

# Contents

**Preface** ix

- 1. Problems of Methodology in Cognitive Science** 1  
*James R. Miller, Peter G. Polson, and Walter Kintsch*
- Methodological Questions 3  
Methodological Suggestions 7  
Theory Construction in Cognitive Science 12  
On the Possibility of Cognitive Science 15  
References 17

## **PART I: ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE**

- 2. Paradigmatic Issues in Cognitive Science** 21  
*Wendy G. Lehnert*
- Concepts of Scientific Investigation 21  
The Role of Task Orientations 25  
Mapping the Cognitive Terrain 35  
Cognitive Mountain Climbing 43  
Appendix A 46  
References 48
- 3. Methodology for Building an Intelligent Tutoring System** 51  
*William J. Clancey*
- Goals: Intelligent Tutoring Systems 52  
From Mycin to Guidon (An AI Enterprise) 54  
From Guidon to Neomycin (A Cognitive Science Enterprise) 58  
The Relation of Theory, AI Formalism, and Program 63  
Methodology 68  
Methodological Pitfalls 72  
Areas for Collaboration 75  
The Prospects for Collaboration 77  
Glossary 79  
References 81

#### 4. First Among Equals

85

*John Haugeland*

References 99

### PART II: LINGUISTICS

#### 5. Grammars as Mental Representations of Language

103

*Joan Bresnan and Ronald M. Kaplan*

The Problem of the Psychological Reality of Grammars 103

Theoretical Constraints on Knowledge Representation 109

Implications for Process Models 115

Theoretical Constraints on Knowledge Processing 121

Implications for Syntactic Knowledge Representation 130

References 133

#### 6. Deductive Vs. Pragmatic Processing in Natural Language

137

*T. Givón*

Methodological Preface 137

Introduction 138

Existence and Referentiality 141

Co-Reference and Definite Description 147

Non-Discreteness of Reference and Definiteness 153

Truth, Fact, and Presupposition 155

Subjects and Predicates 160

Speech Acts 162

Topic Relevance 164

The Context-Dependent, Relativistic Nature of Lexical  
Meaning 165

Pragmatics and Language Change 169

Intermezzo: Knowledge Systems, Wittgenstein and Peirce 178

Synonymy, Polysemy, and Context 180

Ontogeny, Phylogeny, and the Rise of Automatic Processing

Routines 181

Discussion 183

References 187

#### 7. Psychological Constraints on Language: A Commentary on Bresnan and Kaplan and on Givón

191

*Herbert H. Clark and Barbara C. Malt*

Four Possible Psychological Constraints 192

What is a Psychological Constraint? 195

Bresnan and Kaplan on Psychological Constraints	199
Givón on Psychological Constraints	206
Strong and Weak Constraints	210
References	212

### **PART III: PSYCHOLOGY**

<b>8. Theoretical and Methodological Issues in Cognitive Science: A Psycholinguistic Perspective</b>	<b>217</b>
<i>David Swinney</i>	
Basic Theoretical and Methodological Considerations in Psycholinguistics	218
General Constraints on Using Psychological Data to Support Theoretical Positions in the Cognitive Sciences	231
References	232
<b>9. Competitive Argumentation in Computational Theories of Cognition</b>	<b>235</b>
<i>Kurt VanLehn, John Seely Brown, and James Greeno</i>	
An Example of an Argument	245
An Example of the Progression Toward Competitive Argumentation	258
Conclusions	260
References	261
<b>10. Cognitive Science is Methodologically Fine</b>	<b>263</b>
<i>Eugene Charniak</i>	
Methodologies in Cognitive Science	264
Methodological Arguments	264
Achieving Unity	268
What to do While Waiting for the Revolution	269
Word Sense Disambiguation in Cognitive Science	270
Conclusion	273

### **PART IV: TOWARDS COGNITIVE SCIENCE**

<b>11. Methods and Tactics Reconsidered</b>	<b>277</b>
<i>P. G. Polson, J. R. Miller, and W. Kintsch</i>	
Is AI Just Cognitive Psychology in a Different Guise?	278
Linguistic Issues in Cognitive Science	283
Theorizing in Psychology	290
References	296

<b>12. Some General Remarks on the Cognitive Sciences</b>	<b>297</b>
<i>Patrick Suppes</i>	
References	304
<b>13. Cohabitation in the Cognitive Sciences</b>	<b>305</b>
<i>George Mandler</i>	
Cognitive Science or Cognitive Sciences?	305
Sources and Domains of the Cognitive Sciences	305
Toward a Singular Cognitive Science?	310
Muddle: A Process Model	312
References	315
<b>Author Index</b>	<b>317</b>
<b>Subject Index</b>	<b>322</b>