

Contents

General Introduction 1

Part I

The German Discussion 16

Introduction 16

Chapter 1

A Pseudoformalistic Position: Klug 18

1. The Concept of Legal Logic 18
2. Discussion of Antilogical Doctrines. Legal Confirmation.
The Background of Legal Logic 24
3. Analogical Inference. (Formal) Logic and Heuristic "Logic".
Creative Judgment and Semantic Interpretation 32
4. Legal Inference by Inversion.
The Metalegal Character of Its Conclusion 44
5. Conversion of Law Into a Calculus. Legal "Teleologics" 48

Chapter 2

Two Nonformalistic Positions: Engisch and Simitis 53

1. Engisch on Law and Axiomatics 53
2. Engisch on the Nature of Legal Knowledge 54
3. Engisch's Concept of Material Legal Logic 56
4. Simitis on "the Problem of Legal Logic" 60

Chapter 3

An Axiologicistic Position: Heller 65

1. The Logicians' and the Lawyers' Analogical Inference.
The Inductive Nature of Legal Argument 65
 2. Legal Logic Is Essentially Deontic. The Problem of Subsumption.
The Intuitive Character of Legal Argument in Practice 68
 3. The Empirical Nature of Legal Confirmation 72
- Conclusion and Supplementary Observations 77

Part II

The Belgian Discussion 83

Introduction 83

1. Perelman and Kazemier on the Logical Specificity of Law 88
 2. Kalinowski's Denial of the Specificity of Legal Logic 91
 3. Kalinowski on Interpretation: (i) Authenticity, Meaning,
and the Resolution of Contradictions 93
 4. Kalinowski on Interpretation: (ii) The Elimination of Lacunae 95
 5. Feys and Motte on "Legal Logic, Legal Systems" 100
 6. Perelman on "Formal Logic, Legal Logic" 105
 7. Gregorowicz on "the Argument *a Maiori ad Minus* and the Problem
of Legal Logic": (i) General Stand, and Views Disavowed 109
 8. Gregorowicz on "the Argument *a Maiori ad Minus* and the Problem
of Legal Logic": (ii) Views Avowed and Constructive Ideas 116
- Conclusion and Supplementary Observations 123

Part III

The Discussion in the English-Speaking Countries 134

Introduction 134

1. Stone on "Uses and Limitations of Formal Logic
in Legal Reasoning" 139
 2. Levi: Legal Argument as a Reflection of Social Change 143
 3. Hart on "the Ascription of Responsibility and Rights" 148
 4. Hart on "Definition and Theory in Jurisprudence" 156
 5. Jensen: Legal Argument as a Nonlogical Mode of Decision 160
 6. Toulmin: Legal Argument as Archetype of Argument in General 167
 7. Hart on "Formalism and Rule-Scepticism" 176
- Conclusion and Supplementary Observations 187

General Conclusion 196

Appendix

Concerning the Third Edition of Klug's "Juristische Logik" 199

List of References 202

Index of Names 207

Subject Index 209