

Prosecuting Serious Human Rights Violations

ANJA SEIBERT-FOHR

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xvii
<i>List of Documents</i>	xxvii
1. Introduction	1
1. The growing relevance of prosecution in international law	1
2. Impunity, amnesties, and flawed criminal proceedings	5
3. Methodology and course of analysis	8
2. Prosecution under the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	11
1. The duty to bring perpetrators of human rights violations to justice	12
2. Justifying the duty to bring to justice	15
1. Procedural protection: punishment as general protection and implementation	15
2. Punishment and its relevance for substantive rights	17
3. Victims' rights	17
A. The right to a fair trial	18
B. The prohibition of retroactive criminal laws	19
C. Remedial rights	20
D. Punishment as retrospective protection	22
4. New developments	22
5. Inconsistencies and the need for a solid conceptualization	25
3. The required sanctions	27
4. Who needs to be punished?	31
5. Related duties	34
1. Duty to investigate	34
2. Compensation for victims	36
6. Amnesties under the Covenant	37
1. The right to an effective remedy including compensation	38
2. The duty to prosecute	40
A. Prosecution versus reconciliation?	41
B. Human rights violations which cannot be amnestied	43
7. Conclusion and outlook	46
1. The scope of the obligation to prosecute	46

2. The underlying rationale	46
3. Amnesties	47
3. Prosecution under the American Convention on Human Rights	51
1. The duty to punish	53
2. Justifying the duty to punish	55
1. Punishment as general human rights protection	55
2. Victims' rights	56
A. Punishment as retrospective protection	56
B. The right to a fair trial	59
a. The interpretation by the Commission and the Court	59
b. Evaluation	62
C. Remedial rights	64
D. The right to justice	66
3. Related duties	68
1. Investigation and the right to truth	68
2. Humane treatment	71
4. Standards for the conduct of criminal proceedings	71
1. The crimes to be prosecuted	72
2. Investigation	72
3. Criminal proceedings	74
A. Trial stage	74
a. Trial before regular courts	74
b. Expeditious trial	76
c. Evaluation of evidence	76
d. Sentence	77
e. The rights of the accused	78
B. Post-trial stage	79
5. Statutes of limitation	79
6. Extradition for serious human right violations	81
7. The role of the Inter-American Court in criminal cases	82
1. The supervisory function of the Court	82
2. The power of the Court to order investigation and punishment under article 63	82
8. Amnesties under the American Convention	85
1. The developing interpretation by the Inter-American Commission	85
A. The flexible approach	85
B. The influence of the <i>Veldsquez Rodríguez Case</i>	86
C. Limiting the scope for amnesties	87
D. The struggle between justice and political considerations	90
E. The right to justice as the decisive factor in the evaluation of amnesties	91
F. Absolute prohibition of amnesties as the current position	94
G. Summary	96

2. The jurisprudence of the Inter-American Court	97
A. The <i>Castillo Páez Case</i>	97
B. The <i>Barrios Altos Case</i> : prohibition of self-amnesties	100
C. The role of truth commissions	102
D. The current position: absolute prohibition of amnesties?	102
9. Conclusion and outlook	105
4. Prosecution under the European Convention on Human Rights	111
1. The duty to have recourse to criminal law	112
1. The duty to criminalize serious offences	112
2. The duty to establish a criminal-law machinery and conduct criminal proceedings	114
2. Justifying the duty to criminalize, investigate, and prosecute	116
1. Procedural protection: criminalization and prosecution as general human rights protection	116
2. Prosecution and its relevance for individual rights	120
3. Victims' rights	121
A. The right to a fair trial	121
B. The strict denial of a right to justice	123
C. Remedial rights: the right to an investigation	124
D. Retrospective protection	126
E. Distinguishing retrospective protection from remedial rights	130
F. Humane treatment	132
3. Standards for the conduct of criminal proceedings	132
1. Independent and effective criminal investigation	133
2. Taking and evaluation of evidence	134
3. Expedience of investigation	136
4. Transparency	137
5. Trial and punishment	137
6. Involvement of victims in criminal proceedings	138
7. Enforcement of criminal sentences	139
4. The role of the European Court of Human Rights	140
5. Amnesties	141
6. Conclusion and outlook	146
5. Universal Human Rights Conventions Explicitly Requiring Prosecution	153
1. The scope of criminal obligations	153
1. The Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide	153
2. The Convention against Torture	158
3. The Conventions on Slavery, Traffic in Persons, Exploitation of Prostitution and Apartheid	168

4. The scope of the Convention on the Non-Applicability of Statutory Limitations to War Crimes and Crimes against Humanity	170	
5. International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination	172	
6. International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearances	175	
2. Comparative analysis		183
6. Conceptualizing the Duty to Prosecute under Human Rights Treaties		189
1. Comparing different approaches to prosecution and investigation		189
1. Rationalizing the call for prosecution	190	
A. The right to justice controversy	190	
B. Remedies	191	
2. Rationalizing the right to an investigation	193	
2. Significance of the legal rationale		194
3. Evaluation: the duty to prosecute and its proper legal rationale		196
1. Prosecution as a matter of human rights law	197	
A. The 'respect and ensure' provisions	198	
a. Prosecution as prevention	198	
b. Retrospective protection of substantive rights	204	
B. The right to an effective remedy	206	
2. Evaluation of amnesties	214	
4. Summary: suggestions for future conceptualization		222
7. Prosecution of Human Rights Violations under Customary International Law		229
1. The protection of aliens		230
1. The duty to punish injuries to aliens	230	
2. Amnesties for injuries to aliens	232	
3. Applicability to human rights violations	233	
2. The rules of State responsibility		234
1. Punishment under the rules of State responsibility	235	
2. Human rights and State responsibility	238	
A. The controversial individual right to reparation	240	
B. Punishment as an emerging or <i>de lege ferenda</i> form of reparation?	244	
3. Conclusion	247	
3. International individual criminal responsibility		248
4. Universal jurisdiction		254
5. <i>Aut dedere aut judicare</i>		257

6. State international criminal responsibility?	261
7. The relevance of treaties providing for a duty to prosecute	263
8. The relevance of non-binding documents	266
9. Current State practice	268
1. Limiting the option for amnesties internationally	269
2. Domestic State practice	273
3. Human rights violations outside the scope of international crimes	274
10. General principles of law	277
11. Conclusions	277
8. Conclusion	281
1. Role of prosecution for the protection of human rights	281
2. Amnesties and the way forward	285
3. Human rights and international criminal law	289
<i>Bibliography</i>	295
<i>Index</i>	305