

Contents

Illustrations xi

Preface xv

Acknowledgements xvi

Part One: Introduction 1

- 1. Introduction to the study of problem solving** 3
 - What is a problem? 3
 - Categorising problems 6
 - Methods of investigating problem solving 11
 - About this book: Three issues in problem solving 14
 - Summary 17

Part Two: Problem representation and problem-solving processes 19

Part Two: Introduction 21

- 2. Characterising problem solving** 25
 - The information-processing approach 26
 - Analysing well-defined problems 29
 - The interaction of the problem solver and the task environment 36
 - Heuristic search strategies 38
 - Summary 46
- 3. Problem representation: The case of insight** 49
 - Building a problem representation 50
 - Re-representing problems 51
 - Gestalt accounts of problem solving 52
 - Information-processing accounts of insight 59
 - The relationship between insight problems and other problems 69

Influencing problem representations: The effect of instructions	72
Summary	74

Part Three: Analogical problem solving 77

Part Three: Introduction	79
--------------------------	----

4. Transfer of learning 81

Positive and negative transfer	83
Set and Einstellung as examples of negative transfer	84
Hypothesis testing theory	84
Transfer in well-defined problems	87
Specific transfer	91
General transfer	100
What kinds of knowledge transfer?	102
Summary	104

5. Problem similarity 105

Types of similarity	106
Relational similarity	115
Structural Similarity	122
Pragmatic constraints	125
The relation between surface and structural similarity	127
Summary	129

6. Analogical problem solving 131

The importance of analogising	132
Studies of analogical problem solving	133
Accessing a source to solve a target	136
Generating your own analogies	137
Expository analogies	142
"Aesthetic" analogies	148
Summary	149

7. Textbook problem solving 151

Difficulties facing textbook writers	152
The role of examples in textbooks	155
The processes involved in textbook problem solving	158
Laboratory studies of within-domain and textbook problem solving	160
Understanding problems revisited	164
The role of diagrams and pictures in aiding understanding	166
Providing a schema in texts	169
Summary	170

Part Four: Learning and the development of expertise 173

Part Four: Introduction	175
-------------------------	-----

8. Expertise and how to acquire it 177

Induction	177
Schema induction	178

Schema-based knowledge	181
AI models of problem solving and learning	183
Skill learning in ACT-R	187
The power law of learning	194
Criticisms of production system models	195
Neurological evidence for the development of procedural knowledge	198
Summary	200
9. Experts, novices and complex problem solving	201
What distinguishes experts and novices	201
Are experts smarter? Are there differences in abilities?	204
Skill development	206
Knowledge organisation	209
Cognitive processes	214
Writing expertise: A case study	218
Summary	225
10. Conclusions	227
Problems, problems	227
Problem representation	229
Transfer	230
Learning	231
Answers to questions	235
Glossary	239
References	247
Author index	263
Subject index	267

Illustrations

FIGURES

- 1.1 Problem solving 4
- 1.2 Representing a problem in terms of the problem statement, solution procedure, and goal state 6
- 2.1 A trivial version of the Tower of Hanoi puzzle 26
- 2.2 The sequence of imagined moves in solving the two-ring Tower of Hanoi puzzle 27
- 2.3 The initial state, goal state, operators and restrictions in the Tower of Hanoi puzzle 30
- 2.4 The possible states that can be reached after two moves in the Tower of Hanoi puzzle 30
- 2.5 State space of all legal moves for the three-ring Tower of Hanoi puzzle 32
- 2.6 Sources of information used to determine a problem space 35
- 2.7 Solution and state-action graph of the Hobbits and Orcs problem 41
- 2.8 The goal recursion strategy of solving the Tower of Hanoi puzzle 45
- 3.1 The Mutilated Chequer Board problem 50
- 3.2 A simplified version of the Mutilated Chequer Board problem 51
- 3.3 Simpler version of the Dots problem 52
- 3.4 A square “emerges” from the configuration of black dots 52
- 3.5 The problem can be seen as adding up an increasing number of boxes 54
- 3.6 By doubling the number of squares in Figure 3.5 the problem becomes the simple one of finding the area of a rectangle 54
- 3.7 Maier’s Two-string problem 56
- 3.8 Luchins’ Water Jars problem 57
- 3.9 Duncker’s Candle Holder problem (Source: Robertson, 1999, pp. 85–86) 59
- 3.10 Pruning the search tree 62
- 3.11 The different representations of the Mutilated Chequer Board problem (Source: Robertson, 1999, p. 50) 63

xii ILLUSTRATIONS

- 3.12 Diagrams used by Duncker in describing the Radiation problem (adapted from Duncker, 1945) 67
- 3.13 The Nine Dots problem 68
- 3.14 Two variants of the Nine Dots problem presented in MacGregor et al. (in press) 69
- 3.15 The Mad Bird problem from the bird's point of view 71
- 3.16 The Mad Bird problem from the trains' point of view 71
- 3.17 The River Current problem from the observer's point of view 71
- 3.18 The River Current problem ignoring the observer 72
- 4.1 The 4-ring Tower of Hanoi state space showing the substructure of 1-, 2-, and 3-ring sub-spaces. Smaller sub-spaces embedded within larger sub-spaces illustrate the recursive nature of the problem. (Reprinted from *Acta Psychologica*, 1978, Luger and Bauer. "Transfer effects in isomorphic problem situations" pp. 121-131. © 1978, reprinted with permission from Elsevier Science) 90
- 4.2 Four cases where two tasks (A and B in each case) share a number of productions 95
- 4.3 Control panel device (adapted from Kieras & Bovair, 1986) 97
- 4.4 Three types of diagrammatic representations (adapted from Novick & Hmelo, 1994, p. 1299) 101
- 5.1 Intermediate representation of the Fortress problem 107
- 5.2 A continuum of similarity 110
- 5.3 A semantic hierarchy of transport systems 111
- 5.4 A semantic network showing connections between "car" and other forms of transport 112
- 5.5 A semantic network showing connections between "car" and pollution 113
- 5.6 A summary of processes needed to solve the analogy: hot : cold :: dry : ? 118
- 5.7 Relational mappings used to understand effects of those relations in a target domain 119
- 5.8 Similarity space: Classes of similarity based on the kinds of predicates shared. (From Gentner, 1989, p. 207. Reproduced by permission of the publishers) 124
- 5.9 An architecture for analogical processing (adapted from Gentner, 1989, p. 216) 128
- 6.1 Accessing and adapting a source problem to solve a target 136
- 6.2 The relation between a problem and its solution involving an implicit schema 138
- 6.3 Implicit schema cued by accessing source and used to solve target 139
- 6.4 Effects of the analogy between batteries and water reservoirs 143
- 6.5 Batteries and resistors arranged in series and in parallel 143
- 6.6 Near and far analogies and their likely effect on understanding 147
- 6.7 Hawking's analogy of the universe with the earth (adapted from Hawking, 1988, p. 138) 148
- 7.1 Is a category of problems best explained by presenting a number of close variants or a range of examples including distant variants? 154
- 7.2 A hierarchy of Rate problems 160
- 7.3 Applying the source to Target 4 involves two levels of the hierarchy 162

7.4	Intermediate bridging representations	167
7.5	A bridging analogy or intermediate representation (B') helps the analogiser to make the leap from a concept (A) to a concrete example (B)	167
8.1	The example-analogy view of schema induction. Using an ill-understood example to solve an ill-understood problem leads to the partial formation of a problem schema	180
8.2	The process of solving a problem using an example or analogy generates a schema for the problem type. When faced with a later problem of the same type, a solver will either access the schema or an earlier example (or both)	180
8.3	Repeated exposure to examples means that the schema becomes increasingly decontextualised	181
8.4	A problem model as a homomorphism	186
8.5	The architecture of ACT-R (Anderson, 1993)	191
8.6	The analogy mechanism in ACT-R	193
8.7	Mapping correspondences between the example and the current goal	194
8.8	The Power Law of Learning: (a) represents a hypothetical practice curve and (b) is the same curve represented as a logarithmic scale	195
9.1	Dimensions in which one can understand or study expertise	203
9.2	Raufaste and co-workers' (1999) reinterpretation of the intermediate effect	209
9.3	Examples of problem diagrams used in Chi and co-workers' studies (adapted from Chi et al., 1981)	215
9.4	The Hayes-Flower model of composition (based on Hayes, 1989; Hayes & Flower, 1980)	220
9.5	Structure of the knowledge-telling model (adapted from Bereiter & Scardamalia, 1987)	223
9.6	Structure of the knowledge-transforming model (adapted from Bereiter & Scardamalia, 1987)	224
10.1	External and internal factors affecting problem solving and learning	233

Tables

2.1	Average number of moves in each part of the Hobbits and Orcs task	43
3.1	The Monster problem	73
4.1	Conditions in the text editing experiments of Singley and Anderson	95
5.1	"Creative" uses of analogy	106
5.2	Surface and structural features of problems	110
5.3	Mapping similar objects	112
5.4	Attribute mapping	114
5.5	Attribute mappings with variables replacing specific values	115
6.1	Correspondences between two convergence problems and their schema	134
6.2	Mappings between the surface features (objects) in the Fortress and Radiation problems	135
6.3	Study-test relations in Ross (1987)	141
6.4	Mappings between the source domains of water and crowds and the target domain of electricity	143
6.5	Different ways new concepts were presented in Donnelly and McDaniel (1993)	144

xiv ILLUSTRATIONS

- 6.6 Examples of texts with and without an analogy (from Giora, 1993) 145
- 7.1 Close and distant variants of different problem types 155
- 7.2 Examples of rate \times time problems 163
- 7.3 The benefits of an explanatory schema and of diagrams 170
- 8.1 Schema representation of the problem 190
- 8.2 Information presented in evaluation and generation tasks in McKendree and Anderson (1987) 196
- 9.1 *Protocol excerpts from an expert, showing early schema invocation, tuning, and flexibility* 213