

Contents

Introduction	xix
Part One: The History of Paraconsistent Logic	
I. First Historical Introduction: A Preliminary History of Paraconsistent and Dialethic Approaches <i>G: Priest and R. Routley</i>	3
1. Western thought until the fall of the Roman Empire: paraconsistent elements	5
2. Elements of paraconsistent thinking in Eastern philosophy	15
3. Paraconsistent thought in Christendom	18
4. The modern revival: paraconsistent approaches through idealism and common sense	21
5. Contemporary paraconsistent development and approaches	23
5.1 A theory for contradictory objects: Meinong	24
5.2 The overturning of conventional logical wisdom: Łukasiewicz	25
5.3 The Russian forerunners: Vasil'ev and Bochvar	29
5.4 An isolated figure in contemporary history: Wittgenstein	35
5.5 The Polish continuation: Jaśkowski	44
5.6 The Latin American development: da Costa's theories	50
5.7 The position of relevant logics and the contrasting attitudes of their proponents	53
5.8 The Australian movement	55
Appendix: note on recent activity elsewhere	57
Notes	58
References	70
	vii

II. An Outline of the History of (Logical) Dialectic		
<i>G. Priest and R. Routley</i>		76
1.	The origins of dialectic in Western philosophy	76
2.	The development of dialectic in Greek philosophy	78
3.	Dialectic in later Greek and Medieval philosophy	80
4.	Kant and Fichte	82
5.	Hegel	85
6.	Marx and the Marxists	88
7.	Summary and prospects	92
	Notes	92
	References	96
 III. Aspects of the Historical Development of		
Paraconsistent Logic		
<i>A. I. Arruda</i>		99
1.	Introduction	99
2.	The origins of paraconsistent logic	101
2.1	Jan Łukasiewicz (1878–1956)	101
2.2	Nikolaj A. Vasil'ev (1880–1940)	102
2.3	Stanislaw Jaśkowski (1906–1965)	103
2.4	Newton C. A. da Costa	105
3.	The present-day development of paraconsistent logic	107
3.1	Paraconsistent logic in Australia	107
3.2	Paraconsistent logic in Brazil	110
3.2.1	The elaboration of paraconsistent logics other than da Costa's system which would be adequate for the construction of paraconsistent set theories	110
3.2.2	The problem of constructing paraconsistent set theories with strong forms of the axiom schema of separation	112
3.2.3	Discussive logic and dialectical logic	113
3.2.4	The construction of different types of paraconsistent logic as the possible formalizations of the imaginary logic of Vasil'ev and some kinds of logic of vagueness	113
3.2.5	The generalization of the classical method of valuations to paraconsistent logic, and the use of it in order to prove completeness theorems for these logics and to obtain decision methods for them	114

3.2.6	The development of higher-order logics corresponding to da Costa's systems C_n	114
3.2.7	The algebraization of the systems C_n	114
3.2.8	Many-valued paraconsistent logic	115
3.2.9	The relation between fuzzy logic and paraconsistent logic	116
3.2.10	Paraconsistent model theory	116
3.3	Paraconsistent logic in Poland	116
3.4.	Paraconsistent logic in the United States	119
3.5	Paraconsistent logic in Argentina	122
3.6	Paraconsistent logic in Belgium	123
3.7	Paraconsistent logic in Ecuador	125
3.8	Paraconsistent logic in Italy	125
3.9	Paraconsistent logic in Peru	127
	References	127

IV. Classical Logic *aufgehoben*

G. Priest

131

1.	Nineteenth century logic	132
2.	Classical logic: the progressive phase	133
3.	Classical logic: the degenerating phase	135
4.	The shape of things to come	140
4.1	The solution of classical anomalies	141
4.2	Preservation of problem-solving ability	142
4.3	Providing the basis for a new and fruitful research program	143
5.	Conclusion	145
	Notes	145
	References	147

Part Two: Systems of Paraconsistent Logic

V. Systems of Paraconsistent Logic

G. Priest and R. Routley

151

1.	Paraconsistency: characterization and motivation	151
1.1	The proof theoretic reason	151
1.2	The semantical reason	153

2.	Approaches to paraconsistent logical theory: Initial systemic taxonomy of paraconsistent logics; zero degree formulas	155
2.1	Non-adjunctive systems: Jaśkowski's system	157
2.2	Positive-plus systems: da Costa's main system	162
2.3	The relevant approach	168
3.	Approaches to paraconsistent logical theory: implication	171
3.1	Non-adjunctive systems, such as Jaśkowski's system	171
3.2	Positive-plus systems, such as da Costa's main system	175
3.3	The relevant approach	177
	Notes	180
	References	184
	VI. Dynamic Dialectical Logics	
	<i>D. Batens</i>	187
1.	Introduction	187
2.	Regular paraconsistent extensional propositional logics	191
3.	Enters dynamics	194
4.	The dynamic dialectical logic DPI^*	196
5.	The (decent) dynamic dialectical logic DPI	199
6.	Some metatheory	203
7.	Theorems, axiomatizations, elegance	208
8.	Semantics	210
9.	Some other dynamic dialectical logics of the type of DPI	211
10.	Final comments and some open problems	213
	Notes	216
	References	217
	VII. Paraconsistent and Combinatory Logic	
	<i>M. W. Bunder</i>	218
1.	Introduction	218
2.	Combinatory Logic	218
3.	Paraconsistent Logics	220

4.	Paraconsistent Systems based on $\neg_0 X = X \supset \Xi H J_0$	222
5.	Paraconsistent Systems based on $\neg X = X \supset \Xi J I$	223
	References	226
VIII. Problems of Modal and Discussive Logics		
	<i>J. Kotas and N. C. A. da Costa</i>	227
	Introduction	227
1.	Some modal and discussive systems	227
2.	Structural completeness	231
3.	Modal systems with the <i>DSF</i> -property	233
4.	Generalized Jaśkowski logics	234
5.	Strong implication	239
6.	Higher-order discussive logic	240
7.	Discussive set theory	242
	References	243
IX. Abelian Logic (from A to Z)		
	<i>R. K. Meyer and J. K. Slaney</i>	245
	Notes	286
	References	287
X. Paraconsistency and C_1		
	<i>C. Mortensen</i>	289
1.	Introduction	289
2.	C_1 and some related systems	291
3.	Does C_1 have a reasonable conditional and biconditional?	293
4.	Some extensions of C_1	297
5.	More about extending C_1	300
	Notes	303
	References	304

	XI. On Detonating	
	<i>P. K. Schotch and R. E. Jennings</i>	306
1.	Introduction	306
2.	A general theory	312
3.	Some variations	319
4.	Conclusion	325
	Notes	326
	References	327
	XII. Consistency, Completeness and Negation	
	<i>D. Vakarelov</i>	328
1.	Distributive logics	329
1.1	Syntax	329
1.2	Theories, co-theories and prime theories	330
1.3	A characterization of distributive logics	331
1.4	Semantics	334
2.	Negation and consistency	335
2.1	Regular negation	336
2.2	Some familiar laws of negation	338
2.3	Semantics for some regular logics	343
2.4	Standard logics	345
2.5	Paraconsistency	349
2.6	Filtrations	351
3.	Negation and completeness	355
3.1	Co-regular negation	355
3.2	Semantics for some co-regular logics	358
3.3	Paraconsistency and paracompleteness	360
3.4	Concluding remarks and open problems	361
	References	362

Part Three: Applications of Paraconsistent Logic

	XIII. Applications of Paraconsistent Logic	
	<i>G. Priest and R. Routley</i>	367
1.	Introduction: the variety and types of applications	367

2.	Historical and extant inconsistent theories	367
2.1	Philosophy and theology	368
2.2	Natural and social sciences	369
2.3	Logic and mathematics	369
3.	A more detailed look at some of these theories	370
3.1	Naive semantics	370
3.2	Naive property theory, set theory and category theory	372
3.3	The infinitesimal calculus	374
3.4	Quantum mechanics	376
4.	Paraconsistency and wider logical notions	379
4.1	Reason, inference, fallacies and the inconsistent	379
4.2	Extending paraconsistent logic by intensional functors: modal and tense operators	381
4.3	Moral dilemmas: deontic logic	382
4.4	Belief systems: doxastic logic	384
4.5	Probability and inductive reasoning	385
4.6	Information content and data processing	388
4.7	Vagueness	389
5.	Conclusion	390
	Notes	390
	References	392
 XIV. Toward an Antinomic Mathematics		
	<i>F. G. Asenjo</i>	394
1.	Rationale	394
2.	A first calculus of antinomies	394
3.	A second calculus of antinomies	395
4.	“Logic of antinomies”	396
5.	Parenthesis: is dialectic logic necessarily antinomic?	398
6.	The comprehension axiom in antinomic logic	399
7.	An antinomic number theory	400
8.	Equality as an antinomic predicate	407
9.	Antinomies and intuitionism	408
10.	Open problems	410
11.	Forecast	412

Notes	413
References	414
XV. The Non-Triviality of Extensional Dialectical Set Theory	
<i>R. T. Brady and R. Routley</i>	415
1. Scene setting and systemic preliminaries: DKQ and DST; RM3Q and EDST	415
2. The modelling for the extensional general comprehension axiom	420
3. The validity of the extensionality axiom in the structure M_λ	426
Notes	435
References	435
XVI. The Non-Triviality of Dialectical Set Theory	
<i>R. T. Brady</i>	437
1. The logic DSQ and the dialectical set theory DST	438
2. The determination of the model structure MD for dialectical set theory DST	442
3. The soundness of DSQ with respect to MD	451
4. The validity of the GCA in MD and invalidity of some formulae in MD	457
5. The validity of the EA in MD	458
6. Some concluding remarks	465
6.1 The alternative definition for $A \rightarrow B$ in the construction of (S)	465
6.2 The restriction of connectives in the GCA	466
6.3 The addition of “classical” provability, \vdash^c	467
6.4 The incompleteness of the dialectical set theory DST’	468
6.5 The total number of logical values	470
Notes	470
References	471
XVII. RWX is not Curry Paraconsistent	
<i>J. K. Slaney</i>	472
Notes	479
References	480

Part Four: The Philosophical Significance of Paraconsistency

XVIII. The Philosophical Significance and Inevitability of Paraconsistency

G. Priest and R. Routley

483

1.	Introduction	483
2.	Reasons for paraconsistency	483
2.1	There are natural inconsistent but non-trivial theories	483
2.1.1	Inconsistent bodies of law and the like	484
2.1.2.	Inconsistent theories in philosophy and the history of ideas	485
2.1.3	Inconsistent theories in science and the history of science	494
2.1.4.	The matter of non-triviality	495
2.1.5	Naive set theory	498
2.1.6	Naive semantics	501
2.2	The truth of some contradictions	503
2.2.1	Multicriterial terms	503
2.2.2	Logical and semantical paradoxes	505
2.2.2.1	Paradoxes in set theory	506
2.2.2.2	Paradoxes in semantics	506
3.	Ramifications and consequences of paraconsistency, and further reasons for paraconsistency	510
3.1	Pragmatics	510
3.1.1	Assertion: the question of content	511
3.1.2	Criticism and the change of belief	514
3.1.3	Consistency and the metatheory	516
3.2	Metaphysics	517
3.2.1	Meinong's theory of objects	517
3.2.2	Dialectic	519
3.2.2.1	Contradictions in knowledge and the corpus of science	520
3.2.2.2	Contradictions in the natural world	522
3.3	The philosophy of mathematics	523
3.3.1	Gödel's first incompleteness theorem	523
3.3.2	Logicism	524
3.3.3	Hilbert's program	527
4.	Conclusion: the ideology of consistency	528
	Notes	529
	References	537

XIX. Wittgenstein and Paraconsistency	
<i>L. Goldstein</i>	540
1. Introduction	540
2. Contradiction as castration	541
3. Early non-classicism	542
4. Logical proof and proof in logic	546
5. Transition	547
6. Calculus and language-game	549
7. A new perspective	551
8. Wittgenstein as dialethist	554
9. Postscript-conventionalism	557
Notes and References	559

XX. *Verum et ens convertuntur*

The Identity between Truth and Existence within
the Framework of a Contradictorial Modal Set
Theory
L. Peña

	563
Introduction	563
1. Methodological and preliminary remarks	565
2. Identity truth-existence in ordinary speech	568
3. The identity between any thing's existence and the thing itself	571
4. Existence as a redundance predicate	576
5. Degrees of reality and the need for an infinite-valued logic	580
6. Non-existence statements	589
7. Naming and stating	595
8. Existence = the absolutely real thing	597
9. Existence and the existential quantifier	603
10. Why knowing all that exists is being omniscient	606

11.	Relations, combinatory approaches, and existence as the relation of being belonged to	608
	References	611
 XXI. <i>Reductio ad absurdum et modus tollendo ponens</i> <i>G. Priest</i>		613
1.	Introduction	613
2.	Logic as an organon of criticism	613
3.	Plato's Euthypro: an illustration	615
4.	The general unacceptability of contradictions and the particular acceptability of some	615
5.	An important point	617
6.	<i>Reductio ad absurdum</i> as proof	619
7.	<i>Modus tollendo ponens</i>	622
8.	Conclusion: Quasi-valid inferences	625
	Note	626
	References	626
 XXII. Paraconsistent Logic: Some Philosophical Issues <i>F. Miró Quesada</i>		627
1.	Introduction	627
2.	Paraconsistency and heterodoxy	628
2.1	The conception of heterodoxy	628
3.	Semantics	632
3.1	Bivalent Semantics	632
3.2	Other types of semantics	633
4.	Dialectic	634
4.1	Paraconsistency and dialectic	634
4.2	Dialectic, paraconsistency and relevance	636
5.	Applications	638
5.1	Thetic logic	638
5.2	Athetic logic	639

6.	Paraconsistency and the rationality of logic	640
6.1	Classical logic, heterodoxy and rationality	640
6.2	Considerations as to the rationality of logic	642
	Notes	647
	References	651
	XXIII. Moral Dilemmas and the Logic of Deontic Notions	
	<i>R. Routley and V. Plumwood</i>	653
1.	The paradoxes of deontic logic and the consistency and modal requirements	653
2.	The simple relevant resolution versus classical epicycling	656
3.	Documenting moral dilemmas	658
4.	Paraconsistent deontic logic; the relevant development	663
5.	Resultant impact on other puzzles and paradoxes of deontic theory of the relevant/paraconsistent shift	669
6.	Upsetting the moral consensus: unrealizable obligations, and inevitable wrongs	674
7.	Resolving moral dilemmas, so far as can be or need be done	678
	Notes	683
	References	688
	Bibliography	691
	Index	703
	List of Contributors	