Contents

	Acknowledgements	xiii
	List of abbreviations	xv
	Table of reported cases	xvii
In	troduction	1
1	Judging law and ethics at the limits of life	11
	 1.1 Conflicts in the clinic: the case of David Glass 11 1.2 Judging law: rationality and the rule of law 14 1.2.1 Judging law from within 14 1.2.2 Criteria for rational law 16 1.2.3 Fuller and the rule of law 18 1.2.4 Taking stock: criteria for judging law 21 1.3 Judging ethics 22 1.3.1 Judging ethics from within (law): immanent critique 22 1.3.2 Judging ethics from outside (law): judgments, principles and theories 25 1.4 Conclusion: (not) just law 29 	
2	Law at the limits of life: children, welfare and best interests	33
	 2.1 Conflicts in the clinic: the case of Charlotte Wyatt 33 2.2 Best interests, welfare and the law 36 2.2.1 Criminal beginnings? 37 2.2.2 Civil proceedings? 39 2.3 Conclusion: in the child's best interests? 49 	

x Contents

Law at the limits of life: adults, incapacity and precedent autonomy	51
 3.1 Conflicts in the clinic: the case of Terri Schiavo 51 3.2 Best interests, incapacity and precedent autonomy 54 3.2.1 Best interests and the persistent vegetative state 55 3.2.2 Best interests beyond the persistent vegetative state 62 3.2.3 Advance directives 65 3.2.4 Lasting powers of attorney 71 3.3 Conclusion: autonomy or welfare? 72 	
The limits of law at the limits of life: to treat or not to treat?	75
 4.1 Conflicts in the clinic: to treat or not to treat? 75 4.2 Taking exception to exceptions: a duty to treat? 76 4.3 In the patient's best interests? 80 4.3.1 Treating like cases alike? 80 4.3.2 Objective rule(s)? 84 4.3.3 Know-ability and perform-ability? 85 4.4 Respecting autonomy? 90 4.5 Subjective judgments? From law to ethics at the limits of life 95 4.6 Conclusion: problems painting unicorns with Odysseus 101 	
Calculating the value of life at the limits of life	103
 5.1 Looking for values in English law 103 5.2 The value of life in English law 104 5.3 Calculating the value of life 109 5.3.1 The intrinsic value of life: the disutility of futility? 109 5.3.2 The instrumental value of life: worthless lives? 114 5.3 The self-determined value of life: autonomy unbound? 116 5.4 Subjective judgments or objective judgments? 120 5.5 Conclusion: beyond conflict? 122 	
A case for compromise at the limits of life 6.1 Beyond conflict in the clinic: towards compromise 123 6.2 Contemplating compromise 125 6.3 Criticising compromise 127 6.4 Cause to compromise: six reasons to compromise 132 6.5 Constructing compromise: three virtues of compromising 135	123
	 precedent autonomy 3.1 Conflicts in the clinic: the case of Terri Schiavo 51 3.2 Best interests, incapacity and precedent autonomy 54 3.2.1 Best interests and the persistent vegetative state 55 3.2.2 Best interests beyond the persistent vegetative state 62 3.2.3 Advance directives 65 3.2.4 Lasting powers of attorney 71 3.3 Conclusion: autonomy or welfare? 72 The limits of law at the limits of life: to treat or not to treat? 4.1 Conflicts in the clinic: to treat or not to treat? 75 4.2 Taking exception to exceptions: a duty to treat? 76 4.3 In the patient's best interests? 80 4.3.1 Treating like cases alike? 80 4.3.2 Objective rule(s)? 84 4.3.3 Know-ability and perform-ability? 85 4.4 Respecting autonomy? 90 4.5 Subjective judgments? From law to ethics at the limits of life 95 4.6 Conclusion: problems painting unicorns with Odysseus 101 Calculating the value of life at the limits of life 5.1 Looking for values in English law 103 5.2 The intrinsic value of life: worthless lives? 114 5.3.3 The self-determined value of life: worthless lives? 114 5.3.2 The intriment avalue of life: worthless lives? 114 5.3.3 The self-determined value of life: autonomy unbound? 116 5.4 Subjective judgments or objective judgments? 120 5.5 Conclusion: beyond conflict? 122 A case for compromise at the limits of life 6.1 Beyond conflict in the clinic: towards compromise 123 6.2 Contemplating compromise 127 6.4 Cause to compromise is ix reasons to compromise 132

7	Crafting compromise: courts or clinical ethics committees?	143
	7.1 Conflicts in the clinic revisited: to treat or not to treat? 143	
	7.2 Viewing values in the court 144	
	7.2.1 For the courts as vehicles of values 145	
	7.2.2 Against the courts as vehicles of values 146	
	7.2.3 Law and ethics in the courts and beyond 148	
	7.3 Viewing values in clinical ethics support 153	
	7.3.1 For the ethics support of clinical ethics support 153	
	7.3.2 Against the ethics support of clinical ethics support 159	
	7.4 Conclusion: compromise in court or clinical ethics committee? 163	
8	Committees, courts and compromise at the limits of life	165
	8.1 Reconstructing clinical ethics support 165	
	8.2 The products of clinical ethics consultation: issuing consistent guidance 166	
	8.3 The processes of clinical ethics consultation: observing	
	due process 168	
	8.4 Expertise in clinical ethics consultation: exhibiting	
	ethical expertise 172	
	8.5 Conclusion: clinical ethics committees, courts and compromise 177	
	Bibliography	183
	Index	199