

Contents

List of Authors xiii

Foreword xv

Preface xix

Chapter 1	Issues of Cognitive Science in Medicine 1
	David A. Evans
	Arguments for Cognitive Science in Medicine 3
	A Priori Arguments 3
	‘Non-Scientific’ Arguments 5
	Scientific Arguments 6
	Cognition in Medicine: Between Science and Art 9
	Themes of Cognitive Science in Medicine 13
	The Role of Knowledge 13
	Effective Learning 14
	Communicating Information 16
Chapter 2	Estrogen Replacement Decisions of Third-Year Residents: Clinical Intuition and Decision Analysis 21
	Arthur S. Elstein, James Dod, Gerald B. Holzman
	Method 22
	Results 24
	Reliability of Observed Decisions 24

Importance of Cancer Versus Fracture	28
Subjective Probabilities	28
Utility Assessment	30
Expected Utilities and Model Decisions	32
Comparison of Models	33
Comparison of Models with Observed Decisions	34
Differences Between Specialties	35
Sensitivity Analyses	36
Discussion	40
Differences between Observed and Model Decisions	40
Difference between Models	42
Effects of Training and Experience	43
Comparison of Decisions of Residents and Experienced Physicians	43
Subjective Probability, Importance, and Utility of Cancer States	44
Conclusion	47
Appendix 2.A: Outcome Scenarios	50
Appendix 2.B: Procedures for Assessing Utilities and Importance Weights	52

Chapter 3

Biomedical Knowledge and Clinical Reasoning 53

Vimla L. Patel, David A. Evans, Guy J. Groen

Theoretical Perspective	57
Basic Science in Causal Explanations of Clinical Cases by Medical Students	63
Experiment I: Basic Science before Clinical Case	68
Experiment II: Basic Science after Clinical Case	75
Basic Science in Summaries of Clinical Cases by Medical Students and Internists	86

Experiment III: Medical Students Compared to Clinical Practitioners	87
Causal Explanations of Clinical Cases by Expert Practitioners and Researchers	92
Experiment IV: Clinical Practitioners Compared to Researchers	94
Summary: Results of the Four Experiments	104
Conclusion	106
Medical-Scientific Theories and the Pragmatics of Scientific Methodology	106
Patterns of Inference and General Strategies in Medical Problem Solving	108

Chapter 4

The Nature of Conceptual Understanding in Biomedicine: The Deep Structure of Complex Ideas and the Development of Misconceptions 113

Paul J. Feltovich, Rand J. Spiro,
Richard L. Coulson

The Concentrated Study of Concepts and Conceptual Families in Advanced Knowledge Acquisition	114
Complexity and Advanced Knowledge Acquisition	116
Methodology for the Empirical Selection of Concepts for Concentrated Study	119
Kinds of Generality Derivable from Concentrated Conceptual Analysis	121
The 'Anatomy' of a Misconception of Heart Failure	135
Background Regarding Heart Failure	135
Preview of the Misconception	139
A Pervasive and Powerful Misconception	141
The Nature, Acquisition, and Maintenance of the Misconception	142

More than a Simple Chain of Reasoning? A
Network 161

Harnessing the Power of Reciprocating Networks:
Some Instructional Directions 165

Chapter 5

**Application of Cognitive Theory to the
Student–Teacher Dialogue 173**

Kenneth R. Hammond, Elizabeth Frederick,
Nichole Robillard, Doreen Victor

A Historical Shift in Epistemology and Its
Significance for Medicine 174

Pattern Matching vs. Analysis of Functional
Relations 174

Method and Procedure 177

Research Materials 177

Subjects 178

Procedure for the Independent Diagnosis
(‘Think Aloud’) Session 178

Procedure for the Student–Teacher
Dialogue 179

Coding of the Verbal Protocols 179

Single Unit vs. Segment Coding 180

Results 180

Case Material 180

Analysis of Independent Diagnoses 181

Analysis of Student–Teacher Dialogue 184

Analysis of Change in the Dialogue (Segment
Coding) 188

Summary on Student–Teacher Dialogues 192

Theoretical Framework 193

Summary 198

Discussion 198

Appendix 5.A: Clinical Case Summaries 204

**Managing Coherence and Context in Medical
Problem-Solving Discourse 211**

David A. Evans, Cindy S. Gadd

- Coherence and Context in Medical Discourse 212
 - Expert–Expert: ‘Curbside’ Consultation 214
 - Expert–Intermediate: General Medical
Consultation 216
 - Expert–Novice: ‘Rounds’ Discourse 218
- Contexts in Medical Epistemology 221
 - Hierarchical Structure of Medical
Knowledge 223
 - The Interdependence of Knowledge
Levels 228
- Contexts in Procedures 231
 - Strategic Planning 232
 - Tactical Planning 237
- Implications for Computational Models 242
 - Designing Strategies for Consultation and
Tutoring 243
 - Limitations in Declarative/Procedural
Representations 246
- Conclusion 252

**A Cognitive Framework for Doctor–Patient
Interaction 257**

Vimla L. Patel, David A. Evans,
David R. Kaufman

- Patient Data in Models of Medical Expertise 258
 - Traditional Approaches 259
 - New Approaches to Modeling Expertise 261
- Toward a Cognitive Framework: Theoretical and
Methodological Prerequisites 263
 - Epistemological Framework 263

Information in Discourse Situations	265
The Formal Coding of Doctor–Patient Dialogue	269
Reference Model	276
Doctor–Patient Interaction: Empirical Studies	282
Experimental Design	282
Data Analysis	284
Summarization of Diagnostic and Quantitative Results	286
Descriptive Protocol Analysis	289
Conclusion	306

Chapter 8

GUIDON-MANAGE: Teaching the Process of Medical Diagnosis 313

Naomi S. Rodolitz, William J. Clancey

Background	316
Relevant Research in Computer-Based Tutoring Systems	316
NEOMYCIN and Medical Diagnosis	320
A GUIDON-MANAGE Session	325
Interacting with the System	325
The Interface	330
Design and Implementation Issues	335
Major Design Considerations	335
Division of NEOMYCIN's Task Hierarchy into Levels of Abstraction	335
Lookahead	337
Completeness and Flexibility	337
More Implementation Details	338
Student Trials	341
Observations	341
Conclusion	344

Chapter 9

When Less Is More 349

Clark Glymour

Empirical Cognitive Science 349

Assessing Automated Systems 352

The Computational Cost of Representations 354

Large Databases and Automated Discovery 358

Conclusion 365

Appendix 9.A: Models 368

Chapter 10

Context-Specific Requirements for Models of Expertise 373

Alan Lesgold

Approaches to Student Assessment 376

Model Tracing 377

Reconstruction 379

Issues Recognition 382

The Abstracted Problem Space Approach 384

But is it too Superficial? 388

Levels of Cognitive Activity 390

Experience and Connectionist Processing 391

Problems with Connectionist Models of Expertise or of Student Knowledge 392

Possible Advantages of Connectionist Models as Tools for Physician Training 394

Symbolic, Causal Reasoning 395

Schematic Processing 396

Index 401