

NAFTA Tax Law and Policy

Resolving the Clash between
Economic and Sovereignty Interests

ARTHUR J. COCKFIELD

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO PRESS
Toronto Buffalo London

Contents

TABLES	xiii
PREFACE	xv
1 Introduction	3
1 The Clash between Economic and Sovereignty Interests	4
2 Increasing Cooperation on Tax Coordination	5
3 Regulatory Emulation in Three-Player Game	5
4 Outline of the Book	6
PART I. THE CURRENT REGIME	
2 Background Issues	11
1 Introduction	11
2 Economic Concerns	11
2.1 Background	11
2.1.1 Emphasis and Scope of Study: Broad Review of Cross-Border Investment Patterns	11
2.1.2 Trade and Investment within North America	13
2.2 Tax Distortions	15
2.3 Tax Competition	16
2.4 Tax Discrimination	16
2.5 Tax Arbitrage and Transfer Pricing	16
2.6 International Double Taxation	17
3 Political Concerns	18
3.1 Tax Sovereignty	18
3.2 Tax and Domestic Policy Goals	18

3.3 International Tax Policy Principles and Goals	20
4 Conclusion	21
3 The Tax Systems	22
1 Introduction	22
2 Difference in the Tax System	22
2.1 Tax Reform Efforts	22
2.2 Differences in Tax Provisions	23
2.2.1 Taxation of Individuals	28
2.2.2 Taxation of Corporations	29
2.3 Tax Incentives	33
3 Subnational Taxation	34
4 International Aspects	37
4.1 Double Taxation Relief	37
4.2 Transfer Pricing	39
4.3 Anti-Avoidance Rules	41
4.3.1 Thin Capitalization Rules	42
4.3.2 Controlled Foreign Corporation (CFC) Rules	43
4.4 International Consumption Taxes	44
5 Conclusion	45
4 Tax Coordination	46
1 Introduction	46
2 NAFTA and Taxation	46
2.1 Tax Treatment of Goods	46
2.2 Taxes on Services	47
2.3 Conditional Tax Benefits	48
2.4 NAFTA and Tax Treaties	49
3 Tax Treaties in North America	49
3.1 The Purpose of Tax Treaties	49
3.2 Historical Review of Tax Coordination in North America	50
3.2.1 Canada-United States Tax Coordination	50
3.2.2 Tax Coordination with Mexico	51
3.3 Comparative Review of Tax Treaties	52
3.3.1 Taxes Covered	52
3.3.2 Residence	52
3.3.3 Business Profits	53
3.3.4 Permanent Establishment	54
3.3.5 Dividends	55
3.3.6 Interest	56

3.3.7	Royalties	57
3.3.8	Capital Gains and Corporate Reorganizations	57
3.3.9	Anti-Treaty Shopping Provisions	58
3.3.10	Anti-Discrimination Provision	59
3.3.11	Mutual Agreement	59
3.3.12	Exchange of Information	60
3.3.13	Enforcement of Tax Claims	60
3.4	The Limitation of Tax Treaties	61
4	Conclusion	65
PART II. THE ECONOMIC STAKES		
5	Taxes and Cross-Border Investments	69
1	Introduction	69
2	The Importance of Foreign Investment within North America	69
2.1	Investment Flows and the NAFTA Countries	69
2.2	Competition for Investment and NAFTA Rules of Origin	72
3	Does Tax Influence the Movement of Foreign Direct Investment?	73
3.1	FDI Is Influenced by a Number of Non-Tax Factors	74
3.2	Taxes and FDI Movements	74
4	Measuring the Influence of Taxes on Investment Decisions	75
4.1	Why Use Taxes on Marginal Investments?	75
4.2	The Theory of Effective Tax Rates	76
4.3	Calculating the Effective Tax Rate	77
4.4	Problems with Marginal Effective Tax Rate Studies	77
5	Studies of the NAFTA Tax Systems	80
5.1	Marginal Effective Tax Rate Studies of Canada and the United States	80
5.2	Marginal Effective Tax Rate Studies for All NAFTA Countries	82
5.3	Capital Risk Analysis Study Involving Canada and the United States	84
6	Conclusion	85
6	The Impact of U.S. Dividend Tax Reform	87
1	Introduction	87
2	Capital Market Integration between Canada and the United States	87

3	Dividend Tax Reform in the United States	88
3.1	Background: U.S. Anti-Tax Sentiments and Sources of Tax Revenues	88
3.2	The <i>Jobs and Growth Reconciliation Act of 2003</i>	90
4	The Impact of U.S. Dividend Tax Reform on Canada	92
4.1	The Effect of Previous U.S. Tax Reform Efforts	92
4.2	Impact of Tax Reform on Canadian FDI Flows	92
4.2.1	Comparing the Tax Burdens after the Reform Efforts	92
4.2.2	Mitigating Factors	94
4.2.3	The Impact on Canadian Direct Investment Flows	96
4.3	Impact on Financial Strategies	96
4.3.1	Increasing Dividend Distributions	97
4.3.2	Debt Financing of Canadian Affiliates	97
4.3.3	Manipulation of Transfer Prices	98
5	Canadian Reaction to U.S. Dividend Tax Reform	99
5.1	Economic Integration and Canadian Tax Reform	99
5.2	Matching and Undercutting U.S. Tax Changes	100
6	Conclusion	101

PART III. SOVEREIGNTY CONCERNS

7	Lessons from Europe	105
1	Introduction	105
2	European Economic Integration and Tax Harmonization	105
2.1	The Movement towards Political and Economic Integration in Europe	105
2.2	Tax Harmonization in Europe	108
2.2.1	Harmonization of Direct Taxes	108
2.2.2	The Establishment of the Ruding Committee	110
2.2.3	Recent Developments: Harmful Tax Competition, Corporate Tax Base Consolidation, and European Court of Justice Decisions	112
2.2.4	Harmonization of Indirect Taxes	114
2.2.4.1	Legislative Impetus for Harmonizing Indirect Taxes	114
2.2.4.2	Abolition of Barriers to Trade Caused by the VAT	114
3	The Drive towards Economic Integration under NAFTA	116
3.1	Why Have Free Trade within North America?	116
3.2	The Institutional Structure of NAFTA	118

3.3	Comment on the Institutional Structure of NAFTA	113
4	The Loss of Sovereignty under NAFTA Tax Harmonization	120
4.1	Tax as a Policy Tool to Pursue Distinct Socio-Economic Objectives	120
4.2	Different Revenue Objectives within North America	121
4.3	The Need to Reform Non-Tax Laws	124
4.4	Tax Harmonization with a Big Player	124
5	Conclusion	126
8	E-Commerce Tax Policy	128
1	Introduction	128
2	Taxing Cross-Border E-Commerce Profits	129
2.1	Technology as a Catalyst for Economic Integration	129
2.2	Background Reform Efforts	129
2.3	Computer Servers as Permanent Establishments	131
2.4	Evaluating the New Rule	132
2.5	Towards an Economic Presence Test for Income Tax Purposes	133
3	Enforcing GST and VAT Rules on E-Commerce Sales	134
3.1	The GST and Collection Obligations	134
3.2	Revenue Losses and Lack of a Competitive Playing Field	135
3.3	Developing Economic Presence Tests for the GST	137
3.4	Tax Cooperation in a Free Trade Area	139
4	Using Internet Technologies for Tax Purposes	140
5	Conclusion	141

PART IV. DEVELOPING AN INTERNATIONAL TAX POLICY FOR NAFTA

9	Balancing Economic and Sovereignty Interests	145
1	Introduction	145
2	Economic Interests	145
2.1	Distortion of Direct Investment Flows	146
2.2	The Use of Tax Incentives	147
2.3	Transfer Pricing Issues	148
2.4	Trade Flows	149
2.5	Comment on the Economic Interest	150
3	The Sovereignty Interest	150
3.1	Sovereignty as a Driver of International Tax Developments	150

3.2	Lessons from Europe Revisited	151
3.3	Sovereignty Concerns in North America	152
3.4	Tax Reform Initiatives under NAFTA	153
3.4.1	Do Nothing	154
3.4.2	Comprehensive Tax Reform Efforts	155
4	Towards Heightened Multilateral Coordination	157
5	Conclusion	158
10	Modelling NAFTA Tax Competition	160
1	Introduction	160
2	Tax Competition: Theory versus Reality	160
2.1	Tax Competition among Subnational Governments	160
2.2	Theories on International Tax Competition	162
2.3	Harmful versus Fair International Tax Competition	163
3	Regulatory Emulation	164
3.1	Tax Competition with One Big Player	164
3.2	The Canadian and Mexican Approach	164
3.3	The United States and Its 'Go It Alone' Approach	165
4	A Game Theory Perspective on NAFTA Tax Competition	166
4.1	General Observations	166
4.2	Modelling NAFTA Tax Competition	167
4.3	Lessons from the Model	169
4.4	Limitation with the Analysis	173
5	Conclusion	174
11	Recommendations	175
1	Introduction	175
2	Policy Recommendations	175
2.1	NAFTA Tax Working Group	175
2.2	Harmonize Treaty Policy	177
2.3	Arbitration Procedure for Transfer Pricing Disputes	178
2.4	Abolish Withholding Taxes on Parent/Subsidiary Dividends	179
2.5	Corporate Mergers and Reorganizations	180
2.6	Reduction of 'Harmful' Tax Competition	181
2.7	Multilateral Agreement on the GST and VAT	182
2.8	Improving Administrative Cooperation	182
3	Conclusion	183
12	Conclusion	185

NOTES	191
SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY	231
INDEX	245