

The Principle of Loyalty in EU Law

MARCUS KLAMERT

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xiii
<i>Table of Instruments</i>	xxi

Introduction	1
1. The Background	1
2. Caveats as Regards Perspective and Methodology	2
3. The System Applied in this Study	4

I. INTRODUCING LOYALTY

1. Loyalty in the EU Treaties	9
1. Introduction	9
2. Loyalty before the Lisbon Treaty	10
3. The Lisbon Treaty Amendments	11
4. Specifications of Article 4 (3) TEU in the Treaties	13
5. Loyalty and National Identities	19
6. The Vectors of the Application of Loyalty	22
7. Conclusion	29
2. Loyalty in Context	31
1. Introduction	31
2. Some Remarks on Terminology	33
3. Distinguishing the Union Principle of Solidarity	35
4. The Relation with the Principles of Good Faith and <i>pacta sunt servanda</i>	41
5. Federal Fidelity in the European Union	47
6. Conclusion	61
3. Loyalty and the Constitutionalization of EU Law	63
1. Introduction	63
2. Loyalty in the Literature	64
3. The Foundational Case Law Re-assessed	71
4. The Way Loyalty Has Been Used by the Court in the Foundational Case Law	80
5. Conclusion	83
<i>Conclusion of the Introductory Part</i>	84

II. THE COHESION OF EUROPEAN UNION LAW

Introduction	85
4. A Primer on the Structure of Union Law	87
1. Introduction	87
2. The Unity of National Law and Union Law	88

3. The (Inner) Unity of the Union Legal Order	92
4. Conclusion	99
5. Supremacy, Pre-emption, and the Union Interest	101
1. Introduction	101
2. Some Thoughts on the Nature of Supremacy	101
3. Duties Unrelated to Supremacy Flowing from Secondary Law	105
4. Duties Unrelated to Supremacy Flowing from Preparatory Legal Acts	110
5. Do We Need a Concept of Pre-emption in Union Law?	115
6. The Union Interest	122
7. Conclusion	123
6. Effectiveness, Judicial Protection, and Loyalty	125
1. Introduction	125
2. The Principle of Effectiveness and the Enforcement of Individual Rights	126
3. Effectiveness and Compliance by the Member States	131
4. Effectiveness, Effective Judicial Protection, and Indirect Effect	133
5. Effectiveness, Effective Judicial Protection, and Duties of Abstention	136
6. Conclusion	137
<i>Conclusion of the Part on Cohesion</i>	139
 III. COOPERATION IN THE EUROPEAN UNION 	
Introduction	141
7. A Primer on Union Competences	143
1. Codification in the Lisbon Treaty	143
2. Three Categories of Competences	144
3. The General System of External Powers of the Union After Lisbon	146
4. Exclusive Competences	147
5. Non-exclusive Competences	157
6. Conclusion	159
8. Loyalty and Non-exclusive Competences	161
1. Introduction	161
2. Loyalty and 'Regular' Shared Competences	161
3. Loyalty and 'Irregular' Shared Competences	163
4. Loyalty and Supporting Competences	167
5. Conclusion	171
9. Manifestations of Loyalty in Secondary Law	173
1. Introduction	173
2. Non-supervisory Notification Obligations	174
3. Supervisory Notification Obligations on Technical Standards	175

4. Hybrid: The Services Directive	177
5. Prohibitions of Frustration and Transitional Periods	178
6. 'Managed' Preclusion of Member States	179
7. Conclusion	182
10. Loyalty and Mixed Agreements	183
1. Introduction	183
2. Competence and Mixed Agreements	185
3. The General Application of Loyalty to Mixed Agreements	188
4. Loyalty and the Requirement of Unity	190
5. Loyalty and the Conclusion of Mixed Agreements	192
6. Loyalty and Declarations of Competence	195
7. Loyalty and Common Positions	197
8. Loyalty and the Ratification of Mixed Agreements	202
9. Loyalty and the Interpretation and Implementation of Mixed Agreements	203
10. Conclusion	206
<i>Conclusion of the Part on Cooperation</i>	207
IV. THE CONSTRUCTION OF THE EUROPEAN UNION	
Introduction	209
11. A Primer on Cooperation and Constitutional Conflict in the European Union	211
1. Introduction	211
2. Preliminary References and Other Interactions Between Courts in the EU	212
3. Loyalty, Institutional Balance, and Conflicts of Legal Basis	215
4. The Relationship Between the ECJ and the Union Legislature	217
5. Constitutional Conflicts Between EU Law and Member State Legal Regimes	225
6. Conclusion	232
12. On the Nature of Loyalty	233
1. Introduction	233
2. Loyalty as an Independent Source of Obligations	234
3. Loyalty as a General Principle of Union Law	241
4. Conclusion	249
5. <i>Interim Summary of the Roles of Loyalty in EU Law</i>	250
13. Deconstructing Loyalty	252
1. Introduction	252
2. Evaluation Criteria for the Reasoning of the Court	253
3. Loyalty, Effectiveness, and <i>effet utile</i>	261
4. Loyalty and Self-referential Reasoning	267
5. Conclusion	273

14. Amplification and the Limits of Loyalty	275
1. Introduction	275
2. The Amplification of Provisions of Primary and Secondary Law	276
3. Loyalty, the Prohibition of Discrimination, and Inter se Treaties	280
4. The Amplification of Internal Union Rules	286
5. The <i>Hurd</i> Case	288
6. The Limits to Amplification	290
<i>Conclusion of the Part on Construction</i>	297
<i>Final Remarks</i>	298
<i>References</i>	301
<i>Index</i>	325