

THE NOTION OF AN IDEAL AUDIENCE IN LEGAL ARGUMENT

by

GEORGE C. CHRISTIE

*Duke University,
Durham,
North Carolina, U.S.A.*



KLUWER ACADEMIC PUBLISHERS

DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LONDON

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	ix
<i>Chapter 1.</i> Introduction	1
<i>Chapter 2.</i> The Notion of an Ideal Audience as an Analytical Tool	6
A. A General Philosophical Example—Illuminating the Power of Rhetoric	6
B. An Example from Legal Theory—Is a Predictive Theory of Law Logically Possible?	13
<i>Chapter 3.</i> What Are the Constraints that Can Be Imposed on Arguments Addressed to an Ideal Audience?	26
<i>Chapter 4.</i> Some Universal Features of Ideal Audiences in Legal Contexts	41
<i>Chapter 5.</i> Different Conceptions of the Ideal Audience— A First Look	49
<i>Chapter 6.</i> Accounting for Differences in Perceptions of the Ideal Audience—Some Preliminary Observations	62
A. Competing Visions of the Way the State Should Be Organized	63
B. Conflicting Views as to the Purpose of the State	68
<i>Chapter 7.</i> Choosing Between Competing Visions of the Good—the Case of Necessity	76
A. The Need to Choose	76
B. Choosing to Sacrifice the Property of Others	81
1. Destroying Property to Save Human Life	81
2. Destroying the Property of Others to Preserve One's Own Property and the Taking and Consumption of the Property of Others	85

C.	Sacrificing the Life of an Innocent Person to Save the Lives of a Greater Number of Innocent Persons	89
<i>Chapter 8.</i>	The Conflict Between the General and the Particular—Some Legal Background	108
A.	Some Historical Background and Examples	108
B.	The Scope of the Modern Tort of Negligence	117
<i>Chapter 9.</i>	The Conflict Between the General and the Particular—Theoretical Perspectives	129
A.	The Case for General Principles Put Forth by Dworkin	129
B.	Additional Factors Prompting the Search for General Principles	138
C.	Counter-Arguments	143
<i>Chapter 10.</i>	Ambivalent Attitudes with Regard to Discretion	152
A.	Introduction	152
B.	An Analytical Framework	154
C.	The Irresistible Urge to Narrow the Scope of Discretion	161
D.	Structural and Ideological Factors Behind the Urge to Broaden the Scope of Discretion . . .	166
<i>Chapter 11.</i>	Toleration of Diverse and Even Inconsistent Outcomes	180
<i>Chapter 12.</i>	Conclusion	193
<i>Cases Cited</i>		200
<i>Bibliography</i>		205
<i>Index</i>		211