

Contents – Summary

List of abbreviations	19
Introduction	23
<i>Part I – The system of international investment law & arbitration and extraneous rules of international law</i>	
Chapter 1: The Relevance of Extraneous Rules in the System of International Investment Law & Arbitration	37
<i>Part II - Article 31(3)(c) vclt and the 'principle of systemic integration'</i>	
Chapter 2: The Elements of Article 31(3)(c) VCLT	95
Chapter 3: The 'Principle of Systemic Integration' and other Elements of Treaty Interpretation	217
<i>Part III – Article 31(3)(c) vclt and the 'principle of systemic integration' in investment law & arbitration</i>	
Chapter 4: The interpretation of investment treaties	247
Chapter 5: The Interpretation of Investment Treaties and Extraneous Rules of General International Law	283
Chapter 6: The Interpretation of Investment Treaties and Extraneous Rules of International Law of the Same Subject-Matter	305

Chapter 7: The Interpretation of Investment Treaties and Extraneous Rules of International Law not of the Same Subject-Matter – Article 31(3)(C) VCLT and the ‘Principle of Systemic Integration’ – A Means to Reconcile Apparent Norm Conflicts in International Investment Law?	363
Conclusion	457
Table of treaties and legal documents	463
Table of cases	473
Bibliography	493

Contents

List of abbreviations	19
Introduction	23
<i>Part I – The system of international investment law & arbitration and extraneous rules of international law</i>	
Chapter 1: The Relevance of Extraneous Rules in the System of International Investment Law & Arbitration	37
A. Introduction	37
B. The system of international investment law & arbitration	38
I. The sources of international investment rights and obligations	38
II. The basic structure and contents of IIAs	40
1. Preamble – a reference to the object and purpose of IIAs	40
2. Definition of investment	41
3. Exceptions: taxation and essential security interests	43
4. Substantive rights	44
(a) Fair and equitable treatment	45
(b) Expropriation	46
(c) National treatment and most-favoured-nation treatment	48
(d) Arbitrary or discriminatory measures	50
5. Wider considerations in investment treaties	54
6. Further aspects of investment treaties	56
III. Dispute settlement in international investment law	58
1. Investor-state arbitration	58
2. State to state disputes	59
3. The characteristics and advantages of international arbitration	60

4. The limited jurisdiction of investment tribunals	66
(a) Jurisdiction <i>ratione materiae</i>	66
(b) Jurisdiction <i>ratione personae</i>	72
5. Extraneous rules as applicable law in investment disputes	73
(a) Procedural law	73
(b) Investment treaties	74
C. The relevance of extraneous rules	78
I. Extraneous rules of general international law	79
II. Extraneous rules of international law dealing with the same or similar subject-matter as investment treaty provisions	81
III. Extraneous rules of international law not dealing with the same or similar subject-matter as investment treaty provisions	88
D. Conclusion	90

Part II - Article 31(3)(c) vclt and the 'principle of systemic integration'

Chapter 2: The Elements of Article 31(3)(c) VCLT	95
A. Introduction	95
B. 'Any rules of international law'	96
I. 'Any rules of international law' as a reference to the formal sources of international law	96
II. 'Any rules of international law' as a reference to all sources of international law	99
1. Customary law	99
2. General principles of law	100
3. Treaties	103
4. Other sources of law	110
III. 'Any rules of international law' and non-binding instruments	111
IV. Conclusion	114

C	The temporal scope of Article 31(3)(c) VCLT	114
	I. The principle of contemporaneity and the inter-temporal law	115
	1. The principle of contemporaneity	115
	2. The inter-temporal law	118
	II. The interpretation of Article 31(3)(c) VCLT	121
	1. The general rule of treaty interpretation	121
	2. The drafting history of Article 31(3)(c) VCLT	123
	Discussion in the ILC, 728 th and 729 th meeting – 21 and 22 May 1964	124
	3. Conclusion on the interpretation of Article 31(3)(c) VCLT	147
	III. The temporal element in general international law	148
	IV. Conclusion	155
D.	‘Relevant’	157
	I. ‘Relevant’ as reference to ‘the same subject-matter’	157
	II. The wording, context and object and purpose of Article 31(3)(c) VCLT	159
	III. The drafting history of Article 31(3)(c) VCLT	160
	IV. Conclusion	161
E.	‘Applicable in the relations between the parties’	161
	I. Views and merits	164
	1. The narrow interpretation: <i>all treaty parties</i>	164
	2. The divergent interpretation: <i>the parties to a dispute or treaty</i>	167
	3. The broad interpretation: <i>one of the parties to a dispute</i>	168
	II. Limits to treaty interpretation	169
	1. The object and purpose of the treaty	170
	2. The <i>pacta tertiis</i> principle	172
	III. Legal analysis	175
	1. Wording	175
	2. Context	179
	3. The principle of effectiveness	184
	4. The drafting history of Article 31(3)(c) VCLT	193
	IV. Conclusion	195

F. 'There shall be taken into account, together with the context:'	196
I. Relevant rules of international law in treaty interpretation	197
1. The terms used in the treaty have a well-recognized meaning in customary international law	197
2. The terms of the treaty are by their nature open-textured and reference to other sources of international law will assist in giving content to the rule	199
3. Treaty rule is unclear and its meaning is determined by reference to a developed body of international law	200
II. Legal restrictions on the impact of relevant rules on treaty interpretation	202
1. Express derogation from other relevant rules	203
2. Wording	204
3. Different implementation mechanisms	205
(a) Limited jurisdiction of an international tribunal	205
(b) Different organizational structures between regime of the treaty under interpretation and regime of the referred rule	212
4. Inter-organization principle of good neighbourliness ('Störungsverbot')	213
III. The interpretative weight of relevant rules of international law	213
IV. Conclusion	214
G. Conclusion	215
 Chapter 3: The 'Principle of Systemic Integration' and other Elements of Treaty Interpretation	 217
A. Introduction	217
B. Ordinary and special meaning, Article 31(1) and (4) VCLT	217
I. Explicit references	217
II. Specialized or technical meaning	221
III. Special meaning	225
IV. Conclusion	227
C. Subsequent agreement and subsequent practice, Article 31(3)(a) and (b) VCLT	228
I. Subsequent agreements	229
II. Subsequent practice	234

III. Conclusion	242
D. Conclusion	243
 <i>Part III – Article 31(3)(c) vclt and the ‘principle of systemic integration’ in investment law & arbitration</i>	
Chapter 4: The interpretation of investment treaties	247
A. Introduction	247
B. Articles 31 and 32 of the VCLT	247
C. The authority of precedents in investment arbitration	256
D. Article 31(3)(c) VCLT in investment arbitration	258
E. The private law model of investment treaty arbitration: procedural implications on the interpretation of investment treaties in the light of other relevant rules of international law	262
I. Party autonomy as the guiding principle in investment arbitration	263
II. The (non-)invocation of extraneous rules by the disputing parties	266
III. The discontinuation of proceedings	268
1. <i>Foresti v. South Africa</i>	269
2. <i>Aguas del Tunari v. Bolivia</i>	270
IV. The invocation of extraneous rules by third parties	272
1. <i>Amicus curiae</i> in investor-state arbitration	272
2. The limited impact of <i>amicus</i> submissions on final awards of investment tribunals	276
V. The role of the arbitral tribunal	279
F. Conclusion	280
Chapter 5: The Interpretation of Investment Treaties and Extraneous Rules of General International Law	283
A. Introduction	283
B. The interpretation of investment treaties in the light of general international law	284
I. The gap-filling function of general international law	284

II. The elucidation of undefined treaty terms by reference to general international law	287
C. Treaty provisions as <i>lex specialis</i> and references to general international law	289
I. <i>Loewen v. United States</i> and the requirement to exhaust local remedies	290
II. The Argentina cases and the essential security interests clause in Article XI US-Argentina BIT	292
D. Conclusion	301
Chapter 6: The Interpretation of Investment Treaties and Extraneous Rules of International Law of the Same Subject-Matter	305
A. Introduction	305
B. References to customary international law and general principles of law	306
I. The interpretation of FET	306
1. FET linked to international law	306
2. FET as free-standing standard	313
3. Conclusion	315
II. The interpretation of the prohibition of unlawful expropriation	315
III. Issues relating to treaty interpretation in light of customary international law	319
1. Identifying the existence and content of rules of international investment law	319
2. The influence of IIAs on customary international law	326
(a) IIAs as contributor to the development of customary international law	328
(b) IIAs as <i>quid pro quos</i>	330
C. References to extraneous treaty provisions	333
I. The interpretation of non-discrimination provisions in light of international trade law	334
1. The ‘like circumstances’ criterion	335
(a) ‘Like circumstances’ as key element of non-discrimination provisions in IIAs	335
(b) ‘Like circumstances’ as operative element or exception	339

2. Less favourable treatment	343
3. Application of the MFN clause to dispute settlement provisions	346
4. Conclusion	348
II. The protection from unlawful expropriation and the human right to property	349
1. <i>Lauder v. Czech Republic</i>	349
2. <i>Tecmed v. Mexico</i>	351
3. <i>Azurix v. Argentina</i>	353
4. <i>Saipem v. Bangladesh</i>	354
5. Conclusion	355
III. Limitations on references to extraneous treaty rules: the example of non-discrimination provisions in investment treaties and in international trade law	356
D. Conclusion	360
Chapter 7: The Interpretation of Investment Treaties and Extraneous Rules of International Law not of the Same Subject-Matter – Article 31(3)(C) VCLT and the ‘Principle of Systemic Integration’ – A Means to Reconcile Apparent Norm Conflicts in International Investment Law?	
A. Introduction	363
B. Norm conflicts in international investment law	364
I. Norm conflicts and conflict resolution techniques in international law	364
II. Norm conflicts in international investment law – a case study	365
1. <i>Suez, Sociedad General de Aguas de Barcelona, S.A. and Vivendi Universal, S.A. v. Argentina</i>	366
(a) Case facts and investor claims	366
(b) The human rights context of the dispute and Argentina’s obligations under international law	367
(c) The arguments made by Argentina and the <i>amici</i> in the light of Argentina’s human rights obligations	373
(d) The tribunal’s decision	374
2. <i>Glamis Gold v. United States of America</i>	376
(a) Case facts and investor claims	376
(b) The international law context of the dispute	377

(c) The arguments raised by the United States and the amicus curiae	379
(d) The tribunal's decision	381
3. <i>Sempra v. Argentina</i>	382
(a) Case facts and investor claims	382
(b) The arguments made by Argentina	383
(c) The tribunal's decision	383
4. <i>UPS v. Canada</i>	384
(a) Case facts and investor claims	384
(b) The tribunal's decision	384
5. <i>Siemens v. Argentina</i>	385
(a) Case facts and investor claim	385
(b) Argentina's arguments	385
(c) The tribunal's decision	385
6. <i>Azurix v. Argentina</i>	386
(a) Case facts and investor claim	386
(b) Argentina's arguments	386
(c) The tribunal's decision	387
7. <i>S. D. Myers v. Canada</i>	387
(a) Case facts and investor claims	387
(b) Canada's arguments	388
(c) The international law context of the dispute	389
(d) The tribunal's decision	391
8. Conclusion	391
C. The entry points for and relevance of extraneous rules of international law in the interpretation of investment treaties	392
I. General exception clauses and extraneous rules	393
II. Non-discrimination provisions and extraneous rules	395
1. Specific exception clauses relating to non- discriminatory provisions	395
2. Public policy considerations and the 'like circumstances' requirement	396
III. The protection from unlawful expropriation and extraneous rules	404
1. Direct expropriations	404
2. Indirect expropriations and non compensable regulatory measures	405
(a) 'Sole effects doctrine'	405

(b) Police powers doctrine	413
(c) State's right to regulate – margin of appreciation and the principle of proportionality	420
(d) The interpretative impact of extraneous rules according to the different doctrines	425
3. Lawfulness	426
4. Compensation	427
IV. The fair and equitable treatment standard and extraneous rules	437
1. 'A stable legal and business framework'	441
2. Legitimate expectations subject to qualifying requirements	443
V. Conclusion	449
D. Norm conflict avoidance by harmonious interpretation in international investment law	450
E. Conclusion	455
Conclusion	457
Table of treaties and legal documents	463
Table of cases	473
Bibliography	493