Contents

Volume I

Foreword 15
Preface 17
Acknowledgements 21
Notes to the Reader 27
Abbreviations 27

Introduction 29

1. A Great Painter of the Renaissance, his Heir and Copyist and the Antwerp Art Market

A Brilliant Dynasty of Painters 37
Pieter Bruegel the Elder: his Life and Work 38
Pieter Bruegel the Elder's Posthumous Fame 42
The Proliferation of Copies after Pieter Bruegel the Elder at the End of the Sixteenth Century 46
Pieter Brueghel the Younger: his Life and Work 48
Inique facis nisi Patrem in Filio nosci: Pieter Brueghel the Younger as Continuator of his Father 52
The Art Market in Antwerp at the Time of Pieter Brueghel the Younger 56
Reconstructing the Organizational Practices of Antwerp Workshops 63
Rechte princepalen! The Rise of Connoisseurship 67
The Works of Pieter Brueghel the Younger in Seventeenth-Century Antwerp Inventories 72
Signatures and Dates in the Works of Bruegel the Elder and Brueghel the Younger 74

2. The Painting Technique of Pieter Bruegel the Elder: Four Case Studies

Status Quaestionis 93
Preliminary Note on the Paintings Examined 99

Case Study 1. *The Census at Bethlehem* (Brussels, Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België | Musées royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique) 101
Provenance 102
Inscriptions 103
Painting Support 103
Format and Construction - *Barbes* and Unprepared Lateral Borders - Condition
Preparatory Layers 107
Underdrawing 107
Form and Function - Drawing Medium - Position of Underdrawing in the Layer Structure - The Role of the Underdrawing in the Creative Process

Paint Layer 117
Condition - Palette - Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Modifications during Painting
Conclusion 138

Case Study 2. *The Sermon of St John the Baptist* (Budapest, Szépmüvészeti Múzeum) 143
Provenance 143
Inscriptions 145
Painting Support 146
Format and Construction - *Barbes* and Unprepared Borders - Condition
Preparatory Layers 148
Underdrawing 148
Form and Function - The Role of the Underdrawing in the Creative Process
Paint Layer 161
Condition - Palette - Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Gesture and Expression - Modifications during Painting
Conclusion 179

Case Study 3. *The Winter Landscape with Bird Trap* (Brussels, Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België | Musées royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique) 185
Provenance, Rediscovery and Early Controversy 185
Inscriptions 192
Fingerprint 193
Painting Support 194
Format and Construction - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Condition
Preparatory Layers 195
Underdrawing 195
Form and Function - The Place of the Underdrawing in the Evolution of the Composition - An Early Drawing of the Composition
Paint Layer 205
Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling
Conclusion 219

Case Study 4. *The Adoration of the Magi* (Winterthur, Dr Oskar Reinhart Collection 'Am Römerholz') 225
Provenance 226
Inscriptions 226
Painting Support 227
Format and Construction - Condition
Preparatory Layers 230
Underdrawing 231
Paint Layer 231
Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling
Conclusion 240

3. Pieter Bruegel the Elder's Painting Technique: a Reassessment

Painting Supports 245
Format and Construction 245
Barbes and Unprepared Borders 246

Preparatory Layers 249
Ground 249
Imprimatura 251
Underdrawing 259
Drawing Materials 259
Position of Underdrawing in the Layer Structure 263
Underdrawing Styles and Modifications during Drawing and Painting 265
Painting Techniques 282
Pigment Analysis and Layer Structure 282
Sequence of Painting 286
Brushwork and Handling 294
Conclusion 313

Volume II

4. The Painting Technique of Pieter Brueghel the Younger and his Workshop: Ten Case Studies

Status Quaestionis 333
Preliminary Note on the Paintings Examined 341

Case Study 1. Copies of the *Battle between Carnival and Lent* after Pieter Bruegel the Elder 345
Inscriptions 346
Painting Supports 346
Format and Panel Construction - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - *Barbes* and Unprepared Lateral Borders
Preparatory Layers 347
Transfer of the Design to the Prepared Panel Surface: Evidence for the Use of Pricked Cartoons 348
A Series of Smaller Cartoons rather than a Whole Sheet
Underdrawing 349
Form and Function - Modifications in Relation to the Pounced Design - Style
Paint Layer 358
Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling
The Original Model and the Cartoon 361
The Possible Whereabouts of the Original Version at the Time of Brueghel the Younger - The Original Version and the Five Copies: a Comparison - The Christie's New York Version - The Portland Version - A Hierarchy of Copies - The Source of the Cartoons
Conclusion 377

Case Study 2. Copies of the *Census at Bethlehem* after Pieter Bruegel the Elder 381
Inscriptions 381
Painting Supports 384
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - The Panel-maker and Branding - *Barbes* and Unprepared Lateral Borders
Preparatory Layers 390
Underdrawing 395
Form and Function - Modifications during Underdrawing and Painting - Stylistic Variation and the Question of Attribution

Paint Layer 407
Condition - Palette - Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Reflections on Attribution - Style and Brushwork in Comparison to Bruegel the Elder's Original Version
The Model for the Copies 424
Key Elements in Bruegel the Elder's Original Painting that are Missing in the Copies - Key Elements Transformed in the Copies - Misinterpretation of Original Motifs - Elements in the Underdrawing of the Original Dropped during Painting but Repeated in the Copies - Colours - Placement of Signature - Pre-conclusion
Variants among the Copies 428
Five Variants and a Possible Sub-variant - Motifs Varying According to Group - Dating - Secondary Models - Pre-conclusion
Copying Process 433
The Use of Cartoons - Transfer Process - The Source of the Cartoons
Conclusion 440

Case Study 3. Copies of the *Sermon of St John the Baptist* after Pieter Bruegel the Elder 447
Inscriptions 447
Painting Supports 450
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding - *Barbes* and Unprepared Lateral Borders
Preparatory Layers 452
Underdrawing 457
Form and Function - Style and Attribution
Paint Layer 460
Condition - Palette and Paint Layer Structure - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
The Model for the Copies 468
Comparison of the Sons' Copies with Pieter Bruegel the Elder's Budapest Version - Possible Working Relationship between Pieter Brueghel the Younger and Jan Brueghel the Elder - Two Variants
Copying Process 474
Use of Cartoons and Transfer Process - Partial Correlation with Pieter Bruegel the Elder's Budapest Version
Conclusion 479

Case Study 4. Copies of the *Winter Landscape with Bird Trap* after Pieter Bruegel the Elder 485
Inscriptions 485
Painting Supports 487
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding
Preparatory Layers 489
Underdrawing 491
Form and Function - Attribution
Paint Layer 495
Condition - Palette and Paint Layer Structure - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
The Model for the Copies 500
Bruegel the Elder's Version in the Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België | Musées royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique - The Case of the Painting in the Former M. A. Hassid Collection
Copying Process 509
Use of a Cartoon and Transfer Process - Two Additional Motifs in the Mayer van den Bergh and Coppée-le Hodey Versions
Brueghel's Competition: Contemporary Copies and Variants Produced by Other Workshops 512
Excursus: a Late Nineteenth- or Early Twentieth-Century Copy 517
Conclusion 518

Case Study 5. Copies of the *Adoration of the Magi* after Pieter Bruegel the Elder 525
Inscriptions 525
Painting Supports 525
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding
Preparatory Layers 527
Underdrawing 528
Form and Function - Attribution
Paint Layer 529
Condition - Palette, Paint Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
The Model for the Copies 537
Differences between Bruegel the Elder's Original Version and the Copies - Two Faithful Copies
Copying Process 540
Use of a Cartoon and Transfer Process - Differences among the Copies - A Copy from outside Brueghel the Younger's Workshop
Conclusion 542

Case Study 6. *The Magpie on the Gallows*: a Unique Copy after Pieter Bruegel the Elder 547
Inscription 547
Painting Support 548
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks
Preparatory Layers 549
Underdrawing 551
Paint Layer 557
Condition - Palette - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling
The Model for the Copy 562
Bruegel the Elder's Original Version - A Version in the Former Bruno Donath Collection
Copying Process 564
The Original Version and the Copy: a Comparison 565
Conclusion 570

Case Study 7. Copies of the *Wedding Dance in the Open Air* probably after a Lost Painting by Pieter Bruegel the Elder 573
Inscriptions 575
Painting Supports 575
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding
Preparatory Layers 578
Underdrawing 582
Form and Function - Drawing Notations - Attribution
Paint Layer 585
Condition - Palette - Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Adjustments in Design during Drawing and Painting - Attribution
Copying Process 595
Use of a Cartoon and Transfer Process - Motifs not Included in the Cartoon - Colour
Regarding the Model 598
The Engraving by Pieter van der Heyden - The Peasant Wedding Dance in the Detroit Institute of Arts - Evidence for a Lost Painting by Pieter Bruegel the Elder: Versions by Jan Brueghel the Elder and a Variant by Maerten van Cleve
Conclusion 609

Case Study 8. Copies of the *Crucifixion* probably after a Lost Painting by Pieter Bruegel the Elder . 615
Inscriptions 617
Creation of a Compositional Variant and Collaboration with Joos de Momper the Younger 618
Painting Supports 619
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding - *Barbes* and Unprepared Lateral Borders
Preparatory Layers 622
Underdrawing 623
Form and Function - Attribution
Paint Layer 627
Condition - Palette and Paint Layer Structure - Brushwork, Handling and Attribution - Sequence of Painting
Copying Process 633
Common Cartoons for the Figures - Townscape and Landscape Backgrounds: no Evidence for a Common Cartoon - Colour Correspondence in the Figures
Regarding the Model 635
A Lost *Crucifixion* by Pieter Bruegel the Elder: Source Documents - The Vienna Version of the Crucifixion by Jan Brueghel the Elder - Searching for the Appearance of a Lost Original by Pieter Bruegel the Elder
Conclusion 642

Case Study 9. Copies of the *Massacre of the Innocents* probably after a Lost Painting by Maerten van Cleve 647
Inscriptions 647
Painting Supports 648
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating
Preparatory Layers 648
Underdrawing 649
Form and Function - Attribution
Paint Layer 651
Condition - Palette - Layer Structure and Pigment Analysis - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
Copying Process and Reflections on the Model 658
Original Model - Transfer Process
The Version in the Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België | Musées royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique: Evidence of a Cover-up 662
The First Painting - Re-use of Panels in the Sixteenth Century - Why this Re-use in Brueghel's Workshop?
Conclusion 667

Case Study 10. Copies of the *Peasant Lawyer* after an Anonymous Model 671
Inscriptions 671
Painting Supports 673
Format - Panel Construction and Tool Marks - Provenance of the Wood and Dating - Branding
Preparatory Layers 675
Underdrawing 677
Form and Function - Attribution
Paint Layer 683
Condition - Palette and Pigments - Sequence of Painting - Brushwork and Handling - Attribution
Copying Process and Reflections on the Model 695
The Lost Prototype - Two Variants - Use of Cartoons and Transfer Process
Copies by Pieter Brueghel the Younger's Contemporaries and Later Imitators 700
Conclusion 707

Volume III

5. Demystifying the Process: Pieter Brueghel the Younger's Workshop Practice

Painting Supports 729
Format and Provenance of the Wood 729
Barbes and Unpainted Lateral Borders, with Corresponding Rebates on the Reverse 732
The Antwerp Brand and Panel-makers' Marks 733
Quality 738
Preparatory Layers 742
Ground 742
Imprimatura 742
The Role of Cartoons 746
The Transfer Process 746
Single or Partial Pricked Cartoons 746
The Nature of the Cartoons: an Original Master Cartoon and Working 'Substitute Cartoons' 750
Underdrawing 752
Graphite and Black Chalk as Underdrawing Media 752
The Position of the Underdrawing in the Layer Structure 755
The Extent and Character of the Underdrawing 755
Cartoon Transfer and Underdrawing Step-by-Step 757
Painting Techniques 760
Palette 760
Pigment Analysis and Layer Structure 760
Sequence of Painting 763
Brushwork and Handling 763
Mimicking his Father's Brushwork 773
Late Additions 778

6. Searching for the Hand of Pieter Brueghel the Younger

The Underdrawings 785
A Core Group of Underdrawings by the Master 788
Underdrawings outside the Core Group 796
The Attribution of Independent Drawings to Pieter Brueghel the Younger 797
The Painting Stage 802
A Core Group of Paintings by the Master 803
Paintings outside the Core Group 809
Significance of a Signature 812

7. Pieter Brueghel the Younger's Models and Variants

Brueghel the Younger's Models 817
Paintings for which Bruegel the Elder's Original Versions still Survive 817
Paintings Presumed to be after Lost Works by Bruegel the Elder 822
Paintings after Missing Works by Other Artists 822
Variants and Variation in Brueghel the Younger's Production 823
Compositional Variants 823
Variation in the Later Years 825
Organizational Practices under Brueghel the Younger's Direction 825

8. Outside Brueghel the Younger's Workshop

Deceptive Resemblance: Copies in the Manner of Pieter Brueghel the Younger 831
Distinctive Features in Copies by Jan Brueghel the Elder 834
Solving a Famous Controversy: Two Versions of the *Fall of Icarus* 844
The Version in the Koninklijke Musea voor Schone Kunsten van België | Musées royaux des Beaux-Arts de Belgique 846
Provenance - Support - Radiocarbon Dating - Underdrawing - Paint Layer - Conclusion
The Version in the Van Buuren Museum in Brussels 864
Provenance - Support - Underdrawing - Paint Layer - Conclusion
Last Word 872

9. Understanding the Father through the Son: Lost Secrets of Pieter Bruegel the Elder's Working Practice

Evidence from the Copies: Bruegel's Lost Compositional Drawings 879
Evidence from the Copies: Bruegel's Lost Cartoons 880
Evidence from the Originals: the Nature of the Lost Cartoons 882
Other Preparatory Material Employed by Bruegel 884
Record Copies? 884
Model Drawings and Preparatory Cartoons in the Southern Netherlands 886
From Drawing to Painting: Bruegel's Creative Process Reconstructed 890

Conclusions 900

Bibliography 907

Appendices

I. Paintings by Pieter Bruegel the Elder and from the Workshop of Pieter Brueghel the Younger: Inscriptions and Key Technical Features 926

II. Historical Copying Techniques 935
Cartoons - Squaring-up - Pouncing - Tracing - The Counterproof Method - The Proportional Compass - The Pantograph

III. Practical Reconstructions (Christina Currie and Bob Ghys) 957
Preparation of Test Panels and Drawing Materials - Squaring-up - Tracing - Pouncing - Pantograph - Alternative Methods - Discussion

IV. Identifying Pieter Brueghel the Younger's Underdrawing Media (Christina Currie and Steven Saverwyns) 981
Historical Context 982
Black Chalk - Graphite - Metalpoint
Identification of Underdrawing in Paint Samples 985
Analysis of Underdrawing in Brueghel the Younger's Paintings 986
Experimental Conditions - *Crucifixion* - *Massacre of the Innocents* (medium format) - *Wedding Dance in the Open Air* - *Massacre of the Innocents* (large format) - X-ray Fluorescence Analysis of Two Small-format Paintings by Brueghel the Younger
Conclusion 998

V. Dendro-archaeological Examination of Paintings by Pieter Brueghel the Younger (Pascale Fraiture) ... 1002
Provenance of the Wood, Mechanical and Technical Characteristics - Planks from the Same Tree in Different Paintings - Dating - Pieter Bruegel the Elder and Pieter Brueghel the Younger: a Changed Economic Context

VI. Attribution in Pieter Brueghel the Younger's Production 1017
Core Group of Underdrawings by Brueghel the Younger 1017
Core Group of Paintings by Brueghel the Younger 1019

VII. Charts of Variants 1022
a Variable Motifs and Colours in the *Census at Bethlehem* Series 1022
b Variable Motifs and Colours in the *Sermon of St John the Baptist* Series 1026
c Variable Motifs and Colours in the *Peasant Lawyer* Series 1030

Index of Works 1035

Illustration Credits 1057