The United Nations Convention Against Torture

A Commentary

MANFRED NOWAK ELIZABETH McARTHUR

with the contribution of

Kerstin Buchinger

Julia Kozma

Roland Schmidt

Isabelle Tschan

Ludwig Boltzmann Institute of Human Rights Vienna



Table of Contents

| Preface | | v |
|--------------|--|------|
| Note on the | Method of Citation | xvii |
| List of Abbi | reviations | xxi |
| Introductio | n | 1 |
| Conventi | on Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or | |
| | g Treatment or Punishment | 15 |
| Preamble | | 17 |
| PART I | SUBSTANTIVE ARTICLES | 25 |
| Article 1. | Definition of Torture | 27 |
| Article 2. | Obligation to Prevent Torture | 87 |
| Article 3. | Principle of Non-Refoulement | 126 |
| Article 4. | Obligation to Criminalize Torture | 229 |
| Article 5. | Types of Jurisdiction over the Offence of Torture | 253 |
| Article 6. | Procedural Safeguards During the Preliminary | |
| | Investigation Phase | 328 |
| Article 7. | Aut Dedere aut Iudicare | 344 |
| Article 8. | The Convention as a Basis for Extradition | 368 |
| Article 9. | Mutual Judicial Assistance | 383 |
| Article 10. | Training of Personnel | 389 |
| Article 11. | Review of Interrogation and Prison Rules | 401 |
| Article 12. | Ex Officio Investigations | 413 |
| Article 13. | Right of Victims to Complain | 439 |
| Article 14. | Right of Torture Victims to Adequate Remedy | |
| | and Reparation | 452 |
| Article 15. | Non-Admissibility of Evidence Extracted by Torture | 503 |
| Article 16. | Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment | |
| | or Punishment | 538 |

| PART II | : PROCEDURAL ARTICLES | 577 |
|-------------|--|------|
| Article 17. | Committee against Torture | 579 |
| | Rules of Procedure | 607 |
| Article 19. | State Reporting Procedure | 624 |
| | Inquiry Procedure | 659 |
| Article 21. | Inter-State Communications | 699 |
| Article 22. | Individual Complaints Procedure | 719 |
| | Privileges and Immunities | 798 |
| Article 24. | Annual Report | 802 |
| PART II | I: FINAL CLAUSES | 815 |
| Article 25. | Signature and Ratification | 817 |
| | Accession and Succession | 821 |
| Article 27. | Entry into Force | 830 |
| | Opting Out of the Inquiry Procedure | 836 |
| | Amendment | 845 |
| Article 30. | Settlement of Disputes | 853 |
| Article 31. | Denunciation | 866 |
| Article 32. | Notification by the Secretary-General | 871 |
| Article 33. | Authentic Texts | 875 |
| Optional | Protocol to the Convention Against Torture and O | ther |
| | human or Degrading Treatment or Punishment | 879 |
| Preamble | | 881 |
| PART I: | GENERAL PRINCIPLES | 893 |
| Article 1. | System of Preventive Visits to Places of Detention | 895 |
| Article 2. | | 908 |
| Article 3. | Establishment of the National Preventive Mechanism | 919 |
| Article 4. | Obligation to allow Preventive Visits to all | |
| | Places of Detention | 925 |
| PART I | I: SUBCOMMITTEE ON PREVENTION | 935 |
| Article 5. | Size and Composition of the Subcommittee | |
| | on Prevention | 937 |

| | Table of Contents | xiii |
|-------------|--|------|
| Article 6. | Nomination of Subcommittee Members | 950 |
| Article 7. | Election of the Subcommittee | 957 |
| Article 8. | Filling of Vacancies | 967 |
| Article 9. | Term of Office | 970 |
| Article 10. | Rules of Procedures | 976 |
| PART II | I: MANDATE OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE | |
| | ON PREVENTION | 985 |
| Article 11. | Mandate of the Subcommittee | 987 |
| Article 12. | Obligations of States Parties to Cooperate with the | |
| | Subcommittee | 1000 |
| Article 13. | Obligations of the Subcommittee Concerning | |
| | Country Missions | 1015 |
| Article 14. | Obligation of States Parties to Facilitate Visits by | |
| | the Subcommittee to Places of Detention | 1031 |
| Article 15. | Prohibition of Sanctions against any Source of | 10/6 |
| A . 1 . c | Information of the Subcommittee | 1046 |
| Article 16. | Reports of the Subcommittee | 1052 |
| PART IV | : NATIONAL PREVENTIVE | |
| | MECHANISMS | 1065 |
| Article 17. | National Preventive Mechanisms | 1067 |
| | Independence, Pluralism and Efficiency of | |
| | National Preventive Mechanisms | 1071 |
| Article 19. | Mandate and Power of National Preventive | |
| | Mechanisms | 1077 |
| Article 20. | Obligations of States Parties to Facilitate Visits | |
| | by the National Preventive Mechanisms | 1084 |
| Article 21. | Prohibition of Sanctions against any Source of | |
| | Information of the NPM | 1092 |
| Article 22. | Obligation of States Parties to Examine the | |
| | Recommendations of National Preventive Mechanisms | 1096 |
| Article 23. | Annual Report of the National Preventive Mechanism | 1099 |
| PART V: | DECLARATION | 1103 |
| Article 24. | Temporary Opting-Out Declaration | 1105 |

| PART VI: FINANCIAL PROVISIONS | |
|---|--------------|
| Article 25. Financing of the Subcommittee Article 26. Special Fund | 1113 1122 |
| PART VII: FINAL PROVISIONS | 1131 |
| Article 27. Signature, Ratification and Accession | 1133 |
| Article 28. Entry into Force | 1139 |
| Article 29. Validity in Federal States | 1145 |
| Article 30. Prohibition of Reservations | 1149 |
| Article 31. Relation to Regional Systems of Preventive | |
| Visits to Places of Detention | 1154 |
| Article 32. Relation to the International Committee | |
| of the Red Cross | 1161 |
| Article 33. Denunciation | 1166 |
| Article 34. Amendments | 1172 |
| Article 35. Privileges and Immunities | 1177 |
| Article 36. Obligations of Members of the Subcommittee | |
| during Country Missions | 1184 |
| Article 37. Authentic Texts | 1191 |
| APPENDICES | |
| A. Texts relating to the Convention Against Torture 1. Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman | 1195 |
| or Degrading Treatment or Punishment | 1195 |
| 2. Draft Convention Texts | 1208 |
| 3. Reservations, Declarations, Notifications and Objections | 1200 |
| Relating to the Convention | 1227 |
| B. Texts established by the Committee Against Torture | 1283 |
| 1. Rules of Procedure of the Committee | 1283 |
| 2. Guidelines on Reporting | 1317 |
| a) Guidelines on the Form and Content of Initial Reports under | |
| Article 19 to be Submitted by States Parties to the Convention | |
| Against Torture | 1317 |
| b) General Guidelines Regarding the Form and Contents of | |
| Periodic Reports to be Submitted by States Parties under Article 19, Paragraph 1 of the Convention | 1326 |
| ATTICIC 17. CATAVIAGO FOR THE L'ANVENTION | 1 4 7 (1 |

| | Table of Contents | xv | |
|-------|---|------|--|
| | 3. Terms of Reference of the Rapporteurs a) Terms of Reference of the Rapporteur on | 1328 | |
| | New Complaints and Interim Measures | 1328 | |
| | b) Terms of Reference of the Rapporteur on Follow-up | 1320 | |
| | of Decisions on Complaints Submitted under Article 22 | 1329 | |
| | 4. General Comments No. 1 and No. 2 | 1330 | |
| | 5. Model Communication | 1340 | |
| | 6. Standard Secretariat Response to Registered Individual | | |
| | Communications | 1343 | |
| C. | Charts and Tables relating to the Convention Against Torture | 1345 | |
| | 1. Status of Ratifications of CAT | 1345 | |
| | 2. State Reports | 1353 | |
| | 3. Members of the Committee Against Torture since 1988 | 1392 | |
| | 4. Individual Complaints | 1394 | |
| | 5. Individual Complaints Procedure under Article 22 | 1411 | |
| | 6. UN Documents Concerning the Convention | | |
| | Against Torture | 1412 | |
| | a) Documents of the Committee Against Torture | 1412 | |
| | b) Summary Records of Meetings of the Committee | | |
| | Against Torture | 1426 | |
| | c) Documents of States Parties | 1428 | |
| | d) Summary Records of States Parties' Meetings | 1431 | |
| | e) Annual Reports | 1432 | |
| | f) Special Rapporteur on Torture Reports | 1433 | |
| D. | Texts relating to the Optional Protocol | 1439 | |
| | 1. Optional Protocol to the Convention Against Torture | | |
| | and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment | | |
| | or Punishment | 1439 | |
| | 2. Draft Optional Protocol Texts | 1452 | |
| E. | Charts and Tables relating to the Optional Protocol | 1499 | |
| | 1. Status of Ratifications of OPCAT | 1499 | |
| | 2. Members of the Subcommittee on Prevention | 1502 | |
| Bil | bliography | 1503 | |
| | Case Index | | |
| Index | | 1565 | |