

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Test Data Exclusivity: A Primer	3
1.1.1	The Issue	7
1.1.2	Test Data Exclusivity vs. Other Forms of Protections	10
1.1.3	Exceptions to and Limitations of Test Data Exclusivity Protection	14
1.2	Free Trade Agreements and Test Data Exclusivity	14
1.3	Research Question	18
1.4	Structure of the Dissertation	19
2	Test Data Exclusivity: <i>Raison d'être</i>	21
2.1	Justification for Test Data Exclusivity in the Light of Economic Theory: The Incentive and Public Goods Theory of Intellectual Property	21
2.1.1	Test Data as Public Good: Is the Incentive Theory Applicable?	23
2.1.2	Test Data Exclusivity: An Incentive for New Pharmaceutical Products?	25
2.2	Trends in Pharmaceutical Innovation	26
2.3	Impact of Test Data Exclusivity in Selected Developing Countries	30
2.3.1	Jordan	31
2.3.2	Guatemala	32
2.3.3	Colombia	32
2.4	Conclusion	33
3	Test Data Exclusivity and Art 39(3) TRIPS	35
3.1	Treaty Interpretation	37
3.2	Protection Against 'Unfair Commercial Use': Interpretation as per Art 31 VCLT	39
3.2.1	Ordinary Meaning of 'Unfair Commercial Use'	39

3.2.2	Context of ‘Protection Against Unfair Commercial Use’ . . .	46
3.2.3	Object and Purpose	51
3.2.4	Subsequent Agreement as per Art 31(3)(a) VCLT: <i>The Doha Declaration</i>	57
3.2.5	Subsequent Practice of the Parties as per Art 31(3)(b) VCLT	60
3.2.6	Relevant Rules of International Law as per Art 31(3)(c) VCLT	63
3.2.7	Conclusion from Art 31 VCLT	64
3.3	Art 32 VCLT, the Supplementary Means of Interpretation: <i>travaux préparatoires</i> and the Circumstances of Conclusion of TRIPS	65
3.3.1	Negotiation History of TRIPS	65
3.3.2	The Circumstances of Conclusion of TRIPS	77
3.4	Summary as per Arts 31 and 32 VCLT	79
3.5	Conditions of Protection Pursuant to Art 39(3) TRIPS	79
3.5.1	Submission of Data as a Condition for Approval of a Pharmaceutical	80
3.5.2	Data Relating Only to Pharmaceutical Utilizing a New Chemical Entity	82
3.5.3	Undisclosed Test or Other Data	87
3.5.4	Considerable Effort	89
3.6	Conclusions	91
4	Test Data Exclusivity in the US and the EU	93
4.1	United States	93
4.1.1	Hatch-Waxman Act, 1984	94
4.1.2	Biologic Price Competition and Innovation Act (BPCIA)	101
4.2	Europe	113
4.2.1	The Old System	114
4.2.2	Current Regime of Test Data Exclusivity in Europe	118
4.2.3	Test Data Exclusivity for Biological Pharmaceutical Products	126
4.2.4	EMA New Policy of Publication of Test Data	126
4.3	Conclusion	127
5	Index of Data Exclusivity and Access (IDEAS): Free Trade Agreements	129
5.1	Existing Indexes	129
5.2	IDEAS: Methodology	130
5.2.1	Category A: Proximity to Art 39(3) TRIPS	132
5.2.2	Category B: Strength of Test Data Exclusivity Protection	132
5.2.3	Category C: Duration of Data Exclusivity Protection	133
5.2.4	Category D: Inclusion of Exceptions/Access Enabling Provisions	133

5.3	Robustness of IDEAS-FTAs	133
5.4	IDEAS: FTAs—Analysis	134
5.4.1	FTA Rankings	134
5.4.2	Overall IDEAS-FTA Scores	134
5.4.3	FTA Scores on Different Categories	136
5.4.4	Test Data Exclusivity and Access in FTAs Over Time	142
5.4.5	FTA Hub-and-Spokes	143
5.4.6	Analysis of FTAs Based on Geographical Proximity	167
5.4.7	Trans-Pacific Partnership (TPP) Agreement	184
5.4.8	Insights	191
6	Index of Data Exclusivity and Access (IDEAS): National Laws	193
6.1	IDEAS Methodology: National Laws	194
6.2	General Observations	197
6.3	Robustness of IDEAS: National Laws	198
6.4	IDEAS: National Laws—Analysis	198
6.4.1	National Law Rankings	199
6.4.2	Overall Scores	200
6.4.3	Scores on Different Categories	201
6.5	Conclusion	207
7	Test Data Exclusivity in FTAs and Access to Originator Pharmaceuticals	209
7.1	Prohibition of Reliance on Foreign Marketing Approval and Test Data	210
7.2	Impact of the Prohibition of Reliance on Availability of Originator and Generic Pharmaceuticals	212
7.2.1	No Data Exclusivity	213
7.2.2	EU FTA: Strategy 1 (Sequential Filing)	213
7.2.3	EU FTA: Strategy 2 (Simultaneous Filing)	214
7.2.4	US FTA: Strategy 1 (Sequential Filing)	215
7.2.5	US FTA: Strategy 2 (Simultaneous Filing)	216
7.2.6	Impact on Originator Company’s Revenues (Market Share)	216
7.2.7	Insights	218
8	Conclusions and Recommendations	221
8.1	Conclusions of the Chapters	221
8.2	Recommendations	223
8.2.1	FTA Negotiations	223
8.2.2	FTA Provisions	224
8.2.3	National Provisions	228
8.3	Way Forward	231

Annex I: IDEAS—FTA Calculations	233
US FTAs	233
EFTA FTAs	234
EU FTAs	235
Final Scores for Countries with Three FTAs	236
Annex II: IDEAS—National Law Calculation	237
Bibliography	239