

# COMPARATIVE INCOME TAXATION: A STRUCTURAL ANALYSIS

## Principal Author

Hugh J. Ault, Boston College Law School

## Contributing Authors

Brian J. Arnold, University of Western Ontario  
Guy Gest, University of Paris I  
Peter Melz, Stockholm University  
Minoru Nakazato, University of Tokyo  
Albert J. Rädler, University of Hamburg  
J. Mark Ramseyer, University of Chicago Law School  
John Tiley, University of Cambridge  
Richard J. Vann, University of Sydney  
Kees van Raad, University of Leyden

**KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL**  
The Hague • London • Boston

# Table of Contents

<b>Introduction</b> .....	1
---------------------------	---

## Part One: General Description

<b>Australia</b> .....	5
1. History of the income tax .....	5
2. Composition of fiscal system .....	6
3. Tax rates .....	7
4. The basic structure of income tax system .....	8
5. Statutory style .....	10
6. Statutory interpretation .....	12
7. Administrative, taxpayer and judicial style .....	14
7.1 Administrative style .....	14
7.2 Taxpayer style .....	16
7.3 Judicial style .....	18
8. General principles .....	19
8.1 Relation of tax and financial accounting .....	19
8.2 Respect for civil law form .....	19
9. Anti-avoidance legislation .....	21
 <b>Canada</b> .....	 25
1. History of the income tax .....	25
2. Constitutional issues .....	25
3. Composition of fiscal system .....	26
4. Tax rates .....	26
5. Basic structure of the system .....	27
6. Statutory style .....	29
7. Statutory interpretation .....	30
8. The role of the courts .....	31
9. The Canadian self-assessment system .....	32
10. Revenue Canada's administrative style .....	32
11. Taxpayers' style .....	32
12. Relation of tax and financial accounting .....	34
13. Respect of civil or private law form .....	35
14. Substance over form .....	35
15. Anti-avoidance doctrines and legislation .....	36

<b>France</b>	39
1. History and basic structure of the tax system	39
1.1 General outline	39
1.2 The individual income taxation system	39
2. Rate structure	41
2.1 Individual income tax	41
2.2 Corporate income tax	42
3. Basic structure of the tax system	42
4. Statutory style	43
5. Statutory interpretation and judicial style	44
6. Administrative style	45
6.1 Administrative interpretations	45
6.2 Tax audits	46
7. Taxpayers' style	46
8. Relation of tax and financial accounting	47
9. Respect for civil law	47
10. Anti-avoidance doctrines and rules	47
11. Tax assessment	48
<b>Germany</b>	49
1. Power to enact tax laws	49
2. Sharing of tax revenue	49
3. Administrating taxes	50
4. Significance of taxes	50
4.1 Importance of individual taxes	50
4.2 Shift from direct taxes to indirect taxes	53
5. Personal income tax	54
5.1 Tax base	54
5.2 Tax rates	57
6. Corporate income tax	58
7. Trade tax on income and capital	59
8. Statutory style	60
9. Impact of the Constitution and the Federal Constitutional Court	61
9.1 Basic rights	61
9.2 Important decisions	61
10. Statutory interpretation	62
11. Role of the courts	63
12. The German assessment system	63

12.1 Tax filing and audit enforcement .....	64
12.2 Differences in tax compliance .....	64
13. Appeals against tax assessments .....	66
14. Appeal to court .....	66
14.1 Federal Tax Court ( <i>Bundesfinanzhof</i> ) .....	67
15. Administrative style .....	67
16. Taxpayer's style .....	68
17. Relation of tax and financial accounting .....	68
18. Respect of civil or private law .....	69
19. Substance over form .....	69
<b>Japan</b> .....	71
1. History .....	71
2. Basic structure of the system .....	74
3. Rate structure .....	74
4. Composition of fiscal system .....	75
5. Statutory style .....	75
6. Statutory interpretation .....	76
7. Administrative style .....	76
8. Taxpayer style .....	77
9. Judicial role and style .....	78
10. General principles .....	79
10.1 Relation of tax to financial accounting .....	79
10.2 Extent of respect for civil law form .....	79
10.3 Anti-avoidance doctrines or legislation .....	79
11. Procedure .....	80
<b>The Netherlands</b> .....	81
1. Tax system .....	81
2. History of the Netherlands tax system, tax morale and tax simplification .....	82
3. Statutory and judicial style and role .....	83
3.1 Statutory style .....	83
3.2 Judicial role and style .....	84
4. Basic structure of the income tax system .....	85
4.1 Types of income taxes .....	85
4.2 Sources of income .....	86
4.3 Tax rates .....	87
4.4 Indexation to inflation .....	88

5.	Statutory interpretation .....	88
5.1	In general .....	88
5.2	Respect under tax law for the civil (private) law form of contracts .....	89
5.3	Substance over form .....	89
6.	Tax administration .....	89
6.1	Organization of the Revenue Service .....	91
6.2	Taxpayer bill of rights; ombudsman .....	91
6.3	Release of Government information to taxpayers .....	92
6.4	Advance rulings .....	92
7.	Tax procedure .....	93
7.1	Assessment, administrative appeal and appeal to courts .....	93
7.2	Impact of human rights conventions and EC Treaty fundamental freedom provisions .....	94
8.	International .....	95
8.1	Historically-based foreign orientation .....	95
8.2	Double taxation relief .....	95
8.3	Classical system .....	96
	<b>Sweden</b> .....	97
1.	Historical development .....	97
2.	Basic structure .....	97
3.	Composition of fiscal system .....	100
4.	Statutory style .....	101
5.	Statutory interpretation .....	102
6.	Administrative style .....	103
7.	Taxpayer style .....	104
8.	Judicial style .....	104
9.	General principles .....	104
9.1	Relation of tax and financial accounting .....	105
9.2	Respect of civil law .....	105
9.3	Anti-avoidance .....	105
10.	Procedure .....	106
	<b>United Kingdom</b> .....	109
1.	The principle direct taxes .....	109
1.1	Income Tax .....	109
1.2	Capital Gains Tax (CGT) .....	112
1.3	Corporation Tax .....	114

2.	Indirect taxes .....	115
3.	Constitutional structure .....	116
4.	Rate of tax .....	117
	4.1 History and politics .....	117
	4.2 Inflation .....	117
	4.3 Rate structure and reliefs, 1996 .....	117
5.	Tax setting .....	117
	5.1 Administration .....	119
	5.2 Avoidance of tax .....	121
	5.3 Sources of law, official practice and rulings .....	125
6.	Role of courts .....	126
	6.1 Judicial review .....	126
	6.2 Appeal system .....	127
7.	The current situation .....	128
<b>United States</b> .....		131
1.	History of the federal income tax .....	131
2.	Constitutional issues .....	132
3.	Tax rates .....	133
4.	Composition of fiscal system .....	135
5.	Basic structure of income tax for individuals .....	137
6.	Basic structure of the corporate income tax .....	142
7.	Statutory style .....	144
8.	Statutory interpretation .....	145
9.	Administrative, taxpayer and judicial style .....	147
	9.1 Administrative style .....	147
	9.2 Taxpayer style .....	148
	9.3 Judicial structure and style .....	149
10.	Relationship of tax and financial accounting .....	149
11.	Anti-avoidance legislation .....	150
12.	Future developments .....	151

## Part Two: Basic Income Taxation

<b>Subpart A: Inclusions in the tax base</b> .....		155
1.	Employee fringe benefits .....	157
	1.1 General .....	157
	1.2 Employer-provided pension benefits .....	165
2.	Imputed income from owner-occupied housing .....	172

3.	Gifts .....	75
3.1	Gifts outside of a business context ("personal" gifts) .....	176
3.2	Gifts in a business or employment context .....	177
4.	Prizes and awards .....	178
5.	Scholarships and grants .....	180
6.	Cancellation of indebtedness .....	182
7.	Gambling .....	185
8.	Illegal income .....	186
9.	Windfalls .....	187
10.	Subsidies .....	188
11.	Realization and recognition of gain .....	189
12.	Capital gains and losses .....	194
<b>Subpart B: Deductions .....</b>		<b>204</b>
1.	Mixed business and personal expenses .....	204
1.1	Commuting .....	207
1.2	Moving expenses .....	210
1.3	Clothing .....	212
1.4	Business travel .....	214
1.5	Business entertainment .....	216
1.6	Child care .....	219
2.	"Hobby losses" and the criteria for determining business versus personal activities .....	222
3.	Capital costs and recovery methods .....	225
3.1	Determining capital costs .....	225
3.2	Capital cost recovery systems .....	226
4.	Educational costs .....	232
5.	Deduction of personal costs .....	233
5.1	Interest .....	233
5.2	Personal losses .....	236
5.3	Medical expenses .....	238
5.4	Charitable deduction .....	239
6.	Limitations on deductions and losses .....	241
6.1	Illegal payments, fines and penalties .....	241
6.2	Expense associated with tax-exempt income .....	243
6.3	"Quarantining" and other limits or restrictions on certain categories of expenses .....	245

<b>Subpart C: Accounting</b> .....	250
1. Basic accounting methods .....	250
2. Inclusion of advance payments .....	257
3. Income treatment of deferred payments .....	258
4. Original issue discount obligations and other complex financial instruments .....	260
<b>Subpart D: Attribution of income</b> .....	269
1. Definition of taxable unit .....	270
2. Alimony and child support .....	276
3. Limitations on assignment of income .....	280

### Part Three: Taxation of Business Organizations

<b>Subpart A: Corporate-Shareholder Taxation</b> .....	285
1. Overview of corporate tax systems .....	286
2. Defining entities subject to tax .....	289
3. Issues in corporate formation .....	292
4. Issues involving capital structure .....	298
5. Taxation of corporate distributions .....	302
5.1 Basic structure of distribution rules .....	302
5.2 Relating distributions to corporate earnings .....	304
5.3 Constructive dividends .....	305
5.4 Intercorporate dividends .....	308
5.5 Distributions of appreciated or depreciated property .....	311
5.6 Distributions involving changes in corporate structure .....	313
5.6.1 General .....	313
5.6.2 Stock dividends .....	314
5.6.3 Redemptions .....	317
6. Liquidations .....	320
7. Corporate reorganizations and restructuring .....	324
7.1 General .....	324
7.2 Merger transactions .....	325
7.3 Share exchanges .....	331
7.4 Nonmerger asset reorganizations .....	333
7.5 Corporate divisions: "Demergers" .....	333
8. Transfer and limitations on transfer of corporate tax attributes .....	340



- 9. Consolidated corporate taxation ..... 343
- 10. Special tax regimes for closely held corporations ..... 348

**Subpart B: Partnership Taxation ..... 354**

- 1. Qualification for pass-thru taxation ..... 355
- 2. Basic structure of pass-thru taxation ..... 356
- 3. Liabilities, basis and losses ..... 360
- 4. Transactions between partner and partnership ..... 361
- 5. Disposition of partnership interest ..... 363
- 6. Liquidation of the partnership ..... 365

**Part Four: International Taxation**

**Subpart A: Residence Taxation ..... 368**

- 1. Bases for the assertion of personal taxing jurisdiction .... 368
  - 1.1 Individuals ..... 368
  - 1.2 Corporations ..... 371
- 2. Change of status ..... 373
  - 2.1 Change of status of individuals ..... 373
  - 2.2 Change of status of corporations ..... 376
  - 2.3 Dual residence ..... 379
- 3. Mechanisms for relief of double taxation..... 380
  - 3.1 Issues in the structure of a foreign tax credit system ..... 385
    - 3.1.1 Creditable taxes ..... 385
    - 3.1.2 Limitations on the credit ..... 388
    - 3.1.3 Allocation of expenses to foreign-source income ... 391
    - 3.1.4 Treatment of losses in the credit computation ..... 394
    - 3.1.5 Carryover of excess credits or limitation..... 396
    - 3.1.6 Indirect credit for foreign taxes paid by foreign subsidiaries..... 397
      - 3.1.6.1 Share ownership requirements..... 398
      - 3.1.6.2 Tier Limitations ..... 399
      - 3.1.6.3 Computation of the indirect credit ..... 399
    - 3.1.7 Interaction between indirect credit and limitation system ..... 400
  - 3.2 Issues in the structure of an exemption for foreign income ..... 402

3.2.1	Structure of the exemption.....	402
3.2.2	Classes of exempt income .....	402
3.2.3	Allocation of deductions to tax-exempt income.....	406
3.2.4	Treatment of foreign losses .....	408
4.	Limitations on exemptions or deferral of income of foreign corporations.....	409
4.1	Limitations on exemption for shareholders in foreign corporations with significant domestic share ownership.....	411
4.2	Limitations on deferral for shareholders of foreign corporations with significant domestic share ownership.....	413
4.3	Special provisions dealing with domestic portfolio investment in foreign investment companies .....	422
5.	Outbound transfers to foreign branches or subsidiaries .....	425
<b>Subpart B: Source Taxation .....</b>		<b>431</b>
1.	Issues in the structure of net basis taxation of business income .....	431
1.1	Threshold of activity .....	431
1.2	Attribution of business income for net basis taxation ..	434
1.3	Determination of deductions in the net basis taxation of business income .....	439
1.4	Taxation of employment income .....	442
1.5	Other situations involving net basis taxation.....	444
2.	Issues in the structure of gross basis taxation .....	445
3.	Branch profits tax	
4.	Limitations on base-eroding payments to nonresidents.....	452
5.	Restrictions on source-based taxation of nonresidents within the European Union.....	455
<b>Subpart C: Additional International Topics</b>		
1.	Special international anti-avoidance rules. ....	459
2.	Selected intercompany pricing issues.....	461
3.	Selected treaty issues .....	467
3.1	Relation between domestic law and treaties; treaty override.....	467
3.2	Approach to treaty interpretation.....	469

3.3 Anti-treaty shopping policy .....	471
3.4 Nondiscrimination .....	474
3.5 "Model" treaties.....	476
3.6 Tax sparing by treaty.....	478
<b>Part Five: Selected Bibliography .....</b>	<b>481</b>
<b>Index .....</b>	<b>533</b>