

# Heritage under Siege

Military Implementation of Cultural Property  
Protection Following the 1954 Hague Convention

*By*

Joris D. Kila



BRILL

LEIDEN · BOSTON

2012

## CONTENTS

List of Illustrations.....	XI
Acknowledgements.....	XIII
Preface.....	XV
1. Introduction.....	1
Heritage.....	5
Culture.....	7
Siege.....	8
Conflict.....	9
Research Methods, Sources Used, and the Multidisciplinary Nature of the Subject.....	12
The Relevance of Military Cultural Property Protection.....	23
The Volatile Characteristics of Cultural Property.....	29
Looting and Poverty.....	30
2. The Playing Field of Cultural Property Protection.....	35
Setting the Stage.....	35
The Military.....	41
The Media.....	50
Governmental Institutions and Political Organizations.....	57
Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs).....	59
International Organizations (IOs).....	62
Work(ing) and Advisory Groups.....	66
Commerce, Crime, Law and Order, and Religion.....	69
Science.....	74
Trends in Cultural Property Protection until 1954.....	78
The Sociology of Cultural Property Protection and the Military.....	87
3. Case Studies.....	93
An Ethnographical Museum for Afghanistan.....	93
Iconoclasm in the Orthodox Monastery of Matejce in Macedonia: The Creative Use of Damaged Cultural Property ..	98
Saving Uruk from Looting.....	104
The Cultural Importance of Uruk.....	104
History of Excavating Uruk.....	105

Military Cultural Intervention .....	106
Key Elements for an Effective Cultural Property Protection	
Strategy Found in This Case .....	108
CPP and Civil Military Cooperation .....	111
Cultural Property Officers .....	111
Handover Procedures .....	112
Legal Obligations and Implications .....	112
Looting, Illicit Traffic and the Link with Security .....	114
Financing .....	116
Conclusions Concerning the Uruk Case .....	117
The Polish Approach in Iraq .....	118
A Case Example of (Unintended) Violation the Hague	
Convention: Hescos .....	123
The Case of the Iraqi National Library .....	127
Egypt February 12–16th 2011 .....	128
The Necropolis of Saqqara; An Introduction .....	136
Conclusions from the Egypt Looting Casus .....	144
Egyptian Epilogue .....	148
Conclusions .....	151
Libya .....	151
The Current Conflict in Libya .....	154
An Introduction to the Libyan World Heritage Sites .....	154
Follow up Activities to Safeguard Heritage in Libya .....	155
Lessons Learned .....	167
4. The Way Ahead .....	169
Balancing the Interests .....	169
Identified Dilemmas or Challenges Standing in the Way of CPP	
Implementation .....	170
Legal Aspects to Consider When Implementing CPP .....	176
Control Mechanisms and Sanctions .....	186
Common Denominators as Part of Solutions .....	189
Opportunities for Effective Implementation of Military Cultural	
Property Protection .....	191
Research, Education, and Exercise .....	195
Different Perceptions of the Relevance and Need for Training	
between the Military and Parties Who Want to Follow	
Up on the Hague Convention of 1954's Article 25 .....	196
Teaching and Training .....	197
Training <i>in situ</i> .....	201

Examples of Other Means for Training Military: the CPP	
Playing Cards .....	203
Geographic Information Systems (GIS) and Satellite Remote Sensing.....	205
Current Examples of Military CPP Implementation, a Comparative Analysis .....	206
Concluding Remarks: Proceeding From Violently Opposed to Being Accepted as Self-Evident .....	214
Valorization of the Research Outcomes .....	219
Summary .....	223
References .....	229
Glossary .....	237
Interviews .....	239

## APPENDIXES

1. The Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict of 1954 and the First and Second Protocols .....	243
2. Examples of CPP Field Pocket Cards in German and Dutch Prepared in Cooperation with the U.S. DoD Legacy Program .....	291
3. NATO Civil-Military Co-Operation (CIMIC) Doctrine AJP 9 .....	293
4. Regulation Number 200-2 Environmental Quality, CENTCOM Contingency Environmental Guidance.....	295
5. STANAG 7141 EP Joint NATO Doctrine For Environmental Protection During NATO Led Military Activities .....	299
6. Mission Report Civil-Military Assessment Mission for Egyptian Heritage. By Blue Shield and IMCuRWG February 12 to 16, 2011 ....	301
Index .....	313