

CONTENTS

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS	11
PREFACE	17
Acknowledgments	22
Editor's Note	24
CHAPTER 1 Introduction: How It All Began	25
1.1 A Lifetime's Opportunity by Chance	26
1.2 First Look at the Baptistery	31
1.3 Inside: Is It a Roman Building?	36
1.4 How "Roman" is the Baptistery, after all?	42
1.5 First Wider Journeys in the Search for Evidence	44
1.6 The Turning Point: Facing the Challenge	50
1.7 The Adventure of Finding the Keys to the Puzzle	53
1.8 Sixty Years Later, What Progress?	58
CHAPTER 2 Which Side to Take? An Unending Debate	62
2.1 The Centuries Without Archaeological Evidence	63
2.2 The Tradition of an Early Roman San Giovanni	65
2.3 Early Claims for the Seventh and Eighth Centuries	67
2.4 The Romanesque School Seeks to Overturn the Roman Tradition	68
2.5 The Roman Partisans Fight Back	69
2.6 Debate Centres on the Vexed Question of "Tuscan Romanesque"	72
2.7 Proponents of a Byzantine Style Finally Dominate	73
2.8 An Unfinished Debate: Italy versus America?	74
CHAPTER 3 What We Have Learned: Findings of the Archaeological Excavations, 1895-1980	78
3.1 Intentions at the Beginning of Serious Excavations in 1895	80
3.2 The Excavations of 1895 behind the <i>Scarsella</i>	82
3.3 The Rescue Excavations of 1897 by the South Entrance	91
3.4 The Possibly Roman Sarcophagus Discovered in 1911	94

3.5 The Excavations of 1912-15 Underneath the Baptistery	96
3.5.1 The Suspected Octagonal Baptismal Font	98
3.5.2 The Broken-Into Sarcophagus with Skeleton and Presumed Grave Goods	101
3.5.3 Objects Found in the Earth Fill	107
3.5.4 The Coins	109
3.5.5 Galli's Own Conclusions	111
3.6 The Baptistery "Works Excavation" of 1948	112
3.7 The Excavations of 1965-74 under the Cathedral of Florence	113
3.7.1 Radiocarbon Dating from Santa Reparata I	117
3.7.2 The Excavations of 1980 Under the Eastern End of the Cathedral	120
3.8 The Excavations of 1971-73 Between the Baptistery and the Cathedral	122
3.9 Limitations of the Archaeological Evidence	124
CHAPTER 4 What Should the Archaeology Now Be Telling Us?	127
4.1 "Making the Material Talk"	127
4.1.1 Which "San Giovanni" Are We Talking About?	134
4.1.2 Radiocarbon Dating to the Rescue?	138
4.1.3 The Broken-Into Sarcophagus: Mistaken Evidence?	140
4.1.4 Galli's Stone Octagon: Baptismal Font?	146
4.2 San Giovanni's Tapered Cupola	149
4.3 The Baptistery Built by the Lombards (568-774)?	151
4.4 In What Form Did San Giovanni Survive the "Barbarian" Invasions?	160
4.5 Is Any of the Baptistery's Stone, Brick or Marble Roman?	165
4.6 The Perplexing Evidence of the Coins Found In the Excavations	173
4.7 How to Interpret the Bronze Pin and Brooch Fragment	177
4.8 What Does Archaeology Tell Us About How the Building's Appearance Changed?	180
4.8.1 Bare Walls Outside from the Beginning?	181
4.8.2 Has Any Fifth Century Marble Decoration Survived?	186
4.9 The Need for an Earlier Dating of the Piazza San Giovanni Cemeteries	190
4.10 The Baptismal Font and the 1059 "Consecration"	196
4.11 The Key Solution Proposed by Professor Toker	200
4.12 What the Baptistery's Archaeology Has Failed to Tell Us	206
CHAPTER 5 What Should the Architectural and Artistic Evidence Be Telling Us?	211
5.1 Architecture and Art versus Archaeology for Dating San Giovanni	212
5.1.1 Reconciling Architecture, Art History and Decoration with Archaeology	215
5.1.2 Key to Dating: Origins and Spread of the Tuscan Romanesque Architectural Style	220
5.1.3 Needed: An Acceptable Chronology for the Tuscan Romanesque	224
5.2 Whence the Precedents or Inspiration for the Florence Baptistery?	227
5.2.1 Possible Structural Models for the Baptistery	229
5.2.2 Roman and Early-Christian Possible Models	232
5.2.3 The Leading Candidate, the Pantheon?	238
5.2.4 The Fourth-Century Milan "Little Baptisteries" (350-385)	240
5.2.5 Possible Models in Late Antiquity (395-526)	242

5.2.6 Ravenna's Octagonal San Vitale as a Model?	247
5.2.7 Polychromatic Decorative Styles from the East	249
5.3 Whence the Original Inspiration for the Baptistery's Marble Veneering Designs?	253
5.4 Archaeological and Architectural Models for the Cupola	261
5.5 Evidence of the Stonework for an Integral Romanesque Construction	268
5.5.1 The Pantheon's Twin-Walled Construction as a Model	270
5.5.2 The <i>matroneo</i> , "Women's Gallery", Must Be Romanesque	272
5.5.3 Proven: Architectural Unity of the Baptistery's Cupola and its Twin-Walled Support	274
5.6 Late Conversion of the <i>Scarsella</i> into the <i>Tribuna</i>	277
5.7 Late Completion of the External Marble Veneering	282
CHAPTER 6 The Baptistery's Built-in Defensive Role	288
6.1 Clergy Excesses Provoke Growing Resentment	290
6.2 Gathering Danger: San Giovanni Under Siege	292
6.3 Footbridges to and from the Bishop's Palace	295
6.4 The Safest Aerial Walkway: from the Top of the New <i>Tribuna</i>	299
6.5 The Final Crisis: Guelphs versus Ghibellines	302
CHAPTER 7 Making a Choice: Three Alternative Scenarios for the Baptistery's History	304
7.1 A Fifth-Century Baptistery ("Version 1"): Do We Today See an Illusion?	305
7.2 San Giovanni Built As New in the Romanesque Eleventh Century ("Version 2")?	308
7.3 A Fifth-Century "Little Baptistery" Rebuilt, Enlarged and Decorated in the Romanesque Period ("Version 3")?	310
7.4 Positive Evidence for Its Proposed Romanesque Transformation	316
7.5 Who Might Have Paid For a New Romanesque San Giovanni?	322
7.6 The Need for a Chronology for the Baptistery's Romanesque Transformation	324
7.7 Chronological Summary	326
CHAPTER 8 Conclusions	331
APPENDIX I Corroboratory Evidence for Redating the Cemeteries of Piazza San Giovanni	345
APPENDIX II Defensive Stone Towers in Florence and Vicinity Recorded from the Eleventh Century	349
BIBLIOGRAPHY	351
ILLUSTRATIONS	363