

# Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i> .....	xvii
<i>Tables of Legislation</i> .....	xxxii

1. Introduction: The Purpose and Frame of this Inquiry .....	1
I. Introduction.....	1
A. The Objectives of this Book .....	2
B. Why Human Rights and the Environment?.....	3
C. The Significance of the EU Experience.....	4
i. The Relevance of the EU Experience for the WTO .....	5
D. The Starting Point for this Inquiry: Pragmatism Rather than Ideology .....	7
E. Framing the Inquiry: Sustainable Development and Proportionality.....	7
i. Sustainable Development.....	8
ii. The Principle of Proportionality.....	12
II. Structure of the Book.....	15

## PART I: THE EU EXPERIENCE

2. The Emergence of Human Rights and Environmental Protection in the EU .....	21
Introduction .....	21
I. The Protection of Human Rights in the EU.....	23
A. The Emergence of EU Human Rights Protection: A Chronological Account .....	23
i. The Treaty of Rome (1957) .....	23
ii. The Single European Act (1986) .....	27
iii. The Treaty on European Union (1992) .....	29
iv. The Treaty of Amsterdam (1997).....	30
v. The Treaty of Nice (2001) and the Charter of Fundamental Rights for the European Union .....	31
vi. The Treaty of Lisbon (2007) .....	33
B. The Coming of Age of EU Human Rights: 2000–.....	33
i. Issues Raised by the Charter of Fundamental Rights.....	33
ii. The Significance of the Role of the Court of Justice....	40

C.	EU Human Rights Protection and the International Legal Order.....	42
i.	EU Law in the International Legal Order: The Kadi Case.....	42
ii.	The View of the ECHR Regarding EU Fundamental Rights.....	43
iii.	The Impact of Kadi and Kadi II.....	44
D.	Human Rights in the EU: Conclusions .....	46
II.	The Protection of the Environment in the EU .....	47
A.	The Emergence of EU Environmental Protection: A Chronological Account.....	47
i.	The Treaty of Rome (1957).....	47
ii.	The Single European Act (1986): The Foundations of a More Proactive Environmental Policy .....	50
iii.	The Treaty on European Union (1992) .....	51
iv.	The Treaty of Amsterdam (1997).....	52
v.	The Treaty of Nice (2001).....	53
vi.	The Treaty of Lisbon (2007) .....	54
B.	Fundamental Principles in EU Environmental Law and Policy .....	55
i.	Subsidiarity .....	55
ii.	Sustainability: The Sustainable Development Strategy....	56
iii.	Duty of Integration .....	58
iv.	Proportionality.....	61
v.	The Precautionary Principle .....	62
C.	Looking Forward: The Emerging Significance of Sectoral Environmental Objectives (post-2007) .....	63
i.	The Seventh Environmental Action Programme (2013) .....	64
ii.	Climate Change and Energy.....	66
iii.	The Emergence of New Approaches to Governance....	67
iv.	The Benefits of Participatory, Deliberative Approaches: The Kosterhavet National Park .....	68
D.	EU Environmental Policy: Conclusions .....	69
i.	The Development of Secondary EC Environmental Legislation .....	69
ii.	Legal Basis for Measures Including an Environmental Element .....	70
III.	Human Rights and Environmental Protection in the EU: Conclusions .....	71
3.	The Standing of Human Rights and Environmental Protection in the EU Legal Order.....	74
	Introduction .....	74

I.	Regulating the Interface between Economic and Non-economic Interests: The Rules of the Internal Market.....	75
A.	Human Rights and the Fundamental Freedoms .....	78
i.	Schmidberger: Introducing a Sustainable Development-Based Approach.....	79
B.	Environmental Protection and the Fundamental Freedoms.....	85
i.	Environmental Protection as a Justification for Restriction of Movement.....	86
II.	Human Rights and Environmental Protection as Free-Standing Objectives? .....	88
A.	Remedies and Case Law.....	89
i.	The System of Remedies .....	89
ii.	Environmental Protection: A Ground of Review? .....	90
iii.	Non-economic Interests and the Test for Standing .....	90
iv.	Greenpeace.....	91
v.	The Lisbon Treaty Amendment to the Test for Standing of Natural and Legal Persons.....	94
B.	Access to Justice: The Aarhus Convention .....	96
III.	Conclusions: The Significance of Sustainable Development and Proportionality in Balancing the EU's Economic and Non-economic Interests .....	99
A.	Balancing Interests: The Need for Proportionality .....	99
B.	The Emergence of the Two-Way Application of the Proportionality Test .....	99
C.	The Two-Way Application of Proportionality as an Operationalisation of Sustainable Development.....	102
D.	Enforcement of Non-economic Interests Outside the Context of the Internal Market Rules .....	102
4.	The EU's Relations with Third States .....	103
	Introduction .....	103
I.	The Basis of External Competence of the EU .....	104
A.	Conferral: The Source of EU Powers .....	104
B.	The Position under the TEU.....	105
i.	The EC: The First Pillar of the EU .....	105
ii.	The CFSP: The Second Pillar of the EU.....	106
iii.	The Distinction between EC and EU Competences .....	107
C.	The Post-Lisbon Position (2009–) .....	107
II.	The Exercise of EU Competence .....	109
A.	Legal Base: Competency to Undertake External Action.....	109
i.	Express Powers.....	110
ii.	Implied Powers .....	110

iii.	The Scope of Conferred Competence: Common Commercial Policy—Opinion 1/94.....	112
iv.	Article 2(2) TFEU: Member State Competence Subordinate to EU Competence? .....	114
v.	Complementary Competence.....	115
III.	EU Competence in Relation to its Newer Objectives.....	117
A.	The Significance of Concurrent Powers.....	117
B.	The EU’s External Competence: Environmental Protection.....	119
C.	External EU Competence: Human Rights .....	119
i.	The Limits of the Implied External Human Rights Competence.....	120
ii.	Internal Human Rights: Objective or Transverse Obligation? .....	120
iii.	The Distinction between an Obligation to Respect and a Power to Promote .....	122
iv.	The Basis of the Human Rights Clause in EU Agreements with Third States.....	123
v.	Case C-268/94 Portugal v Council and Commission of the European Community .....	124
vi.	The Lisbon Treaty Position: Essential Clarification .....	126
IV.	The Effect of International Agreements in EU Law .....	127
A.	Direct Effect: A Necessary Condition for Reviewability of the Compatibility of EU Law with an International Agreement.....	129
i.	Direct Effect? A Two-Prong Test .....	130
B.	Unpacking the Jurisdiction of the Court of Justice to Review the Compatibility of EU Law with the EU’s International Obligations .....	131
i.	Questions Concerning the Scope of the Court of Justice’s Jurisdiction .....	131
V.	Concluding Comments .....	134
A.	The Nature of EU External Competence.....	135
B.	The Nature of EU External Competence in Respect of Human Rights and Environmental Protection .....	136
C.	The Emergence of External Competence as a Mirror of the Development of Internal Competence.....	137
D.	The Effect of the EU’s External Commitments .....	138
5.	Human Rights and Environmental Protection in the EU’s Relations with Third States .....	139
	Introduction .....	139
	Structure of the Chapter.....	140

I.	Forms and Types of Agreement between the EU and Third States .....	141
	A. Trade Agreements .....	141
	B. Partnership and Cooperation Agreements .....	141
	C. Association Agreements .....	142
	i. Development Cooperation Agreements .....	143
	ii. The Europe Agreements .....	145
	iii. Other Association Agreements .....	145
	D. European Neighbourhood Policy .....	146
	E. Sectoral Agreements .....	147
	F. Interim Agreements .....	147
II.	The Emergence of the Human Rights and Democracy Clause: Lomé IV (1990) .....	148
	A. Article 366a: Introducing Human Rights Conditionality to Lomé (1995) .....	150
	B. The Cotonou Agreement (2000) .....	150
	C. The Human Rights and Democracy Clause in Agreements with Central and Eastern European States .....	152
	i. Ex Ante Human Rights Consideration .....	152
	ii. Human Rights Conditionality within Agreements with European States.....	153
	iii. The Substance of the Clause in Agreements with European States.....	153
	D. Universal Inclusion of the Human Rights Clause .....	154
	i. A Universal Policy with Varying Reference Points and Content.....	155
	E. Human Rights Conditionality and the EU GSP.....	156
	i. Positive Conditionality under the GSP .....	156
	ii. Negative Conditionality .....	157
	iii. Reform of the GSP .....	158
	iv. Temporary Withdrawal of GSP Benefits.....	159
	F. Sectoral Agreements.....	161
	G. External Opposition to Inclusion of the Human Rights Clause: Mexico and Australia .....	162
	i. Mexico .....	162
	ii. Australia.....	163
	H. Questions Regarding the Definition and Perception of Human Rights at Issue: A Truly Universal Policy?.....	164
	I. Continuing Resistance to Human Rights Conditionality ....	165
	J. Factors Influencing the Form and Strength of the Human Rights Clause .....	166
III.	EU Enforcement of the Human Rights Clause .....	167
	A. Meaningful Conditionality? The Partnership and Cooperation Agreement with Russia.....	168

- B. Discretion and Consistency in Relation to the Human Rights Clause ..... 169
- C. The Subsequent Challenge: Standing to Enforce the Clause?..... 170
  - i. *Mugraby v Council and Commission* ..... 171
- D. Reliance on the Exercise of Political Discretion in the Enforcement of the Human Rights Clause ..... 172
- IV. The Protection of the Environment in the EU's Relations with Third States..... 174
  - A. Development Cooperation Agreements ..... 174
    - i. The Cotonou Agreement ..... 176
    - ii. Environmental Protection in the Europe Agreements..... 177
  - B. Partnership and Cooperation Agreements ..... 179
  - C. Cooperation Agreements..... 180
  - D. Trade Agreements ..... 181
  - E. The Agreement with Mexico..... 181
  - F. Australia ..... 182
  - G. The Emergence of an Integrative Approach: Sustainable Development in the EU's Agreements with Third States..... 183
    - i. The Integration of the Environmental Dimension in Development ..... 185
- V. Conclusions..... 186
  - A. On Human Rights Conditionality ..... 186
  - B. On Environmental Protection ..... 187
  - C. The Significance of Relativity in the Pursuit of Non-economic Interests in the EU's External Relations..... 188
    - i. Mitigating the Charge of Imperialism ..... 188
    - ii. The Creation of Regulatory Space for the Protection of Non-economic Values ..... 188
  - D. EU External Policy as a Reflection of its Internal Policy ..... 189
  - E. Lessons Which May Be Drawn from the EU's Experience in Reconciling the Pursuit of Economic and Non-economic Interests..... 190

**PART II: BALANCING ECONOMIC AND NON-ECONOMIC INTERESTS IN THE INTERNATIONAL LEGAL ORDER**

- 6. The International Context: The WTO Legal Order..... 195
  - Introduction ..... 195
    - I. The Framework for International Trade: The WTO..... 196
      - A. Background to the WTO..... 197
      - B. Liberal Trade: A Means to an End? ..... 198

C.	Fundamental Principles and Rules of the GATT .....	200
D.	Provision for the Protection of Non-economic Interests within the WTO Legal Order.....	201
E.	The Dispute Settlement System .....	202
II.	The Relationship between WTO Law and International Law.....	203
A.	WTO Law: No Clinical Isolation from International Law.....	203
B.	Relevant Rules of International Law .....	205
i.	Customary International Law.....	205
ii.	The Impact of Provisions of International Treaties.....	206
7.	Trade and Environment in the WTO Legal Order.....	210
Introduction .....		210
I.	Background to the trade-environment nexus under the GATT/WTO .....	210
A.	The Committee on Trade and Environment .....	212
B.	The GATT Status of Trade-Related Measures in MEAs.....	213
II.	Environmental Regulatory Measures and Dispute Settlement.....	215
A.	Trade/Environment Disputes before the GATT Panel .....	216
i.	Tuna and Tuna Products .....	216
ii.	The Herring and Salmon Dispute .....	218
iii.	Thai Cigarettes .....	219
iv.	Superfund .....	222
v.	US Restrictions on Imports of Tuna (1991) (Tuna-Dolphin).....	224
vi.	US-Restrictions on Imports of Tuna (1994) (Tuna-Dolphin II) .....	226
vii.	Trade and Environment under the GATT: Comment.....	228
B.	Trade/Environment Disputes under the WTO Dispute Settlement System.....	229
i.	US-Gasoline.....	229
ii.	United States-Import Prohibition of Certain Shrimp and Shrimp Products (US-Shrimp).....	230
iii.	EC-Asbestos .....	233
iv.	Testing the Legitimacy of Members' Regulatory Measures: 'Weighing and Balancing'? .....	234
C.	The Agreement on Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures (SPS Agreement).....	235
i.	The Nature of Review: EC-Hormones.....	236

D.	The Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade .....	238
i.	US-Clove Cigarettes.....	239
ii.	US-Measures Concerning the Importation, Marketing and Sale of Tuna and Tuna Products (US-Tuna II) (Mexico) .....	240
III.	Emerging Environmental Measures Posing Particular Challenges for the WTO .....	242
A.	Energy .....	242
B.	Trade in Environmental Goods .....	244
IV.	Application of the Different Tests in the Determination as to Whether a Measure May Justify a Trade Restriction .....	245
A.	The Necessity Test.....	246
B.	The Relationship between GATT/TBT ‘Necessity’ and EU Proportionality .....	247
C.	The Appellate Body: ‘Weighing and Balancing’ Competing Interests?.....	248
D.	The Application of the Court of Justice and Appellate Body Tests Compared .....	249
i.	Ditlev Bluhme .....	249
ii.	PreussenElektra .....	251
V.	Conclusions .....	252
8.	Human Rights Protection and WTO Law .....	254
	Introduction .....	254
I.	Background: International Human Rights Law and the WTO.....	255
A.	No Coherent Relationship .....	255
II.	Unpacking the Interaction between Human Rights and WTO Rules .....	258
A.	Locating Human Rights in the WTO Legal Order .....	259
i.	International Law and the WTO.....	260
ii.	The Relevance of Human Rights Considerations in the Determination of ‘Likeness’ under Article III GATT.....	262
iii.	Invocation of an Exception under Article XX GATT .....	263
B.	Case Study: Labour Rights.....	264
i.	The Singapore Ministerial Declaration .....	265
ii.	Defining Labour Rights .....	267
iii.	Unpacking the Core Standards.....	267
iv.	‘Labour Standards’ to ‘Labour Rights’: Merely a Rhetorical Shift? .....	267
v.	Labour Rights as Human Rights? .....	268
vi.	Testing the Interaction between Human Rights and the WTO Rules with Reference to Labour Rights .....	271



III. Contrasting Approaches: The EU and WTO Approaches Compared .....	278
IV. Conclusions .....	281
A. The Significance of Consensus .....	281
9. Effecting the Reconciliation of Competing Interests:	
Reconceptualising the Legal Framework .....	286
I. The EU Experience .....	286
II. Reconceptualising the Objectives of the WTO through the Lens of Sustainable Development .....	288
A. Unpacking the Objectives of the WTO Rules .....	288
B. The Impact of the Narrow (Neoliberal) Interpretation of the WTO Objectives .....	290
C. The Need for a Holistic Approach .....	291
D. Embedded Liberalism .....	293
E. The Integration of Non-economic Interests into the WTO Legal Order? .....	293
i. The Dangers of Integrating Non-economic Interests into the WTO Legal Order: Reinforcing Existing Hierarchies .....	295
F. Integrating the WTO Legal Order into the Context of Sustainable Development .....	297
G. The Theoretical Framework .....	297
i. Would a Liberal Theoretical Framework Be Helpful? .....	298
ii. The Need to Unpack the Pursuit of Trade Liberalisation: Non-discrimination or a Right to Market Access? .....	299
iii. The Consequence of Reconceptualising the Objectives of the WTO in the Light of Sustainable Development .....	302
III. Operationalisation of the Sustainable Development-Based Approach .....	303
A. Sustainable Development as the Basis of an Adjudicative Mechanism .....	305
B. Applying the Sustainable Development-Based Approach: The Role of 'Proportionality' .....	306
C. The Benefits of this Approach .....	306
IV. Reconciling the Pursuit of Economic and Non-economic Interests: Lessons from the EU .....	307
A. EU Lessons: The Internal Perspective .....	308
B. EU Lessons: The External Perspective .....	309
V. Concluding Comments .....	311
<i>Index</i> .....	314