

The Treatment of Prisoners under International Law

Third Edition

SIR NIGEL RODLEY

School of Law, University of Essex

with

MATT POLLARD

School of Law, University of Essex

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

| | |
|--|-------|
| <i>Selected Abbreviations</i> | xix |
| <i>Table of Treaties and Other International Instruments</i> | xxi |
| <i>Table of Cases</i> | xxxix |

| | |
|---|-----------|
| General Introduction | 1 |
| 1. The Development of an International Law of Human Rights Applicable to Prisoners | 1 |
| 2. The Nature and Scope of the Problem | 8 |
| 2.1 Torture and other ill-treatment | 8 |
| 2.2 Executions | 12 |
| 2.3 Enforced disappearances | 13 |
| 2.4 Prison conditions | 14 |
| 3. The Inherent Dignity of the Enemy | 15 |
| 4. The Approach | 16 |
| | |
| 1. The Response of the United Nations General Assembly to the Challenge of Torture | 18 |
| 1. Introduction | 18 |
| 2. Discussion of Torture at the UN General Assembly 1973–1975 | 20 |
| 2.1 Resolution 3059 (XXVIII) of 2 November 1973 | 20 |
| 2.2 Resolution 3218 (XXIX) of 6 November 1974 | 23 |
| 2.3 The Fifth UN Congress on the Prevention of Crime and the Treatment of Offenders (1975) | 28 |
| 2.3.1 <i>Changes in definition</i> | 29 |
| 2.3.2 <i>International prohibition of torture</i> | 31 |
| 2.3.3 <i>Effective measures by states</i> | 31 |
| 2.3.4 <i>Implementation</i> | 33 |
| 2.4 Resolution 3452 (XXX) of 9 December 1975—The Declaration against Torture | 35 |
| 3. Developments Following the Adoption of the Declaration against Torture | 36 |
| 3.1 Resolution 3453 (XXX) of 9 December 1975 | 37 |
| 3.1.1 <i>Body of Principles for the Protection of All Persons under Any Form of Detention or Imprisonment</i> | 37 |
| 3.1.2 <i>Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials</i> | 38 |
| 3.1.3 <i>Principles of Medical Ethics</i> | 38 |
| 3.1.4 <i>Implementation</i> | 38 |

| | |
|--|-----------|
| 3.2 Resolutions 32/62, 32/63, and 32/64 of 8 December 1977 | 39 |
| 3.2.1 <i>A convention against torture</i> | 40 |
| 3.2.2 <i>Questionnaire on the Declaration against Torture</i> | 41 |
| 3.2.3 <i>Unilateral declarations against torture</i> | 42 |
| 4. Summary | 43 |
| | |
| 2. The Legal Prohibition of Torture and Other Ill-treatment | 45 |
| 1. Introduction | 45 |
| 2. Treaties Prohibiting Torture and Other Ill-treatment | 46 |
| 2.1 The UN Convention against Torture | 47 |
| 2.2 The OAS Convention against Torture | 50 |
| 2.3 The human rights treaties | 53 |
| 2.3.1 <i>The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</i> | 53 |
| 2.3.2 <i>Specific human rights treaties of universal applicability</i> | 56 |
| 2.3.3 <i>Regional human rights treaties</i> | 58 |
| 2.4 The humanitarian law treaties | 59 |
| 2.4.1 <i>Common article 3 and Protocol II</i> | 60 |
| 2.4.2 <i>The Geneva Conventions and Protocol I</i> | 62 |
| 3. Unilateral Declarations against Torture | 64 |
| 4. General International Law and Torture | 64 |
| 4.1 The Charter of the United Nations and General Assembly resolutions | 66 |
| 4.2 Customary international law | 69 |
| 4.3 General principles of law | 70 |
| 4.4 Judicial decisions | 71 |
| 4.5 Teachings of publicists | 77 |
| 4.6 Treaty bodies and other UN experts | 79 |
| 5. Summary | 80 |
| | |
| 3. What Constitutes Torture and Other Ill-treatment? | 82 |
| 1. Introduction | 82 |
| 2. Defining and Distinguishing Torture | 85 |
| 2.1 The status of the perpetrator | 88 |
| 2.1.1 <i>International human rights law</i> | 88 |
| 2.1.2 <i>International criminal law</i> | 89 |
| 2.2 Degree of pain or suffering | 91 |
| 2.2.1 <i>The cumulative approach</i> | 92 |
| 2.2.2 <i>Acts recognised as torture in and of themselves</i> | 95 |
| 2.2.3 <i>Psychological torture</i> | 97 |
| 2.2.4 <i>Does torture involve aggravated pain or suffering?</i> | 98 |
| 2.2.4.1 <i>International human rights law</i> | 100 |
| 2.2.4.2 <i>International criminal law</i> | 115 |
| 2.3 Purpose | 117 |
| 2.3.1 <i>International human rights law</i> | 117 |
| 2.3.2 <i>International criminal law</i> | 120 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 2.4 Conclusion: torture distinguished from other ill-treatment | 122 |
| 3. The Scope of 'Other Prohibited Ill-treatment' | 125 |
| 3.1 General elements of 'other prohibited ill-treatment'? | 126 |
| 3.2 Intentional use of physical force | 131 |
| 3.3 Handcuffs and other means of physical restraint | 136 |
| 3.4 Strip searches and other potentially humiliating treatment | 137 |
| 3.5 Fear and other forms of mental distress | 140 |
| 3.6 Conclusion: a definition of 'other ill-treatment'? | 143 |
| 4. Summary | 143 |
| | |
| 4. The Legal Consequences of Torture and Other Ill-treatment | 145 |
| 1. The Legal Consequences of Torture | 145 |
| 1.1 State responsibility for torture | 145 |
| 1.1.1 <i>Investigation</i> | 147 |
| 1.1.2 <i>Bringing to justice</i> | 150 |
| 1.1.3 <i>Remedy and reparation</i> | 155 |
| 1.1.3.1 <i>Rehabilitation</i> | 156 |
| 1.1.3.2 <i>Compensation</i> | 157 |
| 1.1.3.3 <i>Satisfaction</i> | 159 |
| 1.1.4 <i>Guarantees of non-repetition</i> | 161 |
| 1.1.5 <i>Non-use of information obtained by torture</i> | 162 |
| 1.1.6 <i>Non-refoulement</i> | 166 |
| 1.1.7 <i>Responsibility of other states</i> | 179 |
| 1.2 Individual responsibility for torture | 180 |
| 2. The Legal Consequences of Other Prohibited Ill-treatment | 190 |
| 3. Summary | 194 |
| | |
| 5. International Mechanisms against Torture and Other Ill-treatment | 195 |
| 1. Introduction | 195 |
| 2. Historical Efforts | 198 |
| 2.1 General Assembly questionnaire on torture | 198 |
| 2.2 Sub-Commission annual review of prisoners' rights | 199 |
| 3. Special Rapporteur on Torture | 202 |
| 3.1 Nature and function of the Special Rapporteur | 204 |
| 4. UN Convention against Torture | 208 |
| 4.1 Committee against Torture | 210 |
| 4.1.1 <i>Review of periodic reports</i> | 210 |
| 4.1.2 <i>Interstate complaints</i> | 214 |
| 4.1.3 <i>Individual complaints</i> | 214 |
| 4.1.4 <i>Inquiry into systematic practices of torture</i> | 216 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 5. Voluntary Fund for Victims of Torture | 219 |
| 5.1 Origins of the Fund | 220 |
| 5.2 Beneficiaries of the Fund | 224 |
| 5.3 Intermediaries | 225 |
| 5.4 Country priorities | 225 |
| 5.5 Nature of aid | 226 |
| 6. Mechanisms for Preventing Torture and Other Ill-treatment | 228 |
| 6.1 General obligation to prevent torture and other ill-treatment | 229 |
| 6.2 European Convention for the Prevention of Torture | 231 |
| 6.2.1 <i>History</i> | 231 |
| 6.2.2 <i>The Committee</i> | 233 |
| 6.2.3 <i>Visits</i> | 233 |
| 6.2.4 <i>Publication</i> | 235 |
| 6.3 Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture | 239 |
| 6.3.1 <i>History</i> | 239 |
| 6.3.2 <i>Subcommittee on Prevention</i> | 240 |
| 6.3.3 <i>National preventive mechanisms</i> | 241 |
| 6.3.4 <i>Visits</i> | 241 |
| 6.3.5 <i>Publication</i> | 244 |
| 7. Summary | 244 |
| | |
| 6. Extra-legal Executions | 246 |
| 1. General Prohibition of Murder by Government | 246 |
| 1.1 Racially motivated killing and genocide | 251 |
| 2. Extra-legal Executions as Arbitrary Deprivations of Life | 252 |
| 2.1 Killings as necessary measures of law enforcement | 253 |
| 2.2 Killings in non-international armed conflict | 260 |
| 2.3 Killings in international armed conflicts | 264 |
| 3. Legal Consequences of Extra-legal Executions | 266 |
| 3.1 State responsibility | 266 |
| 3.2 Individual responsibility | 271 |
| 4. International Remedies | 275 |
| 4.1 Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions | 275 |
| 5. Summary | 277 |
| | |
| 7. The Death Penalty | 279 |
| 1. Introduction: The Objective of Abolition | 279 |
| 1.1 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights | 283 |
| 1.2 Other UN initiatives | 284 |
| 1.2.1 <i>Developments in political bodies</i> | 284 |
| 1.2.2 <i>Optional Protocol to the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</i> | 287 |
| 1.2.3 <i>Statutes of international criminal tribunals</i> | 289 |

| | | |
|-----------|---|------------|
| 1.3 | European regional developments | 289 |
| 1.4 | Developments in other regions | 294 |
| 2. | Limits to Capitally Punishable Offences | 297 |
| 2.1 | Lawful sanction | 298 |
| 2.2 | Only the 'most serious crimes' | 298 |
| 2.3 | No other human rights violations should be involved | 300 |
| 2.4 | Non-retroactivity | 301 |
| 2.5 | Political offences | 302 |
| 2.6 | Offences committed by persons under military occupation | 303 |
| 2.7 | Non-reintroduction | 304 |
| 3. | Procedural Restrictions on the Imposition of the Death Penalty | 306 |
| 3.1 | Fair trial | 306 |
| | 3.1.1 <i>Degree of proof</i> | 312 |
| 3.2 | Appeals | 313 |
| 3.3 | Clemency | 315 |
| 3.4 | Non-execution pending appeal and clemency procedures | 316 |
| 3.5 | Transparency | 317 |
| 3.6 | Humane treatment | 318 |
| 4. | Persons Who may not be Executed | 321 |
| 4.1 | Persons under 18 years old | 322 |
| 4.2 | Pregnant women and mothers | 324 |
| 4.3 | Persons over 70 years old (Americas region) | 325 |
| 4.4 | Insane persons | 325 |
| 5. | International Remedies | 325 |
| 5.1 | Secretary-General's 'best endeavours' | 326 |
| 5.2 | Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions | 326 |
| 6. | Summary | 328 |
| 8. | Enforced Disappearance of Prisoners: Unacknowledged Detention | 329 |
| 1. | Enforced Disappearance | 329 |
| 1.1 | The problem of defining 'enforced disappearance' | 332 |
| 2. | The UN Response to Enforced Disappearances | 337 |
| 3. | The International Law Prohibition of Enforced Disappearances | 342 |
| 3.1 | The right to liberty and security of person | 344 |
| 3.2 | The right to humane conditions of detention and freedom from torture and ill-treatment | 348 |
| 3.3 | The right to life | 353 |
| 4. | Legal Consequences of Enforced Disappearances | 358 |
| 4.1 | State responsibility | 358 |
| 4.2 | Individual responsibility | 362 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 5. International Remedies | 366 |
| 5.1 Working Group on enforced or involuntary disappearances | 367 |
| 5.1.1 <i>The scope of the Working Group's concern</i> | 367 |
| 5.1.2 <i>General approach</i> | 368 |
| 5.1.3 <i>Cases and countries considered</i> | 369 |
| 5.1.4 <i>Sources of information</i> | 369 |
| 5.1.5 <i>Screening of information received/admissibility</i> | 371 |
| 5.1.6 <i>Transmittal of information</i> | 371 |
| 5.1.7 <i>Country visits</i> | 372 |
| 5.1.8 <i>Urgent action</i> | 373 |
| 5.1.9 <i>Annual report</i> | 374 |
| 5.2 Committee on Enforced Disappearances | 374 |
| 6. Summary | 376 |
| | |
| 9. Conditions of Imprisonment or Detention | 379 |
| 1. The Legal Rules | 380 |
| 2. Institutional Ill-treatment | 382 |
| 2.1 Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners | 382 |
| 2.2 Practice of the Human Rights Committee | 385 |
| 2.2.1 <i>Prison conditions which violate human dignity</i> | 387 |
| 2.3 Prison conditions in the work of European regional bodies | 393 |
| 2.3.1 <i>The Greek Case at the European Commission of Human Rights</i> | 393 |
| 2.3.2 <i>European Court of Human Rights</i> | 394 |
| 2.3.3 <i>Practice of the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture</i> | 396 |
| 2.4 Prison conditions in the work of American regional bodies | 397 |
| 2.5 Prison conditions in the work of the African Commission | 398 |
| 2.6 Practice of the UN Special Rapporteur on Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman and Degrading Treatment or Punishment | 400 |
| 3. Solitary Confinement | 402 |
| 4. Denial or Misuse of Medical Treatment or Other Basic Necessities | 407 |
| 5. Medical or Scientific Experimentation on Human Beings | 412 |
| 6. Other Areas of Possible Abuse of Prisoners | 415 |
| 6.1 Persons detained on mental health grounds | 415 |
| 6.2 Forcible feeding | 419 |
| 6.3 Separation of categories of prisoner | 421 |
| 7. Legal Consequences of Unlawful Conditions of Imprisonment or Detention | 422 |
| 8. International Remedies | 423 |
| 9. Summary | 425 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 10. Corporal Punishment | 427 |
| 1. The Geography of Corporal Punishment | 427 |
| 2. United Nations Activities Concerning Corporal Punishment | 429 |
| 3. International Humanitarian Law | 433 |
| 4. International Human Rights Law | 435 |
| 5. Summary | 446 |
| | |
| 11. Guarantees against Abuses of the Human Person: Arbitrary Arrest and Detention | 449 |
| 1. United Nations Body of Principles | 452 |
| 1.1 Legal assistance | 453 |
| 1.2 Notification of and communication with families | 454 |
| 1.3 Length of interrogation | 455 |
| 1.4 Pre- and post-interrogation medical examinations | 456 |
| 1.5 Record-keeping | 457 |
| 1.6 Appearance before a judge and judicial supervision | 457 |
| 1.7 Challenging the legality of detention and treatment | 458 |
| 1.8 Other aspects of the Body of Principles | 459 |
| 2. Incommunicado Detention and Habeas Corpus under Treaty and Customary Law | 460 |
| 2.1 Incommunicado detention under the Covenant | 461 |
| 2.1.1 <i>Requirement of promptness in article 9(3)</i> | 462 |
| 2.1.2 <i>Nature and independence of the authority in article 9(3)</i> | 462 |
| 2.1.3 <i>Application of article 9(3) to criminal matters only</i> | 463 |
| 2.1.4 <i>Other rights implicated by incommunicado detention</i> | 464 |
| 2.2 Habeas corpus under the Covenant | 465 |
| 2.3 Incommunicado detention and habeas corpus under other universal human rights treaties | 468 |
| 2.4 Incommunicado detention and habeas corpus under the regional conventions | 470 |
| 2.4.1 <i>Incommunicado detention</i> | 470 |
| 2.4.2 <i>Habeas corpus</i> | 474 |
| 2.5 General international law | 477 |
| 3. States of Emergency | 481 |
| 4. Summary | 492 |
| | |
| 12. International Codes of Ethics for Professionals | 494 |
| 1. Introduction | 494 |
| 2. UN Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials | 495 |
| 2.1 Background | 495 |
| 2.2 Addressees of the Code | 498 |
| 2.3 The scope of the Code | 498 |
| 2.4 Expected response to non-compliance with the Code | 502 |

| | | |
|-------------------------------|--|------------|
| 2.5 | Implementation | 505 |
| 2.6 | Training and dissemination | 507 |
| 3. | Council of Europe Ethical Instruments on the Police | 508 |
| 4. | Code(s) of Military Ethics? | 511 |
| 5. | UN Principles of Medical Ethics | 512 |
| 5.1 | Background | 512 |
| 5.2 | Addressees of the Principles | 513 |
| 5.3 | The scope of the Principles | 514 |
| 5.4 | Expected response to non-compliance with the Principles | 519 |
| 5.5 | Implementation | 520 |
| 5.6 | Training and dissemination | 523 |
| 6. | Ethical Principles for Lawyers? | 523 |
| Concluding Reflections | | 528 |
| <i>Annex 1.</i> | Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Being Subjected to Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment | 535 |
| <i>Annex 2a.</i> | Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment [excerpts] | 538 |
| <i>Annex 2b.</i> | Inter-American Convention to Prevent and Punish Torture [excerpts] | 548 |
| <i>Annex 2c.</i> | European Convention for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment [excerpts] | 552 |
| <i>Annex 2d.</i> | Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment [excerpts] | 556 |
| <i>Annex 3.</i> | Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners | 562 |
| <i>Annex 4.</i> | Body of Principles for the Protection of All Persons under Any Form of Detention or Imprisonment | 578 |
| <i>Annex 5a.</i> | Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials | 587 |
| <i>Annex 5b.</i> | Basic Principles on the Use of Force and Firearms by Law Enforcement Officials | 591 |
| <i>Annex 5c.</i> | Declaration on the Police—Part A | 596 |
| <i>Annex 5d.</i> | European Code of Police Ethics [excerpts] | 598 |
| <i>Annex 6a.</i> | Principles of Medical Ethics relevant to the Role of Health Personnel, particularly Physicians, in the Protection of Prisoners and Detainees against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment | 600 |
| <i>Annex 6b.</i> | Principles on the Effective Investigation and Documentation of Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Istanbul Principles) | 602 |

| | | |
|------------------|--|-----|
| <i>Annex 7.</i> | Principles on the Effective Prevention and Investigation of Extra-legal, Arbitrary, and Summary Executions | 605 |
| <i>Annex 8a.</i> | Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance | 609 |
| <i>Annex 8b.</i> | Inter-American Convention on the Forced Disappearance of Persons [excerpts] | 616 |
| <i>Annex 8c.</i> | International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance [excerpts] | 621 |
| <i>Annex 9a.</i> | Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949 [excerpt] | 634 |
| <i>Annex 9b.</i> | International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights [excerpts] | 635 |
| <i>Annex 9c.</i> | European Convention on Human Rights [excerpts] | 637 |
| <i>Annex 9d.</i> | American Convention on Human Rights [excerpts] | 639 |
| <i>Annex 9e.</i> | African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights [excerpts] | 641 |
| <i>Annex 9f.</i> | Arab Charter on Human Rights [excerpts] | 642 |
| | <i>Bibliography</i> | 645 |
| | <i>Index</i> | 663 |