

# Contents

xi	<i>Foreword</i>
xiii	<i>Acknowledgments</i>
xvii	<i>Abbreviations</i>
<b>1</b>	<b>Overview: Learning to realize education's promise</b>
4	The three dimensions of the learning crisis
16	How to realize education's promise: Three policy responses
27	Learning to realize education's promise
<b>37</b>	<b>Part I: Education's promise</b>
<b>38</b>	<b>Chapter 1: Schooling, learning, and the promise of education</b>
38	Education as freedom
38	Education improves individual freedoms
41	Education benefits all of society
44	Learning and the promise of education
<b>57</b>	<b>Part II: The learning crisis</b>
<b>58</b>	<b>Chapter 2: The great schooling expansion—and those it has left behind</b>
58	Most children have access to basic education
60	Poverty, gender, ethnicity, disability, and location explain most remaining schooling disparities
63	For poor parents, schooling requires trade-offs
68	<i>Spotlight 1: The biology of learning</i>
<b>71</b>	<b>Chapter 3: The many faces of the learning crisis</b>
71	For too many, learning isn't happening
78	Poor children learn the least, which hurts them the most
78	What is causing the learning crisis?
88	<i>Spotlight 2: Poverty hinders biological development and undermines learning</i>
<b>91</b>	<b>Chapter 4: To take learning seriously, start by measuring it</b>
91	The learning crisis is often hidden—but measurement makes it visible
92	Measures for learning guide action
93	Measures of learning spur action

- 95 Choose learning metrics based on what the country needs
- 95 Will learning metrics narrow the vision for education?
- 96 Six tips for effective learning measurement

102 *Spotlight 3: The multidimensionality of skills*

## 107 Part III: Innovations and evidence for learning

108 *Spotlight 4: Learning about learning*

112 **Chapter 5: There is no learning without prepared, motivated learners**

- 112 Investing in their early years prepares children for school
- 116 Providing demand-side support can get kids to school, but not necessarily to learn
- 119 Remedial education can prepare learners for further education and training

131 **Chapter 6: Teacher skills and motivation both matter (though many education systems act like they don't)**

- 131 Most teacher training is ineffective, but some approaches work
- 133 Helping teachers teach to the level of the student has proven effective
- 136 Teacher motivation and incentives make a difference, even with few inputs

145 **Chapter 7: Everything else should strengthen the teacher-learner interaction**

- 145 Technological interventions increase learning—but only if they enhance the teacher-learner relationship
- 147 Other inputs bring learners to school—but promote learning only if they target teaching and learning
- 148 School management and governance are crucial, and involving communities can help overcome incentive problems and information failures—but only if communities have capacity

154 **Chapter 8: Build on foundations by linking skills training to jobs**

- 154 Workplace training can help young people develop skills, yet few benefit from it
- 156 Short-term job training offers opportunities, but most programs fail to deliver
- 156 TVET can prepare young people for work, but early sorting into TVET can limit career growth
- 157 Successful job training programs share several features

164 *Spotlight 5: Technology is changing the world of work: What does that mean for learning?*

## 169 Part IV: Making the system work for learning at scale

170 **Chapter 9: Education systems are misaligned with learning**

- 171 Misalignments and incoherence impede learning
- 175 Technical complexities make it hard to align education systems with learning

183 *Spotlight 6: Spending more or spending better—or both?*

189 **Chapter 10: Unhealthy politics drives misalignments**

- 189 Unhealthy politics can intensify misalignments in education systems
- 190 Multiple actors and interests: Pulling the system out of alignment at each step of the policy cycle
- 195 Trapped in low-accountability, low-learning equilibriums

## 199 Chapter 11: How to escape low-learning traps

- 199 Improving information
- 203 Building coalitions and strengthening incentives
- 207 Encouraging innovation and agility
- 211 How can external actors support initiatives to improve learning?

## Boxes

- 1.1 40 Schooling as human capital formation or as a signaling device?
- 1.2 44 Education can't do it alone
- 1.3 48 Comparing attainment across countries and economies—learning-adjusted years of schooling
- 2.1 61 Access denied: The effects of fragility, conflict, and violence
- 3.1 74 Those who can't read by the end of grade 2 struggle to catch up
- 3.2 75 Gender-based differences in learning depend on the subject
- 3.3 82 Teachers may perceive low effort as being justified
- 4.1 92 Good measures of learning illuminate all parts of the education system
- 4.2 97 A global learning metric?
- 5.1 116 Early childhood education prepares young children for school
- 5.2 118 Communities can leverage the many hours spent outside the classroom to boost learning
- 5.3 120 Providing information on children's school performance can help parents to motivate their children
- 6.1 133 The landscape of in-service teacher training
- 6.2 133 What works in preservice teacher training?
- 6.3 135 Reaching learners in their own language
- 6.4 136 Using diagnostic data to deliver better learning in Latin America
- 6.5 137 Would raising teachers' salaries increase their motivation?
- 6.6 138 One factor undermining teaching: Poor working conditions
- 7.1 149 Training better school principals in Jamaica
- 9.1 172 It's all about (education) systems
- 9.2 174 Aligning all the ingredients for effective teaching in Shanghai
- 9.3 176 Can private schooling be aligned to learning for all?
- 10.1 191 How do teachers' unions affect learning?
- 10.2 193 How politics can derail learning in conflict-affected states
- 11.1 201 Using information to align incentives with learning in Brazil
- 11.2 202 Citizen-led assessments have raised awareness of the learning crisis in South Asia and Sub-Saharan Africa
- 11.3 204 Using the legal system to press for change
- 11.4 205 Using "labs" to build coalitions for learning
- 11.5 205 Reformers in Chile negotiated changes gradually
- 11.6 208 High-performing schools in the West Bank and Gaza offer some learning lessons
- 11.7 209 Burundi improved education services by iterating and adapting

## Figures

- 0.1 5 Shortfalls in learning start early
- 0.2 6 In several countries, the 75th percentile of PISA test takers performs below the 25th percentile of the OECD average
- 0.3 7 Children from poor households in Africa typically learn much less
- 0.4 7 Students often learn little from year to year, and early learning deficits are magnified over time
- 0.5 8 The percentage of primary school students who pass a minimum proficiency threshold is often low

<b>O.6</b>	9	School completion is higher for richer and urban families, but gender gaps are more context-dependent	<b>2.3</b>	60	National income is correlated with the gap between primary and lower secondary completion rates
<b>O.7</b>	10	Why learning doesn't happen: Four immediate factors that break down	<b>2.4</b>	61	Lower-income countries are rapidly expanding secondary education at a time when much of their population has not yet completed primary school
<b>O.8</b>	11	Socioeconomic gaps in cognitive achievement grow with age—even in preschool years	<b>2.5</b>	62	School completion is higher for richer and urban families, but gender gaps are more context-dependent
<b>O.9</b>	11	In Africa, teachers are often absent from school or from classrooms while at school	<b>2.6</b>	63	Multiple exclusions: Girls from poor households often have the lowest rates of education attainment
<b>O.10</b>	12	Management capacity is low in schools in low- and middle-income countries	<b>S1.1</b>	69	Synapse development over the first 20 years of life
<b>O.11</b>	13	Technical and political factors divert schools, teachers, and families from a focus on learning	<b>3.1</b>	72	Most grade 6 students in West and Central Africa are not sufficiently competent in reading or mathematics
<b>O.12</b>	17	Many countries lack information on learning outcomes	<b>3.2</b>	72	Most grade 6 students in southern and East Africa are not sufficiently competent in mathematics, and several countries score poorly in reading as well
<b>O.13</b>	19	Low-performing countries don't face sharp trade-offs between learning and other education outputs	<b>3.3</b>	73	Learning outcomes are substantially lower for poor children in Latin America
<b>O.14</b>	21	It's more complicated than it looks: People act in reaction to the choices of others throughout the system	<b>B3.2.1</b>	75	Girls outperform boys on reading in all countries and economies, but boys typically do better in mathematics and science
<b>O.15</b>	26	Coherence and alignment toward learning	<b>3.4</b>	76	Learning outcomes vary greatly across countries and economies—in several countries, the 75th percentile of PISA test takers performs below the 25th percentile of the OECD average
<b>1.1</b>	39	More schooling is systematically associated with higher wages	<b>3.5</b>	77	Middle-income countries tend to have lower rates of literacy proficiency than high-income countries
<b>1.2</b>	40	Mortality rates in the United States are lower for adults with more education	<b>3.6</b>	77	Reading proficiency is low in many parts of the developing world
<b>1.3</b>	43	People with higher education hold stronger beliefs about the importance of democracy	<b>3.7</b>	78	Family socioeconomic status significantly affects students' average PISA scores
<b>1.4</b>	45	Learning varies widely across countries; in 6 of the 10 countries assessed, only half or fewer of primary completers can read	<b>3.8</b>	79	The proximate determinants of learning
<b>1.5</b>	46	What matters for growth is learning	<b>3.9</b>	79	Socioeconomic gaps in cognitive achievement grow with age—even in preschool years
<b>1.6</b>	47	Increasing learning would yield major economic benefits	<b>3.10</b>	81	A lot of official teaching time is lost
<b>B1.3.1</b>	48	There can be a large gap between learning-adjusted and unadjusted years of schooling	<b>B3.3.1</b>	82	Teachers' beliefs about their effort and its effects
<b>2.1</b>	59	School enrollments have shot up in developing countries			
<b>2.2</b>	59	Most of the world's population with less than a primary education is in South Asia, but rates are similar in Sub-Saharan Africa			

<b>3.1.1</b>	82	Staff compensation consumes the largest share of resources available for public education	<b>6.2</b>	137	Prospective engineers typically score higher than prospective teachers on PISA tests
<b>3.1.2</b>	83	Management capacity is low in schools in low- and middle-income countries	<b>7.1</b>	146	Information and communication technology has had a mixed impact on learning
<b>S2.1</b>	89	Severe deprivation affects brain structure and function from early in life	<b>7.2</b>	148	Schools vary significantly in management quality
<b>S2.2</b>	89	Risk and protective factors affect developmental trajectories	<b>8.1</b>	155	Few benefit from workplace training, and those who do tend to already have better literacy or education
<b>4.1</b>	95	No internationally comparable data on learning are available for most children outside of high-income countries	<b>8.2</b>	157	Most vocational training students enroll during upper secondary school
<b>4.2</b>	96	Low-performing countries don't face sharp trade-offs between learning and other education outputs	<b>S5.1</b>	165	Technology use has increased dramatically over the past decade—but remains low in many countries
<b>S3.1</b>	103	Cognitive, socioemotional, and technical skills interact	<b>9.1</b>	171	Technical and political barriers pull education systems away from the goal of learning
<b>S4.1</b>	108	The number of experimental and quasi-experimental studies of interventions to improve learning has mushroomed in recent decades	<b>9.2</b>	173	Simple associations between education spending and learning are weak
<b>S4.2</b>	109	It's more complicated than it looks: People act in reaction to the choices of others throughout the system	<b>B9.3.1</b>	178	In Bangladesh, there are 11 different kinds of nonstate providers of presecondary education
<b>5.1</b>	114	Investments in high-quality programs during children's early years pay off	<b>S6.1</b>	184	Governments devote a large share of their budgets to education
<b>5.2</b>	115	Intense deprivation can impair brain development	<b>S6.2</b>	185	The relationship between changes in public education spending and student learning is often weak
<b>5.3</b>	117	Integrated programs through the early years are necessary for proper child development	<b>10.1</b>	191	Contradictory interests detract from learning objectives
<b>5.4</b>	118	What happens when school fees are eliminated? Evidence from eight countries	<b>B10.1.1</b>	192	Teacher unionization varies across countries
<b>5.5</b>	119	Not all education systems are equally productive, but even the least productive deliver some learning to some learners	<b>10.2</b>	195	Interdependencies characterize the relationship between teachers and politicians
<b>5.6</b>	120	Young people follow different paths in their education	<b>11.1</b>	200	Primary school numeracy has increased dramatically in England
<b>5.7</b>	121	Workers with higher literacy proficiency are more likely to enter white-collar jobs	<b>B11.5.1</b>	205	Reading scores have improved in Chile
<b>6.1</b>	134	Only a small fraction of learners keeps up with the curriculum	<b>11.2</b>	207	Problem-driven iterative adaptation drives successful reforms
			<b>11.3</b>	210	Trends in public education spending in the Philippines track changes in the broader political and economic context
			<b>11.4</b>	212	Most funding for education comes from domestic sources, but international finance is important for low-income countries

## Map

**B6.3.1** 135 Linguistic diversity around the world

## Tables

<b>O.1</b>	14	Alignment and coherence both matter	<b>B9.3.1</b>	176	Private providers account for a significant share of school enrollment
<b>O.2</b>	14	Multiple interests govern the actions of education stakeholders	<b>S6.1</b>	186	Inequalities in public education spending are common
<b>1.1</b>	39	Examples of education's benefits	<b>11.1</b>	202	Principles for making the most of information and the roles that actors can play
<b>1.2</b>	42	More schooling leads to more voting	<b>11.2</b>	203	Principles for building effective coalitions and the roles that actors can play
<b>3.1</b>	80	Few teachers reach minimum thresholds of performance on knowledge assessments	<b>11.3</b>	209	Principles for encouraging innovation at scale and the roles that actors can play
<b>5.1</b>	113	Models of human behavior can guide actions to improve learner preparation: Some examples			
<b>6.1</b>	132	Models of human behavior can guide actions to improve teaching: Some examples			
<b>7.1</b>	146	Models of human behavior can guide actions to improve the effectiveness of school inputs and governance: Some examples			