Contents

1. Introduction 1
   1.1 Research question 6
   1.2 Objectives of the research 13
   1.3 Contents of the volume 16

2. Socio-cultural context of the forums 19
   2.1 Introduction 19
   2.2 Social networks and communication in online discussion forums 19
   2.3 The participants in online discussion forums (active participants, passive participants, distribution of rights, motivation of participants, and the goals of participants 29
   2.4 The principles and rules of communication in online discussion forums dedicated to the study of arms and armor .. 35
   2.5 The background of the keris controversy and the nationalism controversy 44
   2.6 Summary 51

3. Conflicts and controversies in theory and practice 53
   3.1 Introduction 53
   3.2 Human conflict and polemical discourse 54
   3.3 Different types of polemical discourse: discussion, dispute, and controversy 61
   3.4 The ideal controversy: a model by Leibnitz 70
   3.5 The characteristics of controversies in practice 80
   3.6 The role of emotions in public controversies 94
   3.7 Summary 102

Moshtagh Khorasani, Manouchehr
The development of controversies
2009

digitalisiert durch:
IDS Basel Bern

4. The République des Lettres and pamphlets. 105
4.1 Introduction 105
4.2 The members of the République des Lettres and their attitudes 106
4.3 Pamphlets in the République des Lettres 111
4.4 Summary 118

5. Communication principles from Early Modern Controversies to electronic communication 119
5.1 Introduction 119
5.2 Controversies as language games ruled by principles 121
5.3 Classification of communication principles 123
5.4 The changing nature of communication principles over time. 137
5.5 Summary 143

6. Individual moves and strategies: from the République des Lettres to online discussion forums 145
6.1 Introduction 145
6.2 Moves and strategies used in the scientific controversy between Kepler, Röslin, and Feselius in the 16th century ... 147
6.3 Moves and strategies used in the religious controversy between representatives of Protestant Orthodoxy and the Pietists and a comparison to online controversies 155
6.4 Moves with characteristic rhetoric of individuality in 17th century controversies compared to moves in online controversies 162
6.5 Moves and strategies used in a religious pamphlet war between Protestants and Jesuits in comparison to moves and strategies used in controversies in online discussion forums 169
6.6 Using accusations as special moves in Early Modern Controversies and their equivalents in controversies in online discussion forums 175
6.7 Summary 179

7. Individual moves and strategies in online discussion forums..... 181
7.1 Introduction..... 181
7.2 Global structure of controversies in online discussion forums 182
7.3 Opening moves..... 185
7.3.1 Accusations as an opening move..... 186
7.3.2 Justifying one's entry into a controversy..... 190
7.4 Attacking moves..... 192
7.4.1 Supporting the criticism of thread initiator..... 192
7.4.2 Agreement with friend/friends to support own argument..... 194
7.4.3 Accusations of not having enough knowledge about a subject..... 195
7.4.4 Insulting..... 195
7.4.5 Accusation of making a naked assertion (nudae assertiones)..... 196
7.5 Defending moves..... 196
7.5.1 Defending the author of the article..... 196
7.5.2 Refutation with reference to the accepted experts and authority..... 198
7.6 Counterattacks..... 198
7.6.1 Retorting and correcting the statements of the opponent by providing examples..... 198
7.6.2 Using the partial point-by-point method to counterattack..... 200
7.6.3 Accusations of misrepresentation..... 203
7.6.4 Apologizing as an answer to the accusation..... 204
7.7 Deflecting moves..... 205
7.7.1 Claiming incomprehension and misunderstanding of the article by the opponent..... 205
7.7.2 Stressing that one is not interested in getting involved in a controversy..... 206
7.7.3 Giving interpretation of one's own words..... 206
7.7.4 Using repetition..... 207

7.8 Accusation moves related to violations of principles of communication 208
7.8.1 Accusation of the violation of the principle of being warm and friendly 209
7.8.2 Accusation of the violation of the principle of who carries the burden of proof 209
7.8.3 Accusation of the violation of the principle of not making personal attacks 212
7.8.4 Accusation of the violation of the principle of not solely relying on arguments from authority 213
7.9 Neutral moves 214
7.10 Using rhetorical and direct questions in controversies 216
7.10.1 Using rhetorical questions to support one's own position or a supporter's position 221
7.10.2 Using rhetorical questions to attack the opponent 222
7.10.3 Using direct questions to seek information 223
7.10.4 Using direct questions to challenge the opponent's statements 224
7.10.5 Using direct questions to divert attention 225
7.11 Summary 227

8. Stylistic choices in controversies 229
8.1 Introduction 229
8.2 Style markers in online controversies as written dialogue: audience interaction and addressing other participants 233
8.2.1 The dimension of medium: the usage of vocatives and signature lines 236
8.2.2 The usage of the pronoun *we* to address group identity 243
8.2.3 Different functions of the pronoun *I* 249
8.2.4 Different functions of the pronoun *you* 253
8.2.5 Discourse markers 255
8.3 Lexical choices 260
8.3.1 The usage of jargon and technical terms 261

8.3.2 Person-related terms 264
8.3.3 Polemical terms and phrases towards theories, arguments, and ideas of the other group 265
8.4 Emoticons 267
8.4.1 Emoticons used for their intended purpose or in a neutral way 271
8.4.2 Emoticons used sarcastically to attack the opponent 272
8.5 Summary 273

9. Conclusion 275
9.1 Summary 275
9.2 Future steps in terms of approach into online controversies 280

References 285
Index 301