Contents

List of Figures ix

List of Tables xi

Preface xiii

PART I. CHOOSING AN ACADEMIC HOME 1

1. Finding the Right Conversation 2

Scholarship as a Social, Sensemaking Activity 3

Identifying Scholarly Conversations 5

Choosing Your Conversation 8

Developing a Scholarly Identity That Informs Scholarly Choices 12

Balancing Attraction, Agreement, and Disagreement 14

Conclusion 18

Notes 19

2. Criteria for Contribution 21

Public Locations for Scholarly Conversation 21

Be Interesting and, if Appropriate, Engaging 24

Choose Significant and Ideally Enduring Topics 28

Be Trustworthy and, Especially for More Daring Projects, Authoritative 37

Conclusion 37

Notes 38

3. Theoretic Explanation 39

Theoretic Explanation as a Focal Point of Scholarly Contribution 39

Scholarly Explanations as Theory 40

Theoretic Contributions to Scholarly Conversation 44

Criticisms of Theory 47

Supporting Conversation With Theoretic Explanations 52

Targeting Conversants for a Specific Project 54

Conclusion 58

Notes 59

4. Evolution of Scholarly Projects 61
Design Decisions That Shape Contributions to Scholarship 61
Tracing the Development of Scholarly Projects Over Time 69
Interaction With Others' Scholarship 75
Conclusion 79
Notes 80

PART II. DESIGNING YOUR CONTRIBUTION 83

5. Research Design 85
The Purpose of Research Design 85
Design as a Mechanistic and Organic Process 87
Funding as a Stimulus for Good Design 99
The Value of Plain Language 104
Conclusion 106
Notes 106

6. Ontology and Epistemology 108
Basic Definitions 108
Multiple Ontological/Epistemological Positions 111
Ontological and Epistemological Confusions and Disagreements 116
Using Ontology and Epistemology to Find a Novel Contribution 120
Conclusion 124
Notes 124

7. Disciplines, Professions, and Their Subfields of Inquiry 127
The Importance of Academic Institutions 127
Definitions 128
Subfield Networks That Influence Scholarly Inquiry 129
Alternative Modes of Knowledge Production 135
The Personal Face of Institutional Networks 139
Thinking About Disciplines/Professions as a Part of Research Design 140
The Ethics of Knowledge Generation and Dissemination 142
Conclusion 144
Notes 145

8. Literature Review 147
Sensemaking Connections With the Literature 147
Surveying Your Scholarly Domain 155
Critically Reviewing Articles in Your Particular Area of Interest 161
Reviews That Systematically Synthesize the Work of Others 166
Literature Search in the Midst of a Scholarly Project 173

Conclusion 176
Notes 177

9. Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods 179
Empirical and Theoretical Explanations 179
Strengths and Weakness of All Methods 183
The Importance of a Personal Skill Set 188
Teaching to Learn More About Methods 191
Monitoring Change in Conversations and Methods Used 192
Reflecting on Experience and Learning From Disappointing Results 194
Conclusion 199
Notes 199

10. Links to Practice and Policy 201
Presenting to a Lay Audience 201
The Practical Relevance of Theory 204
The Theoretic Relevance of Good Practice 206
An Example of Extended Collaboration 209
The Promise and Problems of Insider/Outsider Research 210
Conclusion 215
Notes 215

11. Modeling Theoretic Propositions 217
David Whetten
Introduction 218
The Basics: Constructing and Representing Propositional Theory Using Graphic Models 220
Application: Using Graphic Modelingas a Methodology for Theory Development 227
"So What?": Putting Your Propositions to Work 244
Conclusion 245
Notes 247

12. Evaluation of Research Design and Outcomes 251
Evaluation as a Scholarly Project Unfolds 251
The Ethics of Submitting Scholarly Work for Evaluation and the Ethics of Evaluating Others 256
Making Critical Judgments and Putting Them Into a Formal Report 263
Conclusion 268
Notes 268

PART III. CONVERSATIONS ABOUT SCHOLARSHIP 269

13. Mike Wallace on Critical Reading and Writing 271

Critical Reading to Learn How to Write for an Audience of Critical Readers 272

Potential Negative Consequences of a Critical Perspective 275

How to Critically Engage With the Literature 278

Comparing Critical Literature Review and Systematic Literature Review 279

Broader Applications of a Critical Perspective 281

Notes 284

14. Gary Gaile, Susan Clarke, and Jim Huff on Controversies About Theory 285

Theory in Disarray? 286

The Significance of "Theoretic" Explanations 288

Interdisciplinary Theory and Practical Problems 292

Teaching About Theory 293

The Evolution of Theoretic Explanations 294

Notes 296

15. Susan Hanson on the Evolution of Multidisciplinary and Coauthored Research Projects 297

Multiple Sources of Project Ideas 298

Project Evolution 300

Working With Coauthors and Other Collaborators 302

Connecting With Multiple Audiences 304

Impact of One Project on Later Scholarship 307

Notes 310

Appendix A. Internet Tools Supporting Scholarship 311

Appendix B. Questions for Those Designing Research 314
Vivek Velamuri

Appendix C. Exercises Summary 320

Appendix D. Advice Summary 337

Appendix E. Summary of Political and Career Questions 341

Glossary 344

Selected Bibliography 351
Tobias Fredberg

Index 362

About the Author 374

List of Figures

Chapter 1

Figure 1.1. The Sensemaking/ Sensegiving Circle of Scholarship 4
Figure 1.2. Two Conversations About Similar Topics, I and I' 7
Figure 1.3. Indicators of (and Contributions to) Scholarly Conversation 8
Figure 1.4. An Overly Restricted Conversational Map 9
Figure 1.5. An Overly Ambitious Conversational Map 10
Figure 1.6. A Manageable Conversational Map 11

Chapter 2

Figure 2.1. The Scholar's Sensemaking Task 23
Figure 2.2. The Range of Conversational Claims 33
Figure 2.3. More Demanding Criteria for More Interesting Claims 34
Figure 2.4. Distance Options for Connecting With Your Audience 37

Chapter 3

Figure 3.1. Experiential Learning as Theorizing 41
Figure 3.2. Explanatory Sensegiving 48
Figure 3.3. Three Sources of Theoretic Ideas 58

Chapter 4

Figure 4.1. Selected Projects by Susan Hanson and Others 76

Chapter 5

Figure 5.1. Design Decisions Connecting Research Purpose and Outcome 86
Figure 5.2. Organic Activities That Lead to Logical (Mechanical) Outputs 95
Figure 5.3. Research Direction Often Changes Over Time 96
Figure 5.4. Overlapping Requirements for Design, Funding, and Publication 100

Chapter 7

Figure 7.1. The Institutional Context of Scholarly Conversation 134

Chapter 8

Figure 8.1. Four Types of Literature Review over Time 148
Figure 8.2. Mind Map 159
Figure 8.3. Concept Map of Related Conversational Domains 160
Figure 8.4. Toulmin's Description of Scholarly Argument 163

Chapter 9

Figure 9.1. Conversational Exchange Between Theoretical and Empirical Arguments 180

Figure 9.2. McGrath's Research Dilemmatics 186

Chapter 10

Figure 10.1. A "Virtuous Circle" of Interaction With Practice and Policy 204
Figure 10.2. Reasons to Pay Attention to Practical Concerns 205
Figure 10.3. "Inside/Outside" Collaborations 211
Figure 10.4. Interactions that Increase Shared Understanding 212

Chapter 11

Figure 11.1. Model Components 222
Figure 11.2. Options for Modeling/Theory Development 229
Figure 11.3. Complex Graphic Model of Multiple Propositions 229
Figure 11.4. What Is Explained, G or H? 242

Chapter 12

Figure 12.1. Evaluation as Sensemaking and Sensegiving 252
Figure 12.2. Connected Research Design Decisions 254

List of Tables

Chapter 2

Table 2.1. That's Interesting! 25
Table 2.2. That's Interesting Because It's Engaging! 27
Table 2.3. Lincoln and Guba's Criteria for Trustworthiness 32

Chapter 3

Table 3.1. That's Interesting Because It Makes a Theoretic Claim! 47
Table 3.2. Matrix for Responding to Key Conversants 57

Chapter 4

Table 4.1. Contributions From One Part of the Uppsala Study 64
Table 4.2. Contributions From Hanson and Pratt's *Gender, Work and Space* 73

Chapter 5

Table 5.1. Reasons for Conducting Pilot Studies 94
Table 5.2. Additional Ideas for Developing Projects in a New But Externally Defined Domain 97
Table 5.3. Criteria for Funding From the National Science Foundation 100
Table 5.4. NSF Proposal Requirements 103

Chapter 6

Table 6.1. Burrell and Morgan's View of Ontological and Epistemological Alternatives in Science 109
Table 6.2. Worldviews Influencing Scholarly Conversation 112
Table 6.3. Alvesson and Deetz's View of Prototypical Features of Management Research 115
Table 6.4. Different Interpretations of Trustworthy Research 119
Table 6.5. That's Interesting (and Perhaps Significant) Because It Alters Our Worldview! 121

Chapter 7

Table 7.1. Alternative Modes of Knowledge Production 139
Table 7.2. Strengths and Weaknesses of Different Modes of Knowledge Production 137
Table 7.3. That's Interesting (and Perhaps Significant) Because It Defines Knowledge Production in a Different Way! 137
Table 7.4. Clark Kerr's List of Obligatory Ethical Actions 143

Chapter 8

Table 8.1. Overview of Four Types of Literature Review 151

Table 8.2. A Template for Taking Notes During a Literature Survey 156
Table 8.3. Steps in a Typical Critical Review 163
Table 8.4. Concept Matrix Completed in Critical Review 165
Table 8.5. Steps in a Typical Meta-Analysis 168
Table 8.6. Overview of Meta-Ethnography 169
Table 8.7. Standard Subsections of a Narrative Overview 170

Chapter 9

Table 9.1. Comparison of Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods of Inquiry 184
Table 9.2. That's Interesting Because New Methods Provide New Evidence for Theoretical Explanation! 187
Table 9.3. Questions for Survey Design 190

Chapter 10

Table 10.1. Eight Good Ideas for Presenting to a Lay Audience 202
Table 10.2. That's Significant Because of Its Connection to Practice! 207
Table 10.3. Pros and Cons of External and Internal Evaluation 213

Chapter 11

Table 11.1. That's Interesting Because It Proposes a New Theoretic Explanation! 240
Table 11.2. That's Interesting Because It Improves an Existing Theoretic Proposition! 240

Chapter 12

Table 12.1. Questions for Refining Design 253
Table 12.2. Ethical Responsibilities of Submitting Authors 257
Table 12.3. Ethical Requirements of Reviewers With Respect to Authors and Other Colleagues 261
Table 12.4. Questions for Evaluating Manuscripts Submitted for Journal Publication 264
Table 12.5. A Template for Reporting Review Results to Authors and Editors 264