Design and Analysis of Experiments for Statistical Selection, Screening, and Multiple Comparisons

ROBERT E. BECHHOFER
School of Operations Research and Industrial Engineering
Cornell University

THOMAS J. SANTNER
Department of Statistics
The Ohio State University

DAVID M. GOLDSMAN
School of Industrial and Systems Engineering
Georgia Institute of Technology

A Wiley-Interscience Publication
JOHN WILEY & SONS, INC.
New York • Chichester • Brisbane • Toronto • Singapore

Contents

Preface xi

1 The Rationale of Selection, Screening and Multiple Comparisons 1

1.1 Introduction 1
1.2 Basic Concepts of Classical Experimental Design 4
1.2.1 Qualitative Versus Quantitative Factors 4
1.2.2 Principles of Experimental Design 5
1.3 Formulations Considered in This Book 7
1.4 Organization of the Book 12

2 Selecting the Best Treatment in a Single-Factor Normal Response Experiment Using the Indifference-Zone Approach 15

2.1 Introduction 15
2.2 A Single-Stage Procedure for Common Known Variance 18
2.2.1 The Completely Randomized Design 18
2.2.2 Designs with Blocking 24
2.2.3 Robustness of Normal Theory Procedure 28
2.3 Multi-Stage Procedures for Common Known Variance 31
2.3.1 A Closed Two-Stage Procedure with Elimination 32
2.3.2 A Closed Multi-Stage Procedure without Elimination 35
2.3.3 A Closed Multi-Stage Procedure with Elimination 38
2.4 Comparison of Common Known Variance Procedures 41
2.5 A Single-Stage Procedure for Selecting the s Best of t Treatments Having a Common Known Variance 43
2.5.1 Selection without Regard to Order 44
2.5.2 Selection with Regard to Order 46
2.6 A Single-Stage Procedure for Unequal Known Variances 48
2.7 Multi-Stage Procedures for Common Unknown Variance 51
2.7.1 An Open Two-Stage Procedure without Elimination 52
2.7.2 An Open Multi-Stage Procedure with Elimination 54
2.7.3 Comparison of Procedures 56

2.8 Procedures for Unequal Unknown Variances 60
2.8.1 Variances Bounded 60
2.8.2 Variances Unbounded 60
2.9 Chapter Notes 65

3 Selecting a Subset Containing the Best Treatment in a Normal Response Experiment 69

3.1 Introduction 69
3.2 Single-Stage Procedures 71
3.2.1 Balanced Experiments 71
3.2.2 Unbalanced Experiments 76
3.2.3 Robustness of Procedure $\mathcal{N}_G$ 79
3.3 Experiments with Blocking 80
3.3.1 Randomized Complete Block Designs 80
3.3.2 Balanced Incomplete Block Designs 81
3.3.3 Latin Square Designs 84
3.4 Alternative Goals 86
3.4.1 Selection of the s Best Treatments 86
3.4.2 Selection of δ^*-Near-Best Treatments 91
3.4.3 A Bounded Procedure for δ^*-Near-Best Treatments 94
3.5 Chapter Notes 96

4 Multiple Comparison Approaches for Normal Response Experiments 100

4.1 Introduction 100
4.2 Simultaneous Confidence Intervals for Orthogonal Contrasts 101
4.3 Simultaneous Confidence Intervals for All Pairwise Differences . . 109
4.4 Simultaneous Confidence Intervals for Comparing All Treatments with the Best 112
4.5 Chapter Notes 114

5 Problems Involving a Standard or Control Treatment in Normal Response Experiments 116

5.1 Introduction 116
5.2 Selecting the Best Treatment Using the IZ Approach 117
5.2.1 Selection Involving a Standard (Common Known σ^2) . . . 118
5.2.2 Selection Involving a Standard (Common Unknown σ^2) . . 123
5.2.3 Selection Involving a Control (Common Known σ^2) 125
5.3 Selecting a Subset of Treatments 126

5.3.1 Screening Involving a Standard . . . 126
5.3.2 Screening Involving a Control Treatment . . . 129
5.4 Simultaneous Confidence Intervals . . . 131
5.4.1 Comparison with a Standard . . . 131
5.4.2 Comparison with a Control Treatment . . . 133
5.4.3 Comparisons with Respect to Two Control Treatments . . . 138
5.5 Chapter Notes . . . 141

6 Selection Problems in Two-Factor Normal Response Experiments 142

6.1 Introduction . . . 142
6.2 Indifference-Zone Selection Using Completely Randomized Designs (Common Known Variance) . . . 144
6.2.1 Single-Stage Procedure . . . 146
6.2.2 A Closed Sequential Procedure without Elimination . . . 151
6.2.3 A Closed Sequential Procedure with Elimination . . . 152
6.2.4 Comparison of the Performance Characteristics of the Procedures . . . 154
6.3 Indifference-Zone Selection Using Split-Plot Designs (Common Known Variance) . . . 159
6.3.1 Introduction . . . 159
6.3.2 IZ Selection When $(\sigma_w^2, \sigma_\epsilon^2)$ Is Known . . . 161
6.4 IZ Selection Using Completely Randomized Designs (Common Unknown Variance) . . . 163
6.5 IZ Selection Using Split-Plot Designs (Common Unknown Variance) . . . 166
6.6 Subset Selection Using CR Designs . . . 167
6.7 Subset Selection Using Split-Plot Designs . . . 169
6.7.1 Subset Selection When γ_w Is Known . . . 170
6.7.2 Subset Selection When σ_w^2 and σ_ϵ^2 Are Unknown . . . 173
6.8 Chapter Notes . . . 175

7 Selecting Best Treatments in Single-Factor Bernoulli Response Experiments 177

7.1 Introduction . . . 177
7.2 A Single-Stage Procedure for the Indifference-Zone $p_{[t]} - p_{[t-1]} \geq \Delta^*$ . . . 182
7.2.1 Completely Unknown p-Values . . . 182
7.2.2 An Alternative Design Specification . . . 184
7.3 A Closed Adaptive Sequential Procedure . . . 186
7.3.1 Introduction . . . 186

7.3.2 The Procedure . . . 187
7.3.3 Optimality Properties of Procedure $\mathcal{B}_{BK}$ . . . 189
7.4 Open Sequential Procedures for the Odds Ratio Indifference-Zone . 192
7.4.1 An Open Sequential Procedure without Elimination . . . 192
7.4.2 An Open Sequential Procedure with Elimination . . . 195
7.4.3 Comparison of Procedures $\mathcal{B}_{BKS}$ and $\mathcal{B}_P$ . . . 196
7.5 A Single-Stage Subset Selection Procedure . . . 200
7.5.1 Screening in Balanced Experiments . . . 201
7.5.2 Screening in Unbalanced Experiments . . . 209
7.5.3 An Alternative Design Specification . . . 211
7.6 Chapter Notes . . . 211

8 Selection Problems for Categorical Response Experiments 214

8.1 Introduction . . . 214
8.2 Indifference-Zone Procedures for Multinomial Data . . . 216
8.2.1 A Single-Stage Procedure . . . 217
8.2.2 Use of Curtailment When the Maximum Number of Observations Is Specified . . . 227
8.2.3 A Closed Sequential Procedure . . . 229
8.2.4 Applications . . . 233
8.3 Subset Procedures for Multinomial Data . . . 236
8.3.1 A Single-Stage Procedure . . . 236
8.3.2 Curtailment of Procedure $\mathcal{M}_{GN}$ . . . 237
8.3.3 A Curtailed Sequential Procedure . . . 240
8.4 Indifference-Zone Procedures for Cross-Classified Data . . . 241
8.5 Chapter Notes . . . 244

Appendix A Relationships Among Critical Points and Notation 247

Appendix B Tables 253

Appendix C FORTRAN Programs 277

References 303

Author Index 319

Subject Index 323