

The Law of Subsidies under the GATT/WTO System

Marc Benitah



KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL
THE HAGUE / LONDON / NEW YORK

Table of Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	ix
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xi
<i>Introduction</i>	1
Part I. Legal Techniques for Attenuating Entitlements Granted to the Party Allegedly Affected by a Subsidy	7
A. Explicit Techniques of Attenuation	11
Chapter 1: Effect-based Norms	11
Chapter 2: Attenuations Favoring Developing Countries	35
Chapter 3: The <i>De Minimis</i> Technique of Attenuation	44
Chapter 4: Attenuations Favoring Countries in Economic Transition	46
B. Implicit Techniques of Attenuation	51
Chapter 5: The “Mutually Satisfactory Solution”	51
Chapter 6: The Poorly Defined Concept	58
Chapter 7: The Ambiguous Silence as to the Link Between Two Texts	62
Chapter 8: Techniques of Interpretation Functioning as an Attenuation	65
Chapter 9: Placing Functionally Similar Practices Beyond the Field of Subsidies	68
Chapter 10: The Absence of Special Treatment for Special Subsidies	77
Chapter 11: Intensifying the Burden of Proof as an Implicit Technique of Attenuation	84
C. The Relative Weakness of Attenuations in the Countervailing Duty Field	87
Chapter 12: Attenuations Derived From the Simple View of “Distortion” and Constraining the Identification of a Countervailable Subsidy	87

Chapter 13: Dilution of Required Effects	93
Chapter 14: An Unexploited Technique of Attenuation: The Legal Absence of Consumers	97
Chapter 15: Attenuations Favoring Developing Countries in the Field of Countervailing Duties: A Dubious Privilege	111
Chapter 16: Imprecise Requirements with Respect to the Initiation of Countervailing Duty Proceedings	113
Part II. Techniques of Attenuation as a Seed for the Birth of Legal Disputes	117
A. Legal Disputes Arising from the Ambiguous Link between Two Texts	119
Chapter 17: The Relationship between Article I of the 1947 General Agreement and the Tokyo Round Subsidies Code (GATT/1947 System)	119
Chapter 18: The <i>Airbus</i> Case (GATT/1947 System)	125
Chapter 19: Relevance of the Tokyo Round Illustrative List for the Definition of a Countervailable Subsidy (GATT/1947 System)	132
Chapter 20: A Variation on this Theme in the WTO System: The <i>A Contrario</i> Saga	141
Chapter 21: The Issue of Admissibility in the Pasta Case (GATT/1947 System)	151
Chapter 22: Potential Issues as to the Relationship between WTO Agreements	154
B. Disputes Arising from Poorly Defined Concepts	173
Chapter 23: The “More than Equitable Share” Criterion (GATT/1947 System)	173
Chapter 24: The Absence of a Definition of the “Material Advantage” Criterion (WTO System)	181
Chapter 25: “Inconsistency with Development Needs”: A Criterion nearly Impossible to Satisfy (WTO System)	185
Chapter 26: The Ambiguity of the “Otherwise Due” Criterion and the Possibility of Multiple Universal Reference Sets (WTO System)	187
Chapter 27: The “In Fact Tied” Criterion: Tentative Rulings (WTO System)	190

C. The Failure of Extremist Techniques of Interpretation	199
C(a). The Failure of Country B's Sophisticated Economic Interpretations	199
Chapter 28: The <i>Wine Grape Case</i> (GATT/1947 System)	199
Chapter 29: The Attempt to Convert an Indirect Subsidy into a Direct Subsidy (GATT/1947 System)	205
Chapter 30: The Failure of Analyzing a Subsidy as Benefiting a Merchandise Rather than a Firm (WTO System)	212
Chapter 31: Attempts to Sophisticate the Standard Case Law Definition of "Benefit" (WTO System)	214
Chapter 32: The Attempt to Treat Export Restraints as Subsidies	218
C(b). The Failure of Attempts to Intensify Country B's Attenuations Through an Extremist Technique of Interpretation	225
Chapter 33: The Attempt to Differentiate Producers Receiving the Subsidy and Producers Benefiting from the Subsidy (GATT/1947 System)	225
Chapter 34: The Failure of the Net Cost Approach to "Benefit" (WTO System)	227
Chapter 35: The Attempt of an Ultra-restrictive Interpretation of "Payment" (WTO System)	230
Chapter 36: The Failure of the Formalistic Interpretation of "Financed by Virtue of Governmental Action" (WTO System)	235
D. Vulnerability of Attenuations Favoring Developing Countries	239
Chapter 37: Vulnerability of the Eight-year Exemption Relating to Prohibited Export Subsidies	239
Chapter 38: Vulnerability of the Exemption Relating to Subsidies Contingent on the Use of Domestic Products	243
Chapter 39: Vulnerability of the Protection Against the "Serious Prejudice" Claim	248
E. The Difficulty to Apply Coherently Attenuations Derived from the Concept of "Distortion"	251
Chapter 40: Different Views of "Distortion"	252

Chapter 41: Attenuations Derived from the Simple View of “Distortion”	256
Chapter 42: Legal Treatment Reflecting the Sophisticated View of “Distortion”	267
Chapter 43: “Distortion”: A Poor Guide for Explaining Several Normative and Interpretative Choices	273
F. Causality between Subsidy and Injury for the Purpose of Countervailing Duties: A Legally Indeterminate Attenuation	281
Chapter 44: International Texts: A “Double Bind” Scenario	281
Chapter 45: The Confusion of National Legislation and Case Law Faced with the Indeterminacy of International Texts: The Case of the United States	289
Chapter 46: The Confusion of National Legislation and Case Law Faced with the Indeterminacy of International Texts: The Case of the European Union	296
Chapter 47: The False Dilemma between the Effects of “Subsidized Imports” and the “Effects of the Subsidy”: Critical Analysis of the Panel’s Report on Atlantic Salmon	300
Part III. Obstacles in the Way of Clarifying Attenuated Norms through the Case Law Process	305
Chapter 48: Panel’s Reluctance to Rule Clearly	307
Chapter 49: Adoption of the Panel’s Report and the veto of the Losing Party	314
Chapter 50: Conflicting Interpretations of the Panel’s Report	318
Chapter 51: Implementation Made Dependiant upon the Uruguay Round Negotiations	333
Chapter 52: Procedural Obstacles as a Reaction to the Quasi-automatic Establishment of a Panel in the WTO System	336
Chapter 53: Lost Opportunities for the Case Law Process	342
<i>Annex</i>	355
<i>Bibliography</i>	413
<i>Table of Cases</i>	414
<i>Index</i>	415