Seeing Justice Done

The Age of Spectacular Capital Punishment in France

PAUL FRIEDLAND



Contents

List of illustrations	viii
Acknowledgments	ix
Introduction: Reading and Writing a History of Punishment	1
The Sow of Falaise: The Making of an Historical Legend	2
A Distant Mirror? Reading Historical Narratives of the Sow of Falaise From the Barbarians' Point of View: Narratives of Punishment	10
as Historical Anthropology	11
I. THE ROOTS OF MODERN PUNISHMENT In pre-modern Europe	
1. The Fall and Rise of Rome: Compensation, Atonement,	
and Deterrence in the Early Middle Ages	23
Roman Law after the Fall of Rome: Deterrence Decontextualized	26
The Laws of the Salian Franks: Punishment as Payback	29
Christian Penance and Atonement	32
The Renaissance of Roman Legal Studies in Medieval Europe	38
2. Criminal Intent and Spectacular Punishment: The Infiltration	
of Roman Legal Theory and Practice into French Customary Law	46
Intentionality and Customary Law	49
Lèse-Majesté and Treason in Customary Law	52
High Justice, Low Justice, and the Spectacularization of Punishment	56
The Homogenization of Justice	65
II. EXECUTIONERS AND THE RITUAL Of execution	
3. Extraordinary Beings: The Life and Work of Executioners	71
A Race of Outcasts	71
A People Apart: Duties, Privileges, and Restrictions	76
The End of an Era: The Abolition of Havage	85
4. The Execution of Justice: The Ritual of Punishment in Medieval	
and Early Modern France	89
The First Stage: Display and Shame	91
The Second Stage: Expulsion and Liminality	98
The Third Stage: Death as Reintegration or as the Ultimate Exile	101

0	
Conten	t٢

	Beyond Deterrence: The Execution of Inanimate and Non-Human Bodies Reconciling the Irreconcilable: Sixteenth-Century Jurists on	107
	Customary Practice and Deterrence Theory	112
	III. SPECTATORS AND SPECTACLE	
	III. SPECIATORS AND SPECIACLE	
5.	From Ritual to Spectacle: The Rise of the Penal Voyeur	
	in Early Modern France	119
	Watching Executions before the Sixteenth Century	120
	Spectacular Novelties	124
	A New Spectacularity: Anatomy Theaters, Executions, and the	
	Diary of Felix Platter	128
	Markers of a Shift in Viewing Habits: L'Estoile's Journals and	
	the Rise of Canards	132
	Executions as Tragic Spectacle: Rosset's Histoires tragiques	136
6	Executions, Spectator Emotions, and the Naturalization	
υ.	of Sympathy	143
	A Rising Spectacularity	144
	Sentimental Journey: From Stoic Insensitivity to Sensibilité	150
	"Neither shame, nor horror in attending"	155
	The Naturalization of Sympathy: Sensibility as Human Nature	158
7.	A Spectacular Crisis: Watching Executions in the	
	Age of Sensibilité	165
	Penal Spectators and the First Glimmerings of Self-Consciousness	166
	Collision Course: Spectacularity, Sentimentality, and	
	Exemplary Deterrence	168
	The Execution of Damiens: "The most horrible and disgusting	
	punishment that justice has ever dared to imagine"	176
	The 1750s: A Watershed of Sensibilities	183
	In the Wake of Damiens: A "Horror" of the Penal Spectacle	186
	IV. A DEATH PENALTY FOR THE MODERN AGE	
8	Theorizing a New Death Penalty: Penal Reform on the	
	Eve of the Revolution	195
	Utopian Penal Reform	196
	The End of Utopia: Montesquieu's L'Esprit des Lois	199

Beccaria's On Crimes and Punishments	205
Beccaria's Reception and Legacy	208
The Great (non-)Debate on Capital Punishment from Beccaria	
to the Penal Code of 1791	209

Contents	vii
9. Legislating the New Death Penalty: The Simple	
Deprivation of Life	218
Guillotin's Proposals for Reform	218
The Naturalization of the Executioner	224
A New Penal Code?	226
Debates on Capital Punishment	230
A Spectacular Death vs. the Simple Deprivation of Life	233
Killing Humanely	235
10. Executing the New Death Penalty: The Invisible Spectacle	
of the Guillotine	239
The Search for a Humane Killing Machine	240
Inventing the Guillotine	243
The Guillotine in Action	247
Gauging the Guillotine's Popularity	252
The Industrialization of Capital Punishment?	260
Epilogue: The Play Over, the Actors (Slowly) Leave the Stage	266
The Guillotine: A Disappearing Act	266
Conclusion: Punishment Past and Present	280
Notes	285
Index	325