

Tax Treaties and Controlled Foreign Company Legislation

Pushing the Boundaries

Second Edition

Daniel Sandler

*Faculty of Law, The University of Western Ontario,
London, Canada*

and

*Senior Research Fellow
Taxation Law and Policy Research Institute
Deakin University, Melbourne, Australia*

THE CHARTERED INSTITUTE
OF
TAXATION



UK REPRESENTATIVE BODY ON THE
CONFÉDÉRATION FISCALE EUROPÉENNE

 **KLUWER LAW
INTERNATIONAL**
THE HAGUE · LONDON · BOSTON

Contents

<i>Foreword</i>	xiii
<i>Preface</i>	xiv
<i>Preface to first edition</i>	ixx
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xxiii
Chapter 1 The legal and economic environment	1
Introduction	1
The jurisdiction to tax	2
The taxation of foreign-source income of foreign corporations	4
Deferral or avoidance of domestic tax	4
Classical tax havens	5
Other tax havens	7
Resident countries: options for deferral	8
Controlled foreign company regimes	9
Overview	9
Economic climate	9
Characteristics of CFC legislation	14
International double taxation	15
Defining double taxation	15
Eliminating double taxation	16
The OECD and UN Model Treaties	17
Interaction between CFC legislation and tax treaties	18
Chapter 2 Controlled foreign company regimes	23
United States	24
Germany	24
Canada	26
Japan	27
France	27
United Kingdom	28
New Zealand	28
Sweden	29
Australia	30

Norway	31
Finland	31
Spain	32
Indonesia	33
Portugal	33
Denmark	33
Korea	34
Hungary	34
Mexico	34
South Africa	35
Elsewhere	35
Italy	35
The Netherlands	36
Chapter 3 Tax treaties and domestic law	39
Adoption of tax treaties and their status in domestic law	40
Australia	40
Canada	40
Denmark	42
Finland	43
France	43
Germany	43
Hungary	44
Indonesia	45
Japan	46
Korea	47
Mexico	47
New Zealand	48
Norway	48
Portugal	49
Spain	49
Sweden	50
United Kingdom	50
United States	52
Interpretation of tax treaties by domestic courts	54
The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	54
Australia	59
Canada	60
Denmark	63
Finland	64
France	65
Germany	66
Hungary	66
Indonesia	67
Japan	68

Korea	69
Mexico	69
New Zealand	69
Norway	71
Portugal	71
Spain	72
Sweden	72
United Kingdom	74
United States	78
Tax treaty interpretation: some final remarks	81
General rules of tax treaty interpretation	81
The OECD Model and Commentary	82
Parallel treaties	83
 Chapter 4 OECD Model Treaty and CFC legislation	 85
History	85
CFC legislation and the OECD Model: overview	87
Characterization of income attributed under CFC legislation	92
The OECD Model and entity approach CFC legislation	95
Arguments against inconsistency	99
Arguments for inconsistency	103
The OECD Model and transaction approach CFC legislation	105
CFC legislation and the OECD Model: some final remarks	108
 Chapter 5 Treaty practice of states following enactment of CFC legislation	 109
Australia	110
Canada	113
Denmark	122
Finland	128
France	131
Germany	134
Hungary	144
Indonesia	145
Japan	145
Korea	148
Mexico	148
New Zealand	148
Norway	150
Portugal	151
Spain	152
Sweden	153
United Kingdom	158
United States	161
Summary of treaty practice	163

Two final considerations	166
Acquiescence	166
Negative implication	167
 Chapter 6 CFC legislation and European Union Treaty provisions	 169
The European Communities	169
Preliminary rulings of the Court of Justice of the European Communities	171
Community law affecting direct taxation	173
Community law and CFC legislation	176
Relevant Community law	176
Application of CFC legislation within the EU	178
CFC legislation and Article 52 of the EC Treaty	180
CFC legislation and Article 73b of the EC Treaty	186
Is CFC legislation justifiable in the public interest?	188
 Chapter 7 CFC legislation and tax treaties: jurisprudence	 191
The historical dearth of jurisprudence	191
Tax treaties and domestic legislation: some jurisprudence	193
<i>Padmore v. IRC</i>	193
<i>IRC v. Willoughby</i>	194
<i>Bundesfinanzhof, 2 February 1994</i>	195
<i>RMM Canadian Enterprises Inc. et al v. The Queen</i>	198
Tax treaties and CFC legislation: jurisprudence	202
<i>Bricom Holdings Ltd v. IRC</i>	202
<i>Schneider SA v. DVNI and TA Strasbourg</i>	213
<i>Strafor Facom SA v. DGI</i>	214
Some final remarks	215
 Chapter 8 Conclusions	 217
Appendix: Summary of controlled foreign company legislation	223
Australia	224
Canada	227
Denmark	230
Finland	232
France	234
Germany	236
Hungary	239
Indonesia	241
Japan	243
Korea, Republic of	245
Mexico	248
New Zealand	251
Norway	254
Portugal	256

Spain	258
Sweden	261
United Kingdom	263
United States	266
<i>Bibliography</i>	269
<i>Subject Index</i>	281
<i>Index of Cases</i>	295