

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE xiii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS xvii

## INTRODUCTION

CHAPTER 1 : The Psychology of Advanced Mathematical Thinking 3  
David Tall 3

1.	Cognitive considerations	4
	1.1 Different kinds of mathematical mind	4
	1.2 Meta-theoretical considerations	6
	1.3 Concept image and concept definition	6
	1.4 Cognitive development	7
	1.5 Transition and mental reconstruction	9
	1.6 Obstacles	9
	1.7 Generalization and abstraction	11
	1.8 Intuition and rigour	13
2.	The growth of mathematical knowledge	14
	2.1 The full range of advanced mathematical thinking	14
	2.2 Building and testing theories: synthesis and analysis	15
	2.3 Mathematical proof	16
3.	Curriculum design in advanced mathematical learning	17
	3.1 Sequencing the learning experience	17
	3.2 Problem-solving	18
	3.3 Proof	19
	3.4 Differences between elementary and advanced mathematical thinking	20
4.	Looking ahead	20

# I : THE NATURE OF ADVANCED MATHEMATICAL THINKING

<b>CHAPTER 2 :</b>	<b>Advanced Mathematical Thinking Processes</b>	<b>Tommy Dreyfus</b>	<b>25</b>
1.	Advanced mathematical thinking as process		26
2.	Processes involved in representation		30
	2.1 The process of representing		30
	2.2 Switching representations and translating		32
	2.3 Modelling		34
3.	Processes involved in abstraction		34
	3.1 Generalizing		35
	3.2 Synthesizing		35
	3.3 Abstracting		36
4.	Relationships between representing and abstracting (in learning processes)		38
5.	A wider vista of advanced mathematical processes		40
<b>CHAPTER 3 :</b>	<b>Mathematical Creativity</b>	<b>Gontran Ervynck</b>	<b>42</b>
1.	The stages of development of mathematical creativity		42
2.	The structure of a mathematical theory		46
3.	A tentative definition of mathematical creativity		46
4.	The ingredients of mathematical creativity		47
5.	The motive power of mathematical creativity		47
6.	The characteristics of mathematical creativity		49
7.	The results of mathematical creativity		50
8.	The fallibility of mathematical creativity		52
9.	Consequences in teaching advanced mathematical thinking		52
<b>CHAPTER 4 :</b>	<b>Mathematical Proof</b>	<b>Gila Hanna</b>	<b>54</b>
1.	Origins of the emphasis on formal proof		55
2.	More recent views of mathematics		55
3.	Factors in acceptance of a proof		58
4.	The social process		59
5.	Careful reasoning		60
6.	Teaching		60

## II: COGNITIVE THEORY OF ADVANCED MATHEMATICAL THINKING

CHAPTER 5 : The Role of Definitions in the Teaching and Learning of Mathematics	Shlomo Vinner	65
1. Definitions in mathematics and common assumptions about pedagogy		65
2. The cognitive situation		67
3. Concept image		68
4. Concept formation		69
5. Technical contexts		69
6. Concept image and concept definition - desirable theory and practice		69
7. Three illustrations of common concept images		73
8. Some implications for teaching		79
CHAPTER 6 : The Role of Conceptual Entities and their symbols in building Advanced Mathematical Concepts	Guershon Harel & James Kaput	82
1. Three roles of conceptual entities		83
1.1 Working-memory load		84
1.2a Comprehension: the case of "uniform" and "point-wise" operators		84
1.2b Comprehension: the case of object-valued operators		86
1.3 Conceptual entities as aids to focus		88
2. Roles of mathematical notations		88
2.1 Notation and formation of cognitive entities		89
2.2 Reflecting structure in elaborated notations		91
3. Summary		93
CHAPTER 7 : Reflective Abstraction in Advanced Mathematical Thinking	Ed Dubinsky	95
1. Piaget's notion of reflective abstraction		97
1.1 The importance of reflective abstraction		97
1.2 The nature of reflective abstraction		99
1.3 Examples of reflective abstraction in children's thinking		100
1.4 Various kinds of construction in reflective abstraction		101
2. A theory of the development of concepts in advanced mathematical thinking		102

	2.1	Objects, processes and schemas	102
	2.2	Constructions in advanced mathematical concepts	103
	2.3	The organization of schemas	106
3.		Genetic decompositions of three schemas	109
	3.1	Mathematical induction	110
	3.2	Predicate calculus	114
	3.3	Function	116
4.		Implications for education	119
	4.1	Inadequacy of traditional teaching practices	120
	4.2	What can be done	123

### III : RESEARCH INTO THE TEACHING AND LEARNING OF ADVANCED MATHEMATICAL THINKING

#### CHAPTER 8 : Research in Teaching and Learning Mathematics at an Advanced Level Aline Robert & Rolph Schwarzenberger 127

1.		Do there exist features specific to the learning of advanced mathematics?	128
	1.1	Social factors	128
	1.2	Mathematical content	128
	1.3	Assessment of students' work	130
	1.4	Psychological and cognitive characteristics of students	131
	1.5	Hypotheses on student acquisition of knowledge in advanced mathematics	132
	1.6	Conclusion	133
2.		Research on learning mathematics at the advanced level	133
	2.1	Research into students' acquisition of specific concepts	134
	2.2	Research into the organization of mathematical content at an advanced level	134
	2.3	Research on the external environment for advanced mathematical thinking	136
3.		Conclusion	139

#### CHAPTER 9 : Functions and associated learning difficulties Theodore Eisenberg 140

1.		Historical background	140
2.		Deficiencies in learning theories	142
3.		Variables	144
4.		Functions, graphs and visualization	145
5.		Abstraction, notation, and anxiety	148
6.		Representational difficulties	151

7.Summary		152
CHAPTER 10 : Limits	Bernard Cornu	153
1.	Spontaneous conceptions and mental models	154
2.	Cognitive obstacles	158
3.	Epistemological obstacles in historical development	159
4.	Epistemological obstacles in modern mathematics	162
5.	The didactical transmission of epistemological obstacles	163
6.	Towards pedagogical strategies	165
CHAPTER 11 : Analysis	Michèle Artigue	167
1.	Historical background	168
1.1	Some concepts emerged early but were established late	168
1.2	Some concepts cause both enthusiasm and virulent criticism	168
1.3	The differential/derivative conflict and its educational repercussions	169
1.4	The non-standard analysis revival and its weak impact on education	172
1.5	Current educational trends	173
2.	Student conceptions	174
2.1	A cross-sectional study of the understanding of elementary calculus in adolescents and young adults	176
2.2	A study of student conceptions of the differential, and of the processes of differentiation and integration	180
2.2.1	The meaning and usefulness of differentials and differential procedures	180
2.2.2	Approximation and rigour in reasoning	182
2.2.3	The role of differential elements	184
2.3	The role of education	186
3.	Research in didactic engineering	186
3.1	"Graphic calculus"	187
3.2	Teaching integration through scientific debate	191
3.3	Didactic engineering in teaching differential equations	193
3.4	Summary	195
4.	Conclusion and future perspectives in education	196
CHAPTER 12 : The Role of Students' Intuitions of Infinity in Teaching the Cantorial Theory	Dina Tirosh	199
1.	Theoretical conceptions of infinity	200

2.	Students' conceptions of infinity	201
2.1	Students' intuitive criteria for comparing infinite quantities	203
3.	First steps towards improving students' intuitive understanding of actual infinity	205
3.1	The "finite and infinite sets" learning unit	206
3.2	Raising students' awareness of the inconsistencies in their own thinking	206
3.3	Discussing the origins of students' intuitions about infinity	207
3.4	Progressing from finite to infinite sets	207
3.5	Stressing that it is legitimate to wonder about infinity	208
3.6	Emphasizing the relativity of mathematics	208
3.7	Strengthening students' confidence in the new definitions	209
4.	Changes in students' understanding of actual infinity	209
5.	Final comments	214

#### CHAPTER 13 : Research on Mathematical Proof

Daniel Alibert & Michael Thomas 215

1.	Introduction	215
2.	Students' understanding of proofs	216
3.	The structural method of proof exposition	219
3.1	A proof in linear style	221
3.2	A proof in structural style	222
4.	Conjectures and proofs - the scientific debate in a mathematical course	224
4.1	Generating scientific debate	225
4.2	An example of scientific debate	226
4.3	The organization of proof debates	228
4.4	Evaluating the role of debate	229
5.	Conclusion	229

#### CHAPTER 14 : Advanced Mathematical Thinking and the Computer

Ed Dubinsky and David Tall 231

1.	Introduction	231
2.	The computer in mathematical research	231
3.	The computer in mathematical education - generalities	234
4.	Symbolic manipulators	235
5.	Conceptual development using a computer	237
6.	The computer as an environment for exploration of fundamental ideas	238

7.	Programming	241
8.	The future	243
Appendix to Chapter 14		
	ISETL : a computer language for advanced mathematical thinking	244

## EPILOGUE

CHAPTER 15 : Reflections	David Tall	251
BIBLIOGRAPHY		261
INDEX		275