
Homosexuality and the European Court of Human Rights

Paul Johnson

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xii
<i>Table of cases</i>	xiii

Introduction	1
---------------------	----------

<i>The European Convention on Human Rights and the Strasbourg organs</i>	4
<i>The aims of this book</i>	7
<i>A sociological approach to the Court's jurisprudence</i>	8
<i>The Court and heteronormativity</i>	11
<i>Sample of cases</i>	14
<i>A note on terminology</i>	14
<i>Outline of the book</i>	15

PART I

Making the homosexual of human rights	17
--	-----------

1 Emerging voices: homosexuality and the Commission 1955–1980	19
--	-----------

<i>The legal context of the applications lodged between 1955 and 1980</i>	20
<i>Germany and the 'paragraph 175' applications</i>	22
<i>The Austrian cases</i>	29
<i>The Commission and 'the homosexual' in the 1950s and 1960s</i>	31
<i>Constructing the homosexual in the 1970s: the 'age of consent' applications</i>	34
<i>Conclusion</i>	39

2 An ontological struggle: the Court and the homosexual since 1981	41
---	-----------

<i>The subject of ontology</i>	42
--------------------------------	----

- The declarations of applicants* 46
- Recognizing the essentiality of homosexuality* 49
- Contesting an ontology of 'danger'* 52
- The limits of the Court's approach: nature versus value* 57
- Conclusion: the social construction of homosexual nature* 59

PART II

Methods and morals

63

3 Homosexuality in the judicial laboratory: instruments, interpretations and evolutions

65

- Avoiding activism* 66
- The margin of appreciation* 69
- Consensus analysis* 77
- A living instrument to be interpreted in the light of present-day conditions* 84
- Conclusion* 88

PART III

Existing jurisprudence and potential future developments

91

4 'An essentially private manifestation of the human personality': the limitations of Article 8

93

- The Court's approach to private life* 94
- Protecting sexual privacy* 96
- The limits of private life* 100
- The public/private binary and the reproduction of the closet* 103
- The political consequences of the Court's interpretation of private life* 111
- Family life* 113
- Conclusion* 118

5 The anti-discrimination provisions of the Convention: Article 14 and Protocol 12

121

- The Court's approach to discrimination* 123
- The long road to Article 14* 126
 - The 'age of consent'* 127
 - 'Home' and 'family life'* 129
 - Parental rights/adoption of a child* 131

	<i>Freedom of assembly</i>	135
	<i>Four major gaps for homosexual rights under Article 14</i>	135
	<i>Economic benefits</i>	136
	<i>Civil partnership/marriage</i>	139
	<i>Immigration rights for same-sex couples</i>	141
	<i>Employment</i>	143
	<i>Conclusion: is the future bright under Protocol 12?</i>	144
6	A right to marriage? Same-sex relationships and Article 12	146
	<i>Same-sex marriage, heteronormativity and human rights</i>	147
	<i>Strasbourg jurisprudence in respect of same-sex marriage and Article 12</i>	151
	<i>Schalk and Kopf v Austria</i>	155
	<i>The future of same-sex marriage under Article 12</i>	158
	<i>Conclusion</i>	161
7	Expression, assembly and association: Articles 10 and 11	163
	<i>The Court's approach to Article 10</i>	164
	<i>Freedom of expression and homosexuality</i>	165
	<i>The Court's Article 10 jurisprudence in respect of homosexuality</i>	168
	<i>Homosexuality as obscenity</i>	168
	<i>The expression of sexual orientation</i>	172
	<i>Freedom of the press</i>	174
	<i>Protection from 'hate speech'</i>	176
	<i>The Court's approach to Article 11</i>	181
	<i>Association, assembly and homosexuality</i>	183
	<i>The Court's Article 11 jurisprudence in respect of homosexuality</i>	185
	<i>Conclusion</i>	190
8	Humiliation and debasement: degrading treatment and Article 3	192
	<i>Why Article 3 is important for homosexuals</i>	193
	<i>The Court's approach to Article 3</i>	194
	<i>The Court's jurisprudence in respect of Article 3 complaints relating to homosexuality</i>	197
	<i>Criminalization of homosexual sex</i>	198
	<i>Treatment in detention</i>	200
	<i>Treatment of service people in the armed forces</i>	204
	<i>Deportation of asylum seekers</i>	206
	<i>Conclusions: can Article 3 be evolved to better protect homosexuals?</i>	208

Conclusions	210
<i>Bibliography</i>	215
<i>Appendix 1 – European Convention on Human Rights (truncated)</i>	224
<i>Appendix 2 – Chronological list of decisions and judgments of the Strasbourg organs in respect of homosexuality</i>	231
<i>Index</i>	248