

Contents

Acknowledgments *page xi*

1 Introduction to Basic Concepts and Methods	1
1. Problems and Objections	2
2. Arguments from Ignorance	6
3. Three Examples of Burden of Proof Problems	9
4. Survey of Theories of Presumption and Burden of Proof in Argumentation	13
5. Presumption and Burden of Proof in Legal Argumentation	19
6. Shifting of Burden Proof and Critical Questioning	23
7. The Carneades Argumentation System	26
8. Dialogue Models of Argumentation	31
9. Formal Dialogue Models for Legal Argumentation	38
10. A Formal Model of Burden of Proof in the Critical Discussion	42
2 Burdens of Proof in Legal Reasoning	49
1. The Normal Default Rule	50
2. Burden of Persuasion and Evidential Burden	52
3. Standards of Proof	57
4. Stages of Dialogue and Legal Burden of Proof	61
5. Other Legal Burdens of Proof	65
6. The Link between Burden of Persuasion and Production	68
7. The Abstract Argumentation Model	70
8. The Self-Defense Example	73
9. How Carneades Models the Self-Defense Case	77
10. Conclusions	83
3 Presumption in Legal Reasoning	85
1. The Five Components of Argumentation in a Trial	86
2. Presumption in Law and Everyday Reasoning	89

3. Rules and Inferences	91
4. The Logical Component	94
5. The Dialogical Component	97
6. The Letter and the Dark Stairway	101
7. Combining the Inferential and Dialogical Components	105
8. Application of the Dialogical Theory to Examples	109
9. Conclusions	114
10. Directions for Future Research	118
4 Shifting the Burden of Proof in Witness Testimony	122
1. Witness Testimony in the Carneades Argumentation System	123
2. The Case of the <i>State v. Classen</i>	126
3. Scientific Evidence on the Fallibility of Witness Testimony	128
4. The <i>State of Oregon v. Lawson</i>	131
5. The Change Made in Oregon Law	133
6. Reconfiguring the Argumentation Schemes	135
7. The Critical Questions Matching the Scheme	137
8. Admissibility, Bias and Burden of Proof	139
9. Admissibility, Relevance and Examination	140
10. Conclusions	142
5 Burden of Proof in Dialogue Systems	145
1. Hamblin's Why-Because System with Questions	146
2. An Example Argument	149
3. Burden of Proof in Dialogue	150
4. Situating Support Requests in Types of Dialogue	152
5. Specifications for a Why-Because System with Questions	155
6. Analysis of the Argumentation in the Example	158
7. Solution to the Problem of Evasion and Shifting of Burden of Proof	162
8. Speech Acts in Dialogue Systems	164
9. The Dialogue Systems CB1 and CB1CK	167
10. Dialogue Systems with Argument and Explanation	173
6 Solving the Problems of Burden of Proof.	176
1. Problems To Be Solved	177
2. Meta-Arguments and Metadialogues in Logic and AI	178
3. Theoretical Problems of Metadialogues	181
4. Analyzing the Los Gatos Example Using Carneades	183
5. Analyzing the Los Gatos Example Using Abstract Argumentation	187
6. Arguments from Ignorance Revisited	190
7. The Nonfallaciousness of Argument from Ignorance	196
8. When Should a Persuasion Dialogue Be Closed?	200

9. A Solution to These Problems	203
10. An Explanation-Based Approach to Modeling Standards of Proof	205
7 Burdens of Proof in Different Types of Dialogue	211
1. Some Examples	212
2. The Formal Structure of Deliberation Dialogue	216
3. Deliberation versus Persuasion Over Action	218
4. Analysis of the No-Fault Insurance Example	224
5. Analysis of the Wigmore, FDA and Precautionary Principle Examples	229
6. The Persuasion Interval in Deliberation	232
7. Conclusions on Burden of Proof in Deliberation	234
8. Burden of Proof in Inquiry and Discovery Dialogues	236
9. Information-Seeking Dialogue, Negotiation and Eristic Dialogue	240
10. The Contextual Nature of Burden of Proof	241
8 Conclusions	245
1. The Allegation of Hasty Transference	246
2. Comparing Legal and Nonlegal Burden of Proof	249
3. Normative Models and Everyday Conversational Arguments	252
4. The Dialogue on Tipping	256
5. Burdens of Proof in the Dialogue on Tipping	263
6. Burdens of Proof in a Forensic Debate	269
7. The Connection between Burden of Proof and Presumption	273
8. Dialectical Refinements of the Theory of Presumption	277
9. The Legal and the Everyday Notions of Presumption	279
10. Conclusions and Suggestions for Further Research	281
<i>Bibliography</i>	285
<i>Index</i>	297