

# Contents

## Part I: Clearance of Civil Aircraft

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b> .....	<b>3</b>
	Anders Hansson, Andreas Varga	
1.1	Background .....	3
1.2	The COFCLUO Project .....	7
1.3	Outline of the Book .....	8
	References .....	9
<b>2</b>	<b>Clearance Benchmark for a Civil Aircraft</b> .....	<b>11</b>
	Guilhem Puyou, Yannick Losser	
2.1	Introduction .....	11
2.1.1	Nonlinear Benchmark .....	12
2.1.2	Integral Benchmark .....	12
2.2	Description of Flight Control Laws .....	13
2.2.1	Flight Control Laws Philosophy .....	14
2.2.2	Longitudinal Axis .....	15
2.2.3	Lateral Axis .....	16
2.3	The Nonlinear Benchmark Model .....	17
2.3.1	Flight Envelopes .....	17
2.3.2	Pilot Inputs and Pilot Model .....	18
2.3.3	Actuators and Sensors .....	19
2.3.4	Flight Mechanics .....	19
2.3.5	Control Laws .....	22
2.4	Clearance Criteria for the Nonlinear Benchmark .....	23
2.4.1	Un-piloted Aircraft Stability .....	23
2.4.2	Manoeuvrability Requirements for the Longitudinal Axis .....	25
2.4.3	Flight Domain Protection .....	26
2.5	The Integral Benchmark Model .....	27
2.5.1	Flexible Aircraft Model .....	28

2.5.2	Mass Configurations and Flight Points .....	29
2.6	Clearance Criteria for the Integral Benchmark .....	30
2.6.1	Aeroelastic Stability .....	30
2.6.2	Stability Margins .....	31
2.6.3	Comfort with Respect to Turbulence .....	31
2.7	Current AIRBUS Practices .....	32
2.7.1	Validation Methods .....	32
2.7.2	Validation Means .....	34
2.7.3	Validation Coverage .....	35
2.8	AIRBUS Expectations .....	36
	References .....	36

## Part II: Generation of Linear Uncertain Models

<b>3</b>	<b>Generation of LPV Models and LFRs for a Nonlinear Aircraft Model .....</b>	<b>39</b>
	Simon Hecker, Harald Pfifer	
3.1	Introduction .....	39
3.2	Basic Procedure for the Generation of LPV Models .....	41
3.2.1	Specification of Known Relations .....	42
3.2.2	Element-Wise Significance Check .....	42
3.2.3	Multivariable Polynomial Fitting .....	43
3.2.4	Full Rank Basis Reduction .....	45
3.3	Optimisation of the Linear Parameter Varying Model .....	46
3.3.1	Optimisation with $\nu$ -Gap Metric Constraint .....	47
3.3.2	Optimisation of the Polynomial Coefficients .....	47
3.4	Application to the COFLCUO Nonlinear Aircraft Model ..	48
3.4.1	The Aircraft Model .....	48
3.4.2	Trimming and Linearisation .....	49
3.4.3	Generation of an LFR for the Actuator Model and the Sensor Model .....	51
3.4.4	Generation of LPV Models and LFRs for the Flight Dynamics Model .....	52
3.4.5	Validation of the LPV Models and LFRs of the Flight Dynamics Model .....	54
3.5	Conclusion .....	56
	References .....	56
<b>4</b>	<b>Generation of LFRs for a Flexible Aircraft Model .....</b>	<b>59</b>
	Clément Roos	
4.1	Introduction .....	59
4.2	Problem Statement .....	60
4.2.1	Description of the Reference Models .....	60
4.2.2	LFT Modelling Objective .....	61
4.2.3	Challenging Issues .....	62

4.3	Description of the Method . . . . .	62
4.3.1	Generation of Reduced and Consistent Models . . . . .	63
4.3.2	Polynomial Interpolation and LFT Modelling . . . . .	66
4.3.3	Special Case of a Coarse Grid . . . . .	67
4.3.4	Low Order LFR Generation Procedure . . . . .	68
4.4	Numerical Results . . . . .	69
4.4.1	Construction of the LFR . . . . .	70
4.4.2	Validation on the Grid . . . . .	72
4.4.3	Validation on the Whole Continuous Domain . . . . .	72
4.4.4	Evaluation of the Low Order LFR Generation Procedure . . . . .	75
4.5	Conclusion . . . . .	76
	References . . . . .	77
<b>5</b>	<b>Generation of LFRs for a Nonlinear Controller and Closed-Loop Aircraft Models . . . . .</b>	<b>79</b>
	Carsten Döll, Fabien Lescher, Clément Roos	
5.1	Introduction . . . . .	79
5.2	Description of the Nonlinear Controller . . . . .	80
5.3	Generation of the Controller LFRs . . . . .	84
5.3.1	LFRs for Parameter Varying Gains . . . . .	85
5.3.2	LFRs for Saturations and Rate Limiters . . . . .	87
5.3.3	LFRs for Nonlinear Input/Output Relations . . . . .	89
5.3.4	LFRs for the Overall Nonlinear Controller . . . . .	91
5.4	Generation of the Closed-Loop LFR . . . . .	96
5.4.1	Closed-Loop LFRs for the Nonlinear Model Performance Analysis . . . . .	96
5.4.2	Closed-Loop LFRs for the Nonlinear Model Stability Analysis . . . . .	99
5.4.3	Closed-Loop LFRs for the Flexible Model Stability and Performance Analysis . . . . .	100
5.5	Evaluation of the LFR Generation Process . . . . .	101
5.5.1	Evaluation of the LFR of the Nonlinear Controller . . . . .	101
5.5.2	Evaluation of the Closed-Loop LFR . . . . .	103
5.6	Conclusions . . . . .	107
	References . . . . .	108
<b>6</b>	<b>Identification of LPV State-Space Models Using <math>\mathcal{H}_2</math>-Minimisation . . . . .</b>	<b>111</b>
	Daniel Petersson, Johan Löfberg	
6.1	Introduction . . . . .	111
6.2	$\mathcal{H}_2$ -Minimisation . . . . .	113
6.2.1	Important Property of $\mathcal{H}_2$ -Minimisation . . . . .	114
6.2.2	Rewriting the $\mathcal{H}_2$ -Norm of the Error System . . . . .	115
6.3	Method 1: General Nonlinear Optimisation . . . . .	116

6.3.1	Evaluation of the Cost Function .....	116
6.3.2	Evaluation of the Gradient .....	118
6.4	Method 2: Semidefinite Programming .....	120
6.5	Regularisation of the Optimisation Problem .....	122
6.6	Examples .....	123
6.6.1	Academic Example .....	123
6.6.2	Application Example .....	126
6.7	Conclusions .....	127
	References .....	128
 <b>Part III: Analysis Techniques and Tools</b>		
<b>7</b>	<b>Enhanced <math>\mu</math>-Analysis Techniques for Clearance .....</b>	<b>131</b>
	Jean-Marc Biannic, Clément Roos	
7.1	Introduction .....	131
7.2	Problem Statement and Preliminary Results .....	132
7.2.1	Introduction to $\mu$ -Analysis .....	132
7.2.2	Validity of the Scaling Matrices .....	134
7.3	Computation of a Guaranteed Robustness Margin .....	136
7.3.1	Standard Version of the Algorithm .....	136
7.3.2	Extension to Modal Performance Analysis .....	137
7.4	Computation of a Guaranteed Stability Domain .....	138
7.4.1	Standard Version of the Algorithm .....	138
7.4.2	Computation of the $\mu$ -Sensitivities .....	140
7.4.3	Other Algorithmic Variants .....	140
7.5	Connection with Clearance of Flight Control Laws .....	141
7.5.1	Eigenvalue Criterion .....	141
7.5.2	Stability Margin Criterion .....	142
7.6	Conclusion .....	145
	References .....	146
<b>8</b>	<b>Worst-Case Parameter Search Based Clearance Using Parallel Nonlinear Programming Methods .....</b>	<b>149</b>
	Hans-Dieter Joos	
8.1	Introduction .....	149
8.2	Theoretical Basis .....	150
8.2.1	Formulation as Global Optimisation Problem .....	150
8.2.2	Level of Confidence .....	151
8.2.3	Clearance Strategy .....	151
8.2.4	Transformation of Parameter Space .....	152
8.3	Applied Optimisation Methods .....	153
8.4	Parallel Computation .....	155
8.5	Conclusions .....	157
	References .....	158

<b>9</b>	<b>Lyapunov-Based Robustness Analysis Techniques for Clearance</b> .....	161
	Andrea Garulli, Alfio Masi, Simone Paoletti, Ercüment Türkoğlu	
9.1	Introduction .....	161
9.2	Robustness Analysis Using Lyapunov Functions .....	163
9.2.1	Problem Statement in LFR Framework .....	163
9.2.2	Wang-Balakrishnan Relaxations .....	164
9.2.3	Fu-Dasgupta Relaxations .....	165
9.2.4	Dettori-Scherer Relaxations .....	167
9.2.5	Special Case: Affine Parameter-Dependent Systems .....	168
9.3	Clearance of Flight Control Schemes .....	169
9.3.1	Aeroelastic Stability Criterion .....	169
9.3.2	Un-piloted Stability Criterion.....	170
9.3.3	Partitioning of the Uncertainty Domain .....	171
9.3.4	Gridding.....	171
9.3.5	A Graphical User Interface for Robust Stability Clearance Problems .....	172
9.4	Numerical Example.....	173
9.5	Conclusions .....	177
	References .....	177
<b>10</b>	<b>IQC-Based Analysis Techniques for Clearance</b> .....	179
	Christos Papageorgiou, Rikard Falkeborn, Anders Hansson	
10.1	Introduction .....	179
10.2	Analysis of Robust Stability and Robust Performance Using IQCs .....	180
10.2.1	Parametrized and Multiple IQCs .....	182
10.2.2	Verifying the Robust Stability Condition .....	184
10.3	Stability Margins Clearance with IQCs.....	185
10.3.1	Specifying Nichols Exclusion Regions .....	185
10.3.2	Lower Bound Calculation .....	188
10.3.3	Formulation of the Perturbed Stability Margin Problem .....	190
10.4	Formulation of the Comfort Clearance Criterion Using IQCs.....	192
10.4.1	State-Space Formulation of the Comfort Criterion.....	192
10.4.2	Robust $\mathcal{H}_2$ Performance Analysis Using IQCs.....	193
10.5	Preliminary Steps of the Analysis Algorithms .....	198
10.6	Conclusion .....	200
	References .....	200

**11 Nonlinear Programming Methods for Worst-Case Pilot Input Determination** . . . . . 203  
 Daniel Skoogh, Fredrik Berefelt

11.1 Introduction . . . . . 203

11.2 Optimisation-Based Search of Worst-Case Pilot Inputs . . . . . 205

11.2.1 Definition of Clearance Criteria . . . . . 205

11.2.2 Parametrization of Pilot Signals . . . . . 205

11.2.3 Definition of Optimisation Problem . . . . . 205

11.3 Local Optimisation Methods . . . . . 207

11.3.1 Pattern Search . . . . . 207

11.3.2 Cyclic Coordinate Descent Method . . . . . 208

11.3.3 Quasi-Newton Method . . . . . 209

11.4 Global Optimisation Methods . . . . . 210

11.4.1 Genetic Algorithms . . . . . 210

11.4.2 Differential Evolution . . . . . 212

11.4.3 Evolution Strategies . . . . . 213

11.4.4 Dividing Rectangles Method . . . . . 214

11.5 Conclusions . . . . . 215

References . . . . . 216

**Part IV: Analysis Results**

**12 Application of  $\mu$ -Analysis Techniques to Clearance** . . . . . 221  
 Clément Roos, Jean-Marc Biannic

12.1 Introduction . . . . . 221

12.2 Analysis of the Eigenvalue Criterion . . . . . 222

12.2.1 Direct Application of the Analysis Method and Variations . . . . . 222

12.2.2 Influence of the Shape of the Initial Domain . . . . . 224

12.2.3 Evaluation of Conservatism . . . . . 226

12.2.4 Stability with Respect to the Boundary of a Truncated Sector . . . . . 227

12.2.5 Application to Systems with Highly Repeated Parameters . . . . . 229

12.3 Analysis of the Stability Margin Criterion . . . . . 230

12.4 Conclusions and Future Perspectives . . . . . 231

Reference . . . . . 232

**13 Application of Parallel Nonlinear Programming Methods for Worst-Case Parameter Search** . . . . . 233  
 Hans-Dieter Joos

13.1 Introduction . . . . . 233

13.2 Simulation Based Clearance Criteria . . . . . 234

13.2.1 Low Speed Manoeuvrability Criterion . . . . . 234

13.2.2	Load Factor Protection: Longitudinal Manoeuvre .....	240
13.2.3	Load Factor Protection: Lateral Manoeuvre .....	244
13.3	Performance Comparison of Optimisation Methods .....	249
13.4	Computation Times .....	250
13.5	Summary .....	251
	References .....	252
<b>14</b>	<b>Applications of Lyapunov-Based Analysis Techniques for Clearance .....</b>	<b>253</b>
	Andrea Garulli, Alfio Masi, Simone Paoletti, Ercüment Türkoğlu	
14.1	Introduction .....	253
14.2	Results on Aeroelastic Stability Criterion .....	254
14.2.1	LFR Models for Aeroelastic Stability .....	254
14.2.2	Robustness Analysis by Progressive Tiling .....	256
14.2.3	Robustness Analysis by Adaptive Tiling .....	259
14.2.4	Discussion .....	261
14.3	Results on Un-piloted Stability Criterion .....	262
14.3.1	LFR Models for Un-piloted Stability .....	262
14.3.2	Robustness Analysis Results .....	263
14.4	Robustness Analysis of Affine Parameter-Dependent Models .....	272
14.5	Conclusions .....	273
	References .....	275
<b>15</b>	<b>Applications of IQC-Based Analysis Techniques for Clearance .....</b>	<b>277</b>
	Ragnar Wallin, Sina Khoshfetrat Pakazad, Anders Hansson, Andrea Garulli, Alfio Masi	
15.1	Introduction .....	277
15.2	Coping with Computational Complexity .....	279
15.2.1	Choice of IQCs .....	279
15.2.2	Partitioning of the Parameter Space .....	281
15.2.3	Model Reduction .....	281
15.3	Stability Analysis of the Nonlinear Rigid Aircraft Model .....	282
15.3.1	Analysis of Robust Linear Stability for Nominal Centre of Gravity Position .....	283
15.3.2	Analysis of Robust Nonlinear Stability .....	292
15.4	Loads and Comfort Criterion .....	293
15.4.1	Computational Times .....	294
15.4.2	Level of Conservatism .....	294
15.5	Conclusions and Future Research .....	296
	References .....	296

<b>16 Application of Nonlinear Programming Methods for Determination of Worst-Case Pilot Inputs</b> .....	299
Daniel Skoogh, Fredrik Berfelt	
16.1 Introduction .....	299
16.2 Application of Local Methods .....	300
16.2.1 The Quasi-Newton Method .....	301
16.2.2 Pattern Search .....	305
16.3 Application of Global Methods .....	306
16.3.1 Differential Evolution .....	307
16.3.2 Evolution Strategies .....	309
16.3.3 Genetic Algorithm .....	310
16.3.4 Dividing Rectangles .....	312
16.4 Conclusions .....	313
References .....	314

## Part V: Industrial Evaluation

<b>17 Evaluation of Clearance Techniques in an Industrial Context</b> .....	319
Guilhem Puyou, Rafael Fernandes de Oliveira, Adrien Berard	
17.1 Overview of Basic Methods .....	319
17.1.1 Enhanced $\mu$ -Analysis Techniques .....	319
17.1.2 Convex Relaxations .....	321
17.1.3 IQC-Based Analysis Techniques .....	322
17.1.4 Worst-Case Search-Based Methods .....	322
17.2 Methods, Criteria and Models .....	324
17.2.1 Techniques Mapping .....	324
17.2.2 LFR Review .....	324
17.3 Straightforward Applications of LFR Based Methods .....	330
17.3.1 Baseline Solution .....	330
17.3.2 Enhanced $\mu$ -Analysis Techniques .....	331
17.3.3 Convex Relaxations .....	333
17.3.4 IQC-Based Analysis Techniques .....	335
17.3.5 Discussion .....	336
17.4 Straightforward Applications of Worst-Case Search-Based Methods .....	337
17.4.1 Baseline Solution .....	338
17.4.2 Comparisons with the Baseline Solution .....	340
17.5 Industrial Application of Worst-Case Search-Based Methods .....	342
17.5.1 Coupling of Optimisation and Simulation Model .....	342
17.5.2 Benchmark: Worst-Case Pilot Input .....	343
17.5.3 Enhancements .....	347
17.5.4 Proposed Validation Workflow .....	354



17.6	Conclusion .....	356
	References .....	356
<b>18</b>	<b>Concluding Remarks and Industrial Perspective .....</b>	<b>359</b>
	Anders Hansson, Philippe Menard	
18.1	Summary of Achievements.....	359
18.2	Industrial Perspective .....	362
18.3	Future Research.....	362
18.3.1	Influence of Internal Controller Structure .....	362
18.3.2	Identification of Critical Parameter Domains .....	363
18.3.3	Low Computational Burden Challenge .....	363
18.3.4	Clearance of Systems with Failures .....	364
18.3.5	Human Pilot Modelling Challenge.....	364
18.3.6	Other Challenges .....	364
 <b>Part VI: Surveys on Flight Control Clearance</b>		
<b>19</b>	<b>Assessment of Aircraft Flight Controllers Using Nonlinear Robustness Analysis Techniques .....</b>	<b>369</b>
	Peter Seiler, Gary J. Balas, Andrew K. Packard	
19.1	Introduction .....	369
19.2	Sum of Squares Optimization .....	371
19.2.1	Background .....	371
19.2.2	Connections between SOS Polynomials and Semidefinite Matrices.....	372
19.2.3	Software for SOS Optimizations .....	373
19.3	Nonlinear Analysis Tools .....	374
19.3.1	Region of Attraction Estimation .....	375
19.3.2	Input-Output Gains .....	379
19.3.3	Reachable Sets .....	381
19.3.4	Summary of Approach.....	382
19.4	Examples .....	382
19.4.1	ROA Estimation for an F/A-18 .....	382
19.4.2	Reachable Set Estimation for NASA's GTM .....	389
19.5	Conclusion .....	393
	References .....	394
<b>20</b>	<b>Validation and Verification (V&amp;V) of Safety-Critical Systems Operating under Off-Nominal Conditions .....</b>	<b>399</b>
	Christine M. Belcastro	
20.1	Introduction: Motivation for Off-Nominal Conditions .....	399
20.1.1	Aircraft LOC .....	400
20.1.2	Future Advanced System Concept.....	403
20.2	V&V Problem .....	404
20.2.1	V&V Problem Complexity and Technical Challenges .....	405

20.2.2	V&V Process Requirements .....	407
20.2.3	Research Approach .....	411
20.3	V&V Process and Research Framework .....	411
20.4	V&V Research Status and Recent Accomplishments .....	417
20.5	Summary and Concluding Remarks .....	417
	References .....	418
<b>21</b>	<b>Clearance of Flight Control Laws for Carefree Handling of Advanced Fighter Aircraft .....</b>	<b>421</b>
	Robert Stich	
21.1	Introduction .....	421
21.2	Plant Description and Clearance Process .....	422
21.2.1	Aircraft Description .....	423
21.2.2	Control Laws Clearance Process .....	423
21.3	Carefree Handling .....	424
21.3.1	Carefree Handling Definition .....	425
21.3.2	Manoeuvres Category Definition .....	425
21.4	Assessment Model .....	426
21.4.1	Aircraft Model .....	426
21.4.2	Aircraft Configuration .....	427
21.4.3	Tolerance Concept .....	428
21.4.4	Assessment Tools .....	428
21.5	Assessment Methods .....	429
21.5.1	Trim Analysis .....	429
21.5.2	Linear Analysis .....	430
21.5.3	Nonlinear Simulation for Carefree Handling .....	433
21.5.4	Nonlinear Simulation for Dedicated Flight Test Manoeuvres .....	437
21.5.5	Manned Simulation .....	437
21.5.6	Flight Test .....	438
21.5.7	Post-flight Analysis for Aerodynamic Dataset Validation .....	441
21.6	Conclusion .....	441
	References .....	442
<b>A</b>	<b>Nomenclature .....</b>	<b>443</b>
<b>Index .....</b>		<b>447</b>