

The Individual in the International Legal System: Continuity and Change in International Law

Kate Parlett



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

<i>Foreword</i>	page xiii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xv
<i>Select list of abbreviations</i>	xviii
<i>Table of cases</i>	xx
<i>Table of treaties</i>	xxxiii
Part I: The Framework	1
1. Structures of the international legal system	3
1.1 Introduction	3
1.2 Methodology: a rules-based approach	7
1.3 The engagement of individuals in the international legal system: structural issues	10
(a) Prelude: differing legal structures in the early period	10
(b) The long nineteenth century	13
(c) The inter-war period	16
(d) The post-1945 international legal system	26
1.4 International legal personality as the measure of engagement in the international legal system	29
(a) Development of the doctrine of subjects: the <i>Reparations</i> Opinion	30
(b) <i>Sui generis</i> subjects of international law	32
(c) The individual as a 'subject' of international law	36
1.5 Challenges to the centrality of states in the international legal system: alternative approaches	38
(a) Positivism in its classical and modern forms	40
(b) Process approaches	42
(c) 'Cosmopolitanism'	43

Part II: The Individual in International Law	45
2. The individual and international claims	47
2.1 Introduction	47
2.2 Doctrine and practice pre-1914	48
(a) Vattel's articulation	49
(b) The practice	50
(i) Arbitration of specifically defined diplomatic protection claims	52
(ii) Claims tribunals and commissions	54
(A) Control of the claim	55
(B) Payment of awards	57
(C) Binding effect of the decision on an inter-state basis	58
(D) Standing before the International Prize Court and the Central American Court of Justice	60
(c) Conclusions	62
2.3 Doctrine and practice in the inter-war period	65
(a) The development of doctrine	65
(b) The practice of international claims tribunals	71
(i) Mixed arbitral tribunals after the First World War	72
(A) The mixed arbitral tribunals under the Peace Treaties	72
(B) The US Mixed Claims Commissions	73
(C) The Upper Silesian Mixed Commission and Arbitral Tribunal	74
(ii) Mexican Claims Commissions 1923-1932	77
(c) Conclusions	83
2.4 Diplomatic protection and individual claims after 1945	85
(a) The development of doctrine	85
(i) Diplomatic protection	85
(ii) Individual rights	94
(b) International claims tribunals and commissions	97
(i) Post-Second World War commissions and tribunals	97
(ii) The Iran-US Claims Tribunal	98
(iii) The UN Compensation Commission	101
(c) Investment treaty arbitration	103
(d) Conclusions	119

2.5	Conclusions: the position of the individual relative to international claims	120
Appendix I	Arbitration of diplomatic protection claims 1794–1914	124
Appendix II	International claims tribunals and commissions 1794–1914	134
Appendix III	International claims tribunals and commissions 1919–1939	162
3.	The individual in international humanitarian law	176
3.1	Introduction	176
3.2	The individual in international armed conflict	177
(a)	Regulation of international war pre-1914	177
(b)	Developments in the inter-war period	180
(c)	The individual in international armed conflict after 1945	181
(i)	The 1949 Geneva Conventions	182
(ii)	Additional Protocol I of 1977	189
(iii)	Customary international humanitarian law	191
(iv)	International human rights law applicable in international armed conflict	193
3.3	The individual in internal armed conflict	196
(a)	Regulation of civil war pre-1914	198
(b)	The inter-war period	206
(c)	The individual in internal armed conflict after 1945	208
(i)	Common Article 3 of the Geneva Conventions	208
(ii)	Additional Protocol II	213
(iii)	Customary international humanitarian law	219
(iv)	International human rights law applicable in non-international armed conflict	222
3.4	Conclusions: the position of the individual in international humanitarian law	224
4.	The individual in international criminal law	229
4.1	Introduction	229
4.2	Individual responsibility before 1919	230
4.3	The inter-war period: the Kaiser and the Leipzig trials	234
4.4	Individual responsibility after 1945	241
(a)	Post-Second World War prosecutions	241
(i)	The Nuremberg Tribunal	241
(ii)	The Tokyo Tribunal	249

(iii)	Control Council Law No. 10 trials and military commissions in the Pacific	251
(b)	The 'Nuremberg Principles'	253
(c)	Development of substantive international criminal law in the United Nations	258
(d)	International criminal tribunals and courts	260
(i)	Ad hoc international tribunals	261
(ii)	The International Criminal Court	267
(iii)	International crimes before 'hybrid' and domestic courts	271
4.5	Conclusions: the position of the individual in international criminal law	274
5.	The individual in international human rights law	278
5.1	Introduction	278
5.2	Antecedents: the case of slavery	279
5.3	Protection of individuals during the inter-war period	282
(a)	Minorities	282
(b)	Inhabitants of mandated territories	287
(c)	Refugees	291
(d)	The International Labour Organisation	294
(e)	Conclusions	295
5.4	International protection of human rights after 1945	296
(a)	Human rights rhetoric during the Second World War	296
(b)	Preparation for an international bill of rights	299
(c)	The United Nations Charter: a promise postponed	301
(d)	The Universal Declaration of Human Rights	306
(e)	From moral imperative to legal articulation: state obligations, individual rights and international enforcement in the European system	307
(f)	Human rights and state obligations in the UN system	312
(i)	Subject-specific conventions	313
(ii)	The International Covenants	315
(iii)	Declarations of specific rights	320
(iv)	Special procedures before the Human Rights Commission (now the Human Rights Council)	321
(g)	Customary international human rights law: from soft to hard law?	322
(h)	<i>Jus cogens</i> human rights norms	326

(i) The evolution of enforcement mechanisms: the regional systems	
(j) Conclusions	327
5.5 Conclusions: the position of the individual in international human rights law	337
Part III: Reassessing the Framework	341
6. Reflections on the structures of the international legal system	343
6.1 Introduction	343
6.2 Historical development of the position of the individual in the international legal system	343
(a) The nineteenth century international legal system	343
(b) The inter-war period	346
(c) The post-1945 international legal system	349
6.3 International legal personality as the measure of engagement: the case of the individual	353
(a) 'Subjects' versus 'objects'	353
(b) Locating individuals: rights, obligations and capacities	358
(c) Moving from the actor to the action? The notion of international law relationships	363
6.4 Reflections on structural transition in the international legal system: the case of the individual	365
(a) Relative openness and flexibility of the system	365
(b) Forces for structural change: solutions above theories	367
(c) States in the international legal system	369
<i>Bibliography</i>	373
<i>Index</i>	394