

David Hilbert and the Axiomatization of Physics (1898-1918)

From *Grundlagen der Geometrie* to *Grundlagen der Physik*

by

LEO CORRY

*Cohn Institute for History and Philosophy of Science,
Tel Aviv University, Israel*



KLUWER ACADEMIC PUBLISHERS

DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LONDON

CONTENTS

Preface	xi
Acknowledgements and Credits	xv
Introduction	1
Chapter 1: Late Nineteenth Century Background	11
1.1. <i>Hilbert's Early Career</i>	11
1.1.1 <i>Algebraic Invariants</i>	17
1.1.2 <i>Algebraic Number Fields</i>	20
1.1.3 <i>Deep Roots in Tradition</i>	23
1.2. <i>Foundations of Geometry</i>	25
1.2.1 <i>Riemann</i>	25
1.2.2 <i>Projective Geometry</i>	30
1.2.3 <i>Nineteenth-Century Axiomatics</i>	35
1.2.4 <i>Pasch and the Italian School</i>	40
1.3. <i>Foundations of Physics</i>	45
1.3.1 <i>Kinetic Theory, Mechanistic Foundations</i>	46
1.3.2 <i>Carl Neumann</i>	51
1.3.3 <i>Heinrich Hertz</i>	54
1.3.4 <i>Paul Volkmann</i>	61
1.3.5 <i>Ludwig Boltzmann</i>	63
1.3.6 <i>Aurel Voss</i>	66
1.4. <i>Mathematics and Physics in Göttingen at the Turn of the Century</i>	71
1.4.1 <i>Felix Klein</i>	72
1.4.2 <i>The Physicists</i>	78

Chapter 2: Axiomatization in Hilbert's Early Career	83
2.1. <i>Axiomatics, Geometry and Physics in Hilbert's Early Lectures</i>	83
2.1.1 <i>Geometry in Königsberg.....</i>	83
2.1.2 <i>Geometry in Göttingen</i>	89
2.1.3 <i>Mechanics in Göttingen.....</i>	91
2.2. <i>Grundlagen der Geometrie.....</i>	93
2.2.1 <i>Independence, Simplicity, Completeness</i>	95
2.2.2 <i>Fundamental Theorems of Projective Geometry.....</i>	97
2.2.3 <i>On the Concept of Number</i>	99
2.3. <i>The 1900 List of Problems</i>	101
2.3.1 <i>Foundational Problems</i>	104
2.3.2 <i>A Context for the Sixth Problem</i>	109
2.4. <i>Early Reactions to the Grundlagen.....</i>	110
Chapter 3: The Axiomatic Method in Action: 1900-1905.....	119
3.1. <i>Foundational Concerns – Empiricist Standpoint.....</i>	120
3.2. <i>Hilbert and Physics in Göttingen circa 1905.....</i>	127
3.3. <i>Axioms for Physical Theories: Hilbert's 1905 Lectures</i>	138
3.3.1 <i>Mechanics.....</i>	138
3.3.2 <i>Thermodynamics.....</i>	154
3.3.3 <i>Probability Calculus.....</i>	164
3.3.4 <i>Kinetic Theory of Gases</i>	168
3.3.5 <i>Insurance Mathematics.....</i>	171
3.3.6 <i>Electrodynamics</i>	172
3.3.7 <i>Psychophysics.....</i>	175
3.3.8 <i>A post-1909 addendum.....</i>	178
3.4. <i>The Axiomatization Program by 1905 – Partial Summary.....</i>	179
Chapter 4: Minkowski and Relativity: 1907-1909	185
4.1. <i>The Principle of Relativity</i>	189
4.2. <i>The Basic Equations of Electromagnetic Processes</i> <i>in Moving Bodies</i>	193
4.2.1 <i>Three Meanings of "Relativity"</i>	193
4.2.2 <i>Axioms of Electrodynamics</i>	195
4.2.3 <i>Relativity and Mechanics.....</i>	197
4.2.4 <i>Relativity and Gravitation</i>	200
4.3. <i>Space and Time.....</i>	206
4.3.1 <i>Groups of Transformations</i>	208
4.3.2 <i>Empirical Considerations.....</i>	210
4.3.3 <i>Relativity and Existing Physical Theories</i>	212
4.4. <i>Max Born, Relativity, and the Theories of the Electron.....</i>	213
4.4.1 <i>Rigid Bodies.....</i>	217
4.5. <i>Minkowski, Axiomatics and Relativity – Summary</i>	219

Chapter 5: From Mechanical to Electromagnetic Reductionism:

1910-1914	227
5.1. <i>Lectures on Mechanics and Continuum Mechanics.....</i>	234
5.2. <i>Kinetic Theory.....</i>	236
5.3. <i>Radiation Theory.....</i>	242
5.3.1 <i>Hilbert and Kirchhoff's Law: 1912</i>	247
5.3.2 <i>Reactions and Sequels: Early 1913</i>	253
5.3.3 <i>Pringsheim's Criticism: 1913.....</i>	259
5.3.4 <i>Hilbert's Final Version: 1914</i>	263
5.3.5 <i>Kinetic and Radiation Theory: General Remarks</i>	265
5.4. <i>Structure of Matter and Relativity: 1912-1914.....</i>	267
5.4.1 <i>Molecular Theory of Matter - 1912-13.....</i>	267
5.4.2 <i>Electron Theory: 1913.....</i>	271
5.4.3 <i>Axiomatization of Physics: 1913</i>	274
5.4.4 <i>Electromagnetic Oscillations: 1913-14.....</i>	279
5.5. <i>Broadening Physical Horizons - Concluding Remarks.....</i>	284

Chapter 6: Einstein and Mie: Two Pillars of Hilbert's Unified Theory..... 287

6.1. <i>Einstein's Way to General Relativity.....</i>	287
6.2. <i>Mie's Electromagnetic Theory of Matter.....</i>	298
6.2.1 <i>First and Second Installment: Early 1912.....</i>	299
6.2.2 <i>Third Installment: November 1912.....</i>	304
6.3. <i>Contemporary Debates on Gravitation.....</i>	306
6.4. <i>Born's Formulation of Mie's Theory.....</i>	309
6.5. <i>The Background to Hilbert's Unified Theory – Summary</i>	315

Chapter 7: Foundations of Physics: 1915-1916 317

7.1. <i>Einstein in Göttingen – Summer of 1915</i>	320
7.2. <i>Hilbert's Unified Theory – General Considerations.....</i>	330
7.3. <i>Hilbert's Communication to the GWG – November 1915</i>	334
7.3.1 <i>Axioms and Basic Assumptions</i>	334
7.3.2 <i>The Hamiltonian Function and the Field Equations .</i>	340
7.3.3 <i>Summary and Additional Considerations.....</i>	343
7.4. <i>The Hilbert-Einstein Correspondence and Einstein's Four Communications – November 1915</i>	345
7.5. <i>Hilbert's Unified Theory: First Printed Version – March 1916.....</i>	355
7.6. <i>Foundations of Physics – Summary.....</i>	360

Chapter 8: Hilbert and GTR: 1916-1918	363
8.1. <i>Mie's Reaction</i>	370
8.2. <i>Einstein's Reaction</i>	373
8.3. <i>Hilbert Teaches GTR – 1916-1917</i>	376
8.4. <i>Hilbert's Second Communication – December 1916</i>	384
8.5. <i>Göttingen Debates on Energy Conservation in GTR – 1918</i>	388
8.6. <i>Later Talks and Writings on GTR</i>	392
8.7. <i>Last Versions of Hilbert's Theory</i>	399
8.8. <i>Hilbert's Way to GTR – Summary and Concluding Remarks</i>	403
Chapter 9: Epilogue	409
9.1. <i>Foundations of Quantum Theory</i>	414
9.2. <i>The Culture of "Nostrification" in Göttingen</i>	419
9.3. <i>General Relativity and Geometry</i>	423
9.4. <i>Hilbert and Participant Histories of GTR</i>	431
9.5. <i>Hilbert and Physics – Concluding Remarks</i>	437
Appendix 1: General Chronology of Events Mentioned in the Text	445
Appendix 2: Hilbert's Göttingen Courses on Physics	450
Appendix 3: Seminars, Miscellaneous Lectures	453
3.A. <i>Advanced Seminars Taught by Hilbert</i>	453
3.B. <i>Public Lectures by Hilbert</i>	453
3.C. <i>Physical lectures at the GMG and GWG by Hilbert</i>	454
3.D. <i>Lectures on Physical Issues at the GMG by Others</i>	454
Appendix 4: Hilbert's Physics Assistants and Doctoral Students	458
4.A. <i>Assistants for Physics</i>	458
4.B. <i>Doctoral Students on Physical Topics</i>	458
Appendix 5: Letters Quoted in the Book	459
Appendix 6: Items from the Hilbert <i>Nachlass</i> referred to in the Book	462
Appendix 7: Hilbert's Axioms for Radiation Theory	465
References	467
<i>Commonly Used Abbreviations</i>	467
<i>Published and Unpublished Sources</i>	469
INDEX	497