

Contents

1	Criminal Justice in Need of a Paradigm Shift	1
1.1	The Current Situation of Victims' Rights in Europe: Common Rights Without a Common Rationale	1
1.2	A State-Centred Versus a Human-Rights Based Approach	3
1.3	Conceptualising the Victim	9
1.3.1	The Witness Paradigm	9
1.3.2	The Economic Model: The Damaged Victim as Civil Party	13
1.3.3	The Harm Paradigm: The Harmed and Vulnerable Victim in Need and Deserving of Support, Protection and State Compensation	15
1.3.4	Private Accusation and the Victim's Right to Enforce Public Prosecution	21
1.3.5	The Rights Paradigm	22
1.3.6	Victims' Primary, Secondary and Tertiary Rights	23
1.4	The Emerging Paradigm: States' Duty to Combat Impunity	24
1.4.1	In Need of a Paradigm Shift	24
1.4.2	The Fundamental Inconsistency Between the Traditional Paradigm and Victims' Rights	24
1.4.3	The Necessity to Depart from Substantive Criminal Law	26
1.5	First Seismic Activity	28
1.5.1	A Notable Root-Cause: Anti-Authoritarian Scepticism	28
1.5.2	First Indications of a Paradigm Shift at the International Level	30
1.5.3	The Inter-American Court of Human Rights (IACtHR)	32
1.5.4	The European Court of Human Rights on States' Obligations to Protect Rights	33

1.5.5	States' Obligations to Protect by Means of Enacting and Enforcing Criminal Law Provisions	35
1.5.6	The ECtHR's Two Approaches to Criminal Law	41
1.5.7	Relations Between the Procedural Aspects and Article 13 ECHR	42
1.5.8	Criminal Justice Serving to Eradicate Impunity of Grave Human Rights Violations	45
1.5.9	The Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court	47
1.5.10	Recent Developments at State Level	48
1.6	Affirmative Versus Critical Criminal Law Doctrine	51
1.6.1	Deterrent Punishment Disregards the Victim	52
1.6.2	Deterrent Punishment Disregards the Offender	53
1.6.3	Kant's Principle	54
1.6.4	Affirmative Criminal Law Doctrine	56
1.6.5	Human Dignity and Human Rights as Limitations of Criminal Law	58
1.6.6	The Victim's Rights Alone Cannot Justify the Punishment of the Offender	60
1.6.7	Conclusion and Outlook	61
	References	62
2	Punishment and Human Sociality	65
2.1	Why Punish? Three Questions to Explore	65
2.2	The Ultrasociality Riddle	67
2.3	Public Goods, Free Riding and Punishment in Game-Theory Experiments	70
2.3.1	In a Public Goods Game, Peer Punishment Enables a Group's Cooperation	70
2.3.2	The Crucial Role of Third Parties: Punishment is Premised on an Emerging Normative Consensus	72
2.3.3	A Norm is a Public Good	75
2.4	The Inherent Psychology of Punishment	78
2.4.1	Hypothesizing: Deterrent Punishing Versus Retribution	78
2.4.2	Deterrence Does Not Hold the Answer (I)	80
2.4.3	Betrayal Aversion and Conditional Cooperation	81
2.4.4	Punishment is a Second-Order Public Good	86
2.4.5	Non-strategic, Expressive Punishment Driven by Strong Emotions	87
2.5	Punitive Sentiments	89
2.5.1	The Central Concern: the Wrong Suffered by the Victim	90
2.5.2	Indignation and Just Desert	92
2.5.3	The Inclination to Punish Defectors Bonds with Sympathy for Victims	93

2.6	The Genetic and Neural Basis of Punishing	95
2.6.1	Flexible Social Norms and Persistent Punishing	96
2.6.2	Multilevel Selection	97
2.6.3	Gene-Culture Coevolution (GCC)	98
2.6.4	Dual Inheritance Theory and the Normative Animal	100
2.6.5	Ostracism	104
2.6.6	Empathic Reactions of Newborns and Infants' Sympathy for Victims	106
2.6.7	Infants' Aversion Against Obstructive Behaviour and Appreciation of Punishment	108
2.6.8	'Inherent' and Conventional Wrong	110
2.6.9	The Neural Basis of Retributive Punishment	110
2.7	The Mechanism of Punishment	112
2.7.1	The Semantics of Punishing: Punishment as Censure	112
2.7.2	Punishment as Hardship	114
2.7.3	Sharing in the Costs of a Norm: The 'Fairness' of Punishment	116
2.7.4	Deterrence Does Not Hold the Answer (II)	118
2.7.5	For Comparison: Deterrent 'Punishing' in Animals	121
2.7.6	'Mutualism' and 'Nosism'	123
2.8	In Conclusion: Why Punish?	126
	References	131
3	Human Dignity: The Right to be a Person	139
3.1	What this Chapter is About: Human Dignity and its Development	139
3.2	Kant and the Concept of Innate Human Dignity	144
3.2.1	Human Beings Existing in Nature and Culture	147
3.2.2	Freedom, Autonomy and Dignity	148
3.2.3	Legislation Based on Human Dignity	150
3.2.4	God's Voice as Innate Conscience	153
3.2.5	Political Implications	157
3.3	Body, Soul and Agency	160
3.3.1	Orders of Consciousness	161
3.3.2	The 'I'	162
3.4	Fichte and Human Dignity as the Right to be a Person and to Partake in Human Culture	164
3.4.1	The Dignity of All Who Carry a Human Face	165
3.4.2	Fichte's Theory of Calling (<i>Aufforderung</i>)	168
3.4.3	The Concept of a Human Being is the Concept of Humankind	174
3.4.4	Fichte on the Cosmopolitan Right "to go about freely on the earth"	176
3.4.5	The Socialised Person	179
3.4.6	Society's Call Prompts Agency	184
3.4.7	Generating a Normative Order	186

3.4.8	Individuation	195
3.4.9	The Crucial Importance of Fichte's Concept of Human Dignity	198
3.5	The Development of Human Rights	201
3.5.1	The First Generation: Liberal Constitutionalism and Human Rights as a Subject's Private Freedom	202
3.5.2	The Second Generation: Liberal Nation States and Human Rights as the Political Rights of Equal Citizens	203
3.5.3	The Third Generation: the Welfare State and Social Rights	205
3.5.4	The Fourth Generation: Solidarity of Humankind and Universal Rights in a Global Order	207
3.6	Human Dignity Overcoming Collectivism and Nationalism	211
3.6.1	Individualism and Universal Rights	213
3.6.2	The Sovereign Nation	217
3.6.3	The Sovereign Individual	219
3.7	The Second Enlightenment: from Liberal Democracy to a Humanist Society	224
3.7.1	The Mistake of Innate Autonomy and Unrestricted Moral Relativism	225
3.7.2	In Need of a Second Enlightenment	227
3.7.3	The Evolution of the Normative Order	229
3.7.4	Alienating Socialisation	232
3.7.5	Particularistic Morality and Totalitarianism	241
3.7.6	Defending the Preconditions of a Humanist Society	244
3.7.7	The Primacy of Human Dignity and Human Rights: Humanism Overcoming Unconstrained Majoritarianism	250
3.8	Human Dignity as the Foundation and Guiding Principle of a Global Humanist Society	255
3.8.1	Human Dignity and Human Rights are Normative Categories	258
3.8.2	The Structure of a Global Humanist Society	261
3.8.3	Horizontal Societal Differentiation Fostering Pluralism	264
3.9	Human Rights and Obligations	265
3.9.1	Respect and Care	266
3.9.2	Formation Rights and Corresponding Obligations	268
3.9.3	Care Rights	270
3.9.4	Autonomy Rights	271
3.9.5	Resource Rights	273
3.9.6	Rights are to be Practically Effective	274
3.9.7	The Effectivity of Rights is Premised on a Decent Social Order	275
3.10	In Conclusion: Why Human Dignity?	276

3.10.1	Why Normativity?	277
3.10.2	The Crucial Challenge: Legitimising Normativity Under Conditions of Modernity	278
3.10.3	Dignity Norms and Conventional Norms	281
3.10.4	Making a Virtue of Necessity	282
	References	284
4	Criminal Justice Respecting Human Dignity	293
4.1	What this Chapter is about	293
4.1.1	Restrictions Inherent in a System of Criminal Justice Founded on Human Dignity	295
4.1.2	Establishing the Truth, Convicting, Sentencing and Punishing Offenders	296
4.1.3	Criminal Justice in Transition from a Nation State Paradigm to a Humanist Society	298
4.2	The Nation State: Criminal Law Unleashed	299
4.2.1	Franz von Liszt	299
4.2.2	Ernst Beling	301
4.2.3	Overcoming the Nation State in Criminal Law	303
4.3	A Fresh Start: Human Dignity and the Principle of Guilt	305
4.3.1	The Paradox of Deterrence	305
4.3.2	Calling on the Offender	307
4.3.3	Human Dignity, the Principle of Guilt and Limits of European Integration	309
4.4	The Offender's Right to be Held to Account	312
4.4.1	Choosing Punishment?	312
4.4.2	Fichte's "Expiation Contract" and a Citizen's Right to be Punished	315
4.4.3	Max Scheler: Punishment as Atonement and Reconciliation	317
4.4.4	A Right to Hardship?	319
4.4.5	Expiation and the Nation State	321
4.4.6	The Justification of Punishment	322
4.5	Defining the Limits of Criminal Law	323
4.5.1	Kant Does Not Hold the Answer	323
4.5.2	Criminal Law and Punishment Limited to Preserving Dignity Rights	324
4.5.3	Criminalisation: the Message Sent by Criminal Law	328
4.5.4	The Scope of Criminal Law Based on Human Dignity	329
4.5.5	Criminal Law Relating to Different Categories of Human Rights	332
4.6	A Crime Victim's Secondary Rights	333
4.6.1	Right to Non-recurrence	334
4.6.2	Right to be Treated with Care and Respect	335
4.7	A Killed Victim's Right to the Punishment of Her Murderer	336
4.8	The Victim's Right to Justice	341

4.8.1	Right to the Truth	344
4.8.2	Right to the Conviction of Offenders	345
4.8.3	Right to the Punishment of Offenders and to the Compensation of Damages	346
4.8.4	Right to Access Justice	347
4.9	The Relation Between the Victim's and the Offender's Rights . . .	347
4.10	Restoring the Offender's Full Status as a Member of Her Legal Community	348
4.10.1	Punishment as Hardship	349
4.10.2	Criminal Justice Serves the Offender's Formation	351
4.10.3	Punishment: Exclusion or Inclusion?	352
4.10.4	The Offender's Right to Her Full Rehabilitation	355
4.11	Everyone's Right to the Security of Their Rights	356
	References	357
5	Differences Between Traditional Criminal Justice and a Human Dignity Based Approach	363
5.1	Justice for Victims, Offenders and All Others: the Line of Argument	363
5.1.1	The Incompatibility Between the Traditional Concept of Criminal Justice and Victims' Participation in Proceedings	363
5.1.2	A New Paradigm and Start-Up Difficulties	365
5.1.3	The Animal That Punishes	366
5.1.4	Human Dignity as the Right to be a Person	366
5.1.5	Criminal Justice Supporting the Formation of Persons . . .	368
5.2	The Deep Roots of the Traditional State-Centred Paradigm	369
5.2.1	Deontological Versus Consequentialist Ethics	369
5.2.2	Consequentialism in Ethics and Legal Theory	371
5.2.3	Empiricism and Objectivity	372
5.2.4	Is There an Escape from Consequentialism?	373
5.3	From Technical Rationality to Lively Communication	374
5.3.1	Criminal Justice as a System of Acts of Communication	374
5.3.2	From Manipulation to Conviviality: Making Criminal Justice a Participatory Institution	376
5.3.3	The Promise of Objectivity and the Myth of the Vindictive Victim	378
5.3.4	Criminal Justice as Restoration of the Normative Order and the Persons Concerned	381
5.4	In Conclusion	384
	References	386
	Table of Cases	389
	Index	395