

# Table of Contents

	Page
<b>1 Introduction</b> .....	1
1.1 Main Validation Topics .....	1
1.2 Technical Results .....	2
1.3 Cooperative Strategy .....	3
1.4 Conclusions .....	5
<b>2 Structure of the EUROVAL Project</b> .....	7
2.1 List of Tasks and Brief Descriptions .....	7
2.2 Task Matrix .....	9
2.3 Application List .....	9
2.4 List of Partners .....	10
<b>3 Description of Turbulence Models</b> .....	13
3.1 Algebraic Models .....	13
3.1.1 Introduction .....	13
3.1.2 The Baldwin-Lomax [BL] Model (1978) .....	14
3.1.3 The Granville [GR] Model (1987) .....	15
3.1.4 The Cebeci-Smith [CS] Model (1974) .....	16
3.1.5 The Goldberg [GB] Backflow Model (1986) .....	18
3.2 One-half Equation Turbulence Models .....	20
3.2.1 Introduction .....	20
3.2.2 The Johnson-King [JK] Model (1985) .....	20
3.2.3 The Johnson-Coakley [JC] Model (1990) .....	22
3.2.4 The Horton [HO] Model (1990) .....	24
3.3 One-Equation Models .....	26
3.3.1 Introduction .....	26
3.3.2 The Wolfshtein [W] Model (1969) .....	26
3.3.3 The Hassid-Poreh [HP] Model (1975) .....	27
3.4 Two-Equation Models .....	28
3.4.1 Introduction .....	28
3.4.2 The Jones-Launder and Launder-Sharma [JL] Models (1972, 1974) .....	28

Table of Contents (continued)

	Page
3.4.3 The Chien [C] Model (1982) .....	29
3.4.4 The Lam-Bremhorst [LB] Model (1981) .....	30
3.4.5 The "Standard" High-Reynolds-number Jones-Launder [SJL] Model (1972) .....	31
3.5 Reynolds-Stress Models .....	32
3.5.1 Introduction .....	32
3.5.2 The Gibson-Launder-Rodi Reynolds-Stress [RS] Model (1978) .....	32
3.6 Calculation of Boundary Layer Length Scales .....	34
<b>4 Numerical Methods Used by Partners .....</b>	<b>37</b>
4.1 Description of Method Used by Analysis Systems Research Ltd. (S. Perrakis, M. Tzitzidis) .....	37
4.1.1 Introduction .....	37
4.1.2 Method .....	37
4.1.3 Boundary Conditions .....	38
4.1.4 Grid Adaption .....	38
4.1.5 Modifications to the 'Standard' Turbulence Models .....	38
4.1.6 Computers and CPU-Times .....	38
4.2 Description of Methods Used by British Aerospace (J. J. Benton) ..	39
4.2.1 Introduction .....	39
4.2.2 2D Multiblock Navier-Stokes .....	39
4.2.2.1 Summary .....	39
4.2.2.2 Transport Equations .....	39
4.2.2.3 Discretisation .....	40
4.2.2.4 Artificial Dissipation .....	42
4.2.2.5 Time Integration .....	43
4.2.2.6 Multigrid Acceleration .....	44
4.2.2.7 Turbulence Models .....	45
4.2.2.8 Boundary Conditions .....	47
4.2.2.9 Integrated Forces .....	48
4.2.2.10 Computational Performance .....	48
4.2.3 3D Multiblock Viscous-Coupled Euler .....	48
4.3 Description of Method Used by CAPTEC (E. A. Cox) .....	49
4.3.1 Introduction .....	49

## Table of Contents (continued)

	Page
4.3.2 Method .....	49
4.3.3 Grid Adaptation .....	49
4.3.4 Modifications of the Cebeci-Smith Model .....	50
4.4 Description of Methods Used by Construcciones Aeronáuticas S.A. - CASA (A. Abbas, J.J. Guerra) .....	51
4.4.1 Introduction .....	51
4.4.2 Navier-Stokes Approach .....	51
4.4.2.1 Governing Equations .....	51
4.4.2.2 Numerical Formulation .....	52
4.4.2.3 Artificial Dissipation .....	53
4.4.2.4 Turbulence Model Application .....	54
4.4.2.5 Numerical Details .....	54
4.4.3 Euler Approach .....	55
4.4.3.1 Governing Equations .....	55
4.4.3.2 Dissipation Model .....	56
4.4.3.3 Numerical Details .....	57
4.5 Description of Method Used by CERFACS (L. Davidson, A. Kourta, L.Tourette) .....	58
4.5.1 Introduction .....	58
4.5.2 Method 1 (Single Element and Bumps) .....	58
4.5.3 Method 2 (Multi-Element) .....	59
4.5.4 Method 3 (DLR-F5 Wing) .....	60
4.5.4.1 Mesh .....	60
4.5.4.2 The Mean-Flow Equations and their Approximation . . . .	62
4.5.4.3 The $k-\epsilon$ Turbulence Model and its Approximation .....	65
4.6 Description of Method Used by CFD norway (I. Øye, E. Ørbekk, H. Nørstrud) .....	69
4.6.1 Introduction .....	69
4.6.2 Governing Equations .....	69
4.6.3 Numerical Method .....	70
4.6.4 Modifications to 'Standard' Turbulence Models .....	71
4.6.5 Mesh Generation .....	71
4.7 Description of Methods Used by Deutsche Airbus (E. Elsholz) .....	72
4.7.1 Introduction .....	72
4.7.2 Navier-Stokes Approach .....	72

## Table of Contents (continued)

	Page
4.7.3 Boundary Layer Approach . . . . .	75
4.7.3.1 'Locally Infinite Swept Wing' (LISW) Boundary Layer Method . . . . .	75
4.7.3.2 The 3D Boundary Layer Method . . . . .	76
4.8 Description of Method Used by DLR (D. Schwamborn) . . . . .	78
4.8.1 Introduction . . . . .	78
4.8.2 The Block Structured Navier-Stokes Method . . . . .	78
4.8.3 Boundary Conditions . . . . .	79
4.8.4 Performance of the Code . . . . .	80
4.8.5 Turbulence Models . . . . .	80
4.8.5.1 The Baldwin-Lomax Model (BL) . . . . .	80
4.8.5.2 The Granville Modification of the Baldwin-Lomax Model (GR) . . . . .	81
4.8.5.3 The Johnson-King Model (JK) . . . . .	81
4.8.5.4 The Johnson-Coakley Model (JC) . . . . .	81
4.9 Description of Method Used by Dornier (W. Haase, W. Fritz) . . . . .	82
4.9.1 Introduction . . . . .	82
4.9.2 The Boundary Layer Method . . . . .	82
4.9.2.1 Numerical Approach . . . . .	82
4.9.2.2 Turbulence Model Implementation . . . . .	83
4.9.3 The Navier-Stokes Method . . . . .	83
4.9.3.1 Governing Equations . . . . .	83
4.9.3.2 Finite Volume Method . . . . .	84
4.9.3.3 Filtering Technique . . . . .	84
4.9.3.4 Convergence Acceleration . . . . .	85
4.9.3.5 Steady State . . . . .	85
4.9.3.6 Boundary Conditions . . . . .	85
4.9.3.7 Mesh Generation . . . . .	86
4.9.3.8 Modifications to Original Versions of Turbulence Models . . . . .	87
4.10 Description of Method Used by NLR (F.J. Brandsma) . . . . .	89
4.10.1 Introduction . . . . .	89
4.10.2 Governing Equations . . . . .	89
4.10.3 Discretization in Space . . . . .	90
4.10.4 Time Integration . . . . .	92
4.10.5 Convergence Acceleration . . . . .	93

## Table of Contents (continued)

	Page
4.10.6 Boundary Conditions .....	93
4.10.7 Turbulence Models .....	94
4.10.8 Parameter Settings and Code Performance .....	95
4.11 Description of Method Used by RAE (P.D. Smith) .....	97
4.11.1 Governing Equations .....	97
4.11.2 Numerical Method .....	98
4.11.3 Initial and Boundary Conditions .....	99
4.11.4 Turbulence Models .....	99
4.12 Description of Method Used by SAAB (B. Arlinger, T. Larsson) ...	100
4.12.1 Introduction .....	100
4.12.2 Numerical Method (SAAB) .....	100
4.12.3 Turbulence Modelling .....	100
4.12.3.1 The Baldwin-Lomax (BL) Model .....	101
4.12.3.2 The Two-Layer $k-\epsilon$ Model .....	101
4.12.4 Grid Generation .....	101
4.12.5 Numerical Method (HUT) .....	102
4.13 Description of Method Used by TU Berlin (L. Xue, T. Rung, F. Thiele) .....	103
4.13.1 Transformation and Discretisation of the Governing Equations .....	103
4.13.2 Space Marching Integration Scheme .....	105
4.13.3 Turbulence Models .....	106
4.14 Description of Method Used by TU Denmark (J. Michelsen, J.N. Sørensen) .....	107
4.14.1 2D Navier-Stokes Method for Incompressible Flow .....	107
4.14.2 3D Navier-Stokes Method for Direct Simulation of Vortex Breakdown .....	109
4.15 Description of Method Used by UMIST (G. Page, M.A. Leschziner) .....	111
4.15.1 Governing Equations .....	111
4.15.2 Discretisation .....	111
4.15.3 Time Marching .....	113
4.15.4 Time-Stepping Control .....	114
4.15.5 Artificial Dissipation .....	115

Table of Contents (continued)

	Page
4.15.6 Multigrid Acceleration .....	116
4.15.7 Turbulence Models .....	117
<b>4.16 Description of Method Used by VUB (M. Mulas, Ch. Hirsch) .....</b>	<b>118</b>
4.16.1 Introduction .....	118
4.16.2 Cell-Centered Finite Volume Formulation .....	118
4.16.3 High Resolution TVD Schemes .....	119
4.16.4 Time Integration .....	121
4.16.5 Observations .....	121
<b>5 Application-Oriented Discussion of Results .....</b>	<b>123</b>
5.1 Airfoil Flow RAE-2822 Cases 9 and 10 .....	125
5.1.1 Introduction .....	127
5.1.2 Overview on Investigations .....	127
5.1.3 Mandatory Mesh and Parameter Set Establishment, Effect of Camber Correction .....	129
5.1.4 Effect of Turbulence Modelling: Mandatory Test Cases .....	131
5.1.4.1 Algebraic Turbulence Models .....	134
5.1.4.2 Half-Equation Turbulence Models .....	136
5.1.4.3 Transport and Reynolds Stress Turbulence Models (C), (SJL-W), (RS) .....	137
5.1.5 Effect of Mesh: Density, Extension and Far-Field Condition ...	138
5.1.5.1 Mesh Density Effects .....	138
5.1.5.2 Mesh Extension Effects .....	141
5.1.5.3 Effects of Far-Field Boundary Condition .....	141
5.1.6 Effect of Mach Number .....	142
5.1.7 Effect of Numerical Incidence .....	144
5.1.8 Summary / Conclusions .....	146
5.2 ONERA Bumps A and C .....	185
5.2.1 Introduction .....	187
5.2.2 Overview of Contributors and Contributions .....	188
5.2.3 Turbulence Models .....	190
5.2.4 Numerical Algorithms .....	192
5.2.5 Grids .....	192
5.2.6 Boundary Conditions .....	193
5.2.7 Resource Requirements .....	194

## Table of Contents (continued)

	Page
5.2.8 Results .....	195
5.2.8.1 Introductory Comments .....	195
5.2.8.2 Delery Case A .....	196
5.2.8.3 Delery Case C .....	201
5.2.9 Conclusions .....	204
5.3 Maximum Lift Investigations for A-Airfoil .....	267
5.3.1 Partners Versus Methods and Models .....	269
5.3.2 Discussion of Results .....	269
5.3.3 Limits of Applicability .....	270
5.3.4 Turbulence Model Validation .....	270
5.3.5 Matrix of Distinct Values .....	270
5.4 High-Lift Investigations for NLR 7301 Flapped Airfoil .....	305
5.4.1 Introduction .....	307
5.4.2 Partners and Methods .....	307
5.4.3 Test Cases .....	309
5.4.4 Computational Grids .....	310
5.4.5 Discussion of Results .....	311
5.5 Two-Dimensional Boundary Layers .....	349
5.5.1 Introduction .....	351
5.5.2 Test Cases .....	351
5.5.3 Turbulence Models .....	352
5.5.4 Discussion of Results .....	352
5.5.4.1 Stanford IDENT-1300 .....	352
5.5.4.2 Stanford IDENT-1400 .....	353
5.5.4.3 Stanford IDENT-2200 .....	354
5.5.4.4 Stanford IDENT-2400 .....	355
5.5.4.5 Stanford IDENT-2600 .....	356
5.5.5 Conclusions .....	356
5.6 Three-Dimensional Boundary-Layers .....	389
5.6.1 Introduction .....	391
5.6.2 Partners and Methods .....	391
5.6.3 Turbulence Models .....	391
5.6.4 Discussion of Results .....	392
5.6.4.1 Infinite Swept Wing Test Case BEEL72 .....	392

## Table of Contents (continued)

	Page
5.6.4.2 Cylinder on Flat Plate Test Case DEFE77 .....	393
5.6.5 Conclusions .....	393
5.7 DLR-F5 Wing Test Case .....	405
5.7.1 Introduction .....	407
5.7.2 Results from Euler and Navier-Stokes Calculations .....	408
5.7.3 Results from Boundary-Layer Calculations .....	417
5.7.4 Comparison Between Boundary-Layer and Navier-Stokes Results .....	419
5.7.5 Concluding Remarks .....	420
5.8 2D and 3D Wind-Tunnel Simulations .....	489
5.8.1 Introduction .....	491
5.8.2 2D Tunnel Simulation: RAE 5225 Aerofoil .....	492
5.8.2.1 Aerofoil Characteristics and Wind-Tunnel Measurements .....	492
5.8.2.2 Wind Tunnel Corrections .....	493
5.8.2.3 Mesh Generation .....	494
5.8.2.4 Flow Calculation and Evaluation of Corrections .....	494
5.8.2.5 Results .....	496
5.8.2.6 Conclusions .....	497
5.8.3 3D Tunnel Interference Simulation: DLR-F5 Wing .....	497
5.8.3.1 The DLR-F5 Wing and Wind-Tunnel Measurements ...	497
5.8.3.2 Mesh Generation .....	498
5.8.3.3 Flow Calculation .....	498
5.8.3.4 Results .....	499
5.8.3.5 Conclusions .....	500
5.8.4 Overall Conclusion .....	500
5.9 Vortex Breakdown .....	513
5.9.1 Introduction .....	515
5.9.2 Test Cases .....	515
5.9.3 Discussion and Results .....	512
5.9.3.1 Vortex Embedded in a Constant Axial Flow Field .....	516
5.9.3.2 Vortex Embedded in Plane Shear Flow .....	516
5.9.4 Conclusion .....	517
<b>6 Reference List .....</b>	<b>523</b>