Family Law in the World Community

Cases, Materials, and Problems in Comparative and International Family Law

Second Edition

D. Marianne Blair
Professor of Law
University of Tulsa

Merle H. Weiner
Philip H. Knight Professor of Law
University of Oregon

Barbara Stark
Professor of Law
Hofstra Law School

Solangel Maldonado
Professor of Law
Seton Hall Law School

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina
Contents

Table of Cases xxxi
Preface for Instructors xxxv
Acknowledgments xxxvii

Part One
Family Formation, Regulation, and Dissolution

Chapter 1 • Introduction to the Study of Family Law in the World Community 3
A. An Introduction to Comparative Law 3
1. Why Study Comparative Law? 4
   Nora V. Demleitner, Combating Legal Ethnocentrism 8
   Problem 1-1 10
2. What Is Comparative Family Law? 11
   John C. Reitz, How to Do Comparative Law 11
   Shirley S. Abrahamson & Michael J. Fischer, All the World's a
   Courtroom: Judging in the New Millennium 18
   Problem 1-2 19
   Marckx v. Belgium 20
   Notes and Questions 20
   Johan Meeusen, Judicial Disapproval of Discrimination against
   Illegitimate Children 28
B. An Introduction to International Law 30
1. Overview of International Law 31
   a. Sources of International Law 31
   b. Explicit Agreements 32
      Frederic L. Kirgis, International Agreements and U.S. Law 40
      Notes 42
   c. Customary International Law 43
   d. General Principles of International Law 45
      Notes and Questions 47
      Problem 1-3 48
      Notes 50
   e. Enforcing Human Rights Norms in U.S. Courts 51
      Kenneth Roth, The Charade of U.S. Ratification of International
      Human Rights Treaties 51
      Note 53
Problem 1-4 56
Notes 56

2. International Institutions 58
   a. United Nations 59
   b. The Hague Conference on Private International Law 61
   c. Council of Europe 62
      L. v. Finland 66
      Notes and Questions 72
   d. European Union 77
   e. Organization of American States 80
   f. African Union 83
      Problem 1-5 86
      Notes and Questions 87

Chapter 2 • Regulation of Marriage 89
A. The Importance of Marriage 89
   Claude Levi-Strauss, The Family, in Man, Culture, and Society 89
   Joan A. Metge, Marriage in Modern Māori Society 90
B. The Power to Regulate Marriage 92
   1. Customary Law 92
      David L. Chambers, Civilizing the Natives: Customary Marriage in Post-Apartheid South Africa 93
      Notes and Questions 95
      Suen Toi Lee v. Yau Yee Ping 98
      Problem 2-1 99
      Kalyton v. Kalyton 100
      Notes and Questions 102
      Janet Kabeberi-Macharia & Celestine Nyamu, Marriage by Affidavit: Developing Alternative Laws on Cohabitation in Kenya 102
   2. Religious Law 104
      In re Marriage of Vryonis 107
      Notes and Questions 110
   3. Constitutional Law 113
      a. Constitutional Allocation of Power between the Legislative Branches 113
      b. Constitutional Allocation of Power between the Judiciaries 114
      Notes and Questions 116
   4. International Law 116
      Universal Declaration of Human Rights [UDHR] 116
      1956 Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery, the Slave Trade and Institutions and Practices Similar to Slavery 117
      Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women 118
      Fact Sheet No. 23, Harmful Traditional Practices Affecting the Health of Women and Children, Office of the High Commission for Human Rights 119
CONTENTS ix

Report of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women 120
Report of the Committee on Progress Achieved in the Implementation of the Convention: Note by the Secretariat 120
Notes and Questions 121
Problem 2-2 122

C. Procedural Requirements for Entry into Marriage 123
1. France: Age, Consent, Banns, and Compulsory Civil Ceremony 123
   The French Civil Code (1804) 123
   Civil Code of Quebec, Book Two 125
   Notes and Questions 126
   Karl August Prinz Von Sachsen-Gessaphe, Concubinage in Mexico 127
2. The Importance of Formalities 128
   Chief Adjudication Officer v. Kirpal Kaur Bath 128
   Notes and Questions 130

D. Mail-Order Marriages 131
1. The Factual Background 132
   Suzanne H. Jackson, Marriages of Convenience: International Marriage Brokers, “Mail-Order Brides,” and Domestic Servitude 133
   Notes and Questions 134
   Kerry Abrams, Immigration Law and the Regulation of Marriage 134
2. Legal Responses of Countries of Destination 137
   Suzanne H. Jackson, Marriages of Convenience: International Marriage Brokers, “Mail-Order Brides,” and Domestic Servitude 137
3. Legal Responses of Countries of Origin 139
   Republic Act No. 6955 (1990) 139
   Republic Act No. 9208 (2003) 140
   Notes and Questions 141
4. International Legal Responses 142
   a. Discrimination against Women 142
      CEDAW General Recommendation No. 21, ¶ 16 142
   b. Trafficking 143
      Notes and Questions 143
c. Slavery 144
   Problem 2-4 144

Chapter Three • Dissolution of Marriage: A Continuing Conundrum 147
A. Historical Origins of Western Law of Dissolution: From Customary to Religious to State Control 148
   Mary Ann Glendon, The Transformation of Family Law 148
   Notes and Questions 153
Notes and Questions 155

B. Contemporary Divorce Reform 156

1. Modern Divorce Reform in the United States 156
   Riley v. Riley 158
   Mo. Ann. Stat. §452.320 160
   Problem 3-1 163

2. Divorce Reform in England 164
   Matrimonial Causes Act, 1973, c.18 165
   Problem 3-2 168

3. Divorce Reform in the Republic of Ireland 170
   Article 41 — The Family 172
   McA v. McA 173
   Problem 3-3 175

4. A Glimpse of Divorce Reform Around Europe—And Around the World 179
   a. Western Europe 179
      Notes and Questions 182
   b. East Asia 184
      Notes and Questions 188
   c. Africa 189

5. The Debate Continues 189

C. The Intersection of Religion and the State in Contemporary Regulation of Divorce 191

1. Nations Delegating Exclusive Control of Civil Marital Status to the State 192
   Williams v. Williams 192
   Note 193
   Avitzur v. Avitzur 194
   Notes and Questions 195
   Marcovitz v. Bruker 198
   Notes and Questions 201

2. Nations Regulating Termination of Marriage through Religious Norms or Institutions 203
   a. Unitary Systems and Islamic Law 203
   b. Pluralistic Personal Law Systems 206
      Notes and Questions 206
      Problem 3-4 209
      Problem 3-5 210

Chapter 4 • Domestic Partnerships and Same-Sex Marriage 211

A. Domestic Partnerships 211
   Kelly Kollman, Same-Sex Unions: The Globalization of an Idea 211
   Notes and Questions 213
   Pacté Civil de Solidarite 215
   Notes and Questions 216
   Problem 4-1 218

B. Same-Sex Marriage 219
   Notes and Questions 221
CONTENTS


B. Family Violence as a Human Rights Issue in the United Nations’ System 297
   1. Traditional Human Rights Approaches 297
      Dorothy Q. Thomas & Michele E. Beasley, Domestic Violence as a Human Rights Issue 297
      Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women 299
      Jan Arno Hessbruegge, Human Rights Violations Arising From Conduct of Non-State Actors 299
      The Due Diligence Standard as a Tool for the Elimination of Violence against Women 301
      Notes and Questions 302

   2. Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women 304
      Sally Engle Merry, Constructing a Global Law—Violence against Women and the Human Rights System 305
      Goekce v. Austria 306
      Notes and Questions 311
      San Francisco, Ca., 1 Admin. Code ch. 12K, § 12K.3(b) 313

   3. Convention against Torture 313
      a. State Responsibility for Private Acts 314
         Ali v. Reno 314
         Notes and Questions 316
      b. Torture 318
         Rhonda Copelon, Recognizing the Egregious in the Everyday: Domestic Violence as Torture 319
         Notes and Questions 319

   4. Platforms for Action, Declarations, and Reports of the Special Rapporteur 322
      Berta Esperanza Hernandez-Truyol, Sex, Culture, and Rights: A Re/Conceptualization of Violence for the Twenty-First Century 322
      Notes and Questions 323

C. Regional Approaches 325
   1. Convention of Belém do Pará 325
      Maria da Penha Maia Fernandes 326
      Notes and Questions 334

   2. European Convention on Human Rights 341
      Z and Others v. United Kingdom 341
      Bevacqua and S. v. Bulgaria 342
      Notes and Questions 346

   3. Maputo Protocol 349

   4. Arab Charter on Human Rights 350

D. Customary International Law 350
   Rhonda Copelon, Recognizing the Egregious in the Everyday: Domestic Violence as Torture 350
   Notes and Questions 351
   Problem 6-1 353

E. Expanding the Analysis 353
CONTENTS

1. Female Genital Mutilation: The Practice 353
   Fact Sheet No. 23, Harmful Traditional Practices Affecting the Health of Women and Children 354

2. The Universality of Human Rights 357
   Katherine Brennan, Note, The Influence of Cultural Relativism on International Human Rights Law: Female Circumcision as a Case Study 357
   Makau Mutua, Savages, Victims, and Saviors: The Metaphor of Human Rights 358
   Douglas Lee Donoho, Relativism Versus Universalism in Human Rights: The Search for Meaningful Standards 358
   Sally Engle Merry, Constructing a Global Law—Violence against Women and the Human Rights System 360
   Notes and Questions 360

3. National Legal Responses 364
   a. Egypt’s Approach 364
      Susan A. Dillon, Comment, Yoni in the Land of Isis: Female Genital Mutilation Is Banned (Again) in Egypt 364
      Notes and Questions 367
   b. The United States’ Approach 369
      Problem 6-2 371
      Adoption of Peggy 371
      Notes and Questions 372
      In re R-A 374
      Islam v. Secretary of State for the Home Dep’t 378
      Notes and Questions 380
      Asylum & Withholding Definitions 383
      Problem 6-3 385

Part Two
Rights and Responsibilities of Parents, Children, and the State

Chapter 7 • Custody: A Comparative Prologue 389

A. Decision-Makers and Private Ordering 390
B. Determining “Best Interests”—Permissible Factors and Considerations 394
   1. Gender 395
      Bolaji Owasanoye, The Regulation of Child Custody and Access in Nigeria 399
      Note 400
      Problem 7-1 401
      Problem 7-2 401
      Notes and Questions 403
   D. Marianne Blair & Merle H. Weiner, Resolving Parental Custody Disputes—A Comparative Exploration 403
      2. Religion 405
         Hoffmann v. Austria 406
         Notes and Questions 409
Chapter 8 • Child Abduction, Jurisdiction, and Enforcement in International Custody Disputes

A. The Hague Convention on the Civil Aspects of International Child Abduction

1. Wrongful Removal and Retention
   a. Habitual Residence
      Mozés v. Mozés
      Notes and Questions
      Problem 8-1
      Problem 8-2
   b. Rights of Custody
      Whallon v. Lynn
      Notes and Questions
      Croll v. Croll
      Notes and Questions
      Problem 8-3
   c. Actual Exercise
      Friedrich v. Friedrich
      Notes and Questions

2. The Defenses
   a. Grave Risk of Harm
      Blondin v. Dubois
   b. Children's Objection to Return
      England v. England
      Notes and Questions
   c. Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
      Freier v. Freier
      Notes and Questions
   d. Consent or Acquiescence to the Removal
      In re Ponath
      Notes and Questions
   e. One Year Elapsed from the Date of Wrongful Removal
      Wojcik v. Wojcik
      Lops v. Lops
      Notes and Questions
      Problems

B. Jurisdiction in International Custody Disputes and Enforcement of Foreign Orders
1. U.S. Domestic Law 501
      In re Marriage of Reeman and Vikas Sareen 502
      Notes and Questions 506
      Problems 514
   b. Modification and Enforcement Proceedings 515
      White v. Harrison-White 516
      Note and Questions 519
      Susan L. v. Steven L. 521
      Notes and Questions 524
      Hosain v. Malik 528
      Notes and Questions 537
      Problems 540
2. International Conventions 542
   a. 1996 Convention for the Protection of Children 542
      Problems 544
      Notes 545
   b. Regional Conventions and Regulations 545
      Notes 547
C. Other Remedies to Prevent or Respond to Abduction 549
   1. Preventative Measures and Immediate Deterrence 549
      Al-Silham v. Al-Silham 549
      Notes and Questions 551
      Long v. Ardestani 553
      Notes and Questions 560
      Patricia E. Apy, Managing Child Custody Cases Involving Non-Hague Contracting States 563
      Notes 565
   2. Sanctions and Tort Liability 567
      a. International Parental Kidnapping Crime Act and Other Federal Sanctions 567
         United States v. Fazal-Ur-Raheman-Fazal 567
         Notes and Questions 571
      b. Additional Remedies under State Law 576
         Anyanwu v. Anyanwu 576
         Notes and Questions 582
      c. Self Help and Other Options 584
         Patricia E. Apy, Managing Child Custody Cases Involving Non-Hague Contracting States 584
         Notes and Questions 585
Chapter 9 • Financial Support of Children 589
A. Who Must Support Children? 590
   Chartier v. Chartier 590
   John Eekelaar, Are Parents Morally Obliged to Care for Their Children? 594
   Notes and Questions 596
   Problem 9-1 599
Chapter 10 • Establishing and Enforcing Child Support Orders Transnationally

A. U.S. Participation in International Agreements
   1. Foreign Reciprocating Countries
   2. State Reciprocity Arrangements
   3. 2007 Hague Maintenance Convention

B. Establishing, Enforcing, and Modifying Child Support Orders in U.S. Tribunals on Behalf of Residents of Foreign Nations
   1. Establishing an Initial Support Order
   2. Simultaneous Proceedings
   3. Enforcing a Foreign Order in a U.S. Tribunal
   4. Modification Restrictions

C. Enforcing U.S. Support Orders Abroad

D. Multilateral Child Support Agreements around the Globe

Chapter 11 • Adoption: A Comparative Exploration

A. A Glimpse of Adoption across Time and Culture
   Laura J. Schwartz, Models for Parenthood in Adoption Law: The French Conception

B. Termination of Parental Rights
   1. Giving and Revoking Voluntary Consent
Chapter 12 • International Adoption

A. Intercountry Adoption: Benevolent Option or Last Resort?

Problem 12-1

Elizabeth Bartholet, International Adoption: Propriety, Prospects and Pragmatics

Twila Perry, Transracial and International Adoption: Mothers, Hierarchy, Race, and Feminist Legal Theory


David M. Smolin, Intercountry Adoption and Poverty: A Human Rights Analysis

Susan R. Harris, Race, Search, and My Baby-Self: Reflections of a Transracial Adoptee

Susan Soon-Keum Cox, Ritual

D. Marianne Blair, Safeguarding the Interests of Children in Intercountry Adoption: Assessing the Gatekeepers

B. Regulation of International Adoption by International Conventions

1. U.N. Conventions

2. The Hague Intercountry Adoption Convention

a. Central Authorities

b. Accredited Agencies and Approved Persons

c. Convention Requirements for the Adoption Process

d. Recognition of Convention Adoptions and U.S. Certification Procedures

Notes and Questions

Problems

C. Adopting a Child from Abroad—The Process

1. Role of Adoption Agencies and Lawyers

2. U.S. Immigration Requirements

a. Eligibility for Immediate Relative Status for an Orphan
Rogan v. Reno 765
Notes and Questions 767

b. Eligibility for Immediate Relative Status for a Hague Convention Adoption 769
Problem 12-6 770
Notes and Questions 770

c. Process for Obtaining Orphan and Convention Visas 771
Note 776

d. Eligibility and Process for Obtaining Immediate Relative Status as an Adopted Child 776
Kaho v. Ilchert 777
Notes and Questions 780

3. Citizenship 783

4. Adoption, Readoption, and Recognition of Foreign Orders in U.S. Courts 784
a. Initial Adoption in U.S. Court 784
b. Readoption in a U.S. Court 785
c. Recognition of Foreign Adoption Decrees by U.S. Courts 785
Problems 786

Chapter 13 • Reproductive Rights 789
A. Reproductive Rights and Human Rights 789

1. International Population Issues 789
Reed Boland, Symposium on Population Law: The Environment, Population, and Women's Human Rights 791
Paula Abrams, Population Politics: Reproductive Rights and U.S. Asylum Policy 792

2. An Overview of Reproductive Rights 793
Barbara Stark, Reproductive Rights and Abortion 793
Barbara Stark, Crazy Jane Talks with the Bishop: Abortion in China, Germany, South Africa and International Human Rights 793
General Recommendation No. 24, Report of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women 796
Note and Question 797

3. The Protocol on the Rights of Women in Africa 797
Notes and Questions 798

B. State Natalist Policies 799

1. Pro-Natalist Policies 799
Notes and Questions 800

2. Anti-Natalist Policies 800

a. Iran 800
Janet Larsen, Iran's Birth Rate Plummeting at Record Pace: Success Provides a Model for Other Developing Countries 800
b. The People's Republic of China 802
Constitution of the People's Republic of China 803
Marriage Law of the People's Republic of China 803
Xiaorong Li, License to Coerce: Violence against Women, State Responsibility, and Legal Failures in China's Family-Planning Program 803
Population and Family Planning Law of the People's Republic of China 805
CONTENTS

Information Office of The State Council of the People’s Republic of China, Human Rights in China 806
Notes and Questions 808
Problem 13-1 811
Notes and Questions 811
More on Asylum 812
Notes and Questions 813
Problem 13-2 814
Problem 13-3 814

C. Abortion 815
Barbara Stark, Reproductive Rights and Abortion 815
Note and Questions 815

1. Municipal Approaches 816
   a. Canada 816
   b. El Salvador 818
   c. Lebanon 819
     Problem 13-4 820
     Notes and Questions 820

2. Regional Approaches 821
   a. Europe 821
   b. The Americas 822
   c. Africa 822
     Notes and Questions 822

3. International Law 823
   Notes and Questions 824

Chapter 14 • Children’s Human Rights within the Family 827
A. Convention on the Rights of the Child 827
   Jaap E. Doek, What Does the Children’s Convention Require? 828
   Notes and Questions 833
   Michael King, Against Children’s Rights 835

B. Children’s Rights in the United States and South Africa 836
   1. Children’s Rights in the United States 836
      Barbara Bennett Woodhouse, The Constitutionalization of
      Children’s Rights: Incorporating Emerging Human Rights
      into Constitutional Doctrine 836
      Martin Guggenheim, Ratify the U.N. Convention on the
      Rights of the Child, But Don’t Expect Any Miracles 837
      Notes and Questions 840
   2. Children’s Rights in South Africa 841
      Constitution of the Republic of South Africa 841
      Tshepo L. Mosikatsana, Children’s Rights and Family Autonomy
      in the South African Context: A Comment on Children’s
      Rights under the Final Constitution 842
      Julia Sloth-Nielsen, Chicken Soup or Chainsaws: Some
      Implications of the Constitutionalisation of Children’s Rights
      in South Africa 843
      Notes and Questions 844
      Government of the Republic of South Africa v. Grootboom 847
Notes and Questions 862

C. Corporal Punishment 865
1. The Committee’s General Comment 865
   The Committee’s General Comment on Corporal Punishment 865
2. The Special Expert’s Report 868
   Paulo Sérgio Penheiro, World Report on Violence against Children 868
3. Domestic Law and Law Reform Efforts 869
   Katie Sykes, Bambi Meets Godzilla: Children’s and Parent’s Rights in Canadian Foundation for Children, Youth and the Law 870
Notes and Questions 874
Committee on the Rights of the Child, Consideration of Reports Submitted by States Parties 875
Note and Questions 876
Committee on the CRC—Comments on State Reports Regarding Corporal Punishment 876
Notes and Questions 878

Index 881