Contents

Introduction 1

1 Grelling's paradox 1
2 Russell's paradox for properties 1
3 ... *v.* Russell's paradox for sets 2
4 Solution routes to Russell's paradox for properties 4
5 Grelling again 11
6 Change of logic and change of meaning 14
7 Some connections to other issues 18

PART I. A SELECTIVE BACKGROUND

1 Self-Reference and Tarski's Theorem 23
1.1 Self-reference and Gödel–Tarski diagonalization 24
1.2 Tarski's "Undefinability Theorem" 27
1.3 Tarski's "Undefinability Theorem" states more than undefinability 30
1.4 Another form of Tarski's theorem 32
1.5 Can set-theoretic truth be defined? 33
1.6 Inductive characterizations and restricted truth definitions 36
1.7 Further remarks on explicit definition 39

2 Validity and the Unprovability of Soundness 42
2.1 Validity and the necessary preservation of truth 42
2.2 Truth in a model 43
2.3 The Kreisel squeezing argument 46
2.4 The unprovability of soundness 48

3 Kripke's Theory of Truth (Strong Kleene Version) 56
3.1 The Kripke construction for restricted languages 58
3.2 The Kripke construction for unrestricted languages 62
3.3 Conservativeness 65
3.4 Does truth coincide with semantic value 1 even for restricted languages? (KFS *v.* FM) 68
3.5 Gaps and gluts 70

3.6 The weaknesses of Kripke's construction 72
3.7 Acceptance and rejection in KFS 73
3.8 Defectiveness again 76
Appendix: Kleene logic and other deMorgan logics 79

4 Adding a Conditional? Curry and Lukasiewicz 83
4.1 The Curry paradox 83
4.2 Continuum-valued semantics 86
4.3 What do the semantic values mean? 88
4.4 Determinate truth in continuum-valued semantics 89
4.5 Ultimate failure: quantifiers 92
4.6 Indeterminacy and rejection 94
Appendix: The Conservativeness Theorem 97

5 Interlude on Vagueness, and the Paradoxes of König and Berry 100
5.1 Must vague predicates have sharp boundaries? 100
5.2 Penumbral connections and higher order vagueness 102
5.3 Must higher order vagueness collapse? 104
5.4 Linear order? 105
5.5 The König and Berry paradoxes 106
5.6 The role of a classical meta-theory for a non-classical language 108

PART II. BROADLY CLASSICAL APPROACHES

6 Introduction to the Broadly Classical Options 117

7 Truth-Value Gaps in Classical Theories 121
7.1 Gaps and (T-OUT) 121
7.2 Kleene-style gaps versus supervaluation-style gaps 124
7.3 Declaring one's axioms untrue 130
7.4 Propositions to the rescue? 132
7.5 Truth-of, heterologicality, and properties 134
7.6 Restricted (T-OUT) 135
7.7 Does declaring one's axioms untrue destroy the purpose of truth? 138

8 Truth-Value Gluts in Classical Theories 142
8.1 Gluts and (T-IN) 142
8.2 (T-IN) theories 143
8.3 What do glut theories say about themselves? 146
8.4 Evaluation of gluts *v.* gaps 147

9 A Second Interlude on Vagueness 150
9.1 Indeterminacy in classical theories 150
9.2 Supervaluationism 153

10 Introduction to Supervaluational Approaches to Paradox 156
10.1 The simplest supervaluational fixed points 156
10.2 Indeterminacy, weak validity, and reasoning by cases 160
10.3 The status of the truth rules 162
10.4 Indeterminacy again 164
10.5 Boolean-valued semantics 166
10.6 Strong validity, and weak validity revisited 169
10.7 Yogi Berra's advice and ignorance interpretations 172

11 A Survey of Supervaluational and Revision-Rule Theories 176
11.1 Simple supervaluationism is very weak 176
11.2 General supervaluational fixed point theories 177
11.3 Avoiding the problems of simple supervaluationism 181
11.4 Rule-of-revision theories 186
11.5 Soundness proofs revisited 190

12 Are Supervaluational and Revision Theories Self-Undermining? 192
12.1 What do strong supervaluational and strong revision theories say about themselves? 192
12.2 What do medium supervaluational and medium revision theories say about themselves? 196
12.3 Are even the strong theories really "self-undermining"? 199
12.4 Gödel's Second Incompleteness Theorem 200
12.5 Conclusion 204

13 Intersubstitutivity and the Purpose of Truth 205
13.1 Harmless gaps 206
13.2 Acceptance and rejection in weakly classical theories 208
13.3 The rest of the iceberg 209

14 Stratified and Contextual Theories 211
14.1 Contextual theories and "Strengthened Liar reasoning" 211
14.2 Stratified gap and glut theories 214
14.3 "The ghost of the Tarski hierarchy": stratified internal fixed point theories 222
14.4 Stratified determinacy predicates for weakly classical theories 225

PART III. PARACOMPLETENESS

15 What Is To Be Done? 231
15.1 A framework for generalizing continuum-valued semantics 231
15.2 Determinateness and the Liar hierarchy 235
15.3 More on the never-collapsing hierarchy of determinately operators 239

16 Fixed Points and Revision Rules for Conditionals 242
16.1 Yablo fixed points 244
16.2 Revisionism 249
16.3 The transfinite Liar hierarchy and other examples 253
Appendix: The Fundamental Theorem 257

17 More on Revision-Theoretic Conditionals 259
17.1 Algebraic semantics 259
17.2 Conservativeness and schemas 262
17.3 Modal semantics 264
17.4 Laws and non-laws 266
17.5 Variations 271

18 What Has Been Done 275

PART IV. MORE ON PARACOMPLETE SOLUTIONS

19 Validity, Truth-Preservation, and the Second Incompleteness Theorem 281
19.1 Another form of Curry's paradox 281
19.2 The validity argument 284
19.3 The Second Incompleteness Theorem 286

20 Other Paradoxes 291
20.1 Paradoxes of denotation 291
20.2 The naive theory of properties, relations, and propositions 294
20.3 Set theory 296
20.4 Paradoxes of truth and validity 298
20.5 "Non-bivalent" validity? 303

21 Do Paracomplete Solutions Depend on Expressive Limitations? 309
21.1 Boolean negation and "exclusion negation" 309
21.2 Intuitionist negation and the intuitionist conditional 312
21.3 Wright's argument 314
21.4 Restall's argument 316

22 Determinateness, Hyper-Determinateness, and Super-Determinateness 325
22.1 Transfinite iteration made rigorous 326
22.2 Hyper-determinateness: the problem 331
22.3 Hyper-determinateness: the solution 333
22.4 Expanding the language? 338
22.5 Higher-order resources 340
22.6 Super-determinateness 343

23 Determinateness, Stratification, and Revenge 347
23.1 Stratified truth *v.* iterated determinacy 347
23.2 Genuine costs 350
23.3 Trying to get revenge 353

PART V. PARACONSISTENT DIALETHEISM

24 An Introduction to Paraconsistent Dialetheism 361
24.1 Dialetheism, the truth schema, and intersubstitutivity 361
24.2 Acceptance, rejection, and degree of belief 363
24.3 Gluts, gaps, and intersubstitutivity again 364

25 Some Dialetheic Theories 368
25.1 Priest's LP 368
25.2 Dualizing paracomplete theories 369
25.3 Priest's conditionals 371

26 Paraconsistent Dialetheism and Soundness 376
26.1 The first incompleteness theorem, Curry's paradox, and truth-preservation 376
26.2 Can we get even restricted truth-preservation? 380

27 Hyper-Determinacy and Revenge 384
27.1 Model theory, designated values and truth 384
27.2 Sole truth and sole falsehood 386
27.3 Extended paradox? 390

References 393
Index 399