

Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1.1. Preamble	1
1.2. A Less-Trod Path:	
<i>The Text Itself as Evidence for Missionary Theology</i>	1
1.2.1. <i>Unity and Diversity: The Supper Narratives and the Synoptic Question</i>	3
1.2.2. <i>Reconstructing Ritual: The Problem With Texts (1): A Sense of Proportion</i>	5
1.2.3. <i>Reconstructing Ritual: The Problem With Texts (2): Unity & Diversity</i>	6
1.3. New Testament Scholarship: Methodological Issues	7
1.3.1. The “History of Religion” Approach: Culture and Ideology	7
1.3.2. Ideological Assumptions (1): The Context of the New Testament	10
1.3.3. Ideological Assumptions (2): Interpreting Contexts	14
1.3.4. Studying without “Orthodoxy”:	
Family Resemblances & Re-accentuation	16
1.3.4.1. <i>“Orthodoxy”</i>	16
1.3.4.2. <i>“Family Resemblances”</i>	17
1.3.4.3. <i>“Mapping” Family Resemblances</i>	18
1.3.4.4. <i>“Mapping” and Generalisations</i>	18
1.3.4.5. <i>Family Resemblances and Genealogy</i>	19
1.3.4.6. <i>Mapping without Genealogy: “Re-accentuation”</i>	20
1.3.4.7. <i>Mapping without “Genealogy”:</i> Bricolage	20
1.3.5. Form Criticism & the Criterion of Dissimilarity	21
1.3.6. Redaction Criticism and the Relationship between Texts	23
1.3.7. Methodological Issues: A Summary	24
1.4. The Shape of This Thesis	24
1.4.1. Chapter 2: What is “Inculturation”?	25
1.4.2. Analysing the Context of the Supper Narratives	25
1.4.2.1. <i>Chapter 3: Meal Traditions in the New Testament Period</i>	26
1.4.2.2. <i>Chapter 4: Body, Blood, Sacrifice and Communion</i>	27
1.4.2.3. <i>Chapter 5: Eschatology in the New Testament Period</i>	28
1.4.3. Recapitulation	28
1.4.4. Detailed Analysis of the Supper Narratives	28
1.4.4.1. <i>Chapter 6: Meal Traditions and the Supper Narratives</i>	28
1.4.4.2. <i>Chapter 7: Sayings and the Supper Narratives</i>	28

3.4.3.3. <i>One Meal or Two?</i>	95
3.4.3.4. <i>Did. and the New Testament</i>	96
3.4.5. Feeding Miracles	97
3.4.6. Symbolic Prototypes	97
3.4.7. Early Christian Meals: A Summary	97
3.5. Concluding Remarks	98
Chapter 4: Body, Blood, Sacrifice & Communion	99
4.1. Introduction	99
4.2. Sacrifice: Jewish Understandings	100
4.2.1. Kinship & Political Sacrifices	100
4.2.2. <i>Selamim</i> (Communion Meals) & ‘<i>Olah</i> (Burnt Offerings)	101
4.2.3. In Imitation of God: Sacrifice & Purity	102
4.2.4. The Atonement	103
4.2.4.1. <i>The Scapegoat as Sacrifice</i>	103
4.2.4.2 <i>Yom Kippur in the Qumran/Essene Nexus</i>	105
4.2.5. The Mechanics of Atonement	105
4.2.5.1. <i>Expiation and Propitiation: The Right Terms?</i>	105
4.2.5.2. <i>Atonement as “Renewal”</i>	106
4.2.5.3. <i>Atonement: Repairing the Covenant</i>	107
4.2.5.4 <i>Repairing the Covenant: The Temple & Blood</i>	107
4.2.5.5. <i>Blood as Detergent</i>	107
4.2.6. Beyond the Temple: Covenantal Purity in the Second Temple Period	109
4.2.6.1. <i>” Replacing” the Temple: Pharisaism</i>	110
4.2.6.2. <i>Beyond the Temple: the Qumran/Essene Nexus</i>	110
4.2.6.3. <i>Beyond the Temple: The Deaths of the Martyrs</i>	111
4.2.7. Anamnesis: Sacrifice as “Remembering”	112
4.2.8. Sacrifice and Sacramentals	113
4.2.8.1. <i>Spiritual Food</i>	113
4.2.8.2. <i>Is Spiritual Food Sacramental?</i>	114
4.2.8.3. <i>Sacramentals, not Sacraments</i>	114
4.2.9. Sacrifice, “Spiritualisation” and “Sacrificialisation”	115
4.2.10. Jewish Understandings of Sacrifice: A Summary	116
4.3. Sacrifice: Graeco-Roman Understandings	117
4.3.1. Sacrifice and Holocaust	119
4.3.2. The Purposes of Sacrifice	120
4.3.3. Sacrifice as Communion	121
4.3.4. Sacrifice and the Mystery Religions	122

4.3.4.1. <i>The Mysteries: Sarapis/Osiris/Isis</i>	122
4.3.4.2. <i>The Mysteries: Eleusis</i>	123
4.3.4.3. <i>The Mysteries: Dionysus/Bacchus</i>	124
4.3.4.4. <i>The Mysteries: Mithras</i>	126
4.3.4.5. <i>The Mysteries: Cybele</i>	126
4.3.4.6. <i>The Mysteries: Orphism</i>	127
4.3.5. The Mysteries: Sacramental Rites	128
4.3.6. The Greek “Scapegoat”	129
4.3.7. Meals for the Dead	130
4.3.8. Magic	130
4.3.9. A Summary of Graeco-Roman Sacrifice	133
4.4. <i>Christian Understandings of Sacrifice</i>	133
4.4.1. The “Sin Offering”	134
4.4.2. The Passover Sacrifice	134
4.4.3. The Letter to the Hebrews	135
4.4.3.1. <i>The Atonement</i>	135
4.4.3.2. <i>Melchizedek</i>	137
4.4.4. The Use of Blood	138
4.4.5. Manna	139
4.4.6. Sacramentals and John	140
4.4.7. Sacramentalism in Paul	142
4.4.8. A Christian Meal for the Dead	143
4.4.9. <i>Anamnesis</i>	143
4.4.10. Idolatry	144
4.4.11. The <i>Didache</i>: Sacrifice and “Sacrificialisation”	145
4.4.12. The <i>Didache</i> and Eschatology	146
4.4.13. Sacrifice and Related Terms in Early Christianity: A Summary	147
4.5. Conclusion	147
Chapter 5: Eschatology in the New Testament World	149
5.1 Introduction	149
5.2 Judaic Eschatology	150
5.2.1. National and Individual Hopes	150
5.2.2. The Presence of God	151
5.2.3. God and Messiah	151
5.2.4. “Life after Death”	152
5.2.5. National and Individual Hopes in the First Century CE	152
5.2.6. Eschatology: Prophecy & Apocalyptic	154

5.2.7. The Heavenly Feast	155
5.2.8. Manna	156
5.2.9. The Messianic Banquet	156
5.2.10. Eating with the Messiah: The Qumran/Essene Meal	157
5.2.11. Philo and Rabbinic Tradition	158
5.2.12. Judaic Eschatology: Concluding Remarks	159
5.3. <i>Graeco-Roman Eschatology</i>	159
5.3.1. Immortality	160
5.3.2. The Place of the Dead	160
5.3.3. Death and the Mysteries	161
5.3.3.1. <i>Eleusis</i>	162
5.3.3.2. <i>Tammuz-Attis-Adonis</i>	163
5.3.3.3. <i>Osiris</i>	164
5.3.3.4. <i>Mithras</i>	165
5.3.4. Death and the Philosophers	165
5.3.4.1. <i>Body, Soul and Death</i>	166
5.3.4.2. <i>Death and Ethics</i>	166
5.3.4.3. <i>Death and Metaphysics</i>	167
5.3.4.4. <i>Stoic Views of Death</i>	168
5.3.4.5. <i>Epicurean Views of Death</i>	171
5.3.5. Death and the Individual	172
5.3.6. Cults of the Dead	174
5.3.7. A Messianic Figure	176
5.3.8. Life after Death: A Summary	176
5.4. <i>Early Christian Eschatology</i>	177
5.4.1. Resurrection	177
5.4.2. The Kingdom of God	178
5.4.3. When Will the Kingdom Come?	178
5.4.4. “Thorough-going Eschatology”	179
5.4.5. Realised Eschatology	180
5.4.6. The Kingdom: “Now” and “Not Yet”	181
5.4.7. The Heavenly Meal	182
5.4.8. Miracles and the Heavenly Meal	182
5.4.9. Parables and the Heavenly Meal	184
5.4.10. Parables and the Ethics of the Heavenly Meal	184
5.4.11. Ethics, Eschatology and the Meal in the <i>Didache</i>	185
5.4.12. The Christian Meal in Heaven: A Summary	186
5.5. <i>Conclusions</i>	186
Recapitulation	189

Chapter 6: Actions, Gestures & the Supper Narratives	193
6.1 Introduction	193
6.2. “This Tradition...”	194
6.2.1. Terminology	194
6.2.2. Transmission of Tradition in Graeco-Roman “Schools”	195
6.2.3. Transmission in the Mystery Religions	195
6.2.4. Transmission and Paul	197
<i>6.2.4.1. Direct and Remote Transmission</i>	197
<i>6.2.4.2. Transmission in 1 Corinthians</i>	198
<i>6.2.4.3. Paul, Direct Transmission and Ἀποκάλυψις</i>	199
<i>6.2.4.4. The Case for Remote Transmission in 1 Corinthians 11</i>	200
6.3. The Date of The Meal	201
6.3.1. The Problem: The Variety of Dates in the Supper Narratives	201
6.3.2. The Calendars of Second Temple Judaism	202
6.3.3. Jaubert: A Synthesis of Calendars	203
6.3.4. Witherington and an “Illegal” Passover	204
6.3.5. O’Neill: Resolution of the Synoptic & Johannine Texts by Translation	204
6.3.6. Fitzmyer: A Passover Meal in 1 Corinthians?	206
6.3.7. Conclusion: No Firm Passover Date	207
6.4. The Location of the Meal	208
6.4.1. Capper: An Essene Connection?	208
6.4.2. The Upper Room	209
6.4.3. Essenes & Feast Days	210
6.4.4. An Essene Meal? The Need for Further Evidence	210
6.5. The Meal Setting	212
6.5.1. The Timing of The Meal	212
6.5.2. Posture: Lying Down to Eat	212
6.5.3. Jeremias: Reclining and the Passover Meal	213
6.5.4. Criticism of Jeremias’ Claim	213
6.5.5. Conclusion: No Necessary Connection of Passover and Reclining	214
6.6. Actions with the Bread	214
6.6.1. The Cup Event: The Textual Accounts	214
6.6.2. What Kind of Bread?	214
6.6.3. Bread: A Sacrificial Food?	216
6.6.4. “One” Bread	216

6.6.5. Actions with the Bread: A Series of Events	217
6.6.5.1. <i>The Sequence of Actions and the Feeding Miracles</i>	218
6.6.5.2. <i>The Sequence of Actions and the Qumran/Essene Nexus</i>	218
6.6.6. The Significance of “Blessing/Thanksgiving”	219
6.6.7. The Significance of “Breaking”	220
6.6.8. The Role of Jesus	221
6.6.9. The Significance of “Sharing”	222
6.7. Actions with the Cup	222
6.7.1. The Cup Event: Textual Accounts	222
6.7.2. The Lukan Version: A Textual Problem	223
6.7.3. The Cup(s) and the Passover	225
6.7.4. Sharing One Cup	226
6.7.5. Δεῖπνον in 1 Corinthians	227
6.7.6. A Full Meal or a Token Meal?	227
6.8. Conclusions	228
6.8.1. Judaic Resemblances	228
6.8.2. Graeco-Roman Resemblances	230
6.8.3. Early Christian Resemblances	231
6.8.4. An Unconsidered Action	233
Chapter 7: Sayings & the Supper Narratives	235
7.1. Introduction	235
7.2. The Bread/Body Sayings	236
7.2.1. “Body/Blood/Covenant”: Different Emphases	236
7.2.2. “Body/Blood” and Cultus	237
7.2.3. The Meaning of ἔστιν	239
7.2.3.1. <i>“Eating People is Wrong”</i>	241
7.2.4. Anamnesis	242
7.2.5. A Hellenistic Memorial Meal?	243
7.2.6. Hebraic Patterns of Memorial	244
7.2.7. Inculturation and the Body Sayings	245
7.3. The Cup/Blood Sayings	245
7.3.1. For Want of A Name	246
7.3.2. Cup/Wine Metonymy	247
7.3.3. Possible Sources for the Practice of “Drinking Blood”	248
7.3.3.1. <i>“Drinking Blood”: A Universal Taboo?</i>	248
7.3.3.2. <i>How Did Drinking Blood become Acceptable Practice in Judaic Tradition?</i>	249

7.3.3.3. "Drinking Blood": A Borrowing from the Mystery Religions?	249
7.3.3.4. Scurlock: Dionysiac Practice in Judaism	250
7.3.3.5. Evidence for Dionysiac Practice in Palestine	251
7.3.3.6. "Drinking Blood" in Judaism: A Fragment of Evidence	252
7.3.3.7. Blood As Symbol In The Old Testament	253
7.3.3.8. "Drinking Blood": An Eschatological Motif in the Old Testament	253
7.3.3.9. 2 Samuel 23:17 and I Chronicles 11:19: A Davidic Precedent for "Drinking Blood"?	253
7.3.3.10. 1 Samuel 21:2-7: Davidic Precedent For "Illicit" Practice	254
7.3.3.11. 1 Samuel 21:2-7: Associations with Melchizedek	255
7.3.3.12. "Licit" Precedent in the Jewish Cult	256
7.3.3.13. Imitatio Dei: The Role of the Disciple	257
7.3.3.14. Conclusions	257
7.3.4. "Drinking Blood": The Date of the Controversy	258
7.3.5. Literalism and Symbolism	260
7.3.6. What Does Blood "Mean"?	262
7.3.6.1. Blood and Covenant	263
7.3.6.2. "In my blood": Blood as Agent of the Covenant	264
7.3.6.3. "On Behalf Of" Whom?	265
7.3.7. Inculturation in the Cup/Blood Sayings	267
7.4. Sayings About The Cup & The Kingdom	268
7.4.1. The Provenance of the Sayings	268
7.4.2. "The Fruit of the Vine"	270
7.4.3. Did Jesus Drink the Cup?	270
7.4.4. The Cup and the Kingdom	271
7.4.4.1. The Cup: A Fulfilment of the Kingdom?	271
7.4.4.2. Criticism of the Fulfilment Theory	272
7.4.4.3. The Cup and the Coming of Jesus	272
7.4.4.4. Communion and Future Consummation	272
7.4.5. The Lukan Description of the Kingdom	273
7.4.6. Inculturation and the Kingdom Sayings	273
7.5. Lukan Sayings About Service 1- Ranking	274
7.5.1. The Sayings: Echoes of the Essenes	274
7.5.2. The "Ransom" Logion	274
7.5.3. Table-Talk and The Symposium	275
7.5.4. Benefactors	276
7.5.5. Summary	276
7.6. Lukan Sayings About Service 2- Revising Lifestyle	277
7.6.1. A Comparison with Lk. 10:4	277

7.7. Sayings About “Betrayal”	278
7.7.1. Danielou: A Reference to Qumran/Essene Practice?	279
7.7.2. The Common Dish: Criticism of the Qumran /Essene Proposal	279
7.7.3. Capper: An Economic Motive for Betrayal?	279
7.7.4. Betrayed by Whom?: The Role of Peter	280
7.7.5. The Betrayal of Jesus	280
7.7.6. Conclusion	281
7.8. Sayings at the Supper: Conclusions	281
7.8.1. Inculturation: Judaic Contexts	282
7.8.2. Inculturation: Graeco-Roman Contexts	284
7.8.3. Inculturation: Early Christian Contexts	287
7.8.4. Methodological Considerations	288
Chapter 8: The Pauline “Lord’s Supper”	289
8.1. The “Lord’s Supper” in 1 Cor. 11	289
8.2. Phase 1- Setting the Scene: Divisions and Bad Habits	289
8.2.1. Economics and Status	292
8.2.2. Status: Eating Wheat Bread	294
8.3. Phase 2- The Corinthian Meal & Jesus’ Precedent	294
8.3.1. ἴδιον - Whose Meal?	295
8.3.1.1. ἴδιον and Κυριακόν	295
8.3.1.2. Community and Household	295
8.3.1.3. ἴδιον and Κοινά	296
8.3.2. Δεῖπνον :The Meal in Corinth	296
8.3.3. Pauline Reform: A Token Meal	296
8.3.4. A Token Meal: Back to Basics	297
8.3.5. Paul’s Reform: A Note on the Use of Culture in Theology	298
8.4. Phase 3 - Paul’s Interpretation of The Meal	299
8.4.1. “Proclaiming the Lord’s Death”	300
8.4.2. “ Discerning the Body”	301
8.4.2.1. The Body as “Community”	301
8.4.2.2. Christological Implications of the “Body”	303
8.4.2.3. The Mysteries: A Source for Christological Meaning?	304
8.4.2.4. Maccoby and the Mystery Religions	304
8.4.2.5. “Sacramentals”: A Source for Christological Meaning?	305
8.4.2.6. “Sacramentals” and Κοινωνία	306
8.4.2.7. “Sacramentals” and “Extension of Personality”	307

<i>8.4.2.8. The Pauline “Body”: A Development of Judaic Thought</i>	308
8.5. The Consequences of Eating the Pauline Supper	309
8.5.1. Discerning the Body	309
8.5.2. Eating, Judgement, Magic and Mysteries	310
8.5.3. Eating, Judgement and “Sacramentals”	311
<i>8.5.3.1. Destruction</i>	312
<i>8.5.3.2. Judgement</i>	312
8.6. Conclusions	314
Chapter 9: Summary of Findings	317
9.1. Inculturation in the Supper Narratives- Yes!	317
9.2. The Supper Narratives and Judaic Elements	320
9.2.1. The Supper Narratives & the Passover	320
9.2.2. The Supper Narratives & The Temple Cult	320
9.2.3. The Supper Narratives & the Qumran/Essene Nexus	322
9.2.4. Sacramentalism	322
9.2.5. Final Evaluation of the Contribution of Judaic Practice to the Supper Narratives	323
9.3. The Supper Narratives and Graeco-Roman Elements	323
9.3.1. Ranking	324
9.3.2. Cult Meals	324
9.3.3. The Symposium Literary Tradition	324
9.3.4. The Supper Narratives & the Mysteries	325
9.3.5. The Supper Narratives & Hellenistic “Meals for the Dead”	325
9.3.6. The Supper Narratives and Magic	325
9.3.7. Antiquitas	326
9.3.8. Final Evaluation of the Contribution of Graeco-Roman Practice to the Supper Narratives	326
9.4. Early Christian Practice and the Supper Narratives	327
9.4.1. Sacrificial and Sacramental Significance	327
9.4.2. Eschatology	328
9.5. Overview	328
9.6. Does the Fact that Jewish Motifs are Prominent Damage The Case for “Inculturation”?	328

9.7. <i>Implications Of These Findings</i>	330
9.7.1. More than a Passover	330
9.7.2. Natural Theology	330
Bibliography	333
Index of Ancient Sources Cited	379
Index of Modern Authors Cited	389