

# Contents

<i>Foreword by Vassilios Skouris, President of the Court of Justice of the European Union</i> .....	v
<i>Editors' Preface</i> .....	vii
<i>List of Contributors</i> .....	xxxix

## Part I – Commentary on the Articles of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights

<b>Article 1 – Human Dignity</b> .....	3
<i>Catherine Dupré</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 1.....	3
Select Bibliography.....	3
A. Article 1 and the Scope of EU Law.....	4
B. Interrelationship of Article 1 with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	6
C. Sources of Article 1.....	8
I. ECHR.....	8
II. Council of Europe Treaties.....	9
III. UN Treaties.....	10
IV. Relevant EU Law.....	11
V. Other Sources: National Constitutions.....	11
D. Analysis.....	13
I. General Remarks.....	13
II. Scope of Application.....	15
III. Specific Provisions.....	18
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	21
V. Remedies.....	23
E. Evaluation.....	24
<b>Article 2 – Right to Life</b> .....	25
<i>Elizabeth Wicks</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 2.....	25
Select Bibliography.....	25
A. Field of Application of Article 2.....	26
B. Interrelationship of Article 2 with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	27
C. Sources of Article 2 Rights.....	29
I. ECHR.....	29
II. UN Treaties.....	30
III. Other Sources.....	30

D. Analysis .....	31
I. General Remarks .....	31
II. Scope of Application .....	31
III. Specific Provisions.....	33
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	36
V. Remedies.....	37
E. Evaluation .....	38
<b>Article 3 – Right to the Integrity of the Person .....</b>	<b>39</b>
<i>Sabine Michalowski</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 3 .....	39
Select Bibliography .....	39
A. Field of Application of Article 3 .....	40
B. Interrelationship of Article 3 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	42
C. Sources of Article 3 Rights.....	43
I. ECHR.....	43
II. UN Treaties.....	43
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	43
D. Analysis .....	44
I. General Remarks .....	44
II. Scope of Application .....	45
III. Specific Provisions.....	46
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	57
V. Remedies.....	58
E. Evaluation .....	58
<b>Article 4 – Prohibition of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment.....</b>	<b>61</b>
<i>Manfred Nowak and Anne Charbord</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 4 .....	61
Select Bibliography .....	61
A. Field of Application of Article 4.....	63
B. Interrelationship of Article 4 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	67
C. Sources of Article 4 Rights.....	70
I. ECHR.....	70
II. UN Treaties.....	71
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	74
D. Analysis .....	74
I. General Remarks .....	74
II. Scope of Application .....	76
III. Specific Provisions.....	80
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	92
V. Remedies.....	95
E. Evaluation .....	97

<b>Article 5 – Prohibition of Slavery and Forced Labour .....</b>	<b>101</b>
<i>Heli Askola</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 5 .....	101
Select Bibliography .....	102
A. Field of Application of Article 5 .....	103
B. Interrelationship of Article 5 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	104
C. Sources of Rights under Article 5 .....	105
D. Analysis .....	106
I. General Remarks .....	106
II. Scope of Application .....	107
III. Specific Provisions.....	108
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	117
V. Remedies.....	118
<b>Article 6 – Right to Liberty and Security.....</b>	<b>121</b>
<i>Daniel Wilsher</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 6 .....	121
Select Bibliography .....	122
A. Field of Application of Article 6.....	122
B. Interrelationship of Article 6 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	125
C. Sources of Article 6 Rights.....	126
I. ECHR .....	126
II. UN Treaties .....	126
III. Council of Europe Treaties.....	127
IV. Other Sources.....	128
D. Analysis .....	128
I. General Remarks .....	128
II. Scope of Application .....	129
III. Specific Provisions.....	131
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	132
V. Remedies.....	150
E. Evaluation .....	150
<b>Article 7 – Respect for Private and Family Life (Private Life, Home and Communications) .....</b>	<b>153</b>
<i>Jens Vested-Hansen</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 7 .....	153
Select Bibliography .....	153
A. Field of Application of Article 7 (Private Life, Home and Communications) .....	154
B. Interrelationship of Article 7 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	154
C. Sources of Article 7 Rights.....	155

D. Analysis .....	155
I. General Remarks .....	155
II. Scope of Application .....	155
III. Specific Provisions.....	161
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	179
V. Remedies.....	180
E. Evaluation .....	181
<b>Article 7 – Right to Respect for Private and Family Life</b> <b>(Family Life Aspects) .....</b>	<b>183</b>
<i>Shazia Choudhry</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 7 .....	183
Select Bibliography .....	183
A. Field of Application of Article 7 .....	183
I. Gender Equality.....	184
II. Children’s Rights .....	187
III. Free Movement, Immigration and Asylum .....	190
B. Interrelationship of Article 7 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	193
C. Sources of Article 7 Rights.....	194
I. ECHR.....	194
II. Council of Europe Treaties .....	195
III. UN Treaties.....	198
D. Analysis .....	201
I. General Remarks .....	201
II. Scope of Application .....	202
III. Specific Provisions.....	207
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	216
V. Remedies.....	220
E. Evaluation .....	220
<b>Article 8 – Protection of Personal Data.....</b>	<b>223</b>
<i>Herke Kranenborg</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 8 .....	223
Select Bibliography .....	223
A. Field of Application of Article 8 .....	224
I. EU Competence on Data Protection before the Entry into Force of the Lisbon Treaty .....	224
II. EU Competence on Data Protection after the Entry into Force of the Lisbon Treaty .....	225
III. The Scope of Application of Secondary Legislation .....	227
B. Interrelationship of Article 8 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	228
I. Article 7 (Right to Respect for Private and Family Life) .....	228
II. Article 11 (Freedom of Expression and Information).....	231
III. Article 17 (Right to Property) and Article 47 (Right to an Effective Remedy and to a Fair Trial) .....	232

Contents

IV. Article 21 (Prohibition of Discrimination) .....	233
V. Article 42 (Right of Access to Documents) .....	234
C. Sources of Article 8.....	235
I. ECHR.....	235
II. UN Treaties.....	236
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	238
IV. Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development.....	238
D. Analysis .....	239
I. General Remarks .....	239
II. Scope of Application .....	241
III. Specific Provisions.....	247
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	259
V. Remedies.....	263
E. Evaluation .....	264

**Article 9 – Right to Marry and Right to Found a Family.....267**

*Shazia Choudhry*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 9 .....	267
Select Bibliography .....	267

A. Field of Application of Article 9 .....	267
B. Interrelationship of Article 9 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	273
C. Sources of Article 9 Rights.....	274
I. ECHR.....	274
II. Council of Europe Treaties .....	275
III. UN Treaties .....	277
D. Analysis .....	279
I. General Remarks .....	279
II. Scope of Application .....	280
III. Specific Provisions.....	280
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	287
V. Remedies.....	290
E. Evaluation .....	290

**Article 10 – Right to Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion.....291**

*Ronan McCrea*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 10 .....	291
Select Bibliography .....	291

A. Field of Application of Article 10.....	291
B. Interrelationship of Article 10 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	293
I. Religious Freedom and Free Expression .....	293
II. Discrimination on Grounds of Religion.....	295
C. Sources of Article 10 Rights.....	298
D. Analysis .....	299
I. General Remarks .....	299
II. Scope of Application .....	300

III. Specific Provisions.....	301
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	301
V. Remedies.....	307
E. Evaluation.....	307
F. Conclusion.....	309
<b>Article 11 – Freedom of Expression and Information .....</b>	<b>311</b>
<i>Lorna Woods</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 11 .....	311
Select Bibliography .....	311
A. Field of Application of Article 11 .....	312
B. Interrelationship of Article 11 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	314
C. Sources of Article 11 Rights.....	314
I. ECHR.....	314
II. UN Treaties.....	315
III. Council of Europe Treaties.....	318
IV. Other Sources .....	318
D. Analysis .....	320
I. General Remarks .....	320
II. Scope of Application.....	321
III. Specific Provisions.....	325
IV. Limits and Derogations .....	327
V. Remedies.....	330
E. Evaluation .....	331
<b>Article 12 – Freedom of Assembly and of Association .....</b>	<b>341</b>
<b>Article 12(1) .....</b>	<b>341</b>
<i>Filip Dorssemont</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 12(1) .....	341
Select Bibliography .....	341
A. Field of Application of Article 12(1).....	342
B. Interrelationship of Article 12(1) with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	345
C. Sources of Article 12(1) Rights.....	347
I. Council of Europe Treaties.....	347
II. UN Treaties.....	348
III. Other Sources .....	349
D. Analysis .....	349
I. General Remarks .....	349
II. Scope of Application.....	350
III. Limitations and Derogations.....	359
IV. Remedies.....	360
E. Evaluation .....	364

<b>Article 12(2)</b> .....	<b>367</b>
<i>Jo Shaw and Lamin Khadar</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 12(2) .....	367
Select Bibliography .....	367
A. Field of Application of Article 12(2) .....	368
B. Interrelationship of Article 12(2) with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	368
C. Sources of Article 12(2) Rights.....	368
I. ECHR.....	369
II. UN Treaties.....	369
III. Other Sources .....	370
D. Analysis .....	370
I. General Remarks .....	370
II. Scope of Application .....	375
III. Detailed Analysis .....	375
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	377
V. Remedies.....	377
E. Evaluation .....	377
<b>Article 13 – Freedom of the Arts and Sciences</b> .....	<b>379</b>
<i>Debbie Sayers</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 13 .....	379
Select Bibliography .....	379
A. Field of Application of Article 13 .....	379
B. Interrelationship of Article 13 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	381
C. Sources of Article 13 Rights.....	382
I. ECHR.....	382
II. UN Treaties.....	383
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	387
IV. Other Sources .....	388
D. Analysis .....	389
I. General Remarks .....	389
II. Scope of Application .....	390
III. Specific Provisions.....	391
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	397
V. Remedies.....	398
E. Evaluation .....	399
<b>Article 14 – Right to Education</b> .....	<b>401</b>
<i>Gisella Gori</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 14 .....	401
Select Bibliography .....	401
A. Field of Application of Article 14 .....	402
B. Interrelationship of Article 14 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	407

C.	Sources of Article 14 Rights.....	408
I.	ECHR.....	408
II.	UN Treaties.....	411
III.	Council of Europe Treaties.....	412
IV.	Other Sources.....	413
D.	Analysis.....	414
I.	General Remarks.....	414
II.	Scope of Application.....	416
III.	Specific Provisions.....	418
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	419
V.	Remedies.....	420
E.	Evaluation.....	421
<b>Article 15 – Freedom to Choose an Occupation and Right to Engage in Work.....</b>		<b>423</b>
<i>Diamond Ashiagbor</i>		
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 15.....	423
	Select Bibliography.....	423
A.	Article 15 and the Scope of EU Law.....	424
B.	Interrelationship of Article 15 with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	425
C.	Sources of Article 15 Rights.....	427
I.	European Social Charter.....	427
II.	UN Treaties.....	429
III.	Other Sources.....	430
D.	Analysis.....	430
I.	General Remarks.....	430
II.	Scope of Application.....	431
III.	Specific Provisions.....	432
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	433
V.	Remedies.....	434
E.	Evaluation.....	435
<b>Article 16 – Freedom to Conduct a Business.....</b>		<b>437</b>
<i>Michele Everson and Rui Correia Gonçalves</i>		
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 16.....	437
	Select Bibliography.....	437
A.	Field of Application.....	438
I.	Freedom to Conduct a Business as a Human Right.....	440
II.	Freedom to Conduct a Business as an Element of the European Economic Constitution.....	441
B.	Relation of Article 16 to Articles 15 and 17 of the Charter.....	442
C.	Sources of Law.....	445
D.	Analysis.....	448
I.	General Remarks.....	448
II.	Scope of Application of Article 16.....	450



*Contents*

III. Specific Provisions.....	452
IV. Limitation to and Derogations from the Application of Article 16.....	458
V. Remedies.....	462
E. Conclusion.....	463
<b>Article 17 – Right to Property.....</b>	<b>465</b>
<b>Article 17(1) .....</b>	<b>465</b>
<i>Ferdinand Wollenschläger</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 17(1) .....	465
Select Bibliography .....	465
A. Field of Application of Article 17(1).....	467
B. Interrelationship of Article 17(1) with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	467
C. Sources of Article 17(1) Rights.....	468
I. ECHR.....	468
II. UN Treaties.....	469
III. Other Sources.....	469
D. Analysis .....	470
I. General Remarks .....	470
II. Scope of Application.....	471
III. Limitations and Derogations.....	476
IV. Remedies.....	486
E. Evaluation .....	487
<b>Article 17(2) .....</b>	<b>489</b>
<i>Paul Torremans</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 17(2) .....	489
Select Bibliography .....	489
A. Field of Application of Article 17(2).....	490
B. Interrelationship of Article 17(2) with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	492
C. Sources of Article 17(2) Rights.....	494
I. The Human Rights Approach to Copyright in International Instruments.....	494
II. The Human Rights Approach to Other Intellectual Property Rights in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	500
III. ECHR.....	501
D. Analysis .....	502
I. General Remarks .....	502
II. Scope of Application.....	503
III. Specific Provisions.....	503
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	515
V. Remedies.....	516
E. Evaluation .....	516

<b>Article 18 – Right to Asylum .....</b>	<b>519</b>
<i>Maarten den Heijer</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 18 .....	519
Select Bibliography .....	519
A. Field of Application of Article 18 .....	520
B. Interrelationship of Article 18 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	521
C. Sources of Article 18 Rights .....	523
I. ECHR .....	523
II. UN Treaties .....	523
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	526
IV. Constitutional Traditions .....	528
V. Other Sources .....	529
D. Analysis .....	530
I. General Remarks .....	530
II. Scope of Application .....	531
III. Limitations and Derogations .....	537
IV. Remedies .....	539
E. Evaluation .....	539
<b>Article 19 – Protection in the Event of Removal, Expulsion or Extradition .....</b>	<b>543</b>
<i>Elspeth Guild</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 19 .....	543
Select Bibliography .....	543
A. Article 19 and the Scope of EU Law .....	544
B. Interrelationship of Article 19 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	545
C. Sources of Article 19 Rights .....	546
I. ECHR .....	546
II. UN Treaties .....	546
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	548
IV. Other Treaties .....	548
V. Relevant EU law .....	548
D. Analysis .....	552
I. General Remarks .....	552
II. Scope of Application .....	553
III. Specific Provisions .....	554
IV. Limitations and Derogations .....	559
V. Remedies .....	560
E. Evaluation .....	561
<b>Article 20 – Equality before the Law .....</b>	<b>563</b>
<i>Mark Bell</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 20 .....	563
Select Bibliography .....	563
A. Field of Application of Article 20 .....	563
B. Interrelationship of Article 20 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	564

Contents

C. Sources of Article 20 Rights .....566  
    I. ECHR.....566  
    II. UN Treaties.....567  
    III. Council of Europe Treaties .....567  
    IV. Other Sources .....567  
D. Analysis .....568  
    I. General Remarks .....568  
    II. Scope of Application.....569  
    III. Specific Provisions.....570  
    IV. Limitations and Derogations.....573  
    V. Remedies.....575  
E. Evaluation .....576  
**Article 21 – Non-Discrimination.....579**  
*Claire Kilpatrick*  
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 21 .....579  
Select Bibliography .....579  
A. Field of Application of Article 21 .....580  
B. Interrelationship of Article 21 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....582  
C. Sources of Article 21 Rights.....584  
    I. ECHR.....584  
    II. UN Treaties.....584  
    III. Council of Europe Treaties .....586  
D. Analysis .....586  
    I. General Remarks .....586  
    II. Scope of Application.....587  
    III. Specific Provisions.....594  
    IV. Limitations and Derogations.....600  
    V. Remedies.....602  
E. Evaluation .....602  
**Article 22 – Cultural, Religious and Linguistic Diversity .....605**  
*Rachael Craufurd Smith*  
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 22 .....605  
Select Bibliography .....605  
A. Field of Application of Article 22 .....605  
B. Interrelationship of Article 22 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....610  
C. Sources of Article 22 Rights.....613  
    I. ECHR.....613  
    II. UN Treaties.....616  
    III. Council of Europe Treaties .....617  
    IV. Other .....618  
D. Analysis .....618  
    I. General Remarks .....618  
    II. Scope of Application.....622  
    III. Specific Provisions.....623

IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	627
V. Remedies.....	629
E. Evaluation.....	630
<b>Article 23 – Equality between Women and Men.....</b>	<b>633</b>
<i>Dagmar Schiek</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 23.....	633
Select Bibliography.....	633
A. Field of Application of Article 23.....	634
B. Interrelationship of Article 23 with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	636
I. Article 23 and Articles 20, 21 CFREU.....	636
II. Article 23 and Other Charter Articles.....	638
C. Sources for Article 23 Rights.....	639
I. Council of Europe Treaties.....	639
II. UN Treaties.....	640
III. EU Law.....	641
D. Analysis.....	643
I. General Remarks.....	643
II. Paragraph 1.....	644
III. Paragraph 2.....	650
E. Evaluation.....	655
I. Opportunities.....	655
II. Shortcomings.....	659
III. Conclusion.....	660
<b>Article 24 – The Rights of the Child.....</b>	<b>661</b>
<i>Ruth Lamont</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 24.....	661
Select Bibliography.....	661
A. Field of Application of Article 24.....	662
B. Interrelationship of Article 24 with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	671
C. Sources of Article 24 Rights.....	672
I. ECHR.....	672
II. UN Treaties.....	674
D. Analysis.....	678
I. General Remarks.....	678
II. Scope of Application.....	679
III. Specific Provisions.....	680
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	686
V. Remedies.....	688
E. Evaluation.....	689
<b>Article 25 – The Rights of the Elderly.....</b>	<b>693</b>
<i>Colm O’Cinneide</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 25.....	693
Select Bibliography.....	693

*Contents*

A. Field of Application of Article 25 .....	694
B. Interrelationship of Article 25 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	695
C. Sources of Article 25 Rights .....	696
I. ECHR .....	696
II. UN Treaties .....	697
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	698
IV. Other Sources .....	699
D. Analysis .....	701
I. General Remarks .....	701
II. Scope of Application .....	703
III. Specific Provisions .....	705
IV. Limitations and Derogations .....	706
V. Remedies .....	706
E. Evaluation .....	706
<b>Article 26 – Integration of Persons with Disabilities .....</b>	<b>709</b>
<i>Charlotte O’Brien</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 26 .....	709
Select Bibliography .....	709
A. Field of Application of Article 26 .....	710
B. Interrelationship of Article 26 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	712
C. Sources of Article 26 Rights .....	717
I. ECHR .....	717
II. UN Treaties .....	721
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	726
IV. Other Sources .....	728
D. Analysis .....	729
I. General Remarks .....	729
II. Scope of Application .....	734
III. Specific Provisions .....	736
IV. Limitations and Derogations .....	743
V. Remedies .....	745
E. Evaluation .....	747
<b>Article 27 – Workers’ Right to Information and Consultation within the Undertaking .....</b>	<b>749</b>
<i>Filip Dorssemont</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 27 .....	749
Select Bibliography .....	749
A. Field of Application of Article 27 .....	749
B. Interrelationship of Article 27 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	750
C. Sources of Article 27 Rights .....	752
D. Analysis .....	755
I. General Remarks .....	755
II. Scope of Application .....	756
III. Specific Provisions .....	758

IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	763
V. Remedies.....	768
E. Evaluation.....	769
<b>Article 28 – Right of Collective Bargaining and Action .....</b>	<b>773</b>
<i>Catherine Barnard</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 28 .....	773
Select Bibliography .....	773
A. Field of Application of Article 28 CFREU.....	774
B. Interrelationship of Article 28 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	777
I. Other Provisions in the Charter.....	777
II. Protocol 30.....	778
C. Sources of Article 28 Rights.....	779
I. Right to Bargain Collectively.....	779
II. Right to Take Collective Action.....	781
D. Analysis .....	783
I. General Remarks .....	783
II. Scope of Application: Definition of Terms.....	784
III. Specific Provisions.....	787
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	792
V. Remedies.....	793
E. Evaluation .....	794
<b>Article 29 – Right of Access to Placement Services.....</b>	<b>795</b>
<i>Diamond Ashiagbor</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 29 .....	795
Select Bibliography .....	795
A. Article 29 and the Scope of EU Law.....	795
B. Interrelationship of Article 29 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	797
C. Sources of Article 29 Rights.....	798
I. Council of Europe: European Social Charter.....	798
II. UN Treaties.....	798
III. Other Sources .....	800
D. Analysis .....	800
I. General Remarks .....	800
II. Scope of Application.....	801
III. Specific Provisions.....	802
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	802
V. Remedies.....	802
E. Evaluation .....	803
<b>Article 30 – Protection in the Event of Unjustified Dismissal .....</b>	<b>805</b>
<i>Jeff Kenner</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 30 .....	805
Select Bibliography .....	805
A. Article 30 and the Scope of EU Law.....	805

Contents

B. Interrelationship of Article 30 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	810
C. Sources of Article 30 Rights.....	814
I. ECHR.....	814
II. UN Treaties.....	815
III. ILO .....	816
IV. Council of Europe Treaties .....	817
V. National Constitutional Laws.....	817
D. Analysis .....	818
I. General Remarks .....	818
II. Scope of Application.....	824
III. Specific Provisions.....	825
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	829
V. Remedies.....	831
E. Evaluation .....	832
<b>Article 31 – Fair and Just Working Conditions.....</b>	<b>833</b>
<i>Alan Bogg</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 31 .....	833
Select Bibliography .....	833
A. Article 31 and the Scope of EU Law.....	834
B. Interrelationship of Article 31 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	836
C. Sources of Article 31 Rights.....	839
I. Council of Europe Treaties .....	839
II. Other Sources .....	841
D. Analysis .....	845
I. General Remarks .....	845
II. Scope of Application.....	850
III. Specific Provisions.....	852
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	862
V. Remedies.....	867
E. Evaluation .....	868
<b>Article 32 – Prohibition of Child Labour and Protection</b>	
<b>of Young People at Work .....</b>	<b>869</b>
<i>Helen Stalford</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 32 .....	869
Select Bibliography .....	869
A. Field of Application of Article 32 .....	870
B. Interrelationship of Article 32 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	874
C. Sources of Article 32 Rights.....	876
I. UN Treaties.....	876
II. Council of Europe Treaties .....	877
III. Other Sources .....	878
D. Analysis .....	879
I. General Remarks .....	879
II. Scope of Application.....	879

III. Specific Provisions.....	883
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	884
V. Remedies.....	886
E. Evaluation.....	888
<b>Article 33 – Family and Professional Life.....</b>	<b>891</b>
<i>Cathryn Costello</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 33.....	891
Select Bibliography.....	891
A. Field of Application of Article 33.....	892
B. Interrelationship of Article 33 with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	895
C. Sources of Article 33 Rights.....	897
I. ECHR.....	897
II. UN Treaties.....	900
III. Council of Europe Sources—The European Social Charter and Revised European Social Charter.....	905
IV. Other Sources.....	911
D. Analysis.....	917
I. General Remarks.....	917
II. Scope of Application.....	918
III. Specific Provisions and Issues.....	919
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	922
V. Remedies.....	923
E. Evaluation.....	924
<b>Article 34 – Social Security and Social Assistance.....</b>	<b>927</b>
<i>Robin White</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 34.....	927
Select Bibliography.....	927
A. Field of Application of Article 34.....	928
B. Interrelationship of Article 34 with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	930
C. Sources of Article 34 Rights.....	930
I. ECHR.....	930
II. UN Treaties.....	932
III. Council of Europe Treaties.....	933
IV. Other Sources.....	936
D. Analysis.....	936
I. General Remarks.....	936
II. Scope of Application.....	937
III. Specific Provisions.....	941
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	947
V. Remedies.....	948
E. Evaluation.....	948



<b>Article 35 – The Right to Health Care .....</b>	<b>951</b>
<i>Tamara Hervej and Jean McHale</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 35 .....	951
Select Bibliography .....	951
A. Field of Application of Article 35 .....	951
B. Interrelationship of Article 35 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	952
C. Sources of Article 35 Rights.....	953
I. ECHR.....	953
II. UN Treaties.....	953
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	954
IV. Other Sources .....	956
D. Analysis .....	957
I. General Remarks .....	957
II. Scope of Application .....	957
III. Specific Provisions.....	959
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	966
V. Remedies.....	966
E. Evaluation .....	967
 <b>Article 36 – Access to Services of General Economic Interest.....</b>	<b>969</b>
<i>Erika Szyszczak</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 36 .....	969
Select Bibliography .....	969
A. Article 36 and the Scope of EU Law.....	969
B. Interrelationship of Article 36 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	970
C. Sources of Article 36 ‘Rights’ and ‘Principles’.....	971
D. Analysis .....	971
I. General Remarks .....	971
II. Scope of Application .....	972
III. Specific Provisions.....	972
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	981
V. Remedies.....	981
E. Evaluation .....	981
 <b>Article 37 – Environmental Protection .....</b>	<b>983</b>
<i>Elisa Morgera and Gracia Marín Durán</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 37 .....	983
Select Bibliography .....	983
A. Field of Application of Article 37 .....	984
B. Interrelationship of Article 37 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	985
C. Sources of Article 37 .....	987
I. EU Law.....	987
II. National Constitutional Law .....	989

D. Analysis .....	991
I. General Remarks .....	991
II. Specific Provisions.....	992
III. Legal Nature.....	995
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	997
V. Remedies.....	1000
E. Evaluation .....	1002
<b>Article 38 – Consumer Protection .....</b>	<b>1005</b>
<i>Steve Weatherill</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 38 .....	1005
Select Bibliography .....	1005
A. Field of Application of Article 38.....	1005
B. Interrelationship of Article 38 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1006
C. Sources of Article 38 Rights.....	1006
D. Analysis .....	1008
I. General Remarks .....	1008
II. Scope of Application .....	1010
III. Specific Provisions.....	1010
IV. Limitations.....	1024
V. Remedies.....	1025
E. Evaluation .....	1025
<b>Article 39 – Right to Vote and to Stand as a Candidate at Elections to the European Parliament .....</b>	<b>1027</b>
<i>Lamin Khadar and Jo Shaw</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 39 .....	1027
Select Bibliography .....	1027
A. Field of Application of Article 39.....	1028
B. Interrelationship of Article 39 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1028
C. Sources of Article 39 Rights.....	1030
I. ECHR.....	1030
II. UN Treaties.....	1030
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	1032
IV. Other Sources .....	1032
D. Analysis .....	1033
I. General Remarks .....	1033
II. Scope of Application .....	1040
III. Specific Provisions.....	1040
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	1046
V. Remedies.....	1050
E. Evaluation .....	1052

<b>Article 40 – Right to Vote and to Stand as a Candidate at Municipal Elections.....</b>	<b>1057</b>
<i>Kees Groenendijk</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 40 .....	1057
Select Bibliography .....	1057
A. Field of Application of Article 40 .....	1058
B. Interrelationship of Article 40 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1058
C. Sources of Article 40 Rights.....	1059
I. ECHR.....	1059
II. UN Treaties.....	1060
III. Council of Europe.....	1061
IV. Other Sources .....	1061
D. Analysis .....	1062
I. General Remarks .....	1062
II. Scope of Application .....	1063
III. Specific Provisions.....	1064
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	1065
V. Remedies.....	1066
E. Evaluation .....	1066
 <b>Article 41 – Right to Good Administration.....</b>	 <b>1069</b>
<i>Paul Craig</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 41 .....	1069
Select Bibliography .....	1069
A. Article 41 and the Scope of EU Law.....	1070
B. Interrelationship of Article 41 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1071
C. Sources of Article 41 Rights.....	1071
D. Analysis .....	1072
I. General Remarks .....	1072
II. Scope of Application .....	1072
III. Specific Provisions.....	1076
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	1097
V. Remedies.....	1097
E. Evaluation .....	1098
 <b>Article 42 – Right of Access to Documents .....</b>	 <b>1099</b>
<i>Deirdre Curtin and Joana Mendes</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 42 .....	1099
Select Bibliography .....	1099
A. Field of Application of Article 42.....	1100
B. Interrelationship of Article 42 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1102
C. Sources of Article 42 Rights.....	1103

D. Analysis .....	1104
I. General Remarks .....	1104
II. Scope of Application .....	1107
III. Specific Provisions.....	1111
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	1112
V. Remedies.....	1118
E. Evaluation .....	1118
<b>Article 43 – European Ombudsman .....</b>	<b>1121</b>
<i>Ian Harden</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 43 .....	1121
Select Bibliography .....	1121
A. Field of Application of Article 43 .....	1121
B. Interrelationship of Article 43 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1124
C. Sources of Article 43 Rights.....	1124
I. UN Treaties.....	1125
II. Council of Europe Treaties .....	1125
III. Other Sources .....	1126
D. Analysis .....	1127
I. General Remarks .....	1127
II. Scope of Application .....	1129
III. Specific Provisions.....	1136
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	1140
V. Remedies.....	1141
E. Evaluation .....	1143
I. The Ombudsman Remedy as an Alternative Route to Redress.....	1144
II. The Ombudsman Remedy as an Instrument of Public Participation.....	1147
III. Future Trends .....	1149
<b>Article 44 – Right to Petition .....</b>	<b>1151</b>
<i>Mats Lindfelt</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 44 .....	1151
Selected Bibliography.....	1151
A. Field of Application of Article 44.....	1151
B. Interrelationship with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1152
C. Sources of Article 44 Rights.....	1153
D. Analysis .....	1154
I. General Remarks .....	1154
II. Scope of Application .....	1155
III. Specific Provisions.....	1157
IV. Limitations.....	1158
V. Remedies.....	1158
E. Evaluation .....	1159
I. A Tool for Democratic Control.....	1159



C.	Sources of Article 47 Rights.....	1200
I.	An ‘Effective Remedy’.....	1200
II.	A ‘Fair and Public Hearing’.....	1205
III.	‘Within a Reasonable Time’.....	1207
IV.	‘By an Independent and Impartial Tribunal Previously Established by Law’.....	1207
V.	Legal Aid for Indigents.....	1209
D.	Analysis.....	1209
I.	General Remarks.....	1209
II.	Scope of Application.....	1210
III.	Specific Provisions (Meaning).....	1211
IV.	Effective Remedies before Member State Courts and the Principle of Non-Discrimination.....	1228
V.	Damages for Breach of the Charter.....	1235
VI.	Effective Judicial Remedies before the Court of Justice.....	1241
VII.	Article 47(2): Everyone is entitled to a fair and public hearing within a reasonable time <i>by an independent and impartial tribunal previously established by law</i> . Everyone shall have the possibility of being advised, defended and represented.....	1250
VIII.	Article 47(2): Everyone is entitled to a <i>fair and public hearing within a reasonable time</i> by an independent and impartial tribunal previously established by law. Everyone shall have the possibility of being advised, defended and represented.....	1258
IX.	Article 47(3): Legal aid shall be made available to those who lack sufficient resources in so far as such aid is necessary to ensure effective access to justice.....	1269
E.	Evaluation.....	1273
	<b>Article 48 – Presumption of Innocence and Right of Defence (Administrative Law).....</b>	<b>1277</b>
	<i>Hanns Peter Nehl</i>	
	Text of Explanatory Note on Article 48.....	1277
	Select Bibliography.....	1277
I.	ARTICLE 48(1)—PRESUMPTION OF INNOCENCE	
A.	Field of Application of Article 48(1).....	1278
B.	Interrelationship of Article 48(1) with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	1279
C.	Sources of Rights under Article 48(1).....	1280
D.	Analysis.....	1281
I.	General Remarks.....	1281
II.	Scope of Application.....	1282
III.	Specific Provisions: Substantive Content of Article 48(1).....	1283
IV.	Limitations and Derogations.....	1287
V.	Remedies.....	1288
E.	Evaluation.....	1289
II.	ARTICLE 48(2)—RIGHTS OF THE DEFENCE	
A.	Field of Application of Article 48(2).....	1289
B.	Interrelationship of Article 48(2) with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	1291

Contents

C. Sources of Rights under Article 48(2).....1291  
D. Analysis .....1292  
    I. General Remarks.....1292  
    II. Scope of Application.....1292  
    III. Specific Provisions: Substantive Content of Article 48(2) .....1293  
    IV. Limitations and Derogations .....1298  
    V. Remedies .....1298  
E. Evaluation .....1301

**Article 48 – Presumption of Innocence and Right  
of Defence (Criminal Law).....1303**

*Debbie Sayers*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 48 .....1303  
Select Bibliography .....1303

I. ARTICLE 48(1)—PRESUMPTION OF INNOCENCE

A. Field of Application of Article 48(1).....1304  
B. Interrelationship of Article 48(1) with Other Provisions of the Charter .....1305  
C. Sources of Rights under Article 48(1).....1306  
    I. ECHR.....1306  
    II. UN Treaties.....1307  
    III. Council of Europe Treaties .....1309  
    IV. Other Sources .....1309

II. ARTICLE 48(2)—RIGHTS OF THE DEFENCE

A. Field of Application of Article 48(2).....1309  
B. Interrelationship of Article 48(2) with Other Provisions of the Charter .....1313  
C. Sources of Rights under Article 48(2).....1313  
    I. ECHR.....1313  
    II. UN Treaties.....1316  
    III. Other Sources .....1319  
D. Analysis .....1319  
    I. General Remarks .....1319  
    II. Scope of Application .....1321  
    III. Specific Provisions: Substantive Content of Article 48 .....1322  
    IV. Limitations and Derogations.....1344  
    V. Remedies.....1345  
E. Evaluation .....1347

**Article 49 – Principles of Legality and Proportionality  
of Criminal Offences and Penalties.....1351**

*Valsamis Mitsilegas*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 49 .....1351  
Select Bibliography .....1351

A. Field of Application of Article 49 .....1352  
B. Interrelationship of Article 49 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....1352

C. Sources of Rights under Article 49.....	1353
I. UN Sources.....	1353
II. ECHR.....	1354
D. Analysis.....	1358
I. General Remarks.....	1358
II. Legality.....	1359
III. Proportionality.....	1365
E. Evaluation.....	1371

**Article 50 – Right not to be Tried or Punished Twice in Criminal Proceedings for the same Criminal Offence .....1373**

*Jonathan Tomkin*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 50.....	1373
Select Bibliography.....	1373
A. Field of Application of Article 50.....	1374
I. Criminal Law.....	1375
II. Administrative Law Proceedings and Sanctions.....	1377
B. Interrelationship of Article 50 with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	1378
C. Sources of Rights under Article 50.....	1379
I. ECHR.....	1380
II. UN Treaties.....	1381
III. Other Sources.....	1383
D. Analysis.....	1384
I. General Remarks.....	1384
II. Scope of Application.....	1385
III. Specific Provisions.....	1392
IV. Limitations and Derogations.....	1407
V. Remedies.....	1410
E. Evaluation.....	1411

**Article 51 – Field of Application .....1413**

*Angela Ward*

Text of Explanatory Note on Article 51.....	1413
Select Bibliography.....	1414
A. Field of Application of Article 51.....	1415
B. Interrelationship of Article 51 with Other Provisions of the Charter.....	1415
I. Article 51(1).....	1415
II. Article 51(2).....	1421
C. Sources of Article 51 Rules.....	1422
D. Analysis.....	1424
I. General Remarks.....	1424
II. Specific Provisions.....	1427
E. Evaluation.....	1449



<b>Article 52 – Scope and Interpretation of Rights and Principles .....</b>	<b>1455</b>
<i>Steve Peers and Sacha Prechal</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 52 .....	1455
Select Bibliography .....	1457
A. Field of Application of Article 52 .....	1458
B. Interrelationship of Article 52 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1458
C. Sources of Article 52 Rules .....	1459
D. Analysis .....	1459
I. General Remarks .....	1459
II. Specific Provisions .....	1461
E. Evaluation .....	1521
<b>Article 53 – Level of Protection .....</b>	<b>1523</b>
<i>Bruno de Witte</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 53 .....	1523
Select Bibliography .....	1523
A. Sources of Article 53 .....	1524
B. Analysis .....	1524
I. Relation with the Rest of European Union Law .....	1525
II. Relation with International Law .....	1526
III. Relation with National Constitutions .....	1527
IV. An Exception to the Primacy of EU Law? .....	1529
V. The Legal Significance of Article 53 .....	1533
C. Conclusion .....	1537
<b>Article 54 – Abuse of Rights .....</b>	<b>1539</b>
<i>Lorna Woods</i>	
Text of Explanatory Note on Article 54 .....	1539
Select Bibliography .....	1539
A. Article 54 and the Scope of EU Law .....	1539
B. Interrelationship of Article 54 with Other Provisions of the Charter .....	1540
C. Sources of Article 54 Rights .....	1540
I. ECHR .....	1540
II. UN Treaties .....	1541
III. Council of Europe Treaties .....	1543
IV. Other Sources .....	1544
D. Analysis .....	1545
I. General Remarks .....	1545
II. Scope of Application .....	1545
III. Specific Provisions .....	1547
IV. Limits and Derogation .....	1550
E. Evaluation .....	1550

**Part II – Reflections on the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights**

<b>The Place of the Charter in the EU Constitutional Edifice .....</b>	<b>1559</b>
<i>Koen Lenaerts and José Antonio Gutiérrez-Fons</i>	
A. The Scope of Application of the Charter .....	1561
I. <i>Wachauf</i> as a Token of Positive Action on the Part of the Member States .....	1562
II. The Derogation Situation .....	1568
III. <i>Annibaldi</i> as an Example of the Situations where the Charter does not Apply .....	1569
B. The Charter and Primary EU Law .....	1571
I. The Charter and the Treaties .....	1571
II. The Charter and General Principles of EU Law .....	1575
C. The Charter and the Common Constitutional Space .....	1580
I. The Charter and the ECHR .....	1580
II. The Charter and the Constitutional Traditions Common to the Member States .....	1586
D. Concluding Remarks .....	1592
<b>Protocol (No 30) on the Application of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union to Poland and the United Kingdom .....</b>	<b>1595</b>
<i>Anthony Arnall</i>	
Select Bibliography .....	1596
A. Introduction .....	1597
B. The Background to Protocol No 30 .....	1599
C. The Meaning and Effect of Protocol No 30 .....	1603
I. The Preamble .....	1603
II. Article 1(1) of the Protocol .....	1604
III. Article 1(2) of the Protocol .....	1607
IV. Article 2 of the Protocol .....	1609
D. Evaluation .....	1610
<b>The EU Fundamental Rights Agency and the Fundamental Rights Charter: How Fundamental is the Link Between them? .....</b>	<b>1613</b>
<i>Gabriel N Toggenburg</i>	
A. Introduction .....	1613
B. The FRA: a Glimpse at its Role in the EU's Institutional Landscape .....	1614
C. The Agency's Founding Regulation and its Multiannual Framework: a Case of 'Charter-blindness'? .....	1616
D. The Charter in the Agency's Practice: Legal Benchmark and Tool .....	1619
E. Instead of Conclusions: a Triptych of Proposals for Making the Link Between the Charter and the Agency even more Fundamental .....	1623

<b>The Implementation of the Charter by the Institutions of the European Union .....</b>	<b>1627</b>
<i>Olivier De Schutter</i>	
A. Introduction .....	1627
B. The Integration of the Charter of Fundamental Rights in the Work of the European Parliament.....	1629
I. The Parliament's Role in Monitoring the EU Member States.....	1629
II. The Parliament as Guardian of Legality .....	1636
III. The Parliament as Co-legislator .....	1641
C. The Integration of the Charter of Fundamental Rights by the European Commission .....	1643
I. Assessment of Compatibility of Legislative Proposals with the Charter .....	1643
II. Impact Assessments.....	1645
III. Ensuring the Implementation of the Charter of Fundamental Rights.....	1648
D. The Integration of the Charter of Fundamental Rights by the Council of the EU .....	1650
E. The Integration of the Charter of Fundamental Rights in Law- and Policy-making: the Next Steps.....	1652
 <b>The Extraterritorial Application of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights: From Territoriality to Facticity, the Effectiveness Model .....</b>	 <b>1657</b>
<i>Violeta Moreno-Lax and Cathryn Costello</i>	
Select Bibliography .....	1657
A. Introduction .....	1658
B. Relevant Provisions: The Treaty and the Charter.....	1661
C. The Place of 'Jurisdiction' in the EU Legal Order .....	1663
I. 'PIL Jurisdiction' and EU Law .....	1663
II. 'IHLR Jurisdiction' and EU Law.....	1668
D. Analysis: The Applicability of EU Fundamental Rights, an Autonomous Paradigm.....	1679
E. Evaluation: The Emergence of a New Model .....	1682
 <b>The Charter and Universal Human Rights Instruments .....</b>	 <b>1685</b>
<i>Allan Rosas</i>	
A. Introduction .....	1685
B. The Relevance of International Human Rights Instruments for the Development of EU Fundamental Rights .....	1687
C. Examples from Case Law .....	1691
D. Human Rights Instruments in EU External Relations.....	1694
E. The Lisbon Treaty, the Charter and Universal Instruments .....	1697
F. Conclusions .....	1700

<b>Fundamental Social Rights in the Charter—Are They Rights? Are They Fundamental?</b> .....	1703
<i>Niilo Jääskinen</i>	
A. Introduction .....	1703
B. A Short History of EU Fundamental Social Rights.....	1704
C. Nature and Effects of Fundamental Social Rights.....	1707
I. Philosophical Foundations of Fundamental Social Rights.....	1708
II. Effects of Fundamental Social Rights .....	1710
D. Protection of Fundamental Social Rights in a Multi-level Constitutional Structure .....	1710
E. From an Exception to the Fundamental .....	1712
<b>The Explanations Relating to the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union</b> .....	1715
<i>Jean-Paul Jacqué</i>	
A. The Origin of the Explanations.....	1715
I. The First Convention: the Explanations as an Explanatory Report.....	1716
II. The Second Convention: Moving Towards a Specific Status for the Explanations.....	1717
B. A Diversified Content .....	1718
C. The Use of the Explanations in Jurisdiction.....	1721
I. The Search for the Source of a Guaranteed Right .....	1721
II. Interpreting the Charter’s Guaranteed Rights and General Provisions.....	1722
D. Conclusion.....	1724
<b>Part III – Commentary on the Treaty of EU Accession to the European Convention on Human Rights</b>	
<b>Agreement on the Accession of the European Union to the European Convention on Human Rights</b> .....	1727
<i>Paul Gragl</i>	
Text of the Agreement.....	1727
Select Bibliography .....	1733
A. Background and Overview of EU Accession to the ECHR.....	1734
I. The Long History of Accession .....	1734
II. The Constraints of Article 218 TFEU, Article 6(2) TEU, and Protocol No 8 to the Treaties.....	1737
III. The Relevance of Article 52(3) of the Charter of Fundamental Rights.....	1741
B. The Substantive Provisions of the Accession Agreement.....	1745
Article 1—Scope of the Accession and Amendments to Article 59 of the Convention .....	1745
Article 2—Reservations to the Convention and the Protocols .....	1758
Article 3—Co-Respondent Mechanism.....	1761
Article 4—Inter-Party Cases.....	1790

*Contents*

Article 5—Interpretation of Articles 35 and 55  
of the Convention .....1795

Article 6—Election of Judges .....1797

Article 7—Participation of the European Union in the Committee  
of Ministers of the Council of Europe .....1801

Article 8—Participation of the European Union in the  
Expenditure Related to the Convention .....1812

Article 9—Relations with other Agreements.....1815

Article 10—Signature and Entry into Force.....1817

Article 11—Reservations .....1819

Article 12—Notifications.....1819

C. Appraisal .....1820

*Appendix*.....1825

*Index* .....1861