2724-6607

From Chemical Philosophy to Theoretical Chemistry

Dynamics of Matter and Dynamics of Disciplines, 1800–1950

Mary Jo Nye

University of California Press Berkeley / Los Angeles / London

Contents

Plates xi Abbreviations xiii Acknowledgments xv Introduction 1

Part One Discipline-Building in Chemistry

1 Scientific Disciplines: The Construction of Identity 13

The Study of Scientific Disciplines, Schools,
and Traditions13Elements of Identity in the History of Scientific
Disciplines19

2 The Historical Demarcation of Chemistry and Physics: Founder Myths and Social Realities 32

The Historical Problem of the Relation of Chemistry
to Physics 32Historical Accounts of the Origins of Chemistry and Physics
as Disciplines 34Academies and Societies 40Journals for the Physical and Chemical Sciences 43Lecture Traditions in Chemistry and Physics 46Laboratories for Chemistry and Physics 49Conclusion: History and Hierarchy 53

3 Philosophy of Chemistry and Chemical Philosophy: Epistemological Values in the Nineteenth Century 56

The Epistemology of Chemistry56Early Chemical Philosophy: Aims and Methods59Natural History and Chemical Explanation in the Nineteenth
Century65Atomism and Chemical Explanation in the Nineteenth
Century68Mechanics, the Elusive Dream71

4 Language and Image in Nineteenth-Century Chemistry 73

Signs and Meanings 73		
Metaphors and Definitions 77		•
Nomenclature and Taxonomy 81		
Symbols and Algebraic Formulas	89	
Symbols and Structural Formulas	92	

Part Two Chemical Problems and Research Schools

5 Physical Chemistry as Theoretical Chemistry: A Dynamics for Matter at the Turn of the Century 105

The Disciplinary Origins of Physical Chemistry105The Limits of Classical Organic Chemistry110From Chemical Affinity to Chemical Thermodynamics116The Controversy over the Radiation Hypothesis121Ions, Electrons, and Affinity129

6 The Paris School of Theoretical Organic Chemistry, 1880–1930 139

Theoretical Physics and Physical Chemistry at the End of the Nineteenth Century 139

- French Chemistry and the Education of Robert Lespieau ca. 1890 142
- The Practice of Organic Chemistry at the Ecole Normale, 1904–1934 145

Theoretical Chemistry at the Ecole Normale, 1922–1934 148 The Theory of "Synionie" and French Theoretical

Chemistry 151

- The "French" and "Anglo-Saxon" Schools of Theoretical Organic Chemistry 157
- Lespieau's Research School and the Discipline of Theoretical Chemistry 160

7 The London-Manchester School of Theoretical Organic Chemistry, 1880–1930 163

The London-Manchester Network (and the German Connection) 164 Problems of Molecular Structure and Dynamics ca. 1900 170 Lapworth and Lowry in London: Theories for Organic Chemistry 173 Manchester Chemistry and Physics in the Early Twentieth Century 177 A Theory of Chemical Dynamics 182 Manchester-London Controversies, 1922–1928 187 Some Comparisons and Preliminary Conclusions 193

8 Reaction Mechanisms: Christopher Ingold and the Integration of Physical and Organic Chemistry, 1920–1950 196

The Career of Christopher Ingold196"Classical" Structure Chemistry versus PolarChemistry199Conjugated Systems and Resonance202Principles for Aliphatic and Aromatic Substitution207A General Theory for a New Physical OrganicChemistryChemistry211

Part Three Converging Traditions and Rival Disciplines

9 Quantum Chemistry and Chemical Physics, 1920–1950 227

The Application of Quantum Mechanics to Molecules in
the 1920s 228Chemists and Quantum Mechanics in the 1920s and
1930s 239Quantum Chemistry and Chemical Physics in the 1930s and
1940s 250

10 Conclusion: Theoretical Chemistry, Discipline-Building, and the Commensurability of Physics and Chemistry 262

Physics Is Chemistry/Chemistry Is Physics?262Discipline-Building and Theoretical Chemistry263Theoretical Chemistry and the Distinctiveness263of Chemistry274

Contents

2

••

Glossary 285 Bibliography 287 Index 313

х

-