

Contents

Acknowledgements

xi

Chapter 1 The Many Facets of Incommensurability	1
1. Incommensurability as Communication Breakdown	1
2. The Current State of Affairs	5
3. The Many Facets of Incommensurability	7
4. The Presuppositional Interpretation: A Chapter Review	12
5. Scientific Language, Trivalent Semantics	18
Chapter 2 Incommensurability as Untranslatability	25
1. The Received Interpretation: Incommensurability as Untranslatability	25
2. An Influential Line of Criticism	27
3. Feyerabend's and Kuhn's Contextual Theories of Meaning	30
4. Meaning Continuity and Translatability	35
5. Untranslatability and Incommensurability	38
6. The Very Notion of Translation	40
7. Translation and Cross-Language Communication	45
8. Meaning Continuity and Cross-Language Translation	48
Chapter 3 Incommensurability and Conceptual Schemes	53
1. Conceptual Relativism and Incommensurability	53
2. The Very Notion of Conceptual Schemes Defined	55
3. The Quinean Linguistic Model of Conceptual Schemes	61
Chapter 4 In Defense of the Very Notion of Conceptual Schemes	63
1. Inverifiability of Alternative Conceptual Schemes	63
2. Two Assumptions of the Quinean Model	70
3. The Charge of the Third Dogma of Empiricism	76
4. A Non-Dogmatic Scheme–Content Dualism	81
5. Davidson Misses the Target	87
Chapter 5 Case Studies: The Emergence of Truth-Value Gaps	89
1. Traditional Chinese Medical Theory	90
2. Is Untranslatability a Barrier of Cross-Language Understanding?	92
3. What Causes Cross-Language Communication Breakdown?	93
4. The Emergence of a Truth-Value Gap	96
5. The Newton–Leibniz Debate on the Absoluteness of Space	99

6. The Newton–Einstein Debate on the Absoluteness of Time	104
Chapter 6 Toward the Presuppositional Interpretation	107
1. I. Hacking’s Styles of Scientific Reasoning	108
2. N. Rescher’s Factual Commitments	112
3. Introducing Presuppositional Languages	114
4. Conceptual Schemes Reconsidered	118
Chapter 7 Kuhn’s Taxonomic Incommensurability: A Reconstruction	123
1. The Early Development of Kuhn’s Positions on Incommensurability	123
2. Taxonomic Incommensurability	129
3. Truth-Value Status and Taxonomic Structures	134
4. The Role of Truth-or-Falsity in Cross-Language Communication	139
5. Unmatchable Taxonomic Structures	142
6. Truth-Value Gaps and Incommensurability	145
Chapter 8 A Defense of the Notion of Semantic Presupposition	149
1. The Duel between Russell and Strawson over Vacuous Sentences	150
2. A Formal Three-Valued Language	152
3. A Definition of Semantic Presupposition	156
4. Argument from the Distinction between Internal and External Negation	167
5. Argument from Counterexamples	173
6. Is the Notion of Truth-valuelessness Untenable?	175
Chapter 9 The Structure of a Presuppositional Language	183
1. A Theory of Truth-Value	183
2. The Occurrence of Truth-Value Gaps	190
3. The Structure of a Presuppositional Language	192
4. Some Features of a Presuppositional Language	196
Chapter 10 Existential Presumptions and Universal Principles	203
1. Existential Presumptions	203
2. Universal Principles	204
3. Modes of Reasoning and Hidden Universal Principles	209
4. The Pre-Modern Chinese Mode of Reasoning	212
Chapter 11 Categorical Frameworks	219
1. Categorical Frameworks	219
2. The Relativity of Lexical Taxonomies	221
3. Categorical Frameworks and Sortal Presuppositions	227
4. Compatible versus Incompatible Metaphysical Presuppositions	231
Chapter 12 The Failure of Cross-Language Understanding	237
1. The Propositional Understanding	238
2. The Essential Role of Metaphysical Presuppositions in Cross-Language Understanding	243

3. A Truth-Value Conditional Account of Understanding	248
4. Complete Communication Breakdown	254
Chapter 13 Hermeneutic Understanding in Abnormal Discourse	259
1. The Adoptive Approach to Cross-Language Understanding	260
2. Gadamer on Hermeneutic Understanding	264
3. Language Learning as Hermeneutic Interpretation	272
4. The Hermeneutic Dimension of Incommensurability	274
Chapter 14 Informative Communication Breakdown: The Transmission Model	283
1. Hermeneutic Understanding versus Propositional Understanding	284
2. A Bilingual in Cross-Language Communication	288
3. The Transmission Model of Cross-Language Communication	292
4. Communication Breakdown in Abnormal Discourse	295
5. Informative Communication as Mutual Understanding	297
Chapter 15 Dialogical Communication Breakdown I: Gadamer's Conversation Model	301
1. Coming to an Understanding through Conversation	301
2. Communication as Conversation	303
3. Reaching a Common Language through a 'Fusion of Horizons'?	306
4. The Common Language Requirement and Communication Breakdown	309
Chapter 16 Dialogical Communication Breakdown II: Habermas's Discourse Model	315
1. From Gadamer to Habermas	315
2. Habermas on Communicative Action	317
3. Communication as Argumentative Discourse	322
4. Understanding: From Comprehension to Discourse	325
5. Truth Claims and Cross-Language Communication Breakdown	329
Chapter 17 The Concept of Incommensurability	335
1. Kinds of Communication Breakdowns	335
2. Truth-Value Gap and Communication Breakdown	338
3. The Concept of Incommensurability	341
4. Incommensurability, Incompatibility, and Comparability	345
<i>Bibliography</i>	353
<i>Index</i>	363