

---

# **Regulating Public Procurement**

---

**National and International  
Perspectives**

---

**Susan L. Arrowsmith  
John Linarelli  
Don Wallace, Jr.**



*The Hague • London • Boston*

# Contents

<b>Chapter 1</b>	
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
I. What is Public Procurement?	1
II. The Importance of Public Procurement	7
(i) Taxpayers and Funding Agencies	8
(ii) The Beneficiaries of Goods and Services	9
(iii) Government Contractors	9
(iv) Economic Development	10
(v) Social and Environmental Objectives	11
(vi) Integrity of the Administration	11
III. The Market Framework for Government Procurement	12
IV. The Contractual Background	13
V. The Reasons for Regulating Public Procurement and the Recent “Global Revolution”	15
VI. The Limits of Legal Regulation and the Importance of the Procurement Environment	18
A. The Procurement Environment	18
B. The Relationship Between the Procurement Environment and Legal Regulation	20
VII. Outline of the Book	23

<b>Chapter 2</b>	
<b>The Domestic Regulation of Procurement</b>	<b>27</b>
I. Introduction	27
II. The Objectives of Domestic Procurement Policy:	
An Introduction	28
A. Value for Money	28
B. Efficiency of the Procurement Process	31
C. Probity (Integrity)	32
1. The Objective of Probity	32
2. The Relationship Between Probity and Other Procurement Objectives	37
3. Measures for Combatting Corruption	38
(i) Transparency	38
(ii) Conflict of interest rules	39
(iii) "Procurement" sanctions on bidders	41
(iv) Criminal and disciplinary sanctions	49
(v) Requirements for internal control mechanisms by contractors	50
(vi) Supplementary and structural measures	50
(vii) Anti-corruption measures by foreign countries	51
D. Fair and Equal Treatment by Contractors	61
E. Industrial, Social and Environmental Objectives	63
F. Outsourcing Policies	63
1. The Background to Outsourcing	63
2. Implications of Outsourcing for Procurement Regulation	71
III. Regulatory Strategy	73
A. The Concept of Transparency and Rules Versus Discretion	73
B. Law and Administrative Rules	86
IV. The UNCITRAL Model Law on Procurement of Goods, Construction And Services	88

<b>Chapter 3</b>	
<b>International Development Institutions and Public Procurement</b>	<b>99</b>

I. Introduction	99
II. An Overview of the Institutions	100

A. Types of Institutions	100
B. Multilateral Development Banks	100
C. Development Institutions That are not Development Banks	103
III. Procurements Financed by the Multilateral Development Banks	110
A. Questions Considered	110
B. The Role and Legal Status of Procurement Guidelines and Standard Bidding Documents	110
C. The Requirement of International Competitive Bidding (ICB)	
1. The World Bank Model	114
2. The Purposes of International Competitive Bidding	115
3. Domestic Preferences in the World Bank Model	117
4. Other Methods of Procurement	117
5. A Critique	118
6. Note on Procurement Reform	119
D. Consultants	120
E. Adjustment Versus Investment Operations	126
F. Co-Financing	130
G. The Disbursement Process	135
H. How Do Development Banks Deal With Corruption?	138
IV. Remedies: Does a Firm Have Legal Redress Against a Donor or Lender?	142
V. Tied Aid	151

#### Chapter 4

#### International Free Trade Agreements 157

I. The Development of International Agreements on Public Procurement	157
II. The Objectives of Free Trade Agreements and the Obstacles to Success	158
III. Procurement Within the World Trade Organisation (WTO)	182
A. Development of the WTO's Government Procurement Agreement (GPA)	182
B. Obligations Under the GPA	185
1. General Principles of the GPA: National Treatment and the Most Favoured Nation Obligation	186
a. National Treatment	186
b. The Most Favoured Nation (MFN) Obligation	188
c. Rules of Origin	188

Contents

2. Award Procedures Under the GPA	189
3. Provision of Information by Governments	192
C. Coverage of the GPA	194
1. The General Approach to Coverage	194
2. Entities Covered	195
3. Types of Contracts Covered	197
4. Thresholds	198
5. Derogations Based on Reciprocity	199
6. Other Derogations	200
D. Expanding Participation in WTO Disciplines on Government Procurement	201
E. Remedies and Enforcement	219
IV. Regional and Bilateral Agreements	219
A. The Extent of Regional and Bilateral Agreements on Public Procurement	219
B. Regional Agreements and the Global Trading System	225
V. The Relationship Between International and National Procurement Rules	230

**Chapter 5**  
**Industrial, Social and Environmental**  
**Concerns in Public Procurement** 237

I. Introduction	237
II. Industrial Objectives in Public Procurement	238
A. Preferential Procurement Policies	238
1. Policies to Support Domestic Industries Against Competitive Imports	238
2. Policies to Correct Market Imperfections	244
3. Policies to Create a Comparative Advantage in Imperfect Markets	245
4. Policies to Reduce Government Procurement Costs	246
5. Preferential Procurement Based on the Need to Pay Economic Rents	247
6. Preferential Procurement as a Bargaining Tool in Trade Negotiations	247
7. Policies Directed at Non-Economic Objectives	251
8. Potential Problems	252
B. Industrial Objectives Under the UNCITRAL Model Law	253

1. General Principles	253
2. Provisions in the Model Law	254
III. Social and Environmental Objectives in Public Procurement	256
A. The Use of Procurement for Social and Environmental Objectives	256
1. Contract Compliance and the Development of Disadvantaged Groups	257
2. Contract Compliance and Fair Labour Practices	280
3. Other Secondary Policies in Procurement	285
B. Adopting and Designing a Contract Compliance Policy: Theoretical and Practical Concerns	287
1. The Legitimacy of Contract Compliance	287
2. Methods of Policy Implementation	288
3. Costs of Social and Environmental Policies	290
4. Monitoring and Enforcement	291
C. Social and Environmental Policies Under the UNCITRAL Model Law	296
IV. Transparency in Implementing Secondary Objectives	298
V. Industrial, Social and Environmental Objectives Under International Trade Agreements	301
A. The Impact of Trade Agreements on Industrial Objectives	301
1. The Impact of National Treatment Rules	301
2. Should Exceptions be Made for Industrial Policy Measures?	304
B. The Impact of Trade Agreements on Social and Environmental Objectives	310

## Chapter 6

### The Coverage of Public Procurement Rules 323

I. Introduction	323
II. Which Entities are Covered?	324
A. Delimiting and Defining Entity Coverage in Domestic Law	324
1. The Problem of Defining “Public” Procurement	324
2. The Provisions of the UNCITRAL Model Law	332
3. Legislative Techniques for Defining Coverage: the Example of the European Union Procurement Directives	334
4. Should the Rules be the Same for all Regulated Entities?	336

B. Entity Coverage Under International Procurement Agreements	336
III. Which Types of Transactions are Covered?	337
A. Application of Rules	337
B. Defence and Security Issues	338
C. Are Privately Financed Public Projects “Procurement”?	341
D. Classification of Contracts	352
IV. Value Thresholds	353

**Chapter 7**  
**Procurement Planning** 355

I. Introduction	355
II. Procurement Documentation	357
A. The Contents of Procurement Documentation	357
1. Standardised Documents	357
2. The UNCITRAL Model Law	358
3. The World Bank	362
4. Indonesia — Recent Practice by a Developing Country	367
5. Who Bears the Cost of Documentation?	369
B. Contract Types	370
1. Introduction	370
2. Classification by Price Term	370
a. Fixed Price Contracts	371
i. The Firm Fixed Price Contract	371
ii. The Fixed Price Contract with Adjustment Mechanism	375
iii. The Fixed Price Incentive Contract	377
iv. Other Types of Firm Fixed Price Contracts	378
b. Cost Reimbursement Contracts	380
i. The Cost Plus a Percentage of Cost Contract	381
ii. The Cost Plus Fixed Fee Contract	382
iii. The Cost Plus Incentive Fee Contract	384
iv. Cost Plus No Fee Contracts	387
3. Classification by Quantity or Delivery Term	387
4. Turnkey or Design-Build Contracts	392
5. Private Finance	396
C. Drafting Specifications	407

1. Ensuring Adequate Competition: Domestic Regulation, UNCITRAL and the World Bank	407
2. Specifications Under International Trade Agreements	435
D. Drafting Evaluation Criteria	440
E. Price or Cost Estimates	440
III. Record Keeping, Debriefing and Disclosure of Information	453
A. The Requirement to Keep Records of Procurement Proceedings	453
B. Debriefing and Disclosure of Information on the Procurement Proceedings	455

**Chapter 8**  
**Methods of Procurement** 459

I. Introduction	459
II. Formal Tendering Procedures	463
A. Introduction	463
B. Types of Tendering	465
1. Open Tendering	466
2. Restricted Tendering	468
C. Some Controversial Issues in Tendering	472
1. Should There be a Preference for Tendering?	472
2. Is there a Need for Clear and Precise Specifications in Formal Tendering?	487
3. Should There be Restrictions on Negotiations or Discussions Following Submission of Tenders?	488
a. Post-Tender Communications	489
b. Pre-Tender Communications	498
D. The Mechanics of Tendering	503
1. Submission of Tenders	503
2. The Opening of Tenders	505
3. Late Tenders	506
4. Withdrawals and Modifications of Tenders	508
III. Two Stage Tendering	510
IV. Requests for Proposals (RFP)	514
V. Competitive Negotiation	534
VI. Single Source Procurement	537
VII. Requests for Quotations or Shopping	550



<b>Chapter 9</b>		
<b>Publicity for Contract Opportunities</b>		<b>553</b>
I.	Introduction	553
II.	General Notices Giving Advance Publicity of Procurement Opportunities	554
III.	Notices Advertising Specific Procurements	557
IV.	The Place and Method of Publication	563
V.	Content of Notices	569
	A. Information Required in Notices	569
	B. The Language of Notices	577
VI.	Should a Contract be Readvertised When Requirements Change?	579
VII.	Exceptions to Publicity Requirements	582
	A. Competitive Procedures Without Publicity	582
	B. Single Tendering	584
<b>Chapter 10</b>		
<b>Qualification, Prequalification and Shortlisting</b>		<b>585</b>
I.	Introduction	585
II.	Minimum Financial and Technical Criteria	587
	A. Financial and Technical Criteria Under National Systems and World Bank Guidelines	587
	1. Financial Criteria	588
	2. Technical Criteria	590
	B. Procedural Aspects	596
	1. Qualification Generally and "Postqualification"	596
	2. Prequalification Procedures	608
	a. The Concept	608
	b. How to Conduct Prequalifications	616
	C. Financial and Technical Criteria Under International Agreements	621
III.	Qualification Criteria Other Than Financial and Technical Criteria	624
IV.	The Use of Lists in Contractor Qualification	639
	A. Types of Lists	639
	B. Optional Lists	639
	C. Mandatory Lists	641
V.	Shortlisting	645

<b>Chapter 11</b>		
<b>Examination, Evaluation, Selection and Award</b>		<b>649</b>
I.	Introduction	649
II.	Responsiveness	650
III.	Evaluation	673
A.	Introduction	673
B.	The Nature of Evaluation/Award Criteria	674
1.	The Types of Factors	674
2.	Distinguishing Evaluation from Qualification	688
C.	The Evaluation Process	697
1.	Technical Evaluation	697
2.	Price or Cost Evaluation	699
D.	Selecting the Winner	702
E.	The Requirement to State Evaluation/Award Criteria in Advance	721
F.	The Problem of Biased Evaluation Criteria	730
IV.	Contract Award and Notification of Unsuccessful Firms	741
V.	Rejection of All Offers	743

<b>Chapter 12</b>		
<b>Enforcement and Remedies</b>		<b>749</b>
I.	Introduction	749
II.	Review Procedures	751
A.	Introduction to Review Procedures	751
1.	Review Procedures in Domestic Law and the UNCITRAL Model Law	751
2.	Review Procedures Under International Liberalisation Agreements	754
3.	Review Procedures and the International Financing Institutions	757
4.	Designing a Review System	757
5.	Review Procedures in Context	758
B.	Designing Review Procedures	761
1.	The Importance of Speed: Length of Proceedings and Time Limits for Bringing Proceedings	761
2.	The Forum and Procedure for Review	763

a.	The UNCITRAL Model Law	765
b.	The GPA	768
3.	Reviewable and Non-Reviewable Decisions	770
4.	Who May Initiate a Complaint?	771
5.	Suspension (Interim Measures)	772
6.	Remedies to Correct the Breach	781
7.	The Problem of Concluded Contracts	785
a.	Introduction	785
b.	The Right of Aggrieved Firms to Challenge a Concluded Contract	786
c.	Can the Parties to the Contract Deny its Legal Effects?	788
d.	What are the Consequences of Setting Aside a Contract?	788
8.	Damages	
a.	Availability of Compensatory Damages	795
b.	The Principles for Assessing Compensatory Damages	796
c.	“Punitive” or “Exemplary” Damages	803
9.	Standards for Review	803
10.	Documentation of Award Procedures and Reasons for Decisions	815
11.	Example of a System of Challenge Procedures: the Case of Japan	815
III.	Criminal, Administrative and Disciplinary Sanctions	823
IV.	External Enforcement Authorities	825
V.	Inter-Governmental Dispute Settlement	831
A.	Introduction	831
B.	The Dispute Settlement Mechanism Under the GPA	832
1.	Procedures Under the DSU	841
2.	Remedies Under the DSU	841
C.	Inter-Governmental Dispute Resolution and Enforcement Within the European Union	847