Epistemic Contextualism

A Defense

Peter Baumann

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

Introduction 1

Part I. Arguments

1. The Argument from Cases: Standard Contextualism and Standards Contextualism 9
   - 1.1. Cases for Contextualism 9
   - 1.2. Parameters: Standards 14
     - 1.2.1. Evidence, Reliability, Degrees of Belief 14
     - 1.2.2. Epistemic Position 16
     - 1.2.3. Ruling Out Alternatives 18
   - 1.3. Determinants 20
     - 1.3.1. Stakes 20
     - 1.3.2. Purposes and Intentions 22
     - 1.3.3. Conversational Contexts 23
     - 1.3.4. Salience 25
     - 1.3.5. Determinants for the Other Parameters. Norms and Conventions 27
   - 1.4. Conclusion 31

2. The Argument from Reliability: The Role of Reference Classes 33
   - 2.1. Knowledge and Reliability 34
   - 2.2. Reliability and Probability 37
   - 2.3. Reliability and Context 43
     - 2.3.1. Typing Topics 43
     - 2.3.2. Typing Methods 46
     - 2.3.3. Extension and Generalization: Reference Classes 51
     - 2.3.4. Conclusion 58
   - 2.4. Reliability and Modality 58
   - 2.5. Conclusion 63

3. The Argument from Luck: The Role of Descriptions 65
   - 3.1. Luck, Its Varieties, and an Exclusion Claim 66
   - 3.2. Lucky Knowledge: Variations on a Case by Russell 68
   - 3.3. More Cases 74
   - 3.4. Modal Luck 79
   - 3.5. Probabilistic Luck 83
   - 3.6. Conclusion 86

Part II. Problems and Extensions

4. Skepticism, Lotteries, and Contextualist Solutions 91
4.1. Traditional Skepticism 92
4.2. Lottery Skepticism 100
4.3. Knowing Lottery Propositions? 102
4.4. Lotteries and Closure 109
4.5. A Standard Contextualist Solution 111
4.6. Another Contextualist Solution 114
4.7. Conclusion 119

5. Cross-Context Attributions and the Knowability Problem: Does Contextualism Lead to a Contradiction? 120
5.1. Contradictions across Contexts? 121
5.2. Even Worse: Moore-Paradoxality and No Neutrality 124
5.3. A Problem for Contextualists Only? 126
5.4. Knowability Restrictions? 128
5.5. The Contextualist Way Out: Contextualist Closure 131
5.6. Conclusion 136

6. Beyond Knowledge: Action and Responsibility 140
6.1. A Puzzle 141
6.2. Responsibility 142
6.3. Reference Classes Again 145
6.4. No Straight Solution 148
6.5. Practical Contextualism 151

Part III. Objections and Alternatives

7. Objections 159
7.1. WAMs 160
7.1.1. Thought and Language 162
7.1.2. From WAMs to WBMs, and Back Again 166
7.1.3. Conclusion 172
7.2. Cappelen and Lepore's Three Tests 173
7.3. More Linguistic Objections 177
7.4. Cases, Again 182
7.5. More Problems and Questions 190
7.5.1. Complexity 190
7.5.2. Normativity and Arbitrariness 193
7.5.3. Error, Blindness, and the Possibility of Communication 195
7.5.4. One Last Smaller Problem 197

8. Alternatives? 198
8.1. Subject-Sensitive Invariantism 198
8.1.1. Some Questions about Stakes 199
8.1.2. SSI on Factors and Cases (Again) 204
8.1.3. Other Problems 208

8.2. Contrastivism 212
8.2.1. Knowledge without Contrasts 213
8.2.2. More Relata for the Third Slot 216
8.2.3. More Relativization 217
8.2.4. Conclusion 220
8.3. Relativism 221
8.3.1. Relative Truth, Monadic Truth, and Direct Expressibility 222
8.3.2. But Is It Truth? 225
8.3.3. Other Problems? 227
8.4. Conclusion 230

Bibliography 231
Index 257