

Table of Contents

| | |
|---|----|
| Preface | 5 |
| Abbreviations..... | 13 |
| Introduction | 15 |
| 0.1. Origin and Purposes of the Research..... | 15 |
| 0.2. Definition of Direct Effect | 17 |
| 0.3. Legal Background | 18 |
| 0.4. Starting Point for the Analysis: The Effect of International Agreements in Domestic Legal Systems | 23 |
| 0.5. Direct effect of the EU Treaty | 25 |
| 0.6. The Challenging Procedure and the Direct Effect of WTO Agreements ... | 28 |
| 0.7. Structure of the Research | 30 |
| | |
| Part I: Empirical Analysis-Practices of the Member States | 33 |
| | |
| Chapter 1: Positions of the United States and the European Union..... | 35 |
| | |
| 1.1. The Laws and Practices in the United States..... | 35 |
| 1.1.1. The Domestic Legal Status of International Agreements in General | 35 |
| 1.1.1.1. Treaty and Executive Agreements | 36 |
| 1.1.1.2. Self-executing and the Hierarchy of the Norms..... | 37 |
| 1.1.1.3. International Agreements as Guidance for Interpreting Domestic Law | 39 |
| 1.1.1.4. Summary | 41 |
| 1.1.2. The Legal Status of the GATT 1947 in Domestic Law | 42 |
| 1.1.2.1. Provisions of the GATT 1947 as International Obligations under Domestic Law..... | 43 |
| a) The GATT 1947..... | 43 |
| b) Tokyo Round Agreements..... | 44 |
| 1.1.2.2. The Effect of the GATT..... | 45 |
| a) The GATT 1947..... | 45 |

| | | |
|----------|---|----|
| i. | GATT as A Non-self-executing Agreement | 45 |
| ii. | Relationship to Federal and State Law | 49 |
| b) | Tokyo Round Agreements..... | 51 |
| 1.1.3. | The Legal Status of the WTO Agreements in Domestic Law | 52 |
| 1.1.3.1. | Uruguay Round Implementing Legislation..... | 53 |
| a) | The Uruguay Round Agreements Act and the Statement of Administrative Action | 54 |
| i. | Relationship to Federal Law | 55 |
| ii. | Relationship to State Law | 55 |
| iii. | Implementation of DSB Rulings..... | 57 |
| b) | Sovereignty Concerns in the Legislation | 59 |
| i. | Excessive Constraints on Domestic Decision Making Power..... | 60 |
| ii. | Derogation of Federalism and Democracy | 63 |
| 1.1.3.2. | The Indirect Effect of the WTO Agreements..... | 65 |
| a) | Admissibility of the Cases..... | 66 |
| b) | Administrative Agencies' Discretion on Interpreting Ambiguous Statutes | 67 |
| 1.1.4. | Conclusion..... | 72 |
| 1.2. | The Laws and Practices in the European Union..... | 73 |
| 1.2.1. | The Legal Status of International Agreements in General..... | 74 |
| 1.2.1.1. | The Relationship to the Community Law | 75 |
| 1.2.1.2. | The Relationship to the Domestic Law of Members..... | 77 |
| 1.2.1.3. | Grounds for Direct Effect of International Agreements: Uniform Application and Protection for Individual Rights | 80 |
| 1.2.2. | The Legal Status of the GATT 1947 and the WTO Agreements..... | 83 |
| 1.2.2.1. | Participation of the Community in the GATT and the WTO | 83 |
| 1.2.2.2. | The Assessments of the ECJ on the Effect of the GATT/WTO Agreements | 86 |
| a) | Denial of Direct Effect of the GATT 1947..... | 86 |
| b) | Rules of the GATT 1947 as Guidelines for Interpreting and Applying Community Law | 88 |
| c) | Reconfirming the Rulings Concerning the GATT 1947 | 92 |
| d) | Further Developments on the Issue of Direct Effect – Legal Status of Dispute Settlement Body Decision and Indirect Effect of the WTO Agreements..... | 94 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 1.2.2.3. ECJ's Rationale Against Direct Effect of the WTO Agreements | 98 |
| a) Flexibility of the GATT/WTO Agreements | 99 |
| b) Principle of Reciprocity..... | 102 |
| c) Rationale behind the Scene: Discretion of Community's Political Organs | 106 |
| 1.2.3. Conclusion..... | 109 |
| 1.3. Conclusion: Implementation of the WTO Rules as Policy Issue..... | 109 |
| | |
| Chapter 2: Positions of China and Taiwan..... | 111 |
| 2.1. Laws and Practices in China | 111 |
| 2.1.1. Domestic Legal Status of International Agreements in General.... | 112 |
| 2.1.1.1. International Agreements as Part of Domestic Law..... | 112 |
| a) Acceptance of Treaties and International Agreements..... | 112 |
| b) Laws and Regulations Addressing the Effect of International Agreements | 113 |
| i. Laws and Regulations Recognizing Direct Effect of International Agreements..... | 114 |
| ii. Laws and Regulations Implementing the Rules of International Agreements | 116 |
| c) Judicial Interpretations of the Effect of International Agreements in Domestic Legal System..... | 117 |
| i. Interpretations and Rulings Recognizing Direct Effect of International Agreements..... | 118 |
| ii. Interpretations and Rulings Implying Refusal of Direct Effect | 121 |
| d) Preliminary Observations on the Practice of China... | 122 |
| 2.1.1.2. Relationship to Domestic Law | 125 |
| 2.1.2. The Legal Status of the WTO Agreements..... | 126 |
| 2.1.2.1. Accession Documents of China | 127 |
| 2.1.2.2. Laws, Regulations, and Courts' Interpretations Relevant to the Effect of the WTO Agreements: Divergent Views on the Direct Effect..... | 128 |
| 2.1.2.3. The Effect of WTO Agreements under the Current Legal Framework | 131 |
| a) Provisions Concerning the Relationship between Private Parties Tend to Be Directly Effective..... | 132 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| b) Provisions Governing the Measures of Governments Appear Not to Be Directly Effective..... | 134 |
| 2.1.2.4. Problems under the Current System and Possible Developments | 136 |
| 2.1.3. Conclusion..... | 140 |
| 2.2. Laws and Practices in Taiwan..... | 141 |
| 2.2.1. The General Domestic Legal Status of International Agreements..... | 142 |
| 2.2.1.1. International Agreements as Part of Domestic Law..... | 142 |
| a) The Rules of the Constitution..... | 142 |
| b) The Practices of the Legislative and Executive Branches..... | 144 |
| c) Cases Addressing the Effect of International Agreements..... | 147 |
| 2.2.1.2. Relationship to Domestic Laws | 151 |
| 2.2.2. The Legal Status of the WTO Agreements..... | 153 |
| 2.2.2.1. Ratifying the WTO Agreements and Laws Pertinent to the Effect of the WTO Agreements | 154 |
| a) Accession Documents of the Separate Customs Territory of Taiwan, Penghu, Kinmen, and Matsu and the Ratification of the Protocol of Accession | 154 |
| b) Foreign Trade Act and Regulation Governing the Implementation of the Imposition of Countervailing and Anti-Dumping Duties | 155 |
| 2.2.2.2. Cases Addressing the Effect of the WTO Agreements ... | 158 |
| a) The TRIPS Agreement..... | 158 |
| b) The Anti-Dumping Agreement and the Agreement on Government Procurement..... | 161 |
| 2.2.2.3. The Grounds for the Direct Effect of the WTO Agreements | 162 |
| 2.2.3. Conclusion..... | 165 |
| 2.3. Conclusion: Considerations for the Status of the WTO Agreements in the Domestic Legal System..... | 166 |
| Part II: An Analysis of the Grounds For and Against..... | 167 |
| Chapter 1: Major Arguments For and Against the Direct Effect of the WTO Agreements..... | 169 |
| 1.1. Arguments for the Direct Effect of the WTO Agreements..... | 169 |
| 1.1.1. Constitutionalization of International Economic Law..... | 170 |

| | | |
|---|--|-----|
| 1.1.1.1. | The Need for the Restraint on Discretion in Trade Policy | 171 |
| 1.1.1.2. | The Liberal International Trade Rules As Constitutional Constraints on the Discretion in Trade Policy | 172 |
| a) | Liberal International Trade Rules Can Have Constitutional Features..... | 172 |
| b) | Integrating Liberal International Trade Rules into Domestic Constitutional Systems..... | 173 |
| 1.1.2. | Arguments Based on the Political Economy and Ordnungspolitik (Economic Governance)..... | 175 |
| 1.2. | Arguments Against The Direct Effect of The WTO Agreements | 177 |
| 1.2.1. | Policy Analysis on the Direct Effect..... | 177 |
| 1.2.2. | Democratic Deficit of the WTO Agreements | 179 |
| 1.2.3. | The Inconsistencies with the Constitutional Principles | 184 |
| 1.3. | An Intermediate Position for the Direct Effect of the WTO Agreements | 185 |
| 1.3.1. | Intermediation through the Panel and Appellate Body Report | 186 |
| 1.3.2. | The Theory of Justiciability | 187 |
| 1.4. | Summary and Preliminary Observations..... | 189 |
| Chapter 2: Assessments on the Grounds For and Against | | 193 |
| 2.1. | Ground for the Direct Effect I: Rights of Individuals under the WTO agreements..... | 195 |
| 2.1.1. | Human Rights Dimension of the WTO Agreements | 195 |
| 2.1.2. | Assessment of the Relation between Human Rights and WTO Agreements..... | 197 |
| 2.1.2.1. | Conflicts as a Result of Different Perceptions of the Relationship among States, Individuals, and the Market.. | 199 |
| 2.1.2.2. | WTO Provisions Embodying the Protection for Human Rights | 202 |
| 2.2. | Ground for the Direct Effect II: the Effectiveness of the WTO Agreements | 208 |
| 2.3. | Grounds Against Direct Effect I: Allocation of Competence Between the WTO and the Member States | 209 |
| 2.3.1. | Transnational Nature of the Implementation of the WTO rules | 210 |
| 2.3.2. | Inadequate Intervention on the Implementation of the WTO rules | 211 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 2.4. Grounds Against Direct Effect II: Lack of Legitimacy in Terms of Democracy and Constitutional Principles | 213 |
| 2.5. Grounds Against the Direct Effect III: Practical Problems of Direct Effect | 214 |
| 2.6. Conclusion..... | 215 |
| Summary..... | 219 |
| References | 225 |