

# C O N T E N T S

## I. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 Some History 1
- 1.2 Aims and Purposes 5

## II. THE STATUS OF LINGUISTICS AS A SCIENCE

- 2.1 The Early Theory and the 'Standard View' of Scientific Theory Construction
  - 2.1.1 Chomsky's and Lees' (1957) positions 7
  - 2.1.2 The deductive-nomological model of scientific explanations in the natural sciences 11
  - 2.1.3 Observables, implicit discovery procedures and the native speaker's "predictions" 12
- 2.2 The Empirical Scientific Status of the Standard Theory and its Extensions and Revisions
  - 2.2.1 The loss of the direct link to observables in ST: The competence-performance distinction 14
  - 2.2.2 The incorporation of a semantic component 17
  - 2.2.3 Implicit discovery procedures for ST grammars and the proliferation of theoretical constructs 18
  - 2.2.4 The shift to 'unobservables' in the Extended Standard Theory: Universal Grammar as a theory of a 'mental organ' 19
- 2.3 Explanation versus Explication
  - 2.3.1 Generative grammars comparable to axiomatic theories in the nonempirical sciences 22
  - 2.3.2 Linguistics as an 'unnatural', i.e. human science (Itkonen)
    - 2.3.2.1 Linguistic rules versus regularities in nature 25
    - 2.3.2.2 Natural versus artificial languages 27
    - 2.3.2.3 Grammatical Explication 28

### III. THE CONCEPT OF 'LINGUISTICALLY SIGNIFICANT GENERALIZATION' (LSG) AND ITS CRITICS

3.1	Different LSGs as Bases for Different Theories	
3.1.1	LSGs as determined by the formal devices available in the theory	34
3.1.2	'Deep' semantic relationships as LSGs	36
3.1.3	'Atomic predicates' as LSGs	37
3.1.4	'Generativist' versus 'interpretivist' LSGs	38
3.2	LSGs and the Concept of 'Independent Motivation'	
3.2.1	'Abstract verbs' as LSGs	40
3.2.2	'Standard hypotheses' versus 'generalized hypotheses'	41
3.3	The Role of Hypothetical Constructs	
3.3.1	Empirical versus nonempirical generalizations	44
3.3.2	Valid abstractions versus fictions (or expressing versus inventing generalizations)	47
3.3.3	Descriptive versus procedural metalanguages	52
3.4	Linguistically Significant versus Statistically Significant Generalizations	
3.4.1	Significance as a 'scalar' property?	55
3.4.2	Statistical + linguistic significance	
3.4.2.1	Word-order universals	58
3.4.2.2	The curly-brackets notation	60
3.4.2.3	The active-passive relation	62
3.5	LSGs and the Lexical Extension of Linguistic Forms and Processes	64
3.6	Formal versus Explanatory Generalizations	
3.6.1	The terms 'formal' and 'explanatory'	66
3.6.2	Primary and secondary generalizations	69

### IV. THE REVISED EXTENDED STANDARD THEORY (REST) AND ITS MODULES VERSUS THE STANDARD THEORY (ST)

4.1	Chomsky (1980)	72
4.2	Proliferation of Subtheories and of Levels of Representations	75

4.3	Data Restrictions	
4.3.1	Sentence grammar	77
4.3.2	Exclusion of semantics (or 'autonomy of syntax' re-adopted)	79
4.4	Preview: Examining the evidence for REST	81
V. THE MOTIVATION FOR EXTENDING THE BASE COMPONENT: THE LEXICALIST HYPOTHESIS (LH)		
5.1	The Problem of the 'Trading Relations' between the Base and the Transformational Component (LH or TH)	83
5.2	Chomsky's Original Arguments for LH and Their Refutation	
5.2.0	Introduction: Three arguments	84
5.2.1	The 'Derived Structures'Argument (DSA)	
5.2.1.1	Chomsky's analyses of some 'clear cases'	85
5.2.1.2	Some 'unclear cases': Bolinger (1973)	86
5.2.1.3	Other counterevidence to the DSA	
5.2.1.3.1	Chomsky's (1977) analysis and more data	88
5.2.1.3.2	Causative verbs and their DNS (Smith 1972)	89
5.2.2	The 'Internal Structure'Argument (ISA)	
5.2.2.1	DSA and ISA: Generalizing transformations to NPs	90
5.2.2.2	Passives and their nominalizations	
5.2.2.2.1	A history of the passive transformation: ± structure-building	92
5.2.2.2.2	Passive DNS do have sentential origins: 'irregular' passives, DNS, sentential adverbs and 'picture' nouns	95
5.2.2.3	Degrees of 'nouniness'	100
5.2.2.4	A strategy for the disposing of counter- evidence to LH: The postulation of 'ana- logical' rules	103
5.2.3	The 'Semantic Kinkiness'Argument (SKA)	
5.2.3.1	Semantic idiosyncrasy versus 'syntactic' productivity	
5.2.3.1.1	Productivity in ST versus EST	105

5.2.3.1.2	Productivity of word-formation processes: Morphological irregularity versus syntactic productivity	107
5.2.3.2	Lexicalization versus syntactic derivation	
5.2.3.2.1	Lexemes versus syntactic derivatives	109
5.2.3.2.2	The 'pronominalization potential' of DNs and their regular ambiguities	111
5.2.3.3	'Metalinguistic' head nouns and LH versus TH	113
5.3	Further Counterevidence to LH	
5.3.0	Introduction	115
5.3.1	The 'neutral entry' hypothesis refuted:	
5.3.1.1	The directionality of word-forming processes	116
5.3.1.2	<u>Nomina actionis</u> and <u>qualitatis</u> versus agent- and object-nominalizations: The 'double occurrence' constraint (DOC)	118
5.3.1.3	Proliferation of noun classes and lexical entries	120
5.3.1.4	Deverbal adjectives in <u>-able</u>	122
5.3.2	Lexical <sub>2</sub> (and morphological) versus syntactic, phonological and lexical <sub>1</sub> redundancy rules	
5.3.2.1	The transformational character of Chomsky's lexical <sub>2</sub> redundancy rules	125
5.3.2.2	Syntactic, phonological and lexical <sub>1</sub> redundancy rules	128
5.3.2.3	Feature precipitation (phonological, syntactic and semantic) versus morphological feature creation	129
5.3.2.4	Morphological redundancy rules and the filtering effect of PS-rules: <u>un</u> -passives	135
5.3.3	Passive participles as verbs or adjectives or both or neither	
5.3.3.1	Passive participles as verbs - <u>un</u> -passives as adjectives: Hust (1977)	138
5.3.3.2	Passive participles as adjectives: Freidin (1975)	140
5.3.3.3	Deriving contradictory conclusions from the same data and ignoring some (with PS-rules as filters)	143
5.3.3.4	"Predicting" actives from passives: directionality reversed	146
5.4	The "Empirical" Distinction between Transformations and Lexical Rules: Wasow (1977)	

5.4.1	"Natural" properties of transformations as against lexical (redundancy) rules: Wasow's criteria	148
5.4.2	Wasow's arguments refuted:	
5.4.2.1	V-able adjectives: transformations may feed category-changing rules	150
5.4.2.2	Lexical versus transformational passives (Wasow vs. Freidin vs. Hust)	154
5.4.3	Getting rid of counterevidence: PS-rules, empty (subject) nodes and additional semantic interpretation rules	156

## VI. MOTIVATIONS FOR CONSTRAINING THE 'EXTENDED' CATEGORIAL RULES: X' THEORIES

6.0	Preview	159
6.1	Chomsky's Original Motivation for X' Theories	
6.1.1	'Specifiers' and 'Complements'	159
6.1.2	Universality claims: The schema, its categories, their features and NP as a cyclic node	161
6.2	The X' Schema as a Formalization of LH	163
6.3	Counterevidence to LH as Counterevidence to X' Theory	
6.3.0	Introduction	164
6.3.1	Counterargument I to LH and its consequences for X' theory	165
6.3.2	Counterargument II to LH and its consequences for X' theory	169
6.4	Additional Counterevidence to X' Theories	
6.4.0	Introduction	171
6.4.1	Word-formation processes: Denominal verbs and their nominal bases	
6.4.1.0	Productivity versus 'semantic' idiosyncrasy	172
6.4.1.1	Locatum verbs	173
6.4.1.2	Location and duration verbs	175
6.4.1.3	Agent verbs	178
6.4.1.4	Goal (and source) verbs	180
6.4.1.5	Instrument verbs	181
6.4.1.6	Results: Negative and positive generalizations	

6.4.1.6.1	No relevant parallelisms between nouns and their verbal derivatives	183
6.4.1.6.2	Complex NPs and parallel nominal compounds	185
6.4.1.6.3	Lexicon-internal "syntactic" deep structures, obligatoriness of subcategorization features and "hypothetical" verbs	186
6.4.1.7	Denominal adjectives and deadjectival verbs	189
6.4.2	Adnominal NPs and their predicative counterparts	
6.4.2.1	Chomsky's original treatment of adnominal genitive NPs	191
6.4.2.2	Syntactic sources for adnominal genitive NPs	
6.4.2.2.1	Lexicalist case-grammars versus Chomskyan subject-predicate grammars	192
6.4.2.2.2	Predicate genitives as relative clause sources for 'alienable' and other possessives	195
6.4.2.3	Predicate and adnominal genitives as problems for Chomskyan X' theories	
6.4.2.3.1	Chomsky (1968): Subjects of DN's versus subjects of 'picture' nouns	197
6.4.2.3.2	Specifiers without heads	198
6.4.2.3.3	Syntactic irrecoverability versus semantic interpretation: Chomsky (1968) versus Jackendoff (1974, 1977)	200
6.4.2.3.4	Preposing versus postposing analyses of NP's N...constructions: Hornstein (1977) versus Jackendoff	
6.4.2.3.4.1	Differences between NPs and Ss (S + V' or V''')	202
6.4.2.3.4.2	Thematic functions versus grammatical relations: <u>NP's</u> <u>N</u> derived from <u>N</u> <u>PNP</u>	208
6.4.2.3.4.3	DN's versus 'picture' nouns	209
6.4.2.3.4.4	Postposing and spelling rules versus trace theory	210
6.4.2.4	Hornstein's arguments refuted	
6.4.2.4.1	Spelling rules and semantic range of genitive NPs in preposing analyses	213
6.4.2.4.2	Thematic functions + trace theory versus LH + X' theory	216
6.4.2.4.3	Trace theory and the base-generation of passives	218
6.4.2.4.4	Formal syntax, trace theory and selectional information	220

6.4.2.5	Conclusions	
6.4.2.5.1	The readings of prenominal genitive NPs, postnominal PPs and their predicative equivalents	223
6.4.2.5.2	The differences between <u>nomina actionis</u> (DNs) and all other types of nouns and their consequences for lexicalist grammars with X' bases	231
6.4.2.5.3	Postposing (X <sub>1</sub> ') versus preposing (X <sub>2</sub> ') approaches and their consequences for and compatibility with REST tenets	
6.4.2.5.3.1	Divergent properties	234
6.4.2.5.3.2	Common failures	237

## VII. FURTHER ARGUMENTS AGAINST X<sub>1</sub>' AND X<sub>2</sub>' THEORIES

7.0	Introduction	239
7.1	X' Systems and the Modifier-Head Distinction (or the clearly 'unclear' case of prenominal adjectives)	
7.1.1	'Specifier' as a category symbol versus an abbreviation of nodes	
7.1.1.1	Introduction	239
7.1.1.2	"Category Symbolists"	
7.1.1.2.1	Hornstein (1977): S ≠ V'''	
7.1.1.2.1.1	'Specifiers' versus 'modifiers'	241
7.1.1.2.1.2	"Relative clause source" and "subjectival" adjectives	243
7.1.1.2.2	Halitsky (1975): S = V'''	
7.1.1.2.2.1	An X <sub>1</sub> ' prediction: The Specifier Recursion Hypothesis	245
7.1.1.2.2.2	Sentential subjects versus nominal subjects	247
7.1.1.2.2.3	Locality, strict locality, and inherent subcategorization of sentential subjects	250
7.1.1.2.2.4	'Subjectival' adjectives versus the Left Branch Schema	252
7.1.1.2.2.5	The costs of the X <sub>1</sub> ' "prediction"	253
7.1.1.3	'Specifier' as an abbreviation of nodes	
7.1.1.3.1	Jackendoff's (1977) position: S = V'''	255

7.1.1.3.2	Syntactic base-generation of two adjectival slots and semantic projection	257
7.1.1.3.3	Further deficiencies of Jackendoff's approach	
7.1.1.3.3.1	Generalization of syntactic base rules versus generalization of semantic projection rules: Verbs and their DNS versus predicate adjectives and nominals and their DNS	259
7.1.1.3.3.2	Locality versus non-locality of subjects	262
7.1.1.3.3.3	A possible modification of Jackendoff's approach and its refutation: $S = \left\{ \begin{array}{l} V''' \\ A''' \\ N''' \end{array} \right\} ?$	263
7.1.1.3.3.4	Further extensions of generalized grammatical relations: 'subjectival' and 'objectival' adjectives	265
7.1.2	Prenominal adjectives: The explanatory inadequacies of X' theories	266
7.1.3	Modifiers and heads versus verbs and their objects	
7.1.3.0	Introduction: X' theories as formalizations of the modifier-head distinction	268
7.1.3.1	Fries (1952): Modifiers and objects belong to different layers of structure	269
7.1.3.2	Endocentricity versus exocentricity	
7.1.3.2.1	Sentences as exocentric constructions	271
7.1.3.2.2	Emonds (1976) versus Harris (1951)	
7.1.3.2.2.1	Endocentricity of X' phrase nodes versus surface equivalence of morpheme classes	271
7.1.3.2.2.2	The vacuousness of deep structure 'heads'	274
7.1.3.2.2.3	The parenthesis notation as a cause of overgenerating PS-rules	276
7.1.3.2.2.4	Emonds (1976) versus Lyons (1977): The exocentricity of 'common' NPs	278
7.1.3.2.2.5	The circularity of deep structure "explanations": Obligatory $\Delta$ heads and their deletion	280
7.1.3.3	Modifiers and heads in a pre-ST approach (Lees 1962)	
7.1.3.3.1	Subordinate elements as optional constituents of major categories in PS-expansions	282
7.1.3.3.2	Systematic optionality of modifiers versus occasional optionality of objects: a	



	transformational reconstruction of the modifier-head distinction	284
7.1.3.4	"Heads" in the latest version of REST: Chomsky (1981)	
7.1.3.4.1	The revision of REST (RREST): Interacting subcomponents and subtheories	286
7.1.3.4.2	Passive and active 'heads' in government versus $\theta$ -theory: subcategorization versus selection, the 'projection' principle and LF	287
7.1.3.4.3	Adjectival 'heads' in RREST	
7.1.3.4.3.1	A second type of 'indirect' $\theta$ -marking for predicate adjectives	291
7.1.3.4.3.2	The questionability of 'small clauses', a third type of 'indirect' $\theta$ -marking and LF	293
7.1.3.4.3.3	Prenominal adjectives, a fourth type of 'indirect' $\theta$ -marking and LF	295
7.2	The Alleged Restrictivity of X' Categorical Rules	
7.2.0	Introduction: The programme of reducing the class of possible base components and grammars	296
7.2.1	Jackendoff's Uniform Level hypothesis: $S = V''''$	297
7.2.2	Bresnan's features and types ( $X^0 - X''''''$ )	
7.2.2.1	An alleged inadequacy of PS-rules	298
7.2.2.2	The restrictivity of X' PS-rules versus <u>Syntactic Structures</u> types of PS-rules: Bresnan versus Lyons	300
7.2.3	'Perverse' PS-rules to generate GNs: Schachter (1976)	302
7.2.4	GNs and other exceptions to the X' schema: Jackendoff (1977)	304
7.2.5	The vacuousness of X' restrictivity claims and LH:	
7.2.5.1	The "restrictivity" of exceptions to the X' schema	305
7.2.5.2	Word-formation rules as category-switching PS-rules	306
7.2.6	X' conventions as 'constraints on linguistic change': Lightfoot (1979)	307
7.2.7	Lightfoot's vacuousness criteria or the mutual incompatibility of X' conventions	309

7.3	The Restrictivity of the <u>SS</u> -Theory versus EST, REST and RREST	
7.3.0	Introduction	310
7.3.1	Restrictivity of PS-rules and the proliferation of possible and impossible subcategories in lexicalist grammars	
7.3.1.1	Subcategorization of nouns in ST versus EST	311
7.3.1.2	'Mirror image' subject selection: prenominal adjectives	313
7.3.1.3	Base-generated 'garbage' and the lexicon (and other modules) as filters	313
7.3.2	Some restrictive properties of <u>SS</u> grammars	
7.3.2.1	'True heads' and no subcategorizational 'garbage'	314
7.3.2.2	An <u>SS</u> grammar versus ST	
7.3.2.2.1	Fillmore's (1963) approach: <u>SS</u> plus motivated dummies	315
7.3.2.2.2	'Local grammaticality' versus unrestricted deep structures	317
7.3.2.2.3	Embedding transformations versus generalized phrase-markers and the cycle	318
7.3.2.3	"Formal" simplicity of ST- versus 'empirical' restrictivity of <u>SS</u> grammars	320
7.3.3	REST: Restrictivity of transformations traded for the proliferation of other theoretical constructs	
7.3.3.1	Restricting transformations to 'Move $\alpha$ ' at the expense of other modules	324
7.3.3.2	The 'history' of the active-passive relation revisited	324
7.3.3.3	Proliferation of formal devices versus explanatory adequacy	328

VIII. SOME CONCLUDING ARGUMENTS: 'ADVANCED' LEXICALISM  
VERSUS EARLY TRANSFORMATIONALISM

8.1	Introduction	330
8.2	'Advanced' Lexicalism: Recursive Word-Structure Rules, a 'Lexical' Lexicon and 'Transformational' Insertion Conditions	331
8.3	'Morphological' Insertions as Mirror-Images of Syntactic Ones	335

8.4	Disambiguation of Morphological Structures by Structure-Building 'Semantic' Interpretation Rules, i.e. Syntactic Paraphrases	337
8.5	The 'Clausiness' Squish: Syntactic Phrases as Inputs to Word-Structure Rules	339
8.6	'Morphological' Argument Structure Equals Syntactic Argument Structure	340
8.7	The DOC as Counterevidence to Early and 'Advanced' Lexicalism: Verbal Nexus Combinations and N+N Compounds	344
8.8	Hypothetical Verbs as "Semantic Features" in N+N Compounds or the Vacuousness of Modular Solutions to the Variability Problem	347
8.9	Structure-Building 'Interpretive' Filters as Substitutes for Transformations	352
8.10	Conclusions: The Common Failures of Lexicalist Models versus TH	354

#### FOOTNOTES

Footnotes to Chapter I	359
Footnotes to Chapter II	360
Footnotes to Chapter III	365
Footnotes to Chapter IV	375
Footnotes to Chapter V	377
Footnotes to Chapter VI	392
Footnotes to Chapter VII	408
Footnotes to Chapter VIII	436
BIBLIOGRAPHY	442