

The Optional Protocol to the UN Convention Against Torture

RACHEL MURRAY
ELINA STEINERTE
MALCOLM EVANS
ANTENOR HALLO DE WOLF

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Table of Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xv
<i>Table of Treaties</i>	xvii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xix
1. The Origins and Background of OPCAT	1
A. Introduction	1
B. The Origins of the Optional Protocol	6
C. The European Convention for the Prevention of Torture	10
1. Drafting the ECPT	10
2. The work of the CPT and some implications for the drafting of OPCAT	18
2. Drafting OPCAT—Towards Deadlock: 1991–2000	22
A. The Return to the UN and its Consequences	22
B. The Principal Points of Agreement Prior to the 2001 Session and Their Place in the Final Text	27
C. The Principal Points in Dispute Prior to the 2001 Session	31
1. The visiting programme	32
2. Restrictions on access to persons in, or to places of, detention	35
3. The aftermath of a visit or mission	36
4. Reservations	37
D. An Assessment of the Overall Situation	38
3. The Text of OPCAT	39
A. The 2001 Session: New Ideas and New Controversies	40
1. The Mexican Draft	40
2. The EU proposals	43
B. The Chair's Compromise Text: The Optional Protocol and What It Requires of States	45
1. The Subcommittee and its visiting mandate	48
2. The National Preventive Mechanisms	53
3. Conclusion	57
C. The 'What' and the 'With What' Questions	57
1. The 'Concept of prevention'	58
2. Standards	63
4. The Scope of OPCAT	68
A. 'Deprived of liberty'	69
B. Public and Private: '... either by virtue of an order given by a public authority or at its instigation or with its consent or acquiescence', Article 4(1)	70

C. '...are or may be deprived'/'installations and facilities'	73
D. 'any place/all places of detention'	73
1. Prisons, police, and pre-trial facilities	73
2. Refugee, asylum, and immigration centres	74
3. Military detention facilities	75
4. Mental health institutions	75
5. Care homes, foster homes, older persons, and other places	76
E. '... under its jurisdiction or control'	77
1. Nationally	78
2. Extra-territoriality	79
F. Article 14(2) Objection to a Visit by the SPT	81
G. Some Core Issues	82
1. Different approaches and requirements	82
2. Expertise	83
3. Coordination	85
4. Consistency in standards	87
H. Conclusion	89
5. The Role of the Subcommittee on Prevention of Torture (SPT)	90
A. The Membership of the SPT	92
B. The Interpretation of Its Own Mandate and Rules of Procedure	95
C. Pillar I: Visits to States Parties	97
1. Selection of the countries: criteria, types of visits, and frequency	97
2. Content of the visit: choosing places of deprivation of liberty to be visited	102
3. Preventive approach and visits	103
4. Outcomes of a visit: the ongoing dialogue and follow-up	105
D. Pillar II: work with the NPMs	108
1. SPT as adviser to the NPMs	111
E. Pillar III: Cooperation with Other UN and International and Regional Bodies	112
F. Challenges Noted by the SPT	112
G. Conclusion	113
6. The Role of NPMs	115
A. Introduction	115
B. Visiting Powers and Mandate	117
C. Independence	119
1. Factors within the control of the State	120
2. Factors within the control of the NPM itself	124
D. Accountability and the Relationship with the SPT	128
E. NPMs Should Ensure States Comply with the UNCAT and Other Relevant Legal Standards	132
F. As a Forerunner to SPT Visits; Continuation of CPT Nationally; as a Small SPT on the Ground	133
G. Have Expertise	134
H. Large Expectations and Role Not Always Clear	136

I. Additional Factors for an Effective NPM	136
J. Conclusion	137
7. OPCAT within the Broader UN and Regional Systems	139
A. OPCAT and the Convention Against Torture	139
B. Engagement with Other UN Bodies	143
C. Engagement with Regional and Other Bodies	146
D. Some Common Issues	155
1. Confidentiality	155
2. Standards/norms	156
3. The need for consistency in engagement with NPMs	157
E. Conclusion: The Need for Systematic and Strategic Engagement	159
8. Regional Trends towards Ratification and Implementation of OPCAT	162
A. Reasons For and Against Ratification	162
B. The Added Value of Being Parties to OPCAT	168
C. Trends in the Choices for NPMs	170
D. Some Concluding Thoughts	172
9. Conclusion: Emerging Trends and the Future of OPCAT	174
A. Expansion of Membership of OPCAT	175
B. Expertise on OPCAT	176
C. A 'System' of Prevention Through Visits	177
D. Budget and Financial Resources	178
E. Standards and Accommodating Regional Differences	179
F. Influence and Lessons for Other Treaties	180
G. Conclusion	183
Appendices	
Appendix I: Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment	184
Appendix II: Rules of Procedure of the Subcommittee on Prevention of Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment	195
Appendix III: Guidelines of the Subcommittee on Prevention of Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment in relation to Visits to States Parties	205
Appendix IV: Preliminary Guidelines for the Ongoing Development of National Preventive Mechanisms	212
Appendix V: Guidelines on National Preventive Mechanisms	214
Appendix VI: The approach of the Subcommittee on Prevention of Torture to the concept of prevention of torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment under the	

Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment	218
Appendix VII: Members of the Subcommittee on Prevention of Torture (SPT) as at January 2011	222
Appendix VIII: Chronology of States Visited by the SPT	223
<i>Bibliography</i>	224
<i>Index</i>	237