

NATURAL REASONS

PERSONALITY AND POLITY

S. L. Hurley

New York Oxford
OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS

CONTENTS

| | |
|---|----|
| CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION | 3 |
| Part I. Relations Between Mind and Value | |
| CHAPTER 2. OBJECTIVITY | 9 |
| 1. Terminology and distinctions: cognitivism, realism, centralism, and objectivism about reasons for action | 9 |
| 2. Parallels: centralism about colour, law, and logic, and some preliminary doubts | 15 |
| 3. Wittgensteinian and Davidsonian arguments applied against centralism, and how the issue about centralism cuts across the issue about cognitivism | 20 |
| 4. A coherence account and the threats of overdetermination and of indeterminacy | 28 |
| CHAPTER 3. DISAGREEMENT | 30 |
| 1. A coherence account and the locus of disagreement | 30 |
| 2. Disagreement in form of life and substantive disagreement | 31 |
| 3. Practices as criteria of agreement in form of life; constraints on interpretation vs. ultra-interpretations | 33 |
| 4. The antecedence doctrine and substantive disagreement; disagreement about colours? | 38 |
| 5. Uncontestable concepts | 43 |
| 6. Conceivably contestable concepts | 45 |
| 7. Essentially contested concepts | 46 |
| 8. The shifting locus of substantive disagreement and the limits of substantive and conceptual difference | 50 |
| CHAPTER 4. PREFERENCE | 55 |
| 1. Survey of the arguments of three chapters and introduction to the 'problem' of the eligibility of interpretations | 55 |
| 2. Conceptions of the preference relation and examples of the 'problem' involving transitivity | 58 |
| 3. An intuitive introduction to the general idea of independence conditions | 64 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| 4. Mutual Preferential Independence and the individuation of criteria | 69 |
| 5. The argument yet again, this time concerning Independence and the individuation of alternatives: axiom-conservatism vs. data-conservatism | 76 |
| CHAPTER 5. INTERPRETATION | 84 |
| 1. The need for substantive as well as formal constraints on eligibility: a sample of views | 84 |
| 2. Special feelings don't help | 88 |
| 3. Constraint by natural and social environment: the rejection of psychological individualism | 90 |
| 4. The mind as world-laden: naturalism vs. idealism | 92 |
| 5. The role of empirical information: the causation of particular mental states vs. the individuation of their contents in terms of normal causal relations | 95 |
| 6. Causal relations, causal explanations, and rational explanations | 96 |
| 7. Constraint by reasons and values: interpretation does not compete with science | 98 |
| CHAPTER 6. SUBJECTIVISM | 102 |
| 1. Preference as value-laden | 102 |
| 2. Extended preference and interpersonal comparisons | 105 |
| 3. Substantive constraints on extended preference, human nature, and ethical disagreement | 112 |
| 4. Disagreement and democracy | 120 |
| Part II. Conflicting Reasons and Values | |
| CHAPTER 7. CONFLICT | 125 |
| 1. Conflict of reasons: real or apparent? | 125 |
| 2. Restricted agglomerativity: the relational form vs. the indexed form | 128 |
| 3. <i>Prima facie</i> reasons vs. <i>pro tanto</i> reasons, and the absence of evidential <i>akrasia</i> | 130 |
| CHAPTER 8. AKRASIA | 136 |
| 1. Irrational systems and rational subsystems; conflicts within persons and conflicts between persons | 136 |
| 2. The irrationality of taking the unit of agency as fixed | 145 |
| 3. Some illustrations | 149 |
| 4. Collective action, self-determination, and ethics | 156 |
| 5. Attributions of <i>akrasia</i> : conflict and formal vs. substantive constraints on eligibility | 159 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| 6. Some possible examples of evidential <i>akrasia</i> disposed of: the warming effect | 163 |
| CHAPTER 9. COGNITIVISM | 171 |
| 1. The compatibility of conflict and cognitivism | 171 |
| 2. Frege against the proliferation of force | 175 |
| 3. Geach and Dummett on the proliferation of force | 176 |
| 4. The independence of Frege's argument from the availability of additional modes of inference | 180 |
| 5. The objection from skepticism | 185 |
| | |
| Part III. Rationality in the Face of Conflicting Reasons | |
| | |
| CHAPTER 10. THEORY | 189 |
| 1. The refutation of conventionalism | 189 |
| 2. Emotivism and legal positivism as conventionalism | 191 |
| 3. Coherence and the role of theory | 193 |
| 4. Coherence, naturalism, and the authority of theory | 196 |
| 5. The practice of theorizing | 200 |
| | |
| CHAPTER 11. DELIBERATION | 203 |
| 1. A legal example | 203 |
| 2. A schematic characterization of deliberation: the deliberative matrix | 211 |
| 3. Three sorts of reason: deductive, practical, theoretical | 217 |
| 4. An ethical example | 219 |
| | |
| CHAPTER 12. COHERENCE | 225 |
| 1. Coherence accounts and the existence of coherence functions | 225 |
| 2. The analogy between deliberation and social choice | 226 |
| 3. The analogues of conditions <i>P</i> and <i>D</i> | 231 |
| 4. The analogues of conditions <i>U</i> and <i>I</i> | 234 |
| 5. The analogue of single-profile neutrality | 241 |
| 6. The analogues of Roberts' single-profile conditions | 248 |
| 7. Summary and conclusion | 252 |
| | |
| CHAPTER 13. COMMENSURABILITY | 254 |
| 1. Domain restrictions and multi-dimensional conflict | 254 |
| 2. Transitivity as commensurability vs. transitivity as coherence | 256 |
| 3. Conflict, transitivity as coherence, and self-determination | 260 |
| 4. The constitutive status of coherence and the possibility of pluralism | 263 |
| 5. Monism, pluralism, and substantive vs. formal unity: an example | 264 |

Part IV. Knowledge of What Should Be Done

| | |
|---|------------|
| CHAPTER 14. SKEPTICISM | 273 |
| 1. Taking stock | 273 |
| 2. The modal structure of deliberation, the existence of a best theory, and skepticism | 274 |
| 3. The error theory, and the link to psychological states | 278 |
| 4. In pursuit of error: various suppositions about explanatory primacy | 279 |
| 5. In pursuit of error: explanatory primacy and debunking explanations | 287 |
| 6. The possibility of evaluative knowledge: mere lack of explanatory primacy does not debunk | 290 |
| 7. The debunker's dilemma, horn 1: the problematic status of counterevaluative suppositions | 294 |
| 8. The debunker's dilemma, horn 2, preliminaries: projection vs. interpretation, and the explanation of supervenience | 295 |
| 9. The debunker's dilemma, horn 2, concluded: the counterfactual independence assumption exposed and the naturalist alternative | 302 |
| 10. Discriminating debunking and selective skepticism | 309 |
| CHAPTER 15. AUTONOMY and DEMOCRACY | 314 |
| 1. Autonomy without subjectivism | 314 |
| 2. The cognitive value of democracy | 322 |
| 3. Tracking, debunking, and the democratic division of epistemic labour | 333 |
| 4. Democracy and autonomy | 348 |
| 5. Personality and polity: the convergence to full structure | 356 |
| 6. Intrapersonal structure and distributive justice | 360 |
| Epilogue | 383 |
| Notes | 385 |
| Bibliography | 437 |
| Index | 455 |