

NATURAL REASONS

PERSONALITY AND POLITY

S. L. Hurley

New York Oxford
OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS

CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION	3
Part I. Relations Between Mind and Value	
CHAPTER 2. OBJECTIVITY	9
1. Terminology and distinctions: cognitivism, realism, centralism, and objectivism about reasons for action	9
2. Parallels: centralism about colour, law, and logic, and some preliminary doubts	15
3. Wittgensteinian and Davidsonian arguments applied against centralism, and how the issue about centralism cuts across the issue about cognitivism	20
4. A coherence account and the threats of overdetermination and of indeterminacy	28
CHAPTER 3. DISAGREEMENT	30
1. A coherence account and the locus of disagreement	30
2. Disagreement in form of life and substantive disagreement	31
3. Practices as criteria of agreement in form of life; constraints on interpretation vs. ultra-interpretations	33
4. The antecedence doctrine and substantive disagreement; disagreement about colours?	38
5. Uncontestable concepts	43
6. Conceivably contestable concepts	45
7. Essentially contested concepts	46
8. The shifting locus of substantive disagreement and the limits of substantive and conceptual difference	50
CHAPTER 4. PREFERENCE	55
1. Survey of the arguments of three chapters and introduction to the 'problem' of the eligibility of interpretations	55
2. Conceptions of the preference relation and examples of the 'problem' involving transitivity	58
3. An intuitive introduction to the general idea of independence conditions	64

4. Mutual Preferential Independence and the individuation of criteria	69
5. The argument yet again, this time concerning Independence and the individuation of alternatives: axiom-conservatism vs. data-conservatism	76
CHAPTER 5. INTERPRETATION	84
1. The need for substantive as well as formal constraints on eligibility: a sample of views	84
2. Special feelings don't help	88
3. Constraint by natural and social environment: the rejection of psychological individualism	90
4. The mind as world-laden: naturalism vs. idealism	92
5. The role of empirical information: the causation of particular mental states vs. the individuation of their contents in terms of normal causal relations	95
6. Causal relations, causal explanations, and rational explanations	96
7. Constraint by reasons and values: interpretation does not compete with science	98
CHAPTER 6. SUBJECTIVISM	102
1. Preference as value-laden	102
2. Extended preference and interpersonal comparisons	105
3. Substantive constraints on extended preference, human nature, and ethical disagreement	112
4. Disagreement and democracy	120
Part II. Conflicting Reasons and Values	
CHAPTER 7. CONFLICT	125
1. Conflict of reasons: real or apparent?	125
2. Restricted agglomerativity: the relational form vs. the indexed form	128
3. <i>Prima facie</i> reasons vs. <i>pro tanto</i> reasons, and the absence of evidential <i>akrasia</i>	130
CHAPTER 8. AKRASIA	136
1. Irrational systems and rational subsystems; conflicts within persons and conflicts between persons	136
2. The irrationality of taking the unit of agency as fixed	145
3. Some illustrations	149
4. Collective action, self-determination, and ethics	156
5. Attributions of <i>akrasia</i> : conflict and formal vs. substantive constraints on eligibility	159

6. Some possible examples of evidential <i>akrasia</i> disposed of: the warming effect	163
CHAPTER 9. COGNITIVISM	171
1. The compatibility of conflict and cognitivism	171
2. Frege against the proliferation of force	175
3. Geach and Dummett on the proliferation of force	176
4. The independence of Frege's argument from the availability of additional modes of inference	180
5. The objection from skepticism	185
 Part III. Rationality in the Face of Conflicting Reasons	
CHAPTER 10. THEORY	189
1. The refutation of conventionalism	189
2. Emotivism and legal positivism as conventionalism	191
3. Coherence and the role of theory	193
4. Coherence, naturalism, and the authority of theory	196
5. The practice of theorizing	200
 CHAPTER 11. DELIBERATION	 203
1. A legal example	203
2. A schematic characterization of deliberation: the deliberative matrix	211
3. Three sorts of reason: deductive, practical, theoretical	217
4. An ethical example	219
 CHAPTER 12. COHERENCE	 225
1. Coherence accounts and the existence of coherence functions	225
2. The analogy between deliberation and social choice	226
3. The analogues of conditions <i>P</i> and <i>D</i>	231
4. The analogues of conditions <i>U</i> and <i>I</i>	234
5. The analogue of single-profile neutrality	241
6. The analogues of Roberts' single-profile conditions	248
7. Summary and conclusion	252
 CHAPTER 13. COMMENSURABILITY	 254
1. Domain restrictions and multi-dimensional conflict	254
2. Transitivity as commensurability vs. transitivity as coherence	256
3. Conflict, transitivity as coherence, and self-determination	260
4. The constitutive status of coherence and the possibility of pluralism	263
5. Monism, pluralism, and substantive vs. formal unity: an example	264

Part IV. Knowledge of What Should Be Done

CHAPTER 14. SKEPTICISM	273
1. Taking stock	273
2. The modal structure of deliberation, the existence of a best theory, and skepticism	274
3. The error theory, and the link to psychological states	278
4. In pursuit of error: various suppositions about explanatory primacy	279
5. In pursuit of error: explanatory primacy and debunking explanations	287
6. The possibility of evaluative knowledge: mere lack of explanatory primacy does not debunk	290
7. The debunker's dilemma, horn 1: the problematic status of counterevaluative suppositions	294
8. The debunker's dilemma, horn 2, preliminaries: projection vs. interpretation, and the explanation of supervenience	295
9. The debunker's dilemma, horn 2, concluded: the counterfactual independence assumption exposed and the naturalist alternative	302
10. Discriminating debunking and selective skepticism	309
CHAPTER 15. AUTONOMY and DEMOCRACY	314
1. Autonomy without subjectivism	314
2. The cognitive value of democracy	322
3. Tracking, debunking, and the democratic division of epistemic labour	333
4. Democracy and autonomy	348
5. Personality and polity: the convergence to full structure	356
6. Intrapersonal structure and distributive justice	360
Epilogue	383
Notes	385
Bibliography	437
Index	455