

Contents

Chapter One Introduction.....	1
The comparative method in the field of public law	4
Chapter Two The development of judicial review of administrative action .	11
I. Historical introduction	11
1. The common law courts.....	11
2. The tribunal system.....	18
3. The development of separate Administrative Courts in nineteenth century Germany	21
4. The administrative law tradition in Germany	22
II. The constitutional role of the courts	25
1. The constitutional basis for the role of the courts in judicial review in England	25
2. The Basic Law and the Administrative Courts	28
III. The grounds of review	31
1. The grounds of review for administrative action in England.....	31
2. The grounds of review for administrative action in Germany	34
IV. Administrative law remedies for unlawful government action	39
1. Remedies in English courts.....	39
2. Remedies in German Administrative Courts	42
V. Procedural aspects.....	44
1. The adversarial procedure.....	44
2. The inquisitorial procedure	46
VI. Constitutional adjudication - the institutional dimension	47
1. Introduction.....	47
2. The ancient office of Lord Chancellor.....	49
3. The new Supreme Court	51
4. The long path to Germany's Constitutional Court.....	55
5. The Supreme Court Appointments Commission	56
6. Diversity in the appointments process	58
7. Judicial independence under the Basic Law	60
8. Qualification for judicial office in Germany.....	62
a) The selection process - federal level	63
b) The selection process at the Federal Constitutional Court	66
c) The selection process at state level.....	67

VII. Conclusion	69
Chapter Three Judicial review of discretionary powers.....	73
I. Introduction	73
1. The concept of discretion and the constitutional basis for judicial review of discretionary powers in England	74
2. The concept of discretion and the constitutional basis for judicial review of discretionary powers in Germany.....	77
3. Evaluation	83
II. Comparative cases	83
1. Failure to exercise discretion under English law	83
a) Review of self-created rules	84
b) Unauthorised delegation of power	86
c) Acting under dictation.....	86
d) Fettering discretion by contractual undertaking.....	87
2. Failure to exercise discretion in German administrative law	89
a) Review of self-created rules	89
b) Unauthorised delegation of power	89
c) Fettering discretion by contractual undertaking	90
3. Evaluation	91
4. Abuse of discretion in English law	92
a) Use of power for an improper purpose.....	92
b) Unreasonableness.....	93
c) The principle of proportionality in English administrative law.....	95
d) The principle of legitimate expectation in English administrative law.....	105
5. Abuse of discretion in German law	110
a) The principle of proportionality in German administrative law	110
b) Human rights protection and discretion in Germany	114
c) Undefined legal concepts	119
d) European standards for the intensity of review	122
e) The principle of legitimate expectations (Vertrauensschutz) in German law.....	124
f) The Europeanisation of the principle of legitimate expectations in German law.....	127
g) The principle of equality	128
III. Conclusion.....	131
Chapter Four Procedural errors in the administrative procedure.....	137
I. Introduction	137
1. The rules of natural justice in English law.....	138
2. The duty to act fairly.....	143
3. The duty to give reasons	144
4. Legal consequences of procedural errors.....	147

5. Germany's Law on Administrative Procedure (Verwaltungsverfahrensgesetz) 1976	147
6. The right to a hearing.....	149
7. The duty to give reasons	150
8. Legal consequences of procedural errors.....	151
9. Evaluation	155
II. Comparative cases	157
1. The right to a hearing.....	157
a) Legal effects of denial of a hearing in English courts	157
b) Legal effects of denial of a hearing - Germany	159
c) Evaluation	160
2. The duty to give reasons	160
a) Deficient reasons made good in course of proceedings - England ..	160
b) Deficient reasons made good in course of proceedings - Germany	161
c) Evaluation	162
III. European influences.....	163
1. English administrative law and Art. 6(1) of the European Convention on Human Rights	163
2. German administrative law and Art. 6(1) of the European Convention on Human Rights	166
3. The European Court of Justice and German administrative procedure law	167
IV. Conclusion	169
Chapter Five Governmental liability.....	173
I. Introduction.....	173
1. Governmental liability in English courts	173
a) Negligence.....	174
b) Breach of statutory duty	182
c) Vicarious liability	183
d) Misfeasance in public office	183
e) Crown immunity	184
2. Governmental liability in Germany	185
a) Tortious liability according to section 839 of the Civil Code (BGB) in connection with Art. 34 of the Basic Law	186
aa) Persons exercising public office.....	188
bb) Breach of duty	188
cc) Duty towards a third party.....	189
3. Evaluation	190
II. Comparative cases - governmental liability and Human Rights	191
1. Governmental liability for breaches of Human rights in the UK.....	191
a) The English law of negligence under European influence	191
aa) The ruling of the European Court of Human Rights in Osman v UK.....	192
bb) Impact of the ruling in Osman on subsequent decisions.....	194

cc) The ruling of the European Court of Human Rights in Z v UK	196
dd) Impact of the decision in Z v UK on the law of negligence	198
b) Damages for breaches of the Human Rights Act 1998	201
2. Child abuse claims in Germany	203
a) Section 839 BGB in connection with Art. 34 Basic Law	205
aa) Duty of care owed to a third party	205
bb) Fault.....	206
cc) Causation	206
b) The constitutional framework for the law governing childcare	206
c) Judicial review of administrative decisions in childcare cases.....	207
d) The violation of basic rights and compensation.....	210
3. Evaluation	211
III. Comparative cases - member state liability in German and English courts	215
1. The nature of the remedy in domestic law – Germany	217
a) Rights under Community law and duty towards a third party in German law	218
b) The fault requirement in German law	219
c) Europeanisation of the German law of governmental liability.....	220
2. The nature of the remedy in domestic law – United Kingdom	222
3. The condition of “sufficiently serious breach” in German and English decisions	223
4. Causation in member state liability.....	231
a) R v Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex p Gallagher... b) Germany – breach of procedural provisions and causation.....	234 235
IV. Conclusion.....	241
Chapter Six Tradition and change	243