1993-95 - Growth of Money Supply and Prices 281

Figure IX.2: FSU 1993-95 - Growth of Velocity 281

Figure IX.3: Russia 1992-95 - Coefficient of Monetisation and Barter 286

Figure IX.4: Pull Factors of Barterisation - A Simulation 298

Figure IX.5: Push Factors of Barterisation - A Simulation 298

Figure IX.6: Push Factors of Barterisation - Optimal Barter Share 301